

U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS

+ + + + +

TELEPHONIC COMMISSION MEETING

+ + + + +

THURSDAY, AUGUST 16, 2007

+ + + + +

The Commission convened via teleconference at 5:00 p.m., Gerald a. Reynolds, Chairman, presiding.

PRESENT:

GERALD A. REYNOLDS, Chairman  
GAIL HERIOT, Commissioner  
PETER N. KIRSANOW, Commissioner  
ARLAN D. MELENDEZ, Commissioner  
ASHLEY L. TAYLOR, JR., Commissioner  
MICHAEL YAKI, Commissioner

KENNETH L. MARCUS, Staff Director

STAFF PRESENT:

DAVID BLACKWOOD, General Counsel  
CHRISTOPHER BYRNES, Attorney Advisor to the Office  
of the Staff Director and Acting Deputy General  
Counsel, OGC  
PAMELA A. DUNSTON, Chief, Administrative Services  
and Clearinghouse Division  
MONICA KIBLER  
TINALOUISE MARTIN, Director of Management  
EMMA MONROIG, Solicitor/Parliamentarian  
AUDREY WRIGHT

COMMISSIONER ASSISTANTS PRESENT:

LISA NEUDER  
DOMINIQUE LUDVIGSON  
RICHARD SCHMECHEL  
KIMBERLY SCHULD

**LIBRARY**

U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

TABLE OF CONTENTS

2

AGENDA	PAGE
I. Approval of Agenda	7
II. Approval of Minutes of August 2 Meeting	8
III. Management and Operations 2009 Budget	10
IV. Program Planning, Commissioner Responses to Briefing Reports	27
V. State Advisory Committee Issues (tabled)	40
VI. Adjournment	41

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

## P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

(5:00 p.m.)

CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: This is Chairman Reynolds. It is 5:00 p.m. Eastern Standard Time on August 16th, 2007. We're having a telephonic meeting with commissioners participating from different locations. I will call the names of each commissioner in order to determine if there is a quorum to hold a meeting.

Vice Chair Thernstrom?

(No response.)

CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Braceras?

(No response.)

CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Kirsanow?

COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Here.

CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot?

COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Here.

CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Melendez?

(No response.)

CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki?

COMMISSIONER YAKI: Here.

CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Taylor?

(No response.)

CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Taylor?

COMMISSIONER YAKI: Oh, he was on mute.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 He was getting off an airplane. So he may be walking  
2 through the thingamajig right now.

3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. We have, let's  
4 see -- Staff Director, Mr. Staff Director, how many  
5 commissioners do we need for a quorum?

6 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: I believe that  
7 when Commissioner Taylor comes back online, we will  
8 have a quorum. At this point we have four, and we  
9 need one more.

10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

11 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Is that right? We  
12 need more than half?

13 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: Five.

14 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Five. Okay.

15 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: All right. Is the  
16 operator still on the line?

17 TELEPHONE OPERATOR: Yes, I am.

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Please take us off  
19 until Commissioner Taylor is on the line.

20 TELEPHONE OPERATOR: Okay. I will  
21 transfer you back.

22 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Thank you.

23 TELEPHONE OPERATOR: You're welcome.

24 (Whereupon, the foregoing matter went off  
25 the record at 5:01 p.m. and went back on the record at

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 5:07 p.m.)

2 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. We are back. I  
3 am going to go through the roll call once again to  
4 confirm that we have a quorum. Vice Chair Thernstrom?

5 (No response.)

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Braceras?

7 (No response.)

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Kirsanow?

9 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Here.

10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot?

11 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Here.

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Melendez?

13 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Here.

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki?

15 (No response.)

16 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki?

17 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Oh, boy.

18 TELEPHONE OPERATOR: He is online. He may  
19 just have us on mute.

20 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Oh, but --

21 PARTICIPANT: We need to verify.

22 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Right.

23 (Pause.)

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Everyone hit  
25 your mute button. I'm going to try to reach

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Commissioner Yaki.

2 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Why?

3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Oh, Commissioner Yaki?  
4 Commissioner Yaki?

5 COMMISSIONER YAKI: All right. I jumped  
6 off. My other line rang. So I'm sorry. I thought  
7 you guys were still on hold.

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. We have five  
9 commissioners on the line. So we have a quorum. Is  
10 the staff director present?

11 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: I'm here, Mr.  
12 Chairman.

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Is the court reporter  
14 on the line?

15 PARTICIPANT: Neal Gross?

16 THE COURT REPORTER: I am here, Mr.  
17 Chairman. If I could ask that when people speak --

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: If a commissioner  
19 wants to make a statement, please identify yourself  
20 first.

21 Whenever it is necessary to take a vote,  
22 the following procedure will be followed. I will call  
23 out the name of each commissioner. The commissioner  
24 should then answer "Yes," "No," or "Abstain." After  
25 the voting has concluded, I will read aloud the votes

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to ensure that the tally is correct.

2 I. Approval of Agenda

3 The first item on the agenda is the  
4 approval of the agenda. I move that we approve the  
5 agenda.

6 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I have a motion on  
7 that.

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes, Commissioner  
9 Heriot?

10 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I have a motion that  
11 we table the consideration of the state advisory  
12 committee issues. That is item 5 on the agenda.

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Is there a second?

14 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Kirsanow. Second.

15 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Discussion?

16 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I've got some  
17 suggestions I would like to make. And there is not  
18 enough time to make it in the meeting. And I think we  
19 can handle this next week at our regular meeting.

20 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Commissioner  
21 Kirsanow, how do you vote?

22 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot,  
24 it's your vote. I assume you --

25 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. I vote yes.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Melendez?

2 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Yes.

3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki?

4 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

5 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: And I support it also.

6 The vote passes unanimously.

7 **II. Approval of Minutes of August 2 Meeting**

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Next up is the  
9 approval of the minutes of the August 2nd, 2007  
10 meeting. May I have a motion?

11 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I did notice the  
12 first line said it was the monthly meeting, and it was  
13 actually the second meeting of that month, wasn't it,  
14 or -- I don't have it in front of me now since I  
15 managed to drop it.

16 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Ken, what we're  
17 talking about is the minutes of the August 2nd  
18 meeting. Is that correct or no?

19 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: Yes, that's right.  
20 It was the first meeting of the month, but  
21 Commissioner Heriot does have a point in that it was  
22 not the official monthly meeting.

23 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Why don't we just  
24 strike that word?

25 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: Yes.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. So the motion  
2 is for the approval of the minutes of the August 2nd  
3 meeting.

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: With the word  
5 stricken.

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes. Is there a  
7 second?

8 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Second.

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Discussion?

10 (No response.)

11 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Commissioner  
12 Kirsanow, how do you vote?

13 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot?

15 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

16 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Melendez?

17 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Yes.

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki?

19 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Aye.

20 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: The motion passes  
21 unanimously.

22 Next up is --

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I didn't hear your  
24 vote.

25 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I'm sorry?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I didn't hear your  
2 vote.

3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Oh, I vote in favor of  
4 it. It passed unanimously.

5 **III. Management and Operations, 2009 Budget**

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Next up is the 2009  
7 budget. A few weeks ago you were provided with a  
8 summary of the Commission's fiscal year 2009 budget  
9 estimate.

10 As you know, the Commission is asking for  
11 a little over 11 million bucks, which is a \$2 million  
12 increase over what the Appropriations Committee  
13 approved in 2008. Mr. Staff Director, would you  
14 please explain this recommended increase?

15 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: Certainly, Mr.  
16 Chairman. The increase is attributable to a couple of  
17 important items on the draft five-year strategic plan,  
18 the most important of which for budgetary purposes are  
19 the proposed national civil rights conference, which  
20 is part of the strategic objective dealing with  
21 developing the national dialogue on civil rights. And  
22 the second relates to the strategic objective of  
23 reinvigorating the state advisory committees.

24 We have included in this budget both a  
25 little over \$100,000 for a fairly ambitious national

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 conference on civil rights as well as various  
2 increases dealing with regional travel to accommodate  
3 state advisory committee meetings and a number of new  
4 hires, most of which would relate to regional work in  
5 the state advisory committees. They would include,  
6 for instance, a handful of civil rights analysts as  
7 well as administrative assistants and others to deal  
8 with that work.

9 Some of the other important items deal  
10 with new software and technology for the agency,  
11 accommodating the expanded services that we are now  
12 receiving from GSA for accounting, replacements for  
13 computers and printers. Those are the main areas of  
14 increase.

15 And I would be happy to discuss any of  
16 them in greater detail. And, of course, we have  
17 anticipated cost-of-living increases and other  
18 inflation that is also measured in.

19 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. At this point  
20 is there a motion to approve submission of an \$11  
21 million fiscal year 2009 budget estimate to the Office  
22 of Management and Budget?

23 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Kirsanow. So  
24 moved.

25 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Is there a second?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Second.

2 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Discussion?

3 (No response.)

4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Kirsanow,  
5 how do you vote?

6 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: I have one  
7 question on the discussion period, if you don't mind.

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Oh, not at all.

9 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Mr. Staff  
10 Director, did the budget include salaries? I don't  
11 have it in front of me right now, and I am having  
12 difficulty calling it up on my computer. Did it  
13 include salaries or how many special assistants did it  
14 include salaries for?

15 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: I believe it  
16 included salaries for the same number of special  
17 assistants that are currently on board.

18 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: And how many  
19 commissioner salaries did it anticipate?

20 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: Eight. Oh, is it  
21 seven or eight?

22 PARTICIPANT: Eight commissioners.

23 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: Eight. Eight  
24 commissioner salaries. So that if we had to pay fewer  
25 than eight commissioner salaries, of course, we would

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 have a savings.

2 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Okay. Thank you.  
3 That's all I want to know.

4 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I have a question that  
5 --

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Melendez?

7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: This is Commissioner  
8 Yaki.

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Oh, I'm sorry.  
10 Commissioner Yaki?

11 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Why don't we put in  
12 the budget for special assistants for all the  
13 commissioners?

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot?

15 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. I would think  
16 that should be a priority.

17 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I think it's a good  
18 idea. Does anyone have any reservations or concerns?

19 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: It can't hurt to  
20 ask.

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Ken --

22 PARTICIPANT: I'll tell you we're more  
23 likely to get that than a lot of other things we would  
24 be asking for.

25 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: I don't see any

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 reason why not. The increases that we put on were  
2 primarily driven by the strategic plan, which is why  
3 we didn't put that in in the first place, but I don't  
4 see why it would hurt to ask.

5 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: How much time would it  
6 take? I'm assuming that turning the document around  
7 wouldn't take long.

8 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: No. I think if  
9 the Commission were to approve the budget with  
10 additional funds for hiring of eight special  
11 assistants, we could fairly easily add that. It would  
12 not create any additional time problems.

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Additional questions?  
14 Concerns?

15 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Yes. This is  
16 Commissioner Melendez.

17 As far as the regional offices, as far as  
18 the funding, is the rent for all of those regional  
19 offices included in the two million or so that is set  
20 aside for the regional office line item?

21 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: I believe it is in  
22 that line item. And I see a head being nodded. So  
23 unless the Director of Management wants to say  
24 something to the contrary, let me take just a look.

25 (Pause.)

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Ken?

2 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: Yes? I'm sorry.  
3 Office of Management has just indicated to me that  
4 it's in the \$1.305 million line item under ASCD for  
5 rent, communications, and utilities.

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Mr. Melendez, do you  
7 have any other questions or comments?

8 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Yes. The other  
9 thing was, as far as staffing, he says, I believe, new  
10 hires for the regional offices. But I'm not sure  
11 exactly what new hires we're talking about. I believe  
12 on page 2 under the new hire salary, most of those  
13 positions are around 45,000, which would indicate that  
14 we're basically hiring probably secretarial or  
15 administrative staff. Is that the case?

16 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: The positions  
17 would include a civil rights analyst for the Western  
18 regional office, a civil rights analyst for the Rocky  
19 Mountain regional office, a civil rights analyst for  
20 the central regional office, a civil rights analyst  
21 for the Midwestern regional office, administrative  
22 assistant for the Southern regional office, a  
23 writer/editor for the regional program coordination  
24 unit.

25 And now this is another hire that's not

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 related to the regions is a staff assistant in Budget  
2 and Finance Division. These are new hires relative to  
3 2008.

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Do we need to move  
5 to include a budget item for the staff, the special  
6 assistants that Michael was talking about?

7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes. I think that  
8 that would be --

9 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Should we do that  
10 formally?

11 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes.

12 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Michael, did you  
13 want to make that motion?

14 COMMISSIONER YAKI: So moved.

15 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Second.

16 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Discussion?

17 (No response.)

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Kirsanow,  
19 how do you vote?

20 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot?

22 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Melendez?

24 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Yes.

25 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

2 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: And I support it also.

3 The motion passes unanimously. Okay. So that was  
4 just the addition of funds for assistance. Are there  
5 any other comments about the budget?

6 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Yes. Commissioner  
7 Melendez here. As far as the travel compared for the  
8 regions, we only had for 2008 about 15,000. So has it  
9 been increased for the 2009?

10 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: I'm sorry.  
11 Commissioner Melendez, are you asking whether the  
12 travel for the region has been increased?

13 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Yes.

14 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: Yes. And our  
15 request is we are requesting a substantial increase in  
16 regional travel to approximately the amount of  
17 \$266,000.

18 And the reason that it's so large is  
19 twofold: first, because there was virtually no money  
20 in the budget for 2008. So we have really had to fund  
21 virtually all regional travel out of attrition this  
22 year, which is not something we would want to plan  
23 for.

24 The second reason is that we would  
25 anticipate that we will have a much larger number of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 chartered state advisory committees by 2009.  
2 Certainly we have a lot more now than we had a year  
3 ago, and we certainly hope to continue at this pace.  
4 So this is an ambitious travel number which is based  
5 on the hope and expectation that we will have a large  
6 number of active state advisory committees.

7 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Okay. As far as  
8 the Office of General Counsel, we have a decrease in  
9 that position over 2008?

10 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: Yes, it is a  
11 decrease in that there is one attorney who has left  
12 the office. And as between an attorney and a senior  
13 secretary, the Office of General Counsel has  
14 identified an experienced secretary as being their  
15 greatest single need. And so it reflects having a  
16 secretary, rather than an attorney, which is  
17 significant savings, which we can use for other  
18 purposes that are in the budget.

19 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Okay. Based on  
20 the fact that the General Counsel is in charge of the  
21 statutory reports, by not rehiring an attorney in this  
22 position, does that make it more difficult for us to  
23 fulfill our obligations?

24 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: Well, I guess  
25 there are a couple of things to be said to that.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 First, the General Counsel is not typically  
2 responsible for the statutory reports. That  
3 responsibility is usually that of the Office of Civil  
4 Rights Evaluation.

5 This year was an exception in that the  
6 Office of General Counsel was primarily responsible  
7 with only some support from OCRE. Next year is also  
8 something of an exception in the sense that the  
9 prisons project will be shared between those two  
10 offices.

11 Part of the reason for this, of course, is  
12 that it is taking a little more time than initially  
13 anticipated to fill the directorship of the Office of  
14 Civil Rights Evaluation.

15 I would anticipate that by 2009, the  
16 primary responsibility for the statutory report would  
17 return to the Office of Civil Rights Evaluation. As  
18 you might recall, the statutory report for that year  
19 deals with fair housing, which is a kind of report  
20 which is a little closer to the statutory reports  
21 traditionally conducted by OCRE.

22 Now, having said that, there's no question  
23 that it would be more difficult for OGC to conduct its  
24 work in 2009 relative to a period, say, a couple or a  
25 few years ago because it involves a dwindling staff.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           On the other hand, as compared to today,  
2 this would, this budget would, reflect an increase in  
3 that there will be more staffing as compared to today.

4           COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ:     Okay.     Another  
5 question from Commissioner Melendez.     What does the  
6 \$109,300 budgeted for contract labor in the ASCD  
7 Division cover?

8           STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS:    I'm sorry.    Let me  
9 just take a moment to look at that item, Commissioner  
10 Melendez.

11                                       (Pause.)

12           STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS:     I believe,  
13 Commissioner Melendez, that that line item -- and I'm  
14 having OM look at that as we're speaking.    I believe  
15 that that is a line item in which we would include the  
16 event planner, which we would envision having for our  
17 national conference.

18                                       Now, I should add that this budget  
19 projects a relatively ambitious conference for 2009.  
20 We are realistic about the prospect that we might get  
21 less than what we are asking for.

22                                       And so we are trying to project different  
23 levels of conference depending upon the amount of  
24 money that we get.    But in terms of what we are asking  
25 for, we're asking for a budget that is significant

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 enough that would enable us to hire a professional  
2 planner to assist us with some of the aspects of the  
3 conference.

4 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: One more question.  
5 How much money does this budget set aside for the  
6 briefings and the hearings that we are supposed to be  
7 having in 2009?

8 COMMISSIONER YAKI: This is Commissioner  
9 Yaki. I want to add to that because I thought the  
10 budget report said only three briefings, report and  
11 the conference. I just didn't know where that fit in  
12 with the projected backlog of briefing desires for  
13 2009.

14 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: As I recall -- and  
15 others can help me -- the Commission vote during the  
16 Planning Committee meeting was to conduct at least  
17 three briefings during that fiscal year.

18 Now the commissioners identified a greater  
19 number than three of briefings that they would like to  
20 hold. I think numbers of five and six came up  
21 together with various caveats that were expressed  
22 during the course of the meeting that we might only be  
23 able to do three.

24 At the time of the planning meeting, it  
25 was my suggestion that if we were to have not only a

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 statutory report but also a national conference and a  
2 report that's based both on the national conference  
3 and also on all state advisory committees, that we  
4 would need to have a smaller number of briefings than  
5 we have had in the past, with three being a number  
6 that seemed realistic in light of current national  
7 staffing.

8 So the budget assumes approximately three  
9 briefings as well as the national conference and the  
10 multi-state SAC report and, of course, the statutory  
11 report.

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Additional questions?

13 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I have just one  
14 more question. Why are the Commission's projects a  
15 separate column with its own salary and benefit  
16 numbers? And does that money cover additional staff?

17 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: Yes.  
18 Commissioners, because of the way that question goes  
19 to the nature of the Excel spreadsheet and why it was  
20 developed, I think I am going to have to turn to the  
21 Director of Management, Tina Martin. Tina, you are  
22 online?

23 (No response.)

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Mr. Staff Director,  
25 this is Commissioner Reynolds. Is Ms. Martin on the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 line?

2 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: I'm sorry. We're  
3 having difficulty with that. I'm just informed that  
4 while it seems that she is on the line, her line  
5 appears to be muted by the operator. She appears not  
6 to be on the speaking line right now.

7 And I don't know whether that's something  
8 that we can correct at this point. A staff member has  
9 just gone to another line to see if they could work on  
10 that.

11 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Okay. Well, also  
12 --

13 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: I'm sorry. But  
14 aside from the question of the way that the Excel  
15 spreadsheet was set up, Commissioner Melendez, is  
16 there some policy aspect to that question? Is there  
17 somewhere that the question was leading to that I  
18 might be able to address or was it just about why it  
19 was set up in the way that it was?

20 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Well, I think we  
21 need to know who the employees will be in each  
22 division of the agency in 2009 and, you know, just so  
23 it's a little clearer.

24 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: Okay. Well,  
25 perhaps I can help with that. You are trying to find

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 who the employees will be in the agency?

2 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Well, yes. That's  
3 part of it.

4 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: If you're trying  
5 to figure out what the differences are in positions,  
6 the only new position upon which this budget is  
7 predicated would be the ones that I listed a little  
8 while ago.

9 Now, those new hires that I listed would  
10 amount to approximately \$324,000. And, of course,  
11 there are some people who would come on board between  
12 now and 2009.

13 For instance, we've spoken earlier about  
14 the RPCU chief. And you are aware that there are  
15 vacancies that we are filling, for instance, for the  
16 directorship of OCRE. And there is an administrative  
17 assistant opening that recently developed in ASCD that  
18 we will want to fill. And we also have a fairly  
19 recent vacancy for a secretary in -- it's somewhere in  
20 OM. I want to say it's somewhere in OM that we're  
21 going to need to fill.

22 Beyond that, we do not envision in this  
23 budget that we would be eliminating positions, only  
24 adding them. And they're the sorts of positions I  
25 just mentioned.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 Does that answer your question?

2 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Yes. Thank you.

3 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Are there  
4 additional questions?

5 (No response.)

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Since there are  
7 no questions, Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

8 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot?

10 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

11 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Melendez?

12 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: No.

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki?

14 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

15 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I'm sorry?

16 Commissioner Yaki?

17 (No response.)

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki?

19 (No response.)

20 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

21 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: It's funny. I  
22 thought he said, "Yes," but it was so faint that --

23 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes. That's what  
24 it sounded like to me, but --

25 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes but not clear

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 enough.

2 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Right. Okay. And --

3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Yaki,  
5 you're back.

6 COMMISSIONER YAKI: That was a yes.

7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. And I support  
8 it also. So with the exception of Commissioner  
9 Melendez, who voted against the motion the motion  
10 passes unanimously.

11 COMMISSIONER YAKI: How did it pass  
12 unanimously if Commissioner Melendez voted no?

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I said with the --

14 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Other than.

15 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. You're going to  
16 bust my chops now.

17 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Except for the five  
18 runs scored in the bottom of the ninth inning, he had  
19 a shut-out.

20 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Your point is a good  
21 one.

22 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Did Commissioner  
23 Taylor ever join us?

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: No, he did not.

25

#### IV. Program Planning

### NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

**Commissioner Responses to Briefing Reports**

1                   CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Next up. The  
2 staff director recently circulated the commissioner  
3 statements for approving the briefing report on  
4 affirmative action in law schools. Those statements  
5 included Commissioner Melendez's and Yak's alternative  
6 summaries of the explanations of their opposition  
7 votes to each of the approved findings and  
8 recommendations. They wish to include these summaries  
9 following each finding and recommendation set forth in  
10 the briefing report, which was prepared by the staff  
11 for publication.

12                   These commissioner-proposed embedded  
13 dissents have raised several concerns of other  
14 commissioners. The concerns included whether it is  
15 proper to provide a summary of the views of the  
16 dissenters without also providing a summary of the  
17 views of all of the other commissioners, whether it  
18 was appropriate to publish statements of the grounds  
19 of dissent after each finding and recommendation as  
20 well as at the end of the report, and whether we  
21 should provide the dissenting commissioners' own  
22 formulation of the reasons for their dissent, as  
23 opposed to a staff summary of these reasons.

24                   In other to address these issues, I would  
25

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 like to move that to the extent that commissioners  
2 want to provide a finding-by-finding and  
3 recommendation-by-recommendation statement for the  
4 basis of their dissent or an explanation of their  
5 concurrence, they may do so, but it would be included  
6 in their dissent or concurrence.

7 Under this motion, this finding-by-finding  
8 and recommendation-by-recommendation explanation of  
9 concurrences and dissents would take the place of the  
10 explanations included after each finding and  
11 recommendation in the main body of the report.

12 Is there a second?

13 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I will second that.  
14 You know, I think there are a lot of ways to do this.  
15 It's just what I object to right now is these are  
16 supposed to be non-argumentative findings and  
17 recommendations. And then the only argument is the  
18 argument against them.

19 You know, we have either got to let people  
20 have both, you know, the arguments in favor and the  
21 arguments against, together or we've got to take them  
22 and put them somewhere else. I mean, I am open to  
23 other ideas on how to do this.

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

25 COMMISSIONER YAKI: This is Commissioner

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Yaki. I mean, I thought we were just following the  
2 procedure that we had voted on earlier. I didn't  
3 realize it would cause such a fuss.

4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, I believe that  
5 the expectation -- and, you know, the expectation was  
6 that the staff would make a good faith effort to  
7 summarize, briefly summarize, the objection.

8 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: That's asking them  
9 to do a lot, you know, to crawl into all of our minds  
10 here. You know, we all can do it better ourselves.  
11 And it's just a question of where it should be placed.

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: So as a basis for  
13 discussion, though, what do you think of the idea of  
14 allowing this but as putting it with the dissent or  
15 concurrence?

16 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I think that's fine  
17 just to let people write it themselves and put it in  
18 their dissent and concurrence. And it might even  
19 encourage, you know, more concurrences, which I think  
20 we could, you know, use more of.

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Any other comments?

22 (No response.)

23 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Commissioner  
24 Kirsanow, how do you vote?

25 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Point of information.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes, Commissioner  
2 Yaki?

3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: When you have a  
4 quorum, is it simply a majority of those voting to  
5 approve it?

6 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: You mean how does an  
7 abstention count?

8 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No. Is it majority of  
9 those voting or majority of the body? That's all I'm  
10 asking.

11 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Oh. It's the  
12 majority of those voting. But don't take my word for  
13 it because I could make a mistake.

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Mr. Staff Director?

15 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: Commissioner  
16 Heriot is correct. It's the majority of those who are  
17 voting.

18 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Well, in that case,  
19 bye.

20 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. We were just  
21 denied a quorum.

22 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Well, let's keep on  
23 until we can get Ashley back, then.

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Let's hit our  
25 mute buttons and track down Mr. Taylor.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: You might want to  
2 work on Abby and Jennifer, too. Actually, once you  
3 have a quorum, I think you still have a quorum unless  
4 somebody notes its absence.

5 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, I believe I just  
6 did.

7 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I think it may be  
8 that you have to officially.

9 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Mr. Staff Director?

10 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: It's my  
11 understanding -- and we could go to the  
12 parliamentary -- that if a member of the quorum  
13 notes his departure and that departure leads to a loss  
14 of a quorum, then there is no quorum anymore. Madam  
15 Parliamentarian?

16 THE PARLIAMENTARIAN: That's correct.

17 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay. So just his  
18 act of saying, "I'm leaving." But that wasn't my  
19 understanding of how these things work, but fine. Can  
20 we find Jennifer or Abby or Ashley?

21 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I also have  
22 another meeting at 3:00 o'clock our time, which is  
23 about 20 minutes. So either hopefully somebody comes  
24 on the line or we can put this on next Friday's.

25 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Folks, I have Ashley

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 on the other line. Will somebody provide me with the  
2 call-in information?

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: We have got it?

4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Ken, do you have the  
5 call-in information handy?

6 TELEPHONE OPERATOR: 1-(800) 597-76 --

7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I'm sorry? Seven six?

8 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: Let me say it.  
9 1-(800) 597-7623. This is the staff director.

10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. And the code?  
11 Is there a code? Mr. Staff Director, is there a code?

12 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: I'm sorry. We may  
13 have just given you the wrong number. And the person  
14 who definitely has the right number has run out of the  
15 room a few minutes ago to try and reach Commissioner  
16 Taylor. We have got another person going to reach  
17 that person and get a new number for you.

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

19 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: The number that I  
20 just gave you might have been the public listen-only  
21 number, as opposed to the speak number.

22 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Well, when you get the  
23 information, please have someone call Commissioner  
24 Taylor on his cell phone and provide him with both the  
25 number and the code.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: We will do that,  
2 certainly.

3 TELEPHONE OPERATOR: Commissioner  
4 Reynolds?

5 TELEPHONE OPERATOR: Mr. Reynolds?

6 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Yes?

7 TELEPHONE OPERATOR: That is actually the  
8 correct dial-in number. All she has to do is state  
9 that she will be a speaker, and we will open her line.

10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay.

11 STAFF DIRECTOR MARCUS: Operator, of  
12 course, you will expect that he will identify himself  
13 as Ashley Taylor in order for you to do that.

14 TELEPHONE OPERATOR: Okay. That's fine.  
15 That's fine. That is fine. I will go ahead and step  
16 away so I can pick that line up for you.

17 (Pause.)

18 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I have to get  
19 going also. So, unfortunately, I have to leave the  
20 quorum at this point. Commissioner Melendez.

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. You can't hang  
22 on for ten minutes?

23 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I've got to be  
24 across town, and it's --

25 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: You're making a

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 mistake, Arlan.

2 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: I am?

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. You're not  
4 doing what's in your interest.

5 TELEPHONE OPERATOR: Commissioner Taylor  
6 is on.

7 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: I'm on.

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. We have a  
9 quorum.

10 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Let's vote.

11 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Kirsanow,  
12 how do you vote?

13 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

14 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Heriot?

15 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

16 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Melendez?

17 COMMISSIONER MELENDEZ: Against.

18 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Commissioner Taylor?

19 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Help me out on the  
20 motion.

21 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. It's a motion.

22 This is the issue regarding dissents, --

23 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Okay.

24 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: -- whether they should  
25 be included in the body of the document or in the back

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 along with the dissents and concurrences. The motion  
2 is for that type of commentary to be placed in the  
3 dissent and concurrence.

4 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Are you all there?

5 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

6 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Okay. I hate to do  
7 this, but is there a two-sentence summary of the  
8 argument?

9 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. Right now we  
10 have only the reason to be against as the findings and  
11 recommendations written with the findings and  
12 recommendations. So if we want to be fair, we have to  
13 put in also the reasons to be for it.

14 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Right.

15 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: And, therefore, the  
16 easiest thing to do at this point is to put them in  
17 the concurrences and dissent because otherwise --

18 COMMISSIONER YAKI: This is Commissioner  
19 Yaki. The whole point of why we did this in the first  
20 place is because it was to give the minority a chance  
21 to disagree with the findings on a point-by-point  
22 basis, which is a basis for our votes in briefings to  
23 allow vote by vote.

24 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Which is fine. The  
25 only problem is the findings and recommendations are

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 not argumentative.

2 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I'm sorry,  
3 Commissioner Heriot. I believe I was talking, and you  
4 weren't here during the debate. So if you would just  
5 give me the pleasure of --

6 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: You were the person  
7 who already left the quorum, Mr. Yaki.

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Hold on. Commissioner  
9 Yaki, first, I'm surprised that you are on the line.

10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I came back in because  
11 Commissioner Melendez asked me to come back on. But I  
12 don't know if Commissioner Melendez is still here or  
13 not.

14 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: He's already voted.

15 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: The discussion portion  
16 is closed. We are in the process of voting.

17 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Well, let me just by  
18 way of --

19 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner Heriot  
20 was doing the discussion portion. So she reopened it.  
21 So I felt a need to come in.

22 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: The discussion portion  
23 you elected --

24 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I mean, this is --

25 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: -- to get off the line

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 during that --

2 COMMISSIONER YAKI: -- unanimously. This  
3 was put forth by Commissioner Braceras as a way of  
4 ensuring that all viewpoints are expressed in these  
5 briefing reports. And now because some people don't  
6 like it or because they don't like the fact that it  
7 muddies the reports that people actually disagree with  
8 it within the body of the report itself, now we're  
9 going to repeal it? This is This is ridiculous.

10 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: We're just trying to  
11 let --

12 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Guys --

13 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: But, Commissioner  
14 Yaki, your ability to include language --

15 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Then why bother with  
16 voting on the findings point by point when you can  
17 just disagree with the individual ones that you don't  
18 like in the dissent? That doesn't track. That's not  
19 why we did it.

20 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: You're still going  
21 to have the fact that you dissented some particular  
22 finding or recommendation. That's noted.

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: That's not the point.  
24 The point is that we allowed -- the reason why we did  
25 it was to distinguish why we would vote yes on some,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 no on others because we --

2 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Are you arguing that  
3 only those who dissent should have the right to do  
4 this --

5 COMMISSIONER YAKI: -- vote of these  
6 particular issues. Now, I'm sorry. I guess you don't  
7 like the way it looks. You don't like the fact that  
8 someone is going to put in a statement below there  
9 "Commissioners Yaki and Melendez disagree with this  
10 idiotic finding." Well, tough luck. That's what we  
11 voted on. And now, you know, you're going to --

12 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: No one is denying you  
13 --

14 COMMISSIONER YAKI: -- about it. And  
15 don't say, "Well, we have to do it this way" or "this  
16 way." Just say you don't like the way it looks. It  
17 doesn't look as pretty to your friends who are trying  
18 to wave it around to their friends.

19 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: No one is taking away  
20 your ability to express your support or your  
21 disagreement.

22 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Bit by bit, Mr. Chair,  
23 over the past three months, that has not been the  
24 case.

25 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Would you like to give

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 me an example of what has occurred over these last --

2 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I will put it to you  
3 in a nice little polite letter, Mr. Chairman. But for  
4 right now, this is just ridiculous. I vote no. Make  
5 sure that Ashley votes yes because that's what you  
6 want him to do. And let's move on with this.

7 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Okay. Well, thank you  
8 for rejoining us.

9 Mr. Taylor, how do you vote?

10 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Aye.

11 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: And I also vote in  
12 favor. Please let the record reflect that  
13 Commissioners Melendez and Yaki voted against it and  
14 that the remaining commissioners, Commissioners  
15 Taylor, Heriot, Kirsanow, and Reynolds, voted in favor  
16 of it. The motion passes.

17 **V. State Advisory Committee Issues**

18 We have tabled the vote on the state  
19 advisory committees, the ones that were scheduled, New  
20 Jersey --

21 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Reconsider that vote?

22 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: I'm sorry?

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I move to reconsider  
24 that vote.

25 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Is there a second?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Can a person who  
2 voted no move to reconsider?

3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I voted yes.

4 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: He voted in favor of  
5 it. Is there a second?

6 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Check your log better  
7 next time.

8 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Is there a second?

9 (No response.)

10 CHAIRMAN REYNOLDS: Since there is no  
11 second, we will not reconsider it. That is all that  
12 we have on the agenda today. This teleconference is  
13 adjourned.

14 (Whereupon, the foregoing matter was  
15 concluded at 5:47 p.m.)

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



**NEAL R. GROSS**  
COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)