

## U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS

+ + + + +

PUBLIC BRIEFING MEETING **FINAL**

+ + + + +

IN THE NAME OF HATE: EXAMINING THE FEDERAL  
GOVERNMENT'S ROLE IN RESPONDING TO HATE CRIMES

+ + + + +

FRIDAY, MAY 11, 2018

+ + + + +

The Commission convened in Suite 1150  
at 1331 Pennsylvania Avenue, Northwest, Washington,  
D.C. at 9:00 a.m., Catherine Lhamon, Chair,  
presiding.

PRESENT:

CATHERINE E. LHAMON, Chair

PATRICIA TIMMONS-GOODSON, Vice Chair

DEBO P. ADEGBILE, Commissioner

GAIL HERIOT, Commissioner

PETER N. KIRSANOW, Commissioner

DAVID KLADNEY, Commissioner

KAREN K. NARASAKI, Commissioner

MICHAEL YAKI, Commissioner

MAURO MORALES, Staff Director

MAUREEN RUDOLPH, General Counsel

**NEAL R. GROSS**COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

\* *Present via telephone*

PANELISTS PRESENT:

ROY AUSTIN, Harris, Wiltshire & Grannis, LLP

SUSAN BRO, Heather Heyer Foundation

SHELBY CHESTNUT, Transgender Law Center

KRISTEN CLARKE, Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights

Under Law

SGT. DETECTIVE CARMEN CURRY, Boston, MA Police

Department

CYNTHIA DEITLE, Matthew Shepard Foundation

MICAH DAVID-COLE FLETCHER, Survivor of Portland MAX

train stabbing

MELISSA GARLICK, Anti-Defamation League

ASSISTANT CHIEF MARC GARTH GREEN, Seattle, WA

Police

Department

CHIEF TERRENCE CUNNINGHAM, Deputy Executive

Director, International Association of

Chiefs of Police (IACP)

NICOLE JORWIC, The Arc

LYNN LANGTON, Bureau of Justice Statistics, U.S.

Department of Justice

LENA MASRI, Council on American-Islamic Relations

ROBERT MOOSSY, Deputy Assistant Attorney General,

Criminal Section, U.S. Department of Justice

OLABISI OKUBADEJO, Ballard Spahr

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

DEBBIE OSGOOD, Hogan Marren Babbo & Rose

KATHARINE PRESCOTT, LGBTQ Parent, Board Member  
GLSEN

SUMAN RAGHUNATHAN, South Asian Americans Leading  
Together

ANDREA SENTENO, Mexican American Legal Defense &  
Educational Fund

ROBBY SOAVE, Reason Magazine

AVIVA VOGELSTEIN, Brandeis Center

STAFF PRESENT:

TERESA ADAMS

ROBERT AMARTEY

LASHONDRA BRENSON

KATHERINE CULLITON-GONZALEZ

BARBARA DE LA VIEZ

PAMELA DUNSTON, Chief, ASCD

LATRICE FOSHEE

ALFREDA GREENE

WARREN ORR

JOHN RADCLIFFE

SARALE SEWELL

JUANA SMITH

MICHELE RAMEY

BRIAN WALCH

**NEAL R. GROSS**  
COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

MARIK XAVIER-BRIER

COMMISSIONER ASSISTANTS PRESENT :

SHERYL COZART

JASON LAGRIA

CARISSA MULDER

AMY ROYCE

RUKKU SINGLA

ALISON SOMIN

IRENA VIDULOVIC

## A G E N D A

Introductory Remarks: Chair Catherine E. Lhamon....	6
Panel One: Local Law Enforcement.....	19
Panel Two: Community Stakeholders.....	94
Panel Three: Policy and Legal Experts.....	166
Panel Four: Current and Former Federal Officials.....	236
Open Public Comment Session.....	313
Adjourn.....	332

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 9:00 a.m.

3 CHAIR LHAMON: Good morning, this  
4 briefing of the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights  
5 comes to order at 9:00 a.m. on May 11, 2018, and  
6 takes place at the Commission Headquarters, 1331  
7 Pennsylvania Avenue Northwest, Suite 1150,  
8 Washington, D.C. 20425.

9 I'm Chair Catherine Lhamon. The  
10 Commissioners present at this briefing in addition  
11 to me are Vice Chair Patricia Timmons-Goodson,  
12 Commissioner Adegbile, Commissioner Heriot,  
13 Commissioner Kirsanow, Commissioner Kladney,  
14 Commissioner Narasaki, and Commissioner Yaki.

15 A quorum of the Commissioners is  
16 present. I see that the court reporter is present  
17 and that the Staff Director is present.

18 STAFF DIRECTOR MORALES: Yes.

19 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you.

20 **INTRODUCTORY REMARKS: CHAIR CATHERINE E. LHAMON**

21 CHAIR LHAMON: I welcome everyone to our  
22 briefing titled In the Name of Hate: Examining the  
23 Federal Government's Role in Responding to Hate  
24 Crimes.

25 In today's briefing, the Commission

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 examines best practices for local law enforcement  
2 on collecting and reporting data and the role of  
3 the Justice and Education Departments in  
4 prosecution and prevention of these heinous acts.

5 We will hear from local law enforcement  
6 and federal government officials, experts,  
7 advocates, and survivors of hate. Testimony from  
8 this briefing will form an integral basis for the  
9 Commission's eventual report to the President, the  
10 Congress, and the American people regarding the  
11 state of hate in America.

12 The Commission, which voted together  
13 across partisan lines, with seven of our eight  
14 members voting to take up today's briefing, returns  
15 to a topic that the Commission has addressed  
16 multiple times in our 60 year history.

17 To my dismay, despite important  
18 progress the country has made in addressing hate  
19 over time, we nonetheless now confront some of the  
20 same unconscionable woes we have confronted in  
21 years past.

22 In 1983, the Commission recognized that  
23 creating a national database of hate crimes would  
24 be important for addressing and preventing such  
25 crimes. But today, even after Congress has

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 required such a database, we live substantial  
2 deficits in the data collection, about which I know  
3 we will hear more today.

4 In 1983, this Commission warned against  
5 taking any federal actions that would give  
6 perceived permission to act out hate. Certainly,  
7 that warning rings true still today.

8 I look forward to hearing today's  
9 testimony to help guide effective recommendations  
10 in our current reality about how we as a nation can  
11 fulfill our ideals of a pluralistic, equitable  
12 democracy, respectful of all persons who live and  
13 work among us.

14 Avoiding giving any perception of  
15 permission to act out hate necessarily includes  
16 prevention work, separate and apart from  
17 prosecution. That work, when it is effective, can  
18 avoid loss of life or violent harm and can secure  
19 productive civic and community engagement that  
20 benefits all.

21 I look forward to hearing from today's  
22 presenters about effective preventive efforts. And  
23 when that prevention fails, hate crimes prosecution  
24 can also send important corrective messages to  
25 communities.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           Just a few days ago, local prosecutors  
2 secured a conviction for illegally firing a weapon  
3 from a Maryland man who identified himself as a Ku  
4 Klux Klan Imperial Wizard, who was recorded on  
5 video firing his gun towards a black man counter-  
6 protesting at the Charlottesville Unite the Right  
7 Rally last year. These prosecutors did not secure  
8 a conviction for a hate crime and the prosecution  
9 was not federal.

10           One set of questions we take up today  
11 involve whether and when local prosecution without  
12 a hate enhancement is sufficient to respond to hate  
13 motivated criminality.

14           In the wake of the anti-Semitic and  
15 race based violence in Charlottesville last year  
16 this Commission unanimously stated that, quote,  
17 white supremacy and religious intolerance dishonor  
18 national commitments we have forged over time, and  
19 violence in the name of these ideologies must be  
20 met swiftly and forcefully with condemnation and  
21 unwavering and unified response.

22           Some communities are already living  
23 this unified response. While I have been  
24 devastated, as so many of us have, by news reports  
25 of acts of violence and vandalism motivated by

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 hate, I have also drawn hope and inspiration from  
2 the communities that have come together to condemn  
3 manifestations of hate, displaying that unified  
4 response.

5 Citing just one example, last year,  
6 after several Jewish cemeteries were vandalized,  
7 including in Saint Louis, Missouri, several Muslim  
8 activists started a fund-raising effort to ensure  
9 that the cemeteries could be rebuilt and repaired.

10 As much as that and similar stories of  
11 communities rebuilding and connecting together to  
12 strengthen themselves against hate reaffirm for me  
13 the strong pull of equity, I was astounded to learn  
14 in the course of preparing for today's briefing  
15 that the majority of hate and bias motivated crimes  
16 are committed by persons 29 years old and younger,  
17 with approximately 17 percent under the age of 17.

18 That statistic underscores the need for  
19 effective response to hate incidents in schools,  
20 ensuring that we train the nation's students toward  
21 productive civic engagement, not toward hate.

22 I look forward to benefitting from the  
23 experiences and expertise of those who will present  
24 to us today and I look forward to working with my  
25 colleagues to draw conclusions and make

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 recommendations after reviewing the materials  
2 submitted to the Commission and benefitting from  
3 today's briefing.

4 Today's briefing features 21  
5 distinguished speakers who will provide us with an  
6 array of viewpoints, as well as the opportunity to  
7 hear from the public.

8 Panel 1 includes local law enforcement  
9 officials, as well as representatives from a  
10 national law enforcement group and the Department  
11 of Justice and a journalist.

12 Panel 2 includes community  
13 stakeholders, including advocates and family  
14 members and survivors of hate incidents.

15 Panel 3 includes policy and legal  
16 experts. Panel 4 includes current and former  
17 government officials who are serving or who have  
18 served at the Bureau of Justice Statistics, the  
19 FBI, and the Department of Education.

20 I note here that the Commission staff  
21 invited current officials from the relevant offices  
22 at the Department of Education, but they declined  
23 to participate in today's briefing.

24 I thank all who join us now to focus on  
25 this critical topic. Your views help us to fulfill

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 our mission to be the nation's eyes and ears on  
2 civil rights.

3 I now turn to Commissioner Heriot, who  
4 has asked to speak briefly to today's topic.

5 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Thank you, Madam  
6 Chair. I want to thank everyone responsible for  
7 putting together this briefing. But let me say  
8 that I am not really a fan of most hate crimes  
9 laws, which I believe have a tendency to fuel  
10 identity politics at a time when the nation needs  
11 to come together.

12 In particular, I oppose the federal  
13 hate crimes statute passed in 2009. I don't have  
14 time to mention all the special problems with hate  
15 crimes law, in particular with federalizing hate  
16 crimes law, but let me mention just one.

17 We all know that the Constitution's  
18 double jeopardy clause prohibits the government  
19 from trying someone again after they've been  
20 acquitted for a crime.

21 Many people don't know, however, that  
22 the clause does not apply when both the state and  
23 the federal government seek to prosecute the same  
24 defendant.

25 They both get their chance to

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 prosecute, even in the event of an acquittal in the  
2 other system. Such a rule might have been  
3 tolerable back when the number of federal crimes  
4 was small, but now that large numbers of crimes are  
5 potential federal crimes, it is essentially become  
6 a two bites at the apple rule.

7 The Hate Crimes Act is a significant  
8 contributor to this. It defines hate crimes very,  
9 very broadly. It doesn't actually require group  
10 hatred, hence, a Hate Crimes Act is actually a  
11 misnomer.

12 It's enough that a violent crime occur  
13 because of, that's a quote from the statute,  
14 someone's race, sex, disability, et cetera. Many  
15 crimes you wouldn't think of as hate crimes are  
16 actionable under this law. That's not a good idea.

17 Note that hate crimes are frequently  
18 the most politically sensitive crimes, and those  
19 are exactly the crimes where a double jeopardy  
20 prosecution protection is most important.

21 There will be pressure to re prosecute.  
22 We've already seen that kind of pressure with the  
23 Trayvon Martin case. We're likely to see more of  
24 it as time goes by.

25 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you, Commissioner

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Heriot. Commissioner Adegbile is one of the  
2 cosponsors of the project, also will help us  
3 introduce the briefing.

4 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Good morning.  
5 Today, we are here to speak about a subject of  
6 vital importance to the nation. Equal protection  
7 of the law, both as a Constitutional matter, but  
8 also as a value, is something that runs to our  
9 core.

10 Crimes, that is actions, not just  
11 thoughts or ideology, motivated by hate against a  
12 member of a protected class strike a blow against  
13 the rule of law, our commitment to liberty and  
14 equality, our communities, our families, our  
15 children, and sometimes, as we will hear today from  
16 people who sadly know this from personal  
17 experience, against individuals, that is, our  
18 fellow neighbors who are targeted, terrorized,  
19 attacked, maimed, or sometimes even killed by hate  
20 motivated violence.

21 These crimes strike a blow against what  
22 it is to be a nation based on the values that we  
23 hold dear in America.

24 Today, we remember Mr. Byrd and his  
25 unspeakable murder in Jasper, Texas, dragged behind

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 a pickup truck to his death. We remember, too, Mr.  
2 Shepard, a 21-year-old college student, a gay  
3 college student who, because of his identity, was  
4 murdered in Wyoming.

5 We remember also too many others who  
6 are not here today, but who we think about. And  
7 most importantly, we recommit ourselves to learn  
8 about what local and federal officers, law  
9 enforcement officers, can do to prevent and  
10 prosecute these crimes.

11 We learn about efforts to collect data  
12 and information, so that we can understand the  
13 nature and frequency of these crimes, and so our  
14 policy and law enforcement efforts can be based on  
15 information and data.

16 And it is my hope too that we will hear  
17 the role that law enforcement and political leaders  
18 can play in speaking about the injury that these  
19 crimes strike against our core American values.

20 The United States is as much as  
21 anything else an idea that people should have an  
22 opportunity to live their lives regardless of what  
23 their religion is, their race, their gender  
24 identity, and the like.

25 We are grateful today for all of the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 witnesses who are engaged in the continuing work to  
2 make sure that we live up to our promises in the  
3 democracy, and we look forward to being informed by  
4 all of you. Thank you very much.

5 CHAIR LHAMON: I now turn us to begin  
6 our briefing with a few housekeeping items. First,  
7 deep thanks to the Commission staff, who researched  
8 and brought today's briefing into being, Marik  
9 Xavier-Brier and Kathy Culliton Gonzales, in  
10 addition to critical support from Teresa Adams,  
11 LaShonda Brenson, Sheryl Cozart, Pam Dunston,  
12 Latrice Foshee, Laura Gevarter, Jason Lagria, Tina  
13 Louise-Martin, Mayowa Olubakinde, Warren Orr,  
14 Lenore Ostrowsky, Krista Painter, Maureen Rudolph,  
15 Sarale Sewell, Wanda Smith, Irena Vidulovic, Brian  
16 Walch, Michele Yorkman-Ramey, and Shimeng Zeng, for  
17 preparing and making logistical details for today  
18 work.

19 I thank Vice Chair Timmons-Goodson for  
20 spearheading much of the work for today's briefing  
21 and Staff Director Morales for his leadership as  
22 well.

23 I caution all speakers, including our  
24 Commissioners, to refrain from speaking over each  
25 other for ease of transcription and to allow for

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 sign language translation to my right.

2 For any individuals who might need to  
3 view the sign language translation, there are seats  
4 available in clear view. I ask everyone present to  
5 please silence your phones and not to take flash  
6 photos to minimize health risk to persons present.

7 After our four panels and an afternoon  
8 break, we will reconvene at 5:00 p.m. for a public  
9 comment period. If you are interested in  
10 participating in the public comment period, during  
11 which each person will have up to three minutes to  
12 speak, we will be honored to hear from you.

13 In total, the oral public comment  
14 period will last no longer than an hour and a half,  
15 with 30 spots allotted on a first-come first-served  
16 basis. If you did not already sign up for one of  
17 the first ten spots online, you may sign up at the  
18 registration desk beginning at 3:30 p.m., the spots  
19 will be available until filled.

20 For any member of the public who would  
21 like to submit materials for our review, our public  
22 record will remain open until Monday, June 11,  
23 2018. Materials can be submitted by mail to the  
24 U.S. Commission on Civil Rights Office of Civil  
25 Rights Evaluation, 1331 Pennsylvania Avenue

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Northwest, Suite 1150, Washington, D.C. 20425, or  
2 by email, hatecrimes@usccr.gov.

3 During the briefing, each panelist will  
4 have seven minutes to speak. After each panel  
5 presentation, Commissioners will have the  
6 opportunity to ask questions within the allotted  
7 period of time and I will recognize Commissioners  
8 who wish to speak.

9 I will strictly enforce the seven  
10 minute allotment given to each panelist to present  
11 his or her statement. And so, to avoid my cutting  
12 you off, I do encourage you to stay within that  
13 time.

14 And unless we did not receive your  
15 testimony before today, you may assume that we have  
16 read your statements, so you do not need to read  
17 them to us as your opening remarks. Please focus  
18 your remarks on today's topic.

19 I also note that we have a very tight  
20 schedule for the day, with nearly two dozen experts  
21 who will speak before us, so I ask my fellow  
22 Commissioners to be cognizant of the number of  
23 panelists in the interest of each Commissioner to  
24 ask questions.

25 Please be brief in asking your

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 questions so we can move quickly and efficiently  
2 through today's schedule, and I will step in to  
3 move things along if necessary.

4 I also note that today's topic is a  
5 sensitive one and we have several panelists who  
6 will speak from personal experiences. I ask our  
7 audience to be cognizant and respectful of all our  
8 panelists, and I ask my fellow Commissioners to  
9 keep that in mind during our question and answer  
10 period.

11 Panelists, please notice the system of  
12 warning lights that we have set up. When the light  
13 turns from green to yellow, that means that two  
14 minutes remain. When the light turns red, you  
15 should conclude your statements so you do not risk  
16 my cutting you off mid-sentence.

17 My fellow Commissioners and I will do  
18 our part and keep our questions and comments  
19 concise.

20 **PANEL ONE: LOCAL LAW ENFORCEMENT**

21 CHAIR LHAMON: Now, we turn to our first  
22 panel of law enforcement officials. The order in  
23 which they will speak is: Sergeant Detective Carmen  
24 Curry of the Boston Police Department; Assistant  
25 Chief Marc Garth Green of the Seattle Police

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Department; Retired Chief Terrence Cunningham,  
2 Deputy Executive Director of the International  
3 Association of Chiefs of Police.

4 Unfortunately, Chief Will Johnson of  
5 the Arlington, Texas Police Department and head of  
6 the Civil Rights Subcommittee for IACP could not be  
7 with us today, but we are very grateful, Mr.  
8 Cunningham, that you have stepped in at the last  
9 minute, thank you; Robert Moossy, Deputy Attorney  
10 General at the U.S. Department of Justice; and  
11 finally, Robby Soave, Associate Editor at Reason  
12 Magazine and I note also a member of our D.C. State  
13 Advisory Committee.

14 So, thank you very much for your  
15 service to us in that capacity and also for sharing  
16 your expertise with us today.

17 I note that Detective Kevin Hamm of the  
18 Phoenix, Arizona Police Department was scheduled to  
19 speak, but he was unfortunately unable to be with  
20 us today. His written statement will be added to  
21 the record for the Commission's consideration.

22 So, Sergeant Detective Curry, please  
23 begin. And you'll want to turn your microphone on.  
24 Thank you.

25 SGT. DETECTIVE CURRY: Good morning.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIR LHAMON: Good morning.

2 SGT. DETECTIVE CURRY: I'd like to take  
3 this opportunity to thank the Commissioners for  
4 having this event and having me here today to talk  
5 about this most important issue of hate crimes.

6 I've been working in the Civil Rights  
7 Unit of the Boston Police Department for 20-plus  
8 years and have an opportunity to look at these and  
9 deal with victims personally.

10 I think we're seeing an increase of  
11 hate crimes that are happening on a national level.  
12 When I first went into the unit, I was of the  
13 assumption that hate crimes would be eradicated by  
14 now, but what we see is that that's not happening.

15 I think I want to share some, what I  
16 believe are some best practices. And one of the  
17 things that I think is key for law enforcement  
18 agencies is to establish a hate crimes unit.

19 The Boston Police established a hate  
20 crimes unit over 40 years ago and they've had the  
21 opportunity to maintain this unit. And so, that's  
22 all we do there. So, we look at hate crimes, we're  
23 involved with victims, and I think it's crucial  
24 that police departments have someone who is going  
25 to look specifically at hate crimes.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           There are not a lot of agencies that  
2 have a unit that does that, that's dedicated  
3 specifically to deal with hate crimes. I think  
4 having a unit sends a clear message to the  
5 community, to would-be haters or would-be  
6 perpetrators that the issue of hate crimes is  
7 important. It's important, it sends a message to  
8 those internally with the police departments.

9           We see that, in the climate that we're  
10 living in today, there is an increase in and a  
11 boldness of the verbiage that's being used by our  
12 leaders, by the media, by politicians. We see  
13 social media, Facebook, Snapchat, Twitter, they all  
14 play a role in this increase that we're seeing  
15 today.

16           I think establishing a civil rights  
17 unit with a diverse group of dedicated officers  
18 solely to investigate hate crimes would play a key  
19 role in getting victims to report hate crimes.  
20 When we establish that unit, we establish trust  
21 with the community.

22           It's important to establish that trust.  
23 It's important to develop relationships in the  
24 community. It's important to have community  
25 outreach. When you have a unit or an individual

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 who is dedicated specifically for hate crimes, they  
2 become experts, because that's all they do and  
3 that's what's really important here.

4 We need community advocacy agencies, we  
5 need the clergy, we need the local, state, and  
6 federal agencies to come together. In Boston, we  
7 do a lot of community outreach. We meet with a lot  
8 of people to sit at the table and talk about this  
9 issue.

10 One of the things in community outreach  
11 is things like, when the holidays are coming  
12 around, to meet with the groups.

13 So, we see Ramadan is coming on May 15,  
14 we get out and we go and we introduce ourselves and  
15 we let them know that we're aware of what's  
16 happening in the community, we're aware of the  
17 season that we're in now, to let them know we're  
18 there, to let them know to be aware, to look around  
19 in their surroundings.

20 And that's one of the things that I  
21 believe establishes a trust relationship, when they  
22 know that the police are going to take these crimes  
23 seriously.

24 Victims don't come forward for many  
25 different reasons. We talk about data collection,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 it starts at the head. It starts with the police  
2 department clearly articulating that responding,  
3 documenting, and prosecuting hate crimes is a  
4 priority, these types of crimes will not be  
5 tolerated. It must trickle down from the top.

6 We must encourage victims to report  
7 hate crimes. There are many factors why victims  
8 don't report hate crimes. It could be contingent  
9 upon many factors.

10 Their immigration status, this is a  
11 huge one, we are constantly telling advocates and  
12 victims that their status has no bearing on their  
13 case, nor will we look into their status. In most  
14 instances, victims with illegal status will not  
15 move forward. Victims do not speak English and are  
16 afraid to come forward.

17 Victims in the LGBTQ community, in many  
18 instances, they're not out, so they're not going to  
19 come forward to report these crimes. Victims of  
20 color may have issues with mistrust with the police  
21 departments, or they may have language barriers.

22 The Community Disorders Unit, where we  
23 work, the Civil Rights Unit, we're a victim-  
24 oriented unit and so, we hand-hold victims and we  
25 take them through the whole process.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           It doesn't matter whether it's a Part 1  
2 crime or whether it's just a vandalism, if the  
3 person is selected because of who they are, we're  
4 going to hold their hand and we're going to take  
5 them through the whole process.

6           We have people who won't come forward  
7 because they lead very busy lives and they don't  
8 want to go through the process because it's too  
9 disruptive.

10           One of the challenges that we're seeing  
11 is college campus incidents don't get reported to  
12 the local police departments. They tend to keep  
13 those on the inside, which is a challenge for the  
14 local police departments and it's a challenge for  
15 reporting.

16           I believe that for law enforcement,  
17 training is the key, because if a police officer  
18 does not know how to identify a hate crime, then  
19 it's not going to be reported. And so, that's  
20 where we see that there's a decrease in reporting.

21           Particularly in Massachusetts, when we  
22 look at the numbers of how many Massachusetts law  
23 enforcement agencies do not participate in  
24 reporting hate crimes, I believe that they don't  
25 report them because they don't know how to identify

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 what a hate crime is.

2 And so, training is key. Training is  
3 key and training with victims and letting them  
4 know, understand what a hate crime is, what it  
5 isn't, and what the resources are available to  
6 them.

7 If an officer isn't documenting the  
8 incident correctly, it's not going to go to court.  
9 No one is going to be arrested, there's not going  
10 to be any prosecution of that incident.

11 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you very much,  
12 Sergeant Detective. We'll now hear from Assistant  
13 Chief Marc Garth Green.

14 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: Thank you very  
15 much, Madam Chairwoman. And thank you  
16 Commissioners for having me here today. I am Marc  
17 Garth Green and I represent the Seattle Police  
18 Department at this time. Next slide, please.

19 So, for our Bias Crime Unit, it was  
20 staffed in 2015 as a dedicated detective, it's  
21 centered out of our Homicide and Assault Units.  
22 They are dedicated for bias crimes in the  
23 investigation, data gathering, and the analysis, as  
24 well as our public outreach. We have now moved  
25 that up to two detectives this year, based on the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 number of increases that we are seeing. Next  
2 slide, please.

3 So, our legal authority comes from our  
4 Revised Code of Washington 9A.36.080 and the  
5 Seattle Municipal Code 12A.06.115. The Seattle  
6 Municipal Code actually adds different classes to  
7 it. We add homelessness, marital status, political  
8 ideology, age, or parental status at the  
9 misdemeanor level as well.

10 Both of our statutes here are  
11 severable, so that if we cannot prove the bias  
12 elements, we can go forward with the underlying  
13 crime as well, so that allows us to work on both  
14 fronts at the same time. Next slide, please.

15 So, at the Seattle Police Department,  
16 we gather our data in coordination and in following  
17 the Uniform Crime Reporting Standards set by the  
18 FBI and report on the NIBRS, the National Incident  
19 Based Reporting System.

20 The three types of incidents that we  
21 break it down into are the malicious harassments  
22 incidents themselves, which are sometimes referred  
23 to as hate crimes or bias crimes. That's the legal  
24 definition of the crime.

25 The next one are crimes with bias

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 elements, which is generally when a crime occurs  
2 and during the commission of that crime, some type  
3 of derogatory language is used.

4 While not an element of the crime, it  
5 is something that we truly look at. This is where  
6 we see our greatest degree of increase in our  
7 crimes in the City of Seattle are bias elements,  
8 not actually malicious harassment crimes.

9 And we have non-criminal bias  
10 incidents, which are used primarily when folks are  
11 using derogatory language, but not in a criminal  
12 nature. Next slide, please.

13 One of the important things with it,  
14 obviously, for us is the outreach to the community.  
15 We have seen an increase in reporting over the last  
16 periods of several years that we've been keeping  
17 our data, to include a larger degree after we've  
18 had, on the political side, the national front, of  
19 the #MeToo movement and other movements along those  
20 lines.

21 Where we're emboldened in the City of  
22 Seattle and pleased is that we have seen an  
23 increase in reporting by witnesses, people who are  
24 walking down the street and observe something  
25 happening in front of them, across the street from

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1       them, and feel that it's not right and will call in  
2       to us.

3               So, that is a great thing for us,  
4       because it means that our outreach is working, that  
5       our folks in our city are not tolerating that type  
6       of behavior.

7               One of the ideas that came in channel  
8       that we worked very hard on was what we call a Safe  
9       Place Program. And it started out with the LGBTQ  
10      community in a specific geographic region of our  
11      city.

12              But what it is training through  
13      businesses that train their staff that when people  
14      were victims of malicious harassment or hate  
15      crimes, that they could go into those businesses,  
16      speak with those employees there. Those employees  
17      would call 911 and offer them a safe place to wait  
18      until police were coming to take their report.

19              So, over time, we've spread it citywide  
20      to over 6,000 businesses in Seattle and we've had a  
21      great degree of success with this program and  
22      really enjoy that. Move forward, please.

23              Our Bias Crime Coordinator does  
24      community outreach, engage in frequent community  
25      meetings, especially with the under-reporting

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 communities that we've identified in the City of  
2 Seattle.

3 We have a variety of different  
4 communities that do not speak English, and so, we  
5 try to partner with the Seattle Office of Civil  
6 Rights, have interpreters, and then, move out to  
7 those communities as well, to really meet with  
8 them.

9 We do a lot with cultural centers and  
10 religious institutions as well to make sure that  
11 that voice is getting out, as well as issuing  
12 pamphlets in all different types of languages to  
13 help people. Next slide, please. And we'll skip  
14 to the next one, thank you.

15 One of the things that we're really  
16 excited about in the City of Seattle is we have  
17 publication dashboards that gather our data.  
18 They're updated daily for internal facing, however,  
19 they're updated monthly for external facing.

20 So, anybody in the city of Seattle can,  
21 or anywhere else in the nation, can log on and go  
22 to our crime dashboard and take a look at what's  
23 going on within their city, within their geographic  
24 area, their neighborhoods as well.

25 It's broken down to that, captures the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 types of incidents, how they're broken down, and  
2 the actual associated offense type of those  
3 incidents. So, they can go to that.

4 There are also links to our outreach  
5 there and, as the Detective Sergeant said, that is  
6 probably one of the biggest things that law  
7 enforcement can do, is to try to sever that  
8 mistrust that has been built over years.

9 A lot of it comes from different groups  
10 that have moved to this country, where they have  
11 suffered abuse by law enforcement in their own  
12 countries, failures on those legal systems, and  
13 those memories hold dear to them and they come over  
14 with that interpretation as well.

15 And so, meeting with them in their  
16 place of location and their place of safety to talk  
17 about how we do things differently here. With  
18 that, one of the things that we do is, when a  
19 severe malicious harassment crime takes place, we  
20 actually have a team that moves out into the  
21 community.

22 It is composed of our Bias Crimes  
23 detectives, some community members, and then, also  
24 our U.S. State Attorney, one of his deputies goes  
25 out as well. We meet with the victim, in part for

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 the victim, but in a larger part, it's really for  
2 the community.

3 We mobilize with the community to let  
4 them know that this is not tolerated, to find out  
5 what they need to restore themselves to a sense of  
6 security, and then, for follow-up as to how to  
7 prevent these in the future. So, we use that  
8 program quite often when we need to as well.

9 But that is -- the biggest thing, as  
10 Detective Sergeant alluded to also, with  
11 immigration status being an issue right now, we  
12 also work under the premise that we do not ask,  
13 we're not concerned with immigration status at the  
14 time of reporting or through the follow-up, to  
15 ensure that justice is served for those folks.

16 As far as continued outreach, continued  
17 legislation, continued law enforcement activities  
18 as well. Obviously, the very first step in any  
19 type of these things is for the enforcement  
20 portion, for police to get in there.

21 What we see as a correlation of, in  
22 higher crime areas, we have higher bias related  
23 incidents. And on average, 40 percent of ours in  
24 the City of Seattle are conducted by people  
25 suffering from mental crisis or under the influence

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 of alcohol or narcotics. So, those are two  
2 different areas that we need to address as well.

3 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you very much.  
4 Now, we'll hear from Chief Cunningham.

5 CHIEF CUNNINGHAM: Great. Good morning,  
6 Madam Chairman and Vice Chair Timmons-Goodson and  
7 distinguished Commissioners. My name is Terrence  
8 Cunningham, I'm the Deputy Executive Director of  
9 the International Association of Chiefs of Police.  
10 I'm a former chief of the Wellesley, Massachusetts  
11 Police Department, and I also served as the  
12 President of the IACP from 2015 to 2016.

13 The IACP is the world's largest  
14 association of law enforcement leaders, with more  
15 than 30,000 members in over 150 countries. Hate  
16 crime and hate incidents are heinous acts that  
17 demand immediate attention, response, and  
18 resolution whenever possible.

19 What makes hate crimes so malicious is  
20 that their impact spreads far beyond the direct  
21 victims and their families. These crimes have far-  
22 reaching effects on large segments of communities  
23 in which they take place, spreading fear, toxicity  
24 throughout our communities.

25 The IACP has been discussing the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 challenges and impact of hate crimes for close to  
2 two decades, when we held our first summit on the  
3 issue and developed recommendations and a guide for  
4 officer response and investigation to hate crimes.

5 Since that time, we've developed a  
6 model policy concept and issues paper in  
7 conjunction with the Anti-Defamation League in  
8 2016, and on the investigation of hate crimes, an  
9 aid to law enforcement agencies.

10 Additionally, the IACP has partnered  
11 recently with the Lawyers Committee for Civil  
12 Rights Under Law to create an advisory committee  
13 that encompasses diverse representation from law  
14 enforcement, civil rights organizations, and  
15 academia.

16 We have hosted a series of meetings to  
17 hear perspectives from hate crime survivors,  
18 academic experts, national and grassroots advocacy  
19 leaders, and law enforcement officials on barriers  
20 and best practices to combat hate.

21 The end product will be a summary  
22 report outlining the critical issues and action  
23 items detailing the discussions from the advisory  
24 group and it will be released between this summer  
25 and early fall of 2018. It is a very comprehensive

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 document that we will clearly make available to  
2 this committee.

3 Today, I'd like to focus on some of the  
4 challenges law enforcement faces when it comes to  
5 hate crimes. Under-reporting of hate crimes  
6 statistics, as you've heard from the last two  
7 presenters.

8 Over the years, one of the greatest  
9 barriers to confronting and overcoming hate  
10 violence has been the lack of statistical data on  
11 the occurrence and nature of these crimes.

12 Participation in the FBI's national  
13 reporting system, which, like the rest of the UCR,  
14 Uniform Crime Reporting Program, is voluntary.  
15 While participation has increased over the years,  
16 participation levels are seriously lacking.

17 We know that the figures as reported to  
18 the FBI strongly suggest a serious under counting  
19 of hate crimes and that there is a need for more  
20 training and education on the importance and  
21 utility of hate crime reporting and data collection  
22 as a tool for law enforcement in preventing these  
23 crimes and safeguarding the public.

24 While more data needs to be reported by  
25 law enforcement agencies, we also need our

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 communities to report hate crime incidents. The  
2 most recent hate crime victimization publication  
3 from the Bureau of Justice Statistics shows that 54  
4 percent of violent hate crime victimizations were  
5 not reported to police during the period of 2011 to  
6 2015.

7 As law enforcement, we need to make  
8 sure that our communities understand that we want  
9 these incidents to be reported and that no hate  
10 crime or any other crime is insignificant.

11 We never want our communities to feel  
12 that they shouldn't bother us. It's our job and  
13 it's clearly why we chose this career, we want to  
14 protect and serve.

15 So, directly to the challenges of hate  
16 crimes, investigating. The decision of a law  
17 enforcement official whether to classify a crime as  
18 a hate crime and the separate decision of a local  
19 prosecutor whether or not to bring hate crime  
20 charges can be very complicated.

21 It is extremely difficult to determine  
22 the motives of one's heart and their intentions.  
23 Law enforcement executives need to ensure  
24 investigators are looking at each individual case  
25 on its own merits and take a proactive approach on

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 identifying potential crimes with a hate nexus.

2 In today's world, the internet provides  
3 extremists with an unprecedented ability to spread  
4 hate and recruit followers. Individual racists and  
5 organized hate groups now have the power to reach  
6 global audiences of millions to communicate among  
7 like-minded individuals easily, inexpensively, and  
8 anonymously.

9 The ease of sending internet hate  
10 messages and threats across states lines can make  
11 perpetrators and victims difficult to identify and  
12 locate, and creates criminal jurisdictional issues  
13 and pose special challenges to investigators.

14 And although hate speech is offensive  
15 and hurtful, the First Amendment usually protects  
16 such expressions. However, when speech contains  
17 direct credible threats against an identifiable  
18 individual, organization, or institution, it  
19 becomes criminal conduct. Regardless of the mode  
20 of delivery, hate speech containing criminal  
21 threats is not acceptable and it is not protected  
22 by the First Amendment.

23 In order for law enforcement to be  
24 truly effective, officers and agencies must have  
25 the active assistance and support from every facet

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 of our communities.

2 Establishing and maintaining these  
3 crucial relationships in order to build a mutual  
4 understanding and level of trust with diverse  
5 communities requires time and is an ongoing effort.  
6 To maintain and establish strong community-police  
7 relations, we must work towards prevention of hate  
8 crimes in our communities.

9 In order to effectively prevent and  
10 respond to hate crimes, I have a few action item  
11 recommendations that I believe the federal  
12 government, law enforcement, our communities, and  
13 elected officials could take.

14 Number one, the National Criminal  
15 Justice Commission. There is a need to establish a  
16 National Criminal Justice Commission. This would  
17 not just be another study.

18 The establishment of such a committee  
19 would set forth a strategic blueprint for criminal  
20 justice that would guide efforts to protect our  
21 communities for years to come. The last commission  
22 was created in 1965 and produced landmark changes  
23 for the criminal justice system.

24 Training. Law enforcement officers  
25 need training to identify, investigate, and report

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 hate crimes. Training is also needed to help  
2 understand the victim's culture, language, and what  
3 questions to ask.

4 Enhancing community-police relations.  
5 Positive relationships between law enforcement and  
6 communities will encourage members to report hate  
7 crimes and minimize the chance of retaliatory  
8 crimes.

9 Enhanced reporting. Provide  
10 incentives, including additional financial  
11 resources, to states and localities to report crime  
12 data, particular hate crimes, to the FBI.

13 Specialized units. Funding to create  
14 specialized hate crime units or to help agencies  
15 team up to develop multi-agency task forces.

16 Speak out against hate crimes. The  
17 President, members of Congress, state and local  
18 elected officials all need to condemn acts of  
19 bigotry every chance they can.

20 And on behalf of the IACP, I conclude  
21 by thanking you again for the opportunity to appear  
22 before you today and would be happy to answer any  
23 questions that you may have. Thank you.

24 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you very much,  
25 Chief Cunningham. Now, we'll hear from Mr. Moossy.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1           MR. MOOSSY: Good morning. It's really  
2 a pleasure to be here. I'm a 24-year career  
3 employee of the DOJ Civil Rights Division and I am  
4 delighted to be here with my fellow members of law  
5 enforcement and a journalist to talk about the  
6 important work we're doing to combat bias motivated  
7 violent crimes, often called hate crimes.

8           I've spent the majority of my time with  
9 the Civil Rights Division prosecuting a variety of  
10 crimes, including law enforcement misconduct, human  
11 trafficking, and hate crimes. And I can say with  
12 confidence that combating hate crimes is among the  
13 highest priorities for the Civil Rights Division  
14 and for this Justice Department.

15           As you know, hate crimes can be  
16 prosecuted in state or federal courts, depending on  
17 each jurisdiction's laws. We in the Civil Rights  
18 Division, working with our U.S. Attorney partners  
19 and the FBI, prosecute hate crimes in federal  
20 courts across the nation.

21           We're committed to using federal  
22 prosecutions to make clear that any act of bias  
23 motivated violence is unacceptable and that the  
24 Department will use our investigative and  
25 prosecutorial authority to bring perpetrators to

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 justice.

2 The FBI is currently investigating over  
3 200 hate crimes nationwide. Since January 2017,  
4 the Department has brought hate crimes charges  
5 against more than two dozen defendants and obtained  
6 22 convictions.

7 And some examples are, on April 30, two  
8 Texas defendants were sentenced to 15 and 20 years  
9 for using social media dating platforms for gay men  
10 to arrange to meet victims in their homes where  
11 they brutally assaulted them.

12 On April 18, after a four week trial, a  
13 federal jury convicted three men in Kansas of  
14 conspiracy to use a weapon of mass destruction and  
15 conspiracy to commit a hate crime. The defendants  
16 plotted to blow up an apartment complex in an  
17 effort to kill the Somali Muslim immigrants who  
18 lived there and worshiped at a mosque there.

19 Also in April, three East Los Angeles  
20 men agreed to plead guilty to federal civil rights  
21 and racketeering charges for participating in a  
22 2014 fire-bombing intended to drive African  
23 American residents inside of the Ramona Gardens  
24 housing developing out of that development.

25 In March, following a three day trial,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 a jury found a man guilty of committing a federal  
2 hate crime when he used a stun device during a  
3 racially motivated assault of a neighbor at his  
4 apartment complex in Utah.

5 Evidence presented at trial showed that  
6 the defendant shouted racial slurs at the victim's  
7 seven-year-old son as he rode a scooter in the  
8 common area of the apartment and then, when his  
9 father tried to stand up for his son, the defendant  
10 used the stun gun to assault him.

11 In February of 2018, a Virginia man was  
12 indicted for a hate crime for threatening employees  
13 of the American Arab Institute.

14 Also in February 2018, the Department  
15 announced the indictment of a dual United States  
16 and Israeli citizen in three different  
17 jurisdictions for hate crimes and other offenses  
18 arising from alleged threats he made to Jewish  
19 community centers across the United States,  
20 specifically in the Florida, the Israeli Embassy,  
21 and the Anti-Defamation League here in D.C., as  
22 well as multiple other Jewish organizations across  
23 the United States.

24 And in November 2017, the Department  
25 cross-designated one of our Civil Rights Division

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 prosecutors to assist in the state murder trial of  
2 an Iowa man, who was ultimately convicted of  
3 murdering Kedarie Johnson, a transgendered  
4 teenager. And he now faces life imprisonment.

5 So, while my background is federal  
6 prosecutions, the Department of Justice takes a  
7 broader approach in responding to hate crimes  
8 across our nation.

9 Attorney General Sessions has made hate  
10 crimes one of the pillars of his Task Force on  
11 Crime Reduction and Public Safety.

12 The Civil Rights Division has convened  
13 a Hate Crimes Enforcement and Prevention Working  
14 Group, composed of the Civil Rights Division, the  
15 FBI, the U.S. Attorneys Offices, the Office of  
16 Community Oriented Policing, our Office of Justice  
17 Programs, and our Community Relations Service,  
18 known as CRS.

19 And we've been working together to  
20 figure out how can the Department of Justice bring  
21 all of our authorities and abilities and resources  
22 together to really, first and foremost, assist  
23 federal and state investigators to identify and  
24 report these crimes and how to respond to  
25 communities that have been harmed by these crimes.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           Our local police and sheriff officers  
2           are important partners for identifying and  
3           investigating hate crimes. They are the women and  
4           the men who respond to violence on the streets,  
5           they are the officials who will identify a hate  
6           crime when it happens and collect the on-scene  
7           evidence and leads. These local law enforcement  
8           agencies must have the support they need to  
9           identify, investigate, and report hate crimes.

10           Likewise, because there are many more  
11           state and local prosecutors than there are federal  
12           prosecutors, our local district attorneys must also  
13           have the state laws and resources they need to  
14           prosecute hate crimes in the local and state  
15           courts.

16           Also important are the victims  
17           themselves and community-based organizations that  
18           support victims. This is especially true when it  
19           comes to reporting hate crimes to law enforcement.

20           We are really working across the  
21           Department to figure out, how can both law  
22           enforcement and victims better report hate crimes?  
23           Accurate data helps localities better target crime.

24           And we have to understand why 88  
25           percent of police departments that participate in

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the UCR, the Uniform Crime Reporting, reported that  
2 they had zero hate crimes in 2016. And why four  
3 law enforcement agencies in jurisdictions with more  
4 than 250,000 residents didn't even report hate  
5 crimes data to the FBI.

6 We also have to understand and address  
7 why, according to crime victim surveys, more than  
8 half of hate crime victims do not report hate  
9 crimes when they happen.

10 About a quarter of those who don't  
11 report say that they didn't believe the police  
12 would want to be bothered or get involved, that the  
13 police would be inefficient or ineffective, or that  
14 the police would cause trouble to the victims. And  
15 I know you have a panelist later to talk about hate  
16 crimes data.

17 We are working really hard to improve  
18 our training and outreach, because we believe this  
19 will in turn improve our ability to identify and  
20 report hate crimes and then, investigate and  
21 prosecute them.

22 So, since January 2018, our Community  
23 Relations Service has hosted five hate crimes  
24 forums in Pennsylvania, Maryland, Texas, Oregon,  
25 and New York, bringing together 50 to 400 federal

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 and local law enforcement, community leaders,  
2 federal agencies, and advocates. And we're picking  
3 more locales to do these trainings in the coming  
4 years.

5 CRS also recently updated two  
6 trainings, one aimed at engaging and building  
7 partnerships with Muslim Americans and another at  
8 engaging and building partnerships with Sikh  
9 Americans. These are aimed at both law enforcement  
10 and community leaders to better establish community  
11 relationships with those populations.

12 Our FBI has a national training  
13 initiative that reaches literally thousands of  
14 people every year to train them about hate crimes  
15 and civil rights, both in law enforcement and in  
16 the community.

17 And we in the Civil Rights Division  
18 will be hosting a training at our National Advocacy  
19 Center this August to bring together FBI agents and  
20 prosecutors to help increase our ability to  
21 identify and prosecute hate crimes.

22 So, it is a pleasure to be here, I look  
23 forward to answering any questions you may have.

24 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you very much, Mr.  
25 Moosy. Mr. Soave?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           MR. SOAVE: Thank you. I am deeply  
2 honored to participate in this briefing and so  
3 grateful to the Commission for inviting me. What  
4 is the government's role in preventing hate crimes?  
5 I think it might be a slightly more complicated  
6 question than it seems.

7           Most people would agree that the  
8 government obviously has a compelling interest in  
9 preventing crime and most people would also agree  
10 that hateful conduct is unwelcome, but many actions  
11 this society deems hateful are nevertheless  
12 protected by the Bill of Rights.

13           I mean, the First Amendment does give  
14 us the explicit right to engage in expression that  
15 some people would consider hateful. And while many  
16 of today's college students think hate speech  
17 should be illegal, in fact, nearly half of them  
18 according to the Cato Institute, the Supreme Court  
19 has been crystal clear on this, that the thought  
20 that we hate, the famous quote, is perfectly --  
21 it's Constitutional and permissible to engage in  
22 that.

23           Most recently as 2011 in the famous  
24 sort of Westboro Baptist Church case, the Supreme  
25 Court said, the Snyder v. Phelps case, that people

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 shouting for the deaths of military servicemen and  
2 shouting horrific things at gay people that even  
3 that kind of speech was protected.

4 Now, obviously, there's a critical  
5 distinction between hate speech and hate crime.  
6 Here, I think we're generally talking about hate  
7 crime in the context of being additional penalties  
8 against people who commit crimes for reasons that  
9 are especially hateful.

10 Although, I think I did hear one of my  
11 fellow panelists talking about derogatory language  
12 during the commission of a crime being itself an  
13 additional crime, which I think starts to blur that  
14 distinction in ways that could impugn our civil  
15 liberties or free speech rights.

16 The law generally recognizes that  
17 crimes such as vandalism, assault, and murder are  
18 especially heinous if committed for reasons of  
19 bigotry or bias. Although some, I think, might  
20 contend in a philosophical sense, if not a legal  
21 one, that is not in some sense murder murder  
22 regardless of the killer's motivations, or that we  
23 could sort of read the mind of the killer and  
24 divine whether it was impugning some protected  
25 category.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           Anecdotally, we hear from many media  
2 outlets, as someone who is in the press and pays  
3 close attention to this, we hear often that hate  
4 crime rates have increased or are always  
5 increasing.

6           The FBI reported a five percent rise in  
7 hate -- and, indeed, the FBI did report a five  
8 percent rise in hate crimes from 2015 to 2016.  
9 Still, that's a small enough increase that it could  
10 actually have been the result of better reporting,  
11 rather than an actual spike in hate.

12           The FBI reported an increase in anti-  
13 Muslim hate, but that might be because the FBI, the  
14 way I understand it, changed slightly how they were  
15 tracking that information from one year to the  
16 next.

17           According to the U.S. Bureau of Justice  
18 Statistics, hate crime levels have occasionally  
19 fluctuated, but remained relatively stable between  
20 2004 and 2015.

21           As a reporter who focuses specifically  
22 on education issues, schools, higher education in  
23 particular, I can say that the situation on college  
24 campuses is very complicated.

25           There is some data suggesting that hate

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 crimes on campuses, specifically, increased as high  
2 -- by as much as 25 percent in just the last year  
3 or two, possibly because of the divisiveness of the  
4 2016 election, that's kind of been the theory that  
5 was put out.

6 Many of these are hate-inspired acts of  
7 vandalism, destruction of property, and  
8 intimidation. Even so, it can be very difficult to  
9 truly kind of grapple with these incidents and  
10 understand, they are not always what they appear to  
11 be on their face, because perpetrators are almost  
12 never caught in these cases.

13 BuzzFeed News, for instance, reviewed  
14 400 things that were reported on university  
15 campuses as hate crime or a bias incident.

16 Oftentimes, universities have a  
17 separate bias reporting system, where students,  
18 professors can anonymously file reports. This is  
19 obviously a much broader category of behavior.  
20 Many of these things I think would be deemed  
21 perfectly legal, they would be clearly examples of  
22 free expression.

23 But out of 400 cases that BuzzFeed  
24 reviewed of hate generally, and it was able to  
25 verify that 154 did happen, but only in five

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 percent of the cases was the perpetrator caught.

2 This -- unfortunately, it is true that  
3 some of the incidents on college campuses have  
4 turned out to be accidents or even hoaxes. Two  
5 crimes reported at Michigan, the University of  
6 Michigan, where I am a graduate, in the immediate  
7 wake of the election, in November of 2016, they  
8 were discovered to be hoaxes, one involving a young  
9 Muslim woman who claimed a man had threatened to  
10 set her on fire, another involving a young woman  
11 who said a man had attacked her with a safety pin  
12 because she was a pro-immigrant sort of  
13 demonstrator. Police confirmed, the alleged victim  
14 admitted that both crimes had actually been made  
15 up.

16 And I bring up these incidents not at  
17 all to suggest that a large percentage of hate  
18 crimes are hoaxes, I think that's certainly not  
19 true. But on campuses particularly, and we're so  
20 focused on the school question these days, it is  
21 hard to know exactly what's going on.

22 I've seen cases where it appeared that  
23 it was a message of hate, like anti-immigrant hate  
24 or anti-black hate, but actually the person doing  
25 it was an immigrant or a person of color and what

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 they were saying, they were saying, this hateful  
2 message has now become acceptable in our country.

3 So, they were making sort of a  
4 political demonstration. So, that changes whether  
5 obviously it was an act of hate, given who was  
6 doing it.

7 I would urge policymakers, law  
8 enforcement, and other authorities to resist media  
9 pressure to characterize the current atmosphere in  
10 the U.S. as one of increasing hatefulness.

11 While we can and should continue to  
12 track and prosecute criminal activity, we should  
13 keep in mind our cherished First Amendment rights.  
14 There are vastly fewer protections for free  
15 expression in other countries, and I worry at times  
16 that we could undermine our own protections by  
17 drawing the hate crime category too broadly.

18 Scotland, for instance, recently  
19 arrested and fined a comedian on YouTube for a hate  
20 crime. His crime was making a video of his dog  
21 giving like a Nazi salute. He was just trying to  
22 make his girlfriend mad, is what he said. He was  
23 not a Nazi or affiliated with any Nazi  
24 organizations. And he was arrested and fined for  
25 doing so.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           In Liverpool, a young woman named  
2 Chelsea Russell was reported to a hate crime unit  
3 for posting the lyrics to a rap song on her  
4 Instagram page. She was doing it in tribute to a  
5 young man who had died in a car -- who had been run  
6 over by a car and it was like his favorite song.

7           The authorities never charged anyone in  
8 the young man's death, but they did arrest the  
9 woman for posting the rap lyrics. The judge said  
10 there is no place in civil society for language  
11 like that.

12           I think these hate crime arrests in the  
13 U.K. underscore the need for officials in our own  
14 country to remain cognizant of the line between  
15 hate speech and hate crime and to avoid fatalism  
16 and pessimism when considering whether the reach of  
17 hate is actually growing. Thank you.

18           CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you very much, Mr.  
19 Soave. I'm going to open it up now to questions  
20 from my fellow Commissioners.

21           I do want to note, and I think  
22 Assistant Chief Garth Green can speak for himself,  
23 but I didn't hear Assistant Chief Garth Green  
24 actually say what you characterized him as having  
25 said about what the crimes were.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: Thank you, Madam  
2 Chairwoman. No, what that was was that's where we  
3 captured the data, is in those --

4 MR. SOAVE: Okay.

5 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: -- three things,  
6 that the crime doesn't fit the hate speech.

7 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you. So,  
8 Commissioner Narasaki has a question.

9 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: I have so many  
10 questions.

11 (Laughter.)

12 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: I started my  
13 career working on hate crimes, anti-Asian violence  
14 in particular, with the murder of Vincent Chin, who  
15 was viciously murdered a few days before he was  
16 supposed to get married by a father and a son who  
17 was angry about the Japanese car makers in Detroit.

18 And they went after him with a baseball  
19 bat, killed him, and the judge slapped them on the  
20 wrist and gave them time served, because they were  
21 otherwise fine Americans.

22 So, I would say to Commissioner Heriot,  
23 I would not worry that there is too much double-  
24 dipping with the federal government, because it is  
25 extremely difficult to get the federal government

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to step in, there are a lot of jurisdictional  
2 hurdles.

3 And, obviously, the first choice is  
4 always local police, but unfortunately, in this  
5 country, we have a history where local police have  
6 not always been on the side of protecting minority  
7 victims.

8 So, with that, I will say, I have a lot  
9 of questions, so because we have only a short  
10 amount of time, if I cut you off, it's not because  
11 I'm being rude, it's because I want to get to my  
12 other questions.

13 So, first of all, this is just a short  
14 question for Assistant Chief Green. So, who helped  
15 pay for the development of the Seattle data  
16 website, because that sounds like it's a very  
17 important tool?

18 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: Thank you. That  
19 was done internally, it's part of our budget  
20 process is that we do that. We do get some money  
21 from the city as well, external money from them, to  
22 add to it, but it's mostly done internally.

23 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: And is there a  
24 role for the federal government to try to help  
25 other police departments move into that technology

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 space?

2 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: Absolutely, I  
3 mean, with the increase in technology out there,  
4 capturing that and putting that out there for folks  
5 to see, I think absolutely.

6 Where I think the biggest thing there  
7 is just what you alluded to there earlier, ma'am,  
8 is funding. Funding for some of the smaller  
9 agencies that may not have the budgetary needs to  
10 be able to support that.

11 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Great, thank  
12 you. And one of the reasons I'm so excited about  
13 this panel is, we picked you with, or staff picked  
14 you with precision because you are all at the  
15 cutting edge of really trying to lead on  
16 prosecuting hate crimes and we want to learn from  
17 what you are doing.

18 One of the things that we're concerned  
19 about is, there's been a lot of great work on  
20 trying to attack the Islamophobia issues in this  
21 country. We're wondering what's going on in terms  
22 of trying to get at the rising violence and hate  
23 violence against transgendered persons and people  
24 with disabilities.

25 We have witnesses who are coming later

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to talk about the lack of knowledge those  
2 communities have and the difficult relationships  
3 that some of them have with law enforcement. So,  
4 if any of you have some programs that are working,  
5 it would be great to hear about that.

6 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: So, I'll jump in  
7 there, if that's all right. So, as we alluded to  
8 earlier, Safe Place, that started at our LGBTQ  
9 community. We have a very large, robust community  
10 in the city of Seattle that we partner with.

11 And a lot of it is based on outreach to  
12 that community, with police officers that are  
13 demographic, that represent that community. We  
14 spend a lot of time working with the community,  
15 bringing them in, discussing what the issues are  
16 with them, and then, doing a lot of public outreach  
17 through the media as well.

18 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: And people with  
19 disabilities, is anyone doing any outreach work to  
20 that community successfully?

21 MR. MOOSSY: I know when we do our  
22 forums across the country, we do outreach for both  
23 the transgender community and the disability  
24 community. And we are increasingly seeing a number  
25 of disability-related bias crime cases come to us

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 for investigation. It's sort of a pipeline, so --

2 CHAIR LHAMON: Mr. Moossy, would you  
3 mind leaning closer to your --

4 MR. MOOSSY: Oh, I'm sorry.

5 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you.

6 MR. MOOSSY: We're often prosecuting  
7 cases today that happened three and four years ago,  
8 just because of the time it takes to report,  
9 investigate, and prepare for prosecution.

10 But I can say that internally, we've  
11 noted the same thing. We feel like we're seeing  
12 too few transgender and disability matters and we  
13 want to do better at that. That is definitely an  
14 area where we want to improve.

15 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Great.

16 CHIEF CUNNINGHAM: So, I just wanted to  
17 add that the IACP, we're developing model policy  
18 and concept and issues paper just specifically to  
19 the LGBTQ issue, both internally, from a police  
20 perspective, in hiring LGBTQ folks into the police  
21 department, and externally, how they should be  
22 handled from a street patrol officer's standpoint  
23 as well.

24 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Good. I  
25 particularly appreciate that, because I worked for

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 over a decade to try to get the hate crime law,  
2 that my colleague mentioned that she doesn't like,  
3 I worked for ten years to try to get that passed.  
4 And one of the reasons was because it expanded the  
5 definition to include --

6 CHAIR LHAMON: Commissioner Narasaki,  
7 I'm going to ask you to do your last question.

8 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: -- people with  
9 disabilities and LGBT. So, Mr. Moosy, one of the  
10 question I have is, a lot of groups have said that  
11 they very much appreciate the fact that Attorney  
12 General Sessions has been out there talking about  
13 hate crimes, but they sent a letter almost a year  
14 ago, a coalition of over 80 groups, raising a  
15 number of recommendations that they had for the  
16 Department of Justice.

17 And I'm wondering what progress has  
18 been made, because my understanding is that a  
19 response has not come.

20 Particularly, on the recommendation to  
21 establish a separate hate crimes task force or  
22 working group, rather than embedding it in the  
23 Crime Reduction and Public Safety Group; holding  
24 inter-agency hate crime meetings that include  
25 people who work on mental disability issues; and

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 creating a website that aggregates the federal  
2 resources on these kinds of hate crimes and tools.

3 MR. MOOSSY: Yes, I've spoken -- I  
4 actually spoke at the ADL, Anti-Defamation League,  
5 earlier this week, as did the Deputy Attorney  
6 General, and I was asked about the letter. It is  
7 actually with me. We will be responding soon.

8 I kind of wanted to get us to the point  
9 where we could publicly say a lot of things that  
10 we've been doing and developing over the last year,  
11 so I think you'll see that we'll be doing that.  
12 And I'm assuming that that letter will be made  
13 public. But we definitely will be responding soon,  
14 within the next couple days.

15 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Okay, thank you.

16 CHAIR LHAMON: We would welcome seeing  
17 the response, the Commission also, when you do send  
18 it.

19 MR. MOOSSY: I'd be happy to provide it.

20 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you. Vice Chair, I  
21 understand you have some questions.

22 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes, I do.  
23 And again, I also thank you all for taking the time  
24 to appear with us. This question is for Assistant  
25 Chief Green and for Sergeant Curry.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           One of the things that we're seeking to  
2 do as a commission is to identify best practices  
3 that can be used to combat hate crimes. And it  
4 would appear that one of the best practices would  
5 be jurisdictions establishing a dedicated unit to  
6 fight hate crimes.

7           And it's my understanding that Boston,  
8 Sergeant Curry, has had a unit for 40 years. I've  
9 been very impressed with what you've done in  
10 Seattle, Assistant Chief Green.

11           So, what I was wondering, it might help  
12 other jurisdictions that are beginning to consider  
13 a dedicated unit to talk about what some of the  
14 largest impediments or obstacles were to you  
15 getting to the point that you would establish a  
16 dedicated unit.

17           So, what can these other jurisdictions  
18 that are considering this prepare themselves to  
19 face? I know it's been a long time, you've been at  
20 it a long time.

21           SGT. DETECTIVE CURRY: What can they  
22 look forward to in terms of establishing a unit?

23           VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: The biggest  
24 barrier --

25           SGT. DETECTIVE CURRY: Barrier.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: -- or  
2 impediment to you setting up a dedicated unit.

3 SGT. DETECTIVE CURRY: I think one of  
4 the challenges with setting up a dedicated unit is  
5 resources, whether that department has enough  
6 officers that they could dedicate to a specific  
7 unit just to look at hate crimes. That's one of  
8 the challenges that I see, is resources.

9 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: I totally agree,  
10 resource management is probably the number one  
11 thing with it. The second would probably be a true  
12 understanding of what hate crimes really are, where  
13 sometimes, as we alluded to earlier on the  
14 categories that we capture, some people believe  
15 that that's a tremendous amount of work.

16 But really, when you start to break it  
17 down and you look at truly the crimes, as opposed  
18 to others that just involve the bias elements, that  
19 body of work actually becomes smaller.

20 That and then, training with the  
21 department, allowing the patrol officers to know  
22 what information they need to capture and get back.  
23 And those, obviously, funding resources at that  
24 point.

25 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Did you

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 want to add, sir?

2 CHIEF CUNNINGHAM: If I could, if you  
3 don't mind.

4 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

5 CHIEF CUNNINGHAM: So, there's about  
6 roughly 18,000 police agencies in the country.  
7 About 80 percent of them are 25 officers or less,  
8 so most agencies don't have the kind of capacity  
9 that Boston and Seattle do.

10 But what we've found is really  
11 important is to make sure that they have  
12 individuals within the agency that they've  
13 identified to get specialized training, because you  
14 really need help. The officer on the street needs  
15 help looking at those bias indicators, what is it -  
16 - is this really a bias or a hate crime?

17 So, it's important so we do have  
18 specialized, particularly at the supervisory level.  
19 So, if we could get, say, all the sergeants  
20 trained, so the sergeants are responding to these  
21 type of crimes on the street and then making a  
22 determination of whether or not it really is truly  
23 a hate crime.

24 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: Ma'am, if I may  
25 just add one other thing. The other important

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 issue would be to look at on a regional level,  
2 because -- based on the smaller departments.

3 One of the things that Seattle, we're  
4 doing is reaching out to our regional partners, to  
5 try to assist them with training and education and  
6 then, assistance as well, since we're a larger  
7 department. So, I think that's a key thing to  
8 focus on as well.

9 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Okay, thank  
10 you. Madam Chair, may I --

11 CHAIR LHAMON: Yes.

12 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: -- ask one  
13 other quick question? This is for Deputy Attorney  
14 General Moossy.

15 Sir, one of our panelists, who will be  
16 appearing later today, says that the Civil Rights  
17 Division and none of those DOJ components regularly  
18 publishes in an easily accessible location any data  
19 about cases. And that they should be required to  
20 report at least quarterly and those reports should  
21 be prominently displayed.

22 I thought about that, in addition with  
23 the dashboard that we heard about from in Seattle.  
24 Will you address please that concern about -- as  
25 expressed by a future panelist?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MR. MOOSSY: Well, I will say,  
2 everything public we can say about a hate crime  
3 prosecution, we put in a press release at the time  
4 of indictment, conviction, or sentencing.

5 And those are all located on our  
6 website, we put pretty much every significant  
7 action in a hate crime case, or any civil rights  
8 case, we make publicly available on our website.

9 So, we do have, on the DOJ website, a  
10 page devoted to hate crimes that lists hate crime  
11 statistics, that lists the statutes, and it has  
12 access to all of the publicly available press  
13 releases.

14 I think a number of the groups have  
15 asked, civil rights groups have asked, about a more  
16 comprehensive website that might provide  
17 information both for state and local contacts, FBI  
18 contacts, state and locally. Something that might  
19 be like the StopBullying.gov website, which I think  
20 has been very successful.

21 And I can say, we're looking at doing  
22 that. Our, I'm a criminal prosecutor, our  
23 technical expertise and our resources to do some of  
24 this I think important outward facing information  
25 is limited, but it is something that we've been

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 working on --

2 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: But we have  
3 those resources within the federal government that  
4 you could call on, don't we?

5 MR. MOOSSY: Well, we're trying. We  
6 have a group looking at trying to standup a  
7 website. But as I said, right now, even if you go  
8 to DOJ.gov and you go to the Civil Rights Division  
9 website, you'll see a hate crimes page.

10 And if you also go to our Public  
11 Affairs Office, you'll see every single hate crimes  
12 press release will be issued publicly.

13 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Well, I  
14 don't know that they were necessarily talking about  
15 press releases, I believe they were concerned about  
16 -- his concern was about data and reports. What  
17 about quarterly, the notion of putting the  
18 information out quarterly?

19 MR. MOOSSY: I guess I'm not -- I mean,  
20 what we have, what we do at the Civil Rights  
21 Division is we have criminal investigations that we  
22 determine whether they meet the elements of a  
23 statute and we prosecute them. So, as much as we  
24 can make public about that, we do.

25 I don't -- we don't do reports, we

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 don't collect data or statistics nationally, the  
2 Uniform Crime Report does that with the FBI, and I  
3 think they do that. But as far as what we do, I  
4 don't know what else we would have that we could  
5 make public.

6 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Thank you.

7 CHAIR LHAMON: Commissioner Yaki?

8 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Thank you very much,  
9 Madam Chair. I have two quick questions, one for  
10 Mr. Cunningham and one for Mr. Soave.

11 Mr. Cunningham, one of the things that  
12 Mr. Moossy brought up in his testimony was the fact  
13 that there are a large number of jurisdictions that  
14 don't report hate crimes at all. In fact, Florida,  
15 for example, the third most populous state in the  
16 country, reports fewer hate crimes than North  
17 Carolina, which is less than half its size.

18 There are places, counties in Texas,  
19 for example Harris County, with over a million,  
20 nearly two million people, that reported zero hate  
21 crimes. And there are other jurisdictions -- and  
22 that's not, by the way, relegated to the South.  
23 Baltimore County only reported one for a population  
24 of 831,000.

25 How do we get these police departments

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 in these larger jurisdictions to start cooperating  
2 and what can we do to make it either better,  
3 easier, or more compulsory for them to get  
4 involved?

5 CHIEF CUNNINGHAM: Sure. So, a couple  
6 of responses to that. Number one, I think that in  
7 a lot of the jurisdictions, they don't know what  
8 those bias indicators are, so they're not sure it's  
9 a hate crime, so they don't list it as a hate  
10 crime. That's number one.

11 But the bigger issue here is the  
12 reporting piece, because it's all voluntary through  
13 the Uniform Crime Report. IACP and all the major  
14 law enforcement organizations have really been very  
15 supportive of trying to move from the UCR to NIBRS,  
16 because UCR just doesn't give you enough  
17 information.

18 NIBRS gives you a lot more information.  
19 The problem with that is that a lot of the  
20 agencies, including the larger agencies, don't have  
21 the resources to do it. So, their current records  
22 management systems don't allow them to capture that  
23 information and then upload it and send it to the  
24 FBI -- go ahead, sir.

25 COMMISSIONER YAKI: When you mean by

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 resources, what do you mean?

2 CHIEF CUNNINGHAM: Well, like I said,  
3 the records management system isn't capable,  
4 because they're very antiquated. So, there would  
5 be a significant financial investment.

6 So, what we're seeing in dealing with  
7 the FBI, who is leading this effort for us, we've  
8 been very, very supportive of it, because as a  
9 police professional, you need the data and you need  
10 the best data that you can to make decisions.

11 So, we need more information. That  
12 NIBRS information gives you a lot more for you to  
13 be able to make decisions on. But the problem is  
14 that this transition is going to happen by 2020 and  
15 we are moving into just the NIBRS and they won't  
16 even accept the UCR data anymore, but there are a  
17 lot of agencies that need more resources.

18 They just don't have the money to be  
19 able to upgrade their records management systems to  
20 be able to do this. And absolutely, that is a  
21 place where the federal government can help. They  
22 have provided some resources, but they need more.

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Thank you. Mr.  
24 Soave, I was curious about some of the statements  
25 that you made regarding the climate of hate speech.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           You seemed to indicate that there  
2           seemed to be no -- I don't want to paraphrase it,  
3           but you said something that seemed to me, struck me  
4           as concluding that there was -- too much was being  
5           made of the current climate of statements of people  
6           making with regard to hate speech and whether it  
7           was really increasing or not. Could you -- am I  
8           wrong or what exactly did you say about that?

9           MR. SOAVE: I think that I was simply  
10          stating that we -- often, people in the media  
11          assert that hate crimes are getting worse or that  
12          bias incidents are getting worse on college  
13          campuses.

14          I don't know that that's not the case,  
15          but I don't know that the evidence is as compelling  
16          as they often suggest that it is. I think the  
17          situation is more complicated, particularly in our  
18          schools.

19          We have better data, obviously, for the  
20          hard hate crimes, for knowing whether they're --  
21          although, as you just mentioned, in some places, we  
22          just have simply no information.

23          COMMISSIONER YAKI: I'm curious because,  
24          to me, whether it's a college campus or whether  
25          it's the city of Houston, while we all agree that

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 speech is protected, must be protected, certainly  
2 speech can create a climate for action.

3 And I looked at the fact that the  
4 reporting that's mandated by the Department of  
5 Education showed a big spike upwards in reported  
6 hate crimes -- and you may dispute that -- after  
7 November, around November of last year.

8 And I'm concerned, and I think this is  
9 something that goes toward the work that not just  
10 you, but other people on this panel are doing,  
11 everyone, that goes toward what this climate is  
12 that we are engaged in right now and how unusual it  
13 is.

14 When you have a President talking about  
15 -- and these are all statements, so I'm not  
16 renaming out of school -- characterizing Mexican  
17 immigrants as racists and criminals, attacking a  
18 judge for his Mexican heritage as being biased,  
19 talking about people from Haiti as having AIDS,  
20 describing countries in Africa as being s-hole  
21 countries, which I won't go after, Charlottesville,  
22 the "very fine people" comment, pardoning Joe  
23 Arpaio, calling Senator Liz Warren Pocahontas.  
24 These are things that are out there, I mean, they  
25 just -- you can't undo them.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1           We have someone here who's going to  
2 testify later about his role and his bravery in an  
3 attack against two Muslim individuals on a train in  
4 Portland.

5           And it took the President three days,  
6 with 21 other intervening tweets, before that  
7 incident was acknowledged by the White House, and  
8 it wasn't even acknowledged by the President's own  
9 Twitter, it was done by the actually official one,  
10 which is not handled by the President himself.

11           These are things that are out there.  
12 And I'm curious for you, for all of you, how that  
13 atmosphere or does that charge the atmosphere any  
14 more for you and how you're dealing with these  
15 incidents and the climate and just the average  
16 person, patrol person out on the street, in dealing  
17 with hate crimes and how that impacts what it is  
18 that you do?

19           MR. SOAVE: May I just add one quick --  
20 so, I would obviously agree that all the statements  
21 you just listed that Trump and others have said  
22 were horrible and wrongheaded things, but I  
23 certainly wouldn't want our police doing anything  
24 to stop people from expressing those things.

25           COMMISSIONER YAKI: No, of course not.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MR. SOAVE: Now, on a campus, it does  
2 get a little more confusing, right? What --  
3 because teachers have more power in some  
4 circumstances, especially if we're talking K-12, to  
5 police those statements within their classroom or  
6 to make it a hospitable environment for everyone.

7 When you're going to like the public  
8 square on a college campus, well you can write  
9 whatever you want in chalk in the quad, probably  
10 within a greater degree of latitude. Maybe not  
11 anything, but it's just writing like, Latinos, go  
12 back to Mexico, or something, would that be -- that  
13 might get characterized as a bias incident.

14 It's also probably a pretty clear free  
15 expression thing if it's at a public university  
16 campus, public property. So, that's why I say  
17 these things get a little more complicated when we  
18 start blurring these distinctions, particularly at  
19 schools.

20 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Ms. Curry, you have  
21 a comment? Mr. Cunningham?

22 CHIEF CUNNINGHAM: So, I would just say  
23 that words really matter. Whether it's the  
24 previous administration or the current  
25 administration, when it comes from the top of the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 administration, what the President of the United  
2 States says really matters.

3 During the previous administration, we  
4 saw some real high profile use of force cases and I  
5 think that there were some folks in the  
6 administration that jumped to some conclusions very  
7 quickly before they let those investigations play  
8 out. And because of that, there were some words  
9 that caused some strife within, I know, law  
10 enforcement, and there were some issues.

11 And then, in the current  
12 administration, some remarks that are clearly  
13 insensitive remarks, they matter. Words matter  
14 from all of us.

15 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Thank you.

16 CHAIR LHAMON: Ms. Curry, did you have a  
17 response?

18 SGT. DETECTIVE CURRY: No.

19 CHAIR LHAMON: Okay, thank you.  
20 Commission Kladney?

21 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Thank you, Madam  
22 Chair. Chief Johnson, you made mention of 18,000  
23 police departments and then, I think you said a  
24 majority of them have 25 officers or less, or do  
25 you have a number?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHIEF CUNNINGHAM: Eighty percent, 80  
2 percent of the police departments within the United  
3 States are 25 officers or less.

4 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Thank you. Chief  
5 Green, Chief Johnson, in his statement, said that -  
6 - let me see here -- 44 percent of hate crimes are  
7 not reported. I think that's what he said. Fifty-  
8 four, so it sounds to me like your department's  
9 fairly sophisticated in that regard, have you been  
10 able to determine what kind of reporting  
11 percentages you have?

12 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: No, sir. We do  
13 know that we have quite a bit of under-reporting,  
14 as the national average goes, as well. We believe  
15 we do have a very robust outreach to gather that,  
16 however, I think there's a lot of reasons for it.  
17 And it's mostly from personal interaction with  
18 folks and what they bring to it.

19 So, as Mr. Soave says, is the increase  
20 due to an increase or is it an increase just due to  
21 an increase in reporting? At some point, there  
22 will be a plateau, I think, and then at that point,  
23 we can really start to gather the data on if  
24 they're increasing or not.

25 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: And, Chief

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Johnson, I found out the 44 percent, that's where  
2 these matters were privately handled. What does  
3 that mean? Can you give me some examples?

4 CHIEF CUNNINGHAM: I'm sorry, I'm just  
5 not following your question.

6 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: It said here,  
7 hate crimes to police victimization were handled in  
8 another way, 44 percent were privately or through  
9 non-law enforcement officials.

10 CHIEF CUNNINGHAM: Oh, sure. So, I  
11 mean, a lot of times, you'll see, in these hate  
12 events, you'll see victims of those go to other  
13 civil representatives, go to -- whether it's to the  
14 ADL or to other folks, and not report them to law  
15 enforcement.

16 As I think the first speaker, the  
17 Detective Sergeant, had talked about, folks'  
18 immigration status, it's such a concern to people,  
19 they're really afraid to come forward and to report  
20 a lot of these hate crimes. So, they go to other  
21 organizations to make their report.

22 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: And do police  
23 organizations contact those organizations to ask  
24 them to at least anonymously report those crimes?

25 CHIEF CUNNINGHAM: So, I think it is,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 again, in my comments I made, it is so important  
2 for us to maintain those relationships with those  
3 organizations, which I know we do have a great  
4 relationship with them.

5 But it's really incumbent upon the  
6 local agencies to constantly reach out to those  
7 organizations, so that the organization feels that  
8 the agency, the police agencies, are trustworthy  
9 and that they can make those reports to them.

10 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Mr. Moossy, is  
11 that correct?

12 MR. MOOSSY: Yes.

13 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Thank you. You  
14 said that Attorney General Sessions supports  
15 prosecution of hate crimes. What is DOJ doing in  
16 terms of trying to get more reporting done in this  
17 regard?

18 Obviously, the software is changing, or  
19 the reporting software is changing, but are there  
20 other things? You were talking about educational  
21 classes around the country, et cetera, can you be  
22 more specific?

23 MR. MOOSSY: Yes, I can. First, let me  
24 just, to your prior question about outreach to  
25 community groups, I think that's so important in

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 all aspects of our criminal prosecution, whether  
2 we're doing prosecutions of police officers for  
3 excessive force, human trafficking, hate crimes.  
4 The victims in those cases often don't come to  
5 local law enforcement.

6 And really, creating a bridge with  
7 community groups I think is critical. That's why  
8 we have a civil rights point of contact in every  
9 U.S. Attorney's office and every FBI office in this  
10 country, whose job it is to go out and form  
11 relationships with those community groups to try to  
12 create a bridge for victims to be able to come and  
13 report these crimes through a trusted method.

14 We're -- the department actually has  
15 sent two people to this hearing. Later today,  
16 you're going to hear from a representative of our  
17 Bureau of Justice Statistics, who is an expert on  
18 hate crimes reporting and data.

19 But let me say that, I think the first  
20 thing that we're trying to figure out -- and this  
21 is something -- in our Hate Crimes Working Group,  
22 which I mentioned in my statement, this is one of  
23 our priorities, is to figure out what is going on  
24 with this reporting? Why are 80 percent reporting  
25 zero?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           And, I mean, in some ways, maybe there  
2           are just people who don't want to report. I think  
3           there are a number of people who aren't trained and  
4           who don't know. In these 18,000 small person  
5           police departments, the resources to go out and  
6           train every one of them is vast. So, there's a  
7           training issue.

8           There's also just, the mechanism, as  
9           Chief Cunningham said, is just really difficult.  
10          And I think for resource strained departments, the  
11          current system is difficult to use.

12          I think the NIBRS system, it's a drop-  
13          down box that will drive people to report. In  
14          other words, instead of just figuring out to fill  
15          out the hate crimes form and then enter that in,  
16          there's an actual sort of drop-down menu that  
17          basically drives you to report hate crimes. And I  
18          think -- and all crimes. And so, I think that  
19          that's going to work a lot better.

20          So, we are looking -- I think one of  
21          the things that our FBI is doing is, we've put out  
22          the word to local police departments that if you  
23          want training on reporting, we are providing  
24          resources to do that.

25          And we've stepped up a program to start

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 providing training to local police departments, to  
2 increase their ability to do hate crimes reporting.

3 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Do you have any  
4 idea how that's been going or how long that's been  
5 going, whether there's an increase in the training,  
6 the numbers? Do you have any of that?

7 MR. MOOSSY: It's new, I know that it's  
8 a product of our working group. Because as the  
9 Attorney General has put an emphasis on this  
10 program over the last year and we've been  
11 mobilizing folks, I know that our FBI Crime  
12 Reporting Unit is soliciting requests and providing  
13 that training.

14 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: So, this training  
15 program is new under this administration?

16 MR. MOOSSY: I would say, we're  
17 providing new training under this administration.  
18 I don't know that I would classify it as a program,  
19 I think what we're trying to do is identify why are  
20 people not reporting?

21 For those who are not reporting because  
22 they lack training, let's give them that training.  
23 Right. For those who are not reporting for other  
24 reasons, let's try to address those reasons,  
25 whether it be NIBRS, whether it be trying to fund

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 technology upgrades, things like that.

2 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Thank you.

3 CHAIR LHAMON: Commissioner Heriot?

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Thank you, Madam  
5 Chair. Mr. Moossy, my understanding is that the  
6 2009 Act has a certification requirement and that  
7 the AG or his designee must certify certain things  
8 before a federal prosecution can be undertaken.

9 Can you walk me through the process for  
10 how that's done? Has the AG designated someone  
11 else to make that certification and what sort of  
12 documentation goes to that person before a federal  
13 prosecution can be undertaken?

14 MR. MOOSSY: So, you're correct, before  
15 any prosecution under the Shepard-Byrd Act can  
16 commence, the Attorney General has to certify that  
17 such a prosecution is in the public interest and  
18 there's a set of factors laid out in the statute.

19 That authority has been delegated to  
20 the Assistant Attorney General for Civil Rights.  
21 Right now, the acting Assistant Attorney General is  
22 Mr. John Gore. That delegation happened as soon as  
23 the statute was enacted in 2009, so it's always  
24 been that way.

25 There was a short period of time when

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the Attorney General, Ms. Lynch, herself had to do  
2 it because of the Vacancies Act and Ms. Gupta's  
3 position. But as long as the statute has been in  
4 place, there's been this delegation.

5 There is an internal briefing process  
6 by the prosecutors to the Assistant Attorney  
7 General through me, where --

8 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: In writing?

9 MR. MOOSSY: In writing -- where factors  
10 are laid out, the deliberative process is  
11 explained, the strengths and weaknesses of the  
12 internal analysis of the case, and the analysis of  
13 the factors as they relate to the evidence. And  
14 then a decision is --

15 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I would really  
16 like to see that kind of documentation, is that  
17 something the Commission can get?

18 MR. MOOSSY: I believe it would all be  
19 deliberative process protected, just like our  
20 indictment memos would all be deliberative process  
21 protected. I'm not an expert at the Freedom of  
22 Information Act, I would certainly want to comply  
23 with it fully and if you filed a FOIA request, it  
24 would get through the normal course.

25 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIR LHAMON: Mr. Moossy, would you be  
2 able to just share with us what the elements of the  
3 memo are, even if you couldn't share what the memo  
4 says?

5 MR. MOOSSY: Well, the analysis is,  
6 first and foremost --

7 CHAIR LHAMON: I didn't mean as a test  
8 right now, you can do it later.

9 (Laughter.)

10 MR. MOOSSY: Oh, okay, sure. I can send  
11 you --

12 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you.

13 MR. MOOSSY: I can send you that, yes,  
14 ma'am.

15 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you.

16 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Then, Mr. Green,  
17 you had said that there are a lot of cases that go  
18 unreported, and I'm sure that's true, but isn't  
19 that also true for like simple assaults? Do you  
20 have a sense of is something like a simple assault  
21 that isn't a hate crime, what percentage of those  
22 go unreported?

23 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: I don't have a  
24 number for you, ma'am, but I would agree that there  
25 are a large amount of all crimes that go

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 unreported, for probably very much similar reasons  
2 as hate crimes don't as well.

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: And like Mr.  
4 Soave, I think it was Mr. Soave, saying that like  
5 hate crimes from 2015 to 2016 had gone up between  
6 four and five percent. I did a quick Google search  
7 and it's also true that violent crime in general  
8 went up between four and five percent that year.

9 Now, it was a little bit different,  
10 with hate crimes, I think it was 4.6, with violent  
11 crimes, it was 4.1. But we're talking about a  
12 small difference there.

13 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: Yes, we are, I  
14 think, overall. What I would explain, like in the  
15 City of Seattle, our crimes, from 2016 to 2017, our  
16 non-criminal bias incidents rose 112 percent, so  
17 much higher than four to five percent and maybe  
18 some of the national averages --

19 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Wait, wait, wait,  
20 run that by me again.

21 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: So, in the City  
22 of Seattle, our non-criminal bias incidents from  
23 2016 to 2017 rose 112 percent.

24 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Non-criminal bias  
25 incidents?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: So, what we were  
2 talking about, where there was a crime, an  
3 underlying --

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes, that's --

5 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: -- crime and  
6 someone used derogatory, in --

7 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: But that's one  
8 that's going to be subject to --

9 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: Right.

10 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: -- huge variation  
11 based on how that's perceived. That one is --  
12 that's not --

13 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: Right, and  
14 crimes with --

15 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: -- really what  
16 we're talking about here.

17 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: Right. Crimes  
18 with bias elements, which are the malicious actions  
19 crimes, rose 113 percent in the city.

20 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No, I want hate  
21 crimes.

22 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: Yes, ma'am.

23 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Hate crimes.

24 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: One hundred and  
25 thirteen percent.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1                   COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay. How much  
2 did your violent crime go up? How much did your  
3 simple assault go up? How much did anything that  
4 would be a non-hate, how much did it go up?

5                   ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: They increased  
6 as well, but not nearly by that. They've increased  
7 by single or double-digits, not by triple-digits,  
8 ma'am.

9                   COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay.

10                  ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: Now, I will  
11 caveat that with saying, with that, that was only  
12 114 incidents in 2018. Or 2017, rather. So, the  
13 increase, while you look at the statistical number  
14 and you're like, incredible with 113, Seattle is  
15 still a very safe place, in the fact that it was  
16 still only 114 incidents.

17                  COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I'm glad Seattle  
18 is a safe place. On the other hand, again, when  
19 we're talking about these things that are hurling  
20 epithets, you would think that would be subject to  
21 wild variations in whether or not people are  
22 thinking about reporting it, rather than what the  
23 underlying facts are.

24                  If people are told, these things are  
25 going up, they're going to mention that much more

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 readily than they would in a case where people  
2 aren't thinking about it, shall we say.

3 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: Yes, ma'am.

4 CHAIR LHAMON: With five minutes left in  
5 our panel and three questioners still to go --

6 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay.

7 CHAIR LHAMON: -- I'm going to move to  
8 Commissioner Kirsanow.

9 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Thank you, Madam  
10 Chair. And thanks to the witnesses. I just have a  
11 couple of questions for all of the witnesses, if  
12 you have this information. I looked through the  
13 material that was provided by all witnesses, not  
14 just this panel, to see if this information was  
15 there and I didn't see it, maybe I missed it.

16 Are you aware of any data, studies, or  
17 other evidence that show that designating a crime a  
18 hate crime deters, prevents, or reduces that crime?

19 Second, whether designating a crime a  
20 federal hate crime reduces, deters, or prevents  
21 incidents of that crime?

22 Then, one other question, are you aware  
23 of any databases, study, or other evidence that  
24 shows that designating a crime a hate crime,  
25 whether municipal, state, or federal hate crime,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 assists in the resolution of that crime or the  
2 apprehension of the perpetrator? Thank you, Madam  
3 Chair.

4 CHAIR LHAMON: You're welcome.  
5 Commission Adegbile?

6 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Yes, thank you.  
7 Chief Cunningham, I think you said that one of the  
8 things that is important is that jurisdictions come  
9 to understand and are trained in the utility of  
10 reporting, the value of reporting. Right now, can  
11 you give us the elevator pitch about what the  
12 utility of reporting is for jurisdictions?

13 CHIEF CUNNINGHAM: Sure. I think that  
14 any police administrator would look at -- they want  
15 to make data-driven decisions. So, you look at the  
16 data to decide how you put your resources out in  
17 the field.

18 So, if you saw 115 percent increase in  
19 your hate crimes, you'd say, okay, we either need  
20 to establish a unit, add additional resources to  
21 that, make sure we make the connections with the  
22 community, there's clearly something happening  
23 there.

24 But one of the components that I didn't  
25 talk about, and one of the reluctance, particularly

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 in the major cities, when it comes to this shift  
2 from UCR to NIBRS, it's going to appear that  
3 there's been an increase in crime, when in fact,  
4 there hasn't been, it's just a difference in the  
5 way that it's being reported.

6 It's much more important that we  
7 capture all that data, but if you talk to a lot of  
8 the major city chiefs, they'll tell you that they  
9 live and die by their crime statistics. And when  
10 they shift from the UCR data to the NIBRS data,  
11 it's going to look like an increase in crime.

12 So, there's a lot of reluctance on  
13 their part. So, even though we're very, very much  
14 encouraging everybody to do it at the same time, so  
15 that everybody's numbers go up together, because if  
16 you've got, say it's Philadelphia that's not  
17 reporting, and I don't know that they're not, but  
18 say it's Philadelphia that's not reporting and  
19 you've got Chicago that's reporting, it's going to  
20 look like Chicago had an incredible uptick in  
21 crime, when in fact, they didn't.

22 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: So, even before  
23 we get to the shift in the way that crimes are  
24 reported, I think we've heard that Florida has  
25 vanishingly small reports and North Carolina has

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 considerably more and it's a much smaller state, I  
2 take it that's not about the way the data is  
3 reported, there's some inherent reluctance.

4 For example, Florida is a major tourist  
5 destination in the country and people may be making  
6 a judgment that it would not be a boom to tourism  
7 to be reporting these crimes. So, how do you  
8 overcome other issues that are not about how it's  
9 reported, but is about the reluctance of  
10 jurisdictions to tell it like it is?

11 We've already heard the DOJ, while they  
12 issue press releases, don't have any dashboard  
13 mechanism or any regular reporting mechanism to  
14 help us have an understanding of what this looks  
15 like over and across the nation.

16 So, I'm wondering if you could drive  
17 down, not just about how we're changing reporting,  
18 but there seems to be some inherent reluctance.

19 CHIEF CUNNINGHAM: So, this actually  
20 came out at our meetings that we had with the  
21 Lawyers Committee on Civil Rights, and particularly  
22 those jurisdictions that just aren't reporting  
23 anything.

24 There's some shaming that's involved,  
25 that when you hold it up and say, hey, you know

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 what, this jurisdiction didn't report anything and  
2 it's a large jurisdiction, there's something going  
3 on there.

4 There's also the piece where we talk  
5 about, there are no penalties for not reporting,  
6 right? So, maybe you need to incentivize agencies  
7 to report, give them a carrot instead of the stick.

8 And the other piece that really is the  
9 communities holding those agencies responsible. If  
10 a community stands up and says, hey, you know what  
11 chief, or police department, we're showing zero  
12 hate crimes reported here in a jurisdiction of this  
13 size, it's just not possible, it's not realistic.

14 And I still go back to the fact that a  
15 lot of police officers don't know what those bias  
16 indicators are, so they don't report it as a hate  
17 crime. I really, in a lot of agencies, I don't  
18 think it's they're doing it for nefarious purposes,  
19 I think they just don't know. We need more  
20 training.

21 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Mr. Moossy,  
22 there are, and Commissioner Yaki has spoken about a  
23 number of statements that the President has made  
24 that were targeted at particular groups.

25 I'm trying to understand, to the extent

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that you say community outreach and building a  
2 bridge to communities is an essential role and that  
3 there's a difficulty with respect to immigration  
4 status in having reporting and the like about  
5 crimes, I'm trying to understand what role those  
6 statements across a category of groups, national  
7 origin statements, statements about transgender  
8 people, policy pronouncements, how does that make  
9 your job any easier in the area of hate crimes?

10 MR. MOOSSY: As I said, I mean, I don't  
11 -- I really do think that forming bridges with  
12 these community groups is critical. Definitely, we  
13 have some impediments to doing that, but I think  
14 we're committed to doing it, our Attorney General  
15 is committed to doing it, all of us are committed  
16 to doing it.

17 I do want to though just say, I want to  
18 be really careful about attributing really  
19 provocative speech to criminality. And I hope none  
20 of us are trying to make any connection, where  
21 we're saying that provocative speech somehow  
22 exculpates the people who commit violent hate  
23 crimes because they're being driven to it or  
24 something like that.

25 I mean, that is certainly not our

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 position. I think under our First Amendment  
2 jurisprudence, we see a really hard line there,  
3 where we say, if something is a threat, incitement  
4 to violence, or violence, those people, you are  
5 responsible for that conduct.

6 And so, I think our position has always  
7 been, we respect vibrant and, at some times,  
8 shocking speech, but that that is separate and  
9 apart from violent crime and violent conduct. And  
10 the people who engage in violent crime and violent  
11 conduct are to be held responsible for that.

12 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: But my question  
13 went to the bridge building. I take it that  
14 there's a distinction in law between speech and  
15 conduct, we've been speaking about that today, so  
16 I'm not talking about whether or not an authority  
17 will duly prosecute when somebody steps over that  
18 line.

19 What I'm talking about is that I  
20 understand the law enforcement officers on the  
21 panel, all of you, to be saying that to do this job  
22 well, we need to have bridges to the community and  
23 that community interactions are a key component of  
24 being able to vindicate these laws.

25 And so, I'm trying to understand how

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the tone from the top affects law enforcement's  
2 ability to engage with communities that may already  
3 be reluctant to participate with law enforcement  
4 and to report. That's the question.

5 MR. MOOSSY: Sure. And what I can tell  
6 you is, what we do is, we go to those communities.  
7 I partner with National Center for Transgender  
8 Equality and every month, I get from them a list of  
9 possible hate crimes that may happen and we look at  
10 those.

11 And so, we make an overt effort to go  
12 to our communities and say, I'm with the Civil  
13 Rights Division, we care about investigating and  
14 prosecuting hate violence. I'm going to stand with  
15 my local police department and say, we're the  
16 people who, if there's an act of violence, we are  
17 here and we want to take it seriously.

18 And so, we're putting faces to our  
19 actions. And that's why we have civil rights  
20 points of contact in every U.S. Attorney's office,  
21 in every FBI, and that's why the FBI has the  
22 national training initiative, where they're going  
23 out to these communities and saying, if an act of  
24 violence happens, my name is Agent Smith, I want  
25 you to come and tell me about it because I want to

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 do something about it, I'm showing you that our  
2 commitment to do this is real. That's what we do.

3 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Thank you.

4 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you. We are close  
5 out of time, I'm going to let the -- oh, I'm sorry.

6 ASSISTANT CHIEF GREEN: I'm sorry, Madam  
7 Chairman. I misspoke earlier, Commissioner Heriot.  
8 So, the actual increase in the crime itself was 33  
9 percent, not 113, 33 percent.

10 CHAIR LHAMON: That's an important  
11 clarification, thank you. And we'll let the Vice  
12 Chair ask one question and then, I'm going to just  
13 squeeze in another for myself.

14 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Okay.

15 CHAIR LHAMON: But that means that we're  
16 going to have a very short break between this panel  
17 and the next. So, go fast.

18 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Thank you  
19 very much, Madam Chair. We were speaking -- you  
20 were speaking, Mr. Moosy, earlier about commitment  
21 to eradicating hate crimes and all of that.

22 It occurred to me that I believe the  
23 most recent budget proposal sought to eliminate  
24 roughly 27 positions in the Civil Rights Division  
25 or the Civil Rights Team, whatever. How is

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 eliminating those positions consistent with the  
2 reported increases in racial harassment and hate  
3 crimes?

4 MR. MOOSSY: So, our -- I believe we got  
5 a flat, for the Civil Rights Division, I think it  
6 was a flat budget. I'm not aware that -- there was  
7 I think some reporting about some spots that were  
8 eliminated that were never filled, they were  
9 literally just accounting type positions. But as  
10 far --

11 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: I think I'm  
12 talking about the proposal sought.

13 MR. MOOSSY: I'm not aware that the  
14 Civil Rights Division budget was cut --

15 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Or Civil  
16 Rights Team --

17 MR. MOOSSY: -- we have a --

18 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: -- whatever  
19 you --

20 CHAIR LHAMON: The Vice Chair is asking  
21 about the proposal from DOJ, not what Congress gave  
22 to DOJ.

23 MR. MOOSSY: Again, I know that, for  
24 example, in our criminal section, we've added  
25 attorneys to it. So, for the people who are

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 prosecuting hate crimes, I think that since January  
2 1, 2017, we've added 16 criminal prosecutors, I  
3 think for a net of eight, because we've had some  
4 attrition.

5 So, for the unit that's doing that kind  
6 of work, it's grown. And I know our budget has  
7 been flat. I'm not aware of a proposal to decrease  
8 the funding to the prosecutors or attorneys who  
9 would be handling hate crimes matters. I'm not  
10 aware of that all.

11 CHAIR LHAMON: Okay, thank you.

12 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Thank you.

13 CHAIR LHAMON: I'm going to ask my quick  
14 question, Mr. Moossy, also. We received some  
15 recommendations from panelists who are coming later  
16 today also about the value of inter-agency working  
17 groups focused on hate crimes. And you've included  
18 in your testimony information about within DOJ  
19 component work about hate crimes focus.

20 In my last life, when I was with the  
21 Department of Education, I participated in some of  
22 the inter-agency working groups focused on hate  
23 crimes. I found them valuable and wonder if you  
24 do. And if so, whether any work like that is  
25 continuing to take place, if you think it would be

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 valuable to take place, and if not, why not?

2 MR. MOOSSY: I do think it's valuable  
3 and I would love to explore reconstituting our work  
4 on that.

5 CHAIR LHAMON: Okay, thank you. Do you  
6 have a reason -- do you why it isn't constituted  
7 now?

8 MR. MOOSSY: I don't.

9 CHAIR LHAMON: Okay, thank you. With  
10 that, we're going to conclude this panel. I thank  
11 very much each of the panelists for your expertise.

12 We invite you to share further  
13 information if you have further information that  
14 occurs to you from today. And we look forward to  
15 staying in conversation with you.

16 We'll take a break for four minutes,  
17 until 10:40, and invite our next panel to come up.

18 (Whereupon, the above-entitled matter  
19 went off the record at 10:36 a.m. and resumed at  
20 10:42 a.m.)

21 **PANEL TWO: COMMUNITY STAKEHOLDERS**

22 CHAIR LHAMON: Okay. I am as rigid as  
23 possible, so we are back, because it is 10:40.  
24 We're going to proceed with our second panel.  
25 Commissioner Kirsanow, I'm starting us again,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 thanks. We're going to proceed with our second  
2 panel of community stakeholders.

3 In the order in which they will speak,  
4 our panelists are: Suman Raghunathan, Executive  
5 Director of the South Asian Americans Leading  
6 Together, SAALT; then, Melissa Garlick, Civil  
7 Rights National Counsel from the Anti-Defamation  
8 League, ADL; then, Nicole Jorwic, Director of  
9 Rights Policy at The Arc; then, Katherine Prescott,  
10 LGBTQ Parent Advocate and GLSEN Board Member; and  
11 then, Micah David-Cole Fletcher, survivor; and  
12 Susan Bro, Chair and President of the Heather Heyer  
13 Foundation.

14 I reiterate my other remarks that  
15 several panelists today will speak from personal  
16 experience and I ask our audience to be cognizant  
17 and respectful of all of our panelists, and I ask  
18 my fellow Commissioners to keep that in mind during  
19 the question and answer session as well. Ms.  
20 Raghunathan, please begin.

21 MS. RAGHUNATHAN: Good morning.

22 CHAIR LHAMON: Good morning.

23 MS. RAGHUNATHAN: It's an honor to join  
24 today's critical hearing, in particular with  
25 survivors and family members of hate violence

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 victims. Thank you so very much for your  
2 resilience, your commitment to change, and for  
3 speaking up.

4 South Asian Americans Leading Together  
5 is a national nonpartisan racial justice  
6 organization fighting for the civil rights of South  
7 Asians in the U.S. Our ultimate vision is dignity  
8 and full inclusion for all.

9 South Asians are the second most  
10 rapidly growing demographic group in the U.S.,  
11 numbering over five million today. The South Asian  
12 American population has more than doubled since  
13 2000.

14 We are a largely immigrant community  
15 and roughly one in three South Asians are Muslim.  
16 Our communities increasingly are caught in a  
17 crosshairs of race, religion, and immigration. All  
18 of these factors make our communities and many  
19 others the disproportionate targets of violence,  
20 regardless of our actual religion or citizenship  
21 status.

22 SAALT as an organization was born in  
23 the aftermath of September 11, in response to the  
24 violent backlash and divisive policies aimed at  
25 South Asian, Muslim, Sikh, Hindu, Arab, and Middle

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Eastern individuals, communities, and institutions.

2 Our work has grown to include rapid  
3 response efforts in the wake of hate violence, to  
4 anticipating and working to prevent hate violence  
5 through an evolved field and policy strategy. We  
6 do this in partnership with the National Coalition  
7 of South Asian Organizations, a network of 62  
8 grassroots South Asian groups across the country.

9 The NCSO reminds us of the realities  
10 our communities are facing everyday on the ground,  
11 which in turn informs our strategy for developing  
12 national responses through executive and  
13 legislative recommendations.

14 SAALT is proud that our work hinges on  
15 working with community stakeholders on the front  
16 lines to develop policies that prevent and respond  
17 to hate violence and hate crimes.

18 This is a critical moment for South  
19 Asian, Muslim, Arab, Sikh, Hindu, and Middle  
20 Eastern communities as we see our nation become a  
21 melting pot of hate, rather than a melting pot of  
22 diversity.

23 This pot is being stirred by the White  
24 House, key agencies in the federal government, and  
25 a resurgent white supremacist movement that is

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 amplified and, indeed, encouraged by an  
2 administration that has already demonstrated its  
3 commitment to operationalizing a white supremacist  
4 agenda.

5 South Asian, Muslim, Sikh, Hindu, and  
6 Middle Eastern communities are existing in a moment  
7 where we are the targets of hate that are actively  
8 spurred by the anti-immigrant, anti-Muslim, anti-  
9 people of color policies advanced by the current  
10 administration, including the Department of  
11 Justice.

12 We are in the throes of a divisive and  
13 troubling surge of hate violence confronting our  
14 communities. And we have actually been tracking  
15 this issue for more than a decade, since before the  
16 FBI updated its own hate crimes categories, and  
17 it's becoming tragically clear that this wave of  
18 hostility and violence will not ebb any time soon.

19 Our latest report, Communities on Fire,  
20 points to a different and more sinister melting  
21 pot, one where the tiki torch that was seen in the  
22 white supremacist rally of Charlottesville,  
23 Virginia has now been supplanting the Statue of  
24 Liberty as the symbol of this nation as white  
25 supremacist groups proliferate and are enabled by

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the policies, pronouncements, and actions of the  
2 Trump administration.

3 These symbols are pointing to the  
4 xenophobic political rhetoric, as well as hate  
5 violence that is impacting our communities. We're  
6 also impacted by the devastating and rising tide of  
7 anti-immigrant, anti-refugee, and asylee policies,  
8 such as the Muslim ban, the Department of Justice  
9 lawsuit against California's commitment to  
10 protecting all of its residents though its so-  
11 called sanctuary cities policies, the rescission of  
12 DACA, and federal efforts to erode protections  
13 against racial profiling.

14 These policies and rhetoric explicitly  
15 target our communities as un-America, identify us  
16 as undeserving of core rights and protections and  
17 as worthy targets of violence. As a result, our  
18 communities are increasingly questioning our very  
19 place in this nation.

20 We documented in the year immediately  
21 after the election of President Trump 302 incidents  
22 of hate violence and xenophobic political rhetoric  
23 aimed at South Asian, Muslim, Sikh, Hindu, Middle  
24 Eastern, and Arab communities.

25 This was an over 45 percent increase

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 from the previous year. Eighty-two percent of the  
2 incidents that we documented were animated by anti-  
3 Muslim sentiment, 82.

4 And perhaps most troubling, one in five  
5 of the hate violence perpetrators that we  
6 documented explicitly referred to President Trump,  
7 a President Trump policy such as the Muslim ban, or  
8 a Trump campaign slogan as they were violently  
9 assaulting our community members.

10 So, for us right now, the connection  
11 between the bully pulpit emboldening, and indeed,  
12 encouraging individuals to violently assault our  
13 community members is perhaps never been clearer.

14 We have a number of recommendations in  
15 our report, which we submitted to the Commission.  
16 From a top-line perspective, we know that political  
17 leadership can be tied to the troubling uptick in  
18 violence.

19 We are deeply troubled by the current  
20 administration's silence on a white supremacist  
21 agenda. We are deeply troubled as well by the  
22 elimination of the budget of the Community  
23 Relations Service.

24 And we applaud the leadership of the  
25 International Association of Police Chiefs that are

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 unfortunately placed in the position of having to  
2 make up for the inaction or silence of the current  
3 administration when it comes to the violence that  
4 is impacting our community members every day.

5 We know that we need preventative  
6 measures to respond to the needs of our  
7 communities. We know that we need to build  
8 productive relationships with willing law  
9 enforcement leaders between our community members.

10 And we also know that we need to  
11 prioritize post--9/11 violence, in particular, this  
12 current moment, as an issue that is deeply and  
13 disproportionately impacting our communities.

14 And finally, we also know that Congress  
15 must pass meaningful legislation to address and  
16 stem the current tide of violence against our  
17 communities. We have maintained that the NO HATE  
18 Act, which is currently in Congress, is the  
19 strongest piece of legislation that addresses the  
20 spike in religious hate crimes and provides a  
21 restorative justice component.

22 And I will simply end with this  
23 important acknowledgment: Deah Barakat, Khalid  
24 Jabara, Srinivas Kuchibhotla, Nabra Hassanen,  
25 Harnish Patel. I believe that the families of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 these individuals who were murdered in the context  
2 of hate crime incidents in the last two years alone  
3 are quite clear, there's no hoax with respect to  
4 hate violence today. Thank you.

5 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you very much, Ms.  
6 Raghunathan. Ms. Garlick?

7 MS. GARLICK: Good morning, Chair Lhamon  
8 and members of the Commission. My name is Melissa  
9 Garlick. I'm the Civil Rights National Counsel at  
10 the Anti-Defamation League, ADL. I greatly  
11 appreciate the opportunity to testify this morning  
12 on behalf of the ADL on hate crimes and the federal  
13 government's role in responding to hate crimes.

14 For more than 30 years, this Commission  
15 and state advisory committees have done  
16 trailblazing work elevating the issue of hate crime  
17 and bias motivated violence, and we're grateful for  
18 your continued leadership and attention to this  
19 national problem.

20 Since 1913, ADL has been working to  
21 stop the defamation of the Jewish people and to  
22 secure justice and fair treatment for all.

23 We are proud of our longstanding work  
24 and leadership on effective responses to violent  
25 bigotry, including our annual audit on anti-Semitic

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 incidents in the country and drafting model hate  
2 crime laws for state legislatures. We are  
3 privileged to lead the broad coalition which worked  
4 in support of the 2009 Matthew Shepard and James  
5 Byrd, Jr. Hate Crimes Prevention Act.

6 We all in this society have a stake in  
7 effective response to violent bigotry. Hate crimes  
8 demand priority attention, as you've heard from our  
9 law enforcement partners, because of their unique  
10 impact on both victims and members of the victims'  
11 community, leaving them feeling fearful, isolated,  
12 and vulnerable.

13 Hate crimes damage the fabric of our  
14 society, they fragment communities, and they make  
15 members of minority communities suspicious of other  
16 groups and the power structure that is supposed to  
17 protect them. Hate crimes are a national problem,  
18 they are all of our problems.

19 Over the past few years, we've seen  
20 hate-filled language, memes, stereotyping, and  
21 scapegoating injected into the mainstream of  
22 America's political and policy debate, especially  
23 through traditional and social media. Over the  
24 course of the 2016 election, we saw a level in  
25 anti-Semitism and the normalization of bigotry that

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 deeply concerned us at ADL.

2 And now, we see the rhetoric which  
3 involves stereotyping and attacks based on national  
4 origin, religion, and physical appearance cemented  
5 into federal policies and executive actions that  
6 marginalize communities already vulnerable to hate  
7 crimes and deter these individuals from reporting  
8 such crimes to local police.

9 The federal administration policies and  
10 positions defending such actions, such as a tax on  
11 so-called sanctuary cities, the Muslim ban, the  
12 transgender military ban, they all raise legitimate  
13 fears in schools and communities across the  
14 country, encourage hate, and have created an  
15 environment in which victims are afraid to report  
16 crimes or come forward as witnesses, including  
17 crimes. The federal government has an essential  
18 leadership role to play in confronting crimes.

19 And thank you for bringing attention to  
20 the letter, which we attached to our testimony,  
21 which more than 80 civil rights organizations sent  
22 to acting Assistant Attorney General John Gore with  
23 recommendations for DOJ after the violence in  
24 Charlottesville to address hate crimes. And I'm  
25 glad to hear that a response is forthcoming today.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           We hope that the Commission will  
2 recommend the creation, as has been asked, of a  
3 federal inter-agency task force on fighting hate,  
4 and recognize the importance and need for federal  
5 agencies to call out bigotry at every opportunity.

6           At the same time, we see a rise in  
7 anti-Semitic incidents, hate crimes, and the  
8 emboldening of extremists. Our recent audit on  
9 anti-Semitic incidents shows that the number of  
10 incidents remained significantly higher in 2017,  
11 compared to 2016, with an increase of 57 percent.

12           Now, these incidents include both  
13 criminal and non-criminal acts of harassment, but  
14 they provide an important snapshot into trends of  
15 anti-Semitism in our society.

16           Similarly, the FBI also documented an  
17 increase in hate crimes. In their most recent  
18 report available, the FBI documented a five percent  
19 overall increase over the 2015 report.

20           Notably and disturbing, 21 percent of  
21 all reported hate crimes in 2016 were motivated by  
22 religious bias and crimes directed against Jews  
23 increased three percent, crimes directed against  
24 Muslims increased 19 percent, the second most  
25 reported against Muslims ever, second only to the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1       backlash after the 9/11 terrorist attacks.

2                   Ultimately, hate crime statistics do  
3       not speak for themselves, because behind every  
4       statistic is a victim injured or intimidated for no  
5       other reason than how they worship, who they love,  
6       and who they are.

7                   And these crimes remain seriously  
8       under-reported, partly because of mistrust of  
9       police in communities. Eighty-eight percent of  
10      participating police agencies that participate in  
11      hate crime reporting affirmatively reported zero  
12      hate crimes to the FBI last year or did not report  
13      any data to the FBI.

14                  There are significant consequences to  
15      this lack of comprehensive reporting of hate  
16      crimes. Victims are far more likely to report a  
17      hate crime if they believe that police are ready  
18      and able to respond effectively and take them  
19      seriously. We urge that the Commission recommend  
20      and support incentives for participation in the  
21      FBI's hate crime data collection program.

22                  Our ADL Center on Extremism is also  
23      tracking a resurgence in white supremacist activity  
24      in the United States. Extremists and anti-Semites  
25      are using technology in new ways to spread their

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 hate on college campuses and communities on- and  
2 off-line.

3 After the violence in Charlottesville,  
4 ADL partnered with the United States Conference of  
5 Mayors to promote the fundamental principles of  
6 justice and equality that define America in the  
7 Mayors Compact Against Hate.

8 Finally, the growing epidemic of cyber-  
9 harassment and stalking and the spread of hate  
10 online is something that we continue to monitor and  
11 draw attention to.

12 Just a few days ago, ADL released a new  
13 report analyzing anti-Semitic speech on Twitter and  
14 finding that at least 4.2 million anti-Semitic  
15 tweets were shared or re-shared in English on  
16 Twitter over the 12 month period ending January 28,  
17 2018. Again, not all of these are going to be  
18 criminal, but they provide an important snapshot  
19 into the state of hate right now.

20 We hope that the Commission will  
21 recommend that Congress confer with specialists in  
22 the field to identify new and Constitutionally  
23 sound ways for victims to achieve legal redress to  
24 cyber-harassment and stalking, and that law  
25 enforcement receive training, not only in hate

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 crimes, but also in this context, so that they are  
2 better equipped to better handle such incidents.

3 We attached specific and detailed  
4 recommendations for the Commission and hope they're  
5 constructive, but note that law is a blunt  
6 instrument to confront violent bigotry. It is much  
7 more important to prevent these crimes in the first  
8 place.

9 So, we also urge the Commission to look  
10 at recommending comprehensive federal and state  
11 anti-bias education, hate crime prevention, and  
12 anti-bullying initiatives to complement anything  
13 that we do to achieve effective response to hate  
14 violence as well.

15 There are no quick complete solutions  
16 to these problems, we're in it for the long haul  
17 and we look forward to working with the Commission  
18 to achieve as much of these recommendations as  
19 possible. Thank you.

20 CHAIR LHAMON: Thanks very much, Ms.  
21 Garlick. Ms. Jorwic?

22 MS. JORWIC: Good morning. My name is  
23 Nicole Jorwic and I am the Director of Rights  
24 Policy for The Arc of the United States. I  
25 appreciate the opportunity to present in front of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 you today and The Arc values the continued work and  
2 engagement of the Commission when it comes to the  
3 civil rights of individuals with disabilities.

4 The Arc is the largest national  
5 community-based organization advocating for people  
6 with intellectual and development disabilities, or  
7 IDD, and their families. The Arc also runs the  
8 National Center for Criminal Justice and  
9 Disability, or NCCJD.

10 The Arc was founded over 65 years ago  
11 on the guiding principle that all people with  
12 disabilities belong in the community and have  
13 fundamental moral, civil, and the Constitutional  
14 right to be there and fully included and actively  
15 participate in all aspects of society.

16 This includes the criminal justice  
17 system. However, the criminal justice system is  
18 the slowest to adequately respond to the special  
19 circumstances of people with disabilities. I  
20 believe it was Ruth Luckasson, an expert in the  
21 field, who referred to the criminal justice system  
22 as the last frontier for people with disabilities  
23 when it came to inclusion.

24 This is one reason why the disability  
25 community was relieved after the efforts

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 spearheaded by the National Disability Rights  
2 Network, that the Matthew Shepard and James Byrd,  
3 Jr. Hate Crimes Prevention Act of 2009 expanded the  
4 role of the FBI to allow for the investigation of  
5 hate crimes committed against those based on biases  
6 related to disability.

7 This is a necessary role for the  
8 federal government to lead by example in  
9 documenting and enforcing these laws for the  
10 disability community after being seen as less-than  
11 in society.

12 More does need to be done, though, to  
13 ensure that we are fully capturing the scope of  
14 these cases and supporting individuals with  
15 disabilities to report and be active participants  
16 in prosecution. The current laws are not enough.

17 There are many reasons why offenses  
18 against people with disabilities go unreported. A  
19 key factor is lack of understanding of  
20 stakeholders. Often, individuals with  
21 disabilities, their family members, allies, don't  
22 know what constitutes a hate crime and there is  
23 little outreach about this topic to the disability  
24 community specifically.

25 Most hate crime related outreach

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 focuses on other populations, as it should, but  
2 more resources must be provided to all parts of the  
3 disability community as well.

4 Without that knowledge, reporting will  
5 continue to be lower, despite the actual incidence  
6 not necessarily being less. This outreach must be  
7 cross-disability, reach under-served communities,  
8 and accessible to all.

9 We know that across the country many  
10 victim assistance organizations, local police  
11 departments, health systems, and other providers  
12 are not trained on how to assist victims with  
13 disabilities or know what kind of accommodations  
14 they are required to provide victims with  
15 disabilities under the Americans with Disabilities  
16 Act.

17 Untrained law enforcement officers  
18 often believe incorrectly that victims with  
19 disabilities lack credibility and in addition, the  
20 police themselves lack standardized protocols for  
21 handling complaints by victims with disabilities  
22 leading to ineffective assistance and cases that  
23 often go unreported and uninvestigated.

24 Prosecuting these cases can be  
25 difficult due to the lack of training among court

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 officials, attorneys, and judges on how to assist  
2 individuals with disabilities as victims or  
3 witnesses to hate crimes based on disability bias.

4 Unfortunately, we have seen that if a  
5 victim of a hate crime has a disability, the case  
6 is often minimized. Cases of abuse and torture can  
7 sometimes be categorized as pranks or bullying,  
8 instead of calling them what they are, hate crimes.

9 We must work to change this  
10 mischaracterization, because too often, disabled  
11 lives are devalued and we know that disabled people  
12 are more than twice as likely to be victims of  
13 violent crime overall, but these cases are often  
14 lumped together as abuse instead of considered a  
15 hate crime.

16 And even when deemed abuse, it often  
17 goes un- or under-investigated and not properly  
18 prosecuted in the criminal justice system. This,  
19 of course, is only for incidents that are reported  
20 in the first place, and even reporting is something  
21 that is difficult for people with disabilities.

22 A factor in this under-reporting in  
23 this disability hate crime is that many people with  
24 disabilities know the person who harasses or abuses  
25 them, which is not a common feature in other hate

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 crimes.

2 Clearly, when you know someone, it can  
3 be difficult to report an incident, as you may be  
4 more afraid of the consequence and not have  
5 anywhere to turn for support.

6 This is just one reason why it is  
7 imperative that law enforcement continue to make  
8 efforts to improve their identification and  
9 reporting of hate crime offenses and to continue to  
10 support more people to come forward to report these  
11 crimes.

12 Legally, disability-related hate crimes  
13 can only be prosecuted on the federal level if it  
14 is interstate and individual states vary in their  
15 state-based hate crime laws.

16 It is imperative that the federal  
17 government continues to lead by example to make  
18 progress in reporting, prosecuting, and preventing  
19 hate crimes, and to be a resource to states as they  
20 expand their hate crime statutes to include  
21 protections for people with disabilities and better  
22 reporting at the local, state, and federal level.

23 A key part of reporting is data  
24 collection. In late 2016, the FBI's Uniform  
25 Reporting Program released data indicating that

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 there were 88 reported hate crime offenses during  
2 2015 related to disability bias.

3 This was down from 95 the previous  
4 year. The decline in disability-related cases  
5 comes as the FBI indicated that the total number of  
6 hate crimes rose. Again, it is very clear that is  
7 due to mis- or under-reporting.

8 Overall, the agency documented 5,850  
9 incidents last year, as has been discussed. Among  
10 those hate crime victims, 1.2 percent were people  
11 with disabilities. We know from the data that hate  
12 crimes against people with disabilities are  
13 critically under-reported and have discussed the  
14 challenges to reporting this type of hate crime,  
15 notably, the victim's potential isolation or  
16 proximity to the perpetrator, the fear that their  
17 claim will not be taken seriously, and the risk  
18 that law enforcement officers will not recognize  
19 the severity of this type of hate crime.

20 Access to the justice system remains a  
21 critical challenge. The Arc urges and challenges  
22 the federal government and the U.S. Commission on  
23 Civil Rights to play a central role in ensuring  
24 better access to these prosecutions for people with  
25 disabilities, from the initial assessment of the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 victim's needs to support mechanisms for victims  
2 through the governmental or non-governmental  
3 institutions.

4 Developing an effective police response  
5 is something that the Arc's National Center for  
6 Criminal Justice and Disability focuses on. To  
7 counter these crimes is dependent on collecting  
8 reliable data.

9 As states, the general public, and  
10 individuals with disabilities and their families  
11 recognize hate crimes against people with  
12 disabilities and their impacts increase awareness,  
13 better reporting by victims and data collection  
14 will help reveal the full magnitude of the problem  
15 and enable policymakers to identify the appropriate  
16 responses.

17 The Arc of the United States looks  
18 forward to being a partner to improve the  
19 enforcement of hate crimes against people with  
20 disabilities. Thank you.

21 CHAIR LHAMON: Thanks very much, Ms.  
22 Jorwic. Ms. Prescott?

23 MS. PRESCOTT: Good morning. My name is  
24 Katherine Prescott. Thank you for inviting me to  
25 be here today as part of this briefing on an issue

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 of great urgency. It's truly an honor to be here.

2 Author Margaret J. Wheatley wrote, you  
3 can't hate someone whose story you know, and I  
4 agree. So, let us make it our responsibility to  
5 know the stories of those around us and make it our  
6 mission to hear one another and share our stories.

7 The story I am here to share with you  
8 today is unique and individual, but it's also a  
9 story that has much in common with the thousands of  
10 stories that continue to play out all across our  
11 nation.

12 In sharing my story, my son's story, I  
13 hope to give voice to the thousands of other youth  
14 who have suffered and continue to suffer, kids who  
15 need and demand our support and protection.

16 My son Kyler was a musician, a writer,  
17 and an artist. He had a beautiful spirit full of  
18 love and compassion for all living things. Kyler  
19 was also transgender and he bravely tried to be his  
20 authentic self in a society that is intolerant of  
21 gender nonconformity.

22 Kyler came out as trans when he was 13  
23 years old. Signs of personal struggle had appeared  
24 a few years earlier, but it was at 13 that Kyler  
25 found the courage to declare that his gender

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 identity, his sense of self did not conform with  
2 the body he was born with.

3 For those of us who have not  
4 experienced gender dysphoria, we can only imagine  
5 how this would feel. Anyone who has not personally  
6 gone through this struggle, the emotional,  
7 psychological, and biological toll that it brings,  
8 should not pass judgment or pretend to understand  
9 what this would be like.

10 But I can tell you that when your own  
11 child, whom you love more than life itself, tells  
12 you that he can't stand to change his clothes or  
13 look in the mirror, you listen.

14 Our family supported Kyler in his  
15 transition. He began the process of social  
16 transition and received appropriate medical care.  
17 We took the legal steps needed to change Kyler's  
18 name and gender, and separately, we applied for a  
19 new birth certificate based on these legal steps.

20 However, while we could affirm and  
21 support our child in the safety of our home, it was  
22 not so easy in the public sphere. School, in  
23 particular, became a particularly menacing place.

24 Kyler had always loved school and he  
25 was a phenomenally gifted student. Once he

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 transitioned, however, school became a place where  
2 Kyler felt unwelcome, misunderstood, and  
3 ostracized.

4 While it was most comfortable to  
5 imagine that this was because of intolerant young  
6 peers, in truth, his difficulties stemmed more from  
7 teachers and administrators than they did from  
8 other students. School records continued to  
9 announce his old name and gender, even after he had  
10 received a legal name and gender change.

11 Teachers continued to call him she in  
12 front of other students, thus exposing his trans  
13 status in front of students who otherwise would not  
14 have known. Administrators tried to force him to  
15 use the girls' bathroom.

16 Imagine being a child and being called  
17 out every day at school by the wrong name and  
18 having teachers use the wrong pronouns repeatedly.  
19 Imagine being humiliated every day because the  
20 school willfully refused to do what it was required  
21 to do.

22 The classroom, which had always been a  
23 place where Kyler could shine as a brilliant  
24 student, became a hostile environment. Over time,  
25 we came to the decision that Kyler had to leave

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 school and do independent study instead.

2 And while this may seem like a solution  
3 to some, for Kyler it felt like exile. He felt  
4 displaced, unwelcome, and rejected. He was given  
5 the unspoken message that his identity was  
6 unacceptable, that he was a freak who did not  
7 belong with other children.

8 Kyler struggled mightily to be accepted  
9 and understood, but on May 18, 2015, just a few  
10 weeks shy of his 15th birthday and almost three  
11 years ago today, Kyler took his own life. And in  
12 so doing, he took a part of me with him. His new  
13 birth certificate with his new name and gender  
14 change arrived three days after his death.

15 This country guarantees a free  
16 education to all of its children. It guarantees to  
17 protect its citizens from discrimination.

18 Federal courts have held that  
19 transgender students like Kyler, who are entitled  
20 to protection under federal law, and many schools  
21 live up to those obligations without fanfare and  
22 without problems, but Kyler, like so many other  
23 youth, was tortured because his school failed in  
24 its obligation to protect and serve all students.

25 Schools are ground zero for prevention

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 of bias related incidents. They are public  
2 institutions where, as a government and as a  
3 society, we guarantee a safe environment for our  
4 children.

5 I stand before you as witness to our  
6 collective failure to live up to these promises.  
7 Kyler's experience is just one among thousands of  
8 youth who are made to feel that they do not belong  
9 in our classrooms.

10 And if a child does not feel welcome at  
11 school, how can we say that we have guaranteed that  
12 child's education? How can a child learn in an  
13 environment where he or she does not feel safe,  
14 affirmed, and respected? How can we be satisfied  
15 with any level of harassment, bias, or hatefulness  
16 in our schools?

17 This is not an issue that applies only  
18 to transgender youth. It applies to all the  
19 children who feel ostracized based on any aspect of  
20 their identity, whether it's race, religion,  
21 national origin, ethnicity, disability, gender  
22 identity, or sexual orientation.

23 Schools where bias is expressed by  
24 adults are places where students learn to reject  
25 and hate their peers. As adults, perhaps no other

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 responsibility is more sacred than the  
2 responsibility to provide to our children a safe,  
3 supportive environment where they can learn,  
4 develop, and reach their full potential.

5 History has shown us time and time  
6 again that hoping for and expecting the best out of  
7 people is not enough when it comes to bias, hate,  
8 and civil rights. We know that the government can  
9 and does play an essential role in ensuring the  
10 freedoms, rights, and dignity of all people.

11 Indeed, over the past decade, we have  
12 seen what improvements are possible when the  
13 federal government acts to end bias and hate, not  
14 just through criminal law, but also through  
15 proactive efforts to alert schools to our  
16 obligations and to show them how to live up to  
17 them.

18 Over the past decade, years of focused  
19 federal action led to a decrease in bullying in our  
20 schools, including the bullying and discrimination  
21 experienced by LGBT students. It can be done.

22 Federal action matters. When a school  
23 or community or state is failing to live up to our  
24 shared promise of justice and equality, it is  
25 incumbent upon the federal government to do all

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that it can to right the course.

2 We have the ability to prevent acts of  
3 hate and bias related incidents in our schools,  
4 whether among children or perpetrated by adults.  
5 Kyler was vulnerable and he was wounded by the bias  
6 of his school administrators and other students.

7 If Kyler had been accepted and embraced  
8 at school, he might still be here today. However,  
9 since he cannot be here, I stand in his place to  
10 ask that we all come together to create and enforce  
11 the federal policies, rules, and procedures to  
12 ensure that all of our children, our friends and  
13 colleagues are given the respect, honor, and  
14 appreciation they deserve to protect the most  
15 vulnerable among us from hate.

16 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you, Ms. Prescott.  
17 Ms. Bro, we'll go to you next.

18 MS. BRO: Hi, my name is Susan Bro. My  
19 daughter, Heather Heyer, was standing with her  
20 friends on August 12 in Charlottesville.

21 The crowd that she was with were  
22 getting reports from other people who were watching  
23 on the news to let them know where the violence  
24 was, so that they could deliberately stay away from  
25 the violence.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           They carried no weapons with them, they  
2           only had signs.    The four friends, she and her  
3           three friends, didn't even have signs, she simply  
4           had her keys, her phone, and her billfold in her  
5           pockets.

6           A young man who believed the lies of  
7           hate that he had been fed on the internet and who  
8           believed the lies of hate that he had been fed by a  
9           number of other people in his life chose to drive  
10          his car into the crowd.

11          The evidence that I've seen in his  
12          preliminary hearing indicated that he pulled  
13          forward towards the crowd, stopped, backed up, sat  
14          for a second, and then gunned it into the crowd.

15          My daughter was crushed between two  
16          cars.   All the doctors would tell me was that her  
17          heart had stopped.   I found out later from the  
18          medical report and from photographs that I have on  
19          my phone that the cause of death was actually blunt  
20          force trauma to the abdomen.

21          Money poured in from around the world  
22          for the family and even when we closed the GoFundMe  
23          at \$220,000, money continued to pour in.   So, nine  
24          days within my daughter's death, we filed the IRS  
25          paperwork to form a 501(c)(3), which is the Heather

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 Heyer Foundation.

2 Our first goal, because it is -- having  
3 been an educator for a number of years was, well,  
4 we can give out scholarships, I don't know what  
5 else to do. I was still kind of in shock at that  
6 time, obviously.

7 So, we set a goal to give a scholarship  
8 at Charlottesville High School, as well as William  
9 Monroe High School, where Heather had attended. In  
10 addition, we're giving a third scholarship this  
11 year.

12 Because of technicality, we forgot to  
13 say that we were only doing those two high schools  
14 and so, other people applied, and so, we said,  
15 okay, we'll do a miscellaneous scholarship. Our  
16 goal is to expand the number of high school  
17 scholarships we give.

18 And we still didn't feel like that was  
19 enough, so we are also launching, this August, a  
20 program called Higher Voices, which will have  
21 teachers trained as facilitators in schools to  
22 allow youth to run their own programs.

23 And the youth that we have talked to  
24 around the country are very eager and excited about  
25 it and very disappointed that we're not ready to

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 launch this nationally yet.

2 But we're trying to start it out with a  
3 summer camp program first in Waynesboro, Virginia,  
4 and then, we will move it into the Albermarle  
5 County School District. I have a teacher there  
6 who's willing to work with me, we'll work out a few  
7 of the kinks and then try to roll it out in a more  
8 controlled manner.

9 The third year, I'm looking at perhaps  
10 launching a, at least a public access to begin  
11 with, television show where people have a chance to  
12 speak on TV and explain their situation, because so  
13 often, people of diversity, people of color, people  
14 of disability, people of gender identity issues  
15 don't get a chance to express themselves.

16 So, if they're brave enough to be seen  
17 on TV, because it is risky in this current climate,  
18 unfortunately, if they're brave enough to come on  
19 TV, we will let them share their story and share  
20 some of how they feel as a member of the community,  
21 positive and negative.

22 Our goal is to move social justice  
23 forward in a positive, affirming, nonviolent  
24 method. That is continually our focus and our  
25 work.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           This past year, we worked in  
2 conjunction with the AIDS Healthcare Foundation and  
3 they approached us, apparently they do a lot of  
4 work outside of just AIDS work and they had a  
5 program called Stand Against Hate.

6           And we put an essay contest out around  
7 the country, we got in 18 essays, because there was  
8 only about a three week period there that people  
9 knew about it. And the top three winners of that  
10 have a chance to ride in the Rose Bowl Parade with  
11 us.

12           And we gave out, with the AIDS  
13 Healthcare Foundation, a \$5,000 scholarship, I  
14 think -- there was at least three \$5,000  
15 scholarships and then, two \$1,000 scholarships.

16           So, we're trying to move things forward  
17 from Heather's death. I say, I got some very  
18 bitter lemons there and we're trying to make some  
19 very good lemonade from this.

20           CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you, Ms. Bro.

21           MS. BRO: Thank you.

22           CHAIR LHAMON: Mr. Fletcher?

23           MR. FLETCHER: My name is Micah  
24 Fletcher. May 26, 2017, I and two other  
25 individuals were assaulted on a commuter train

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 heading towards Clackamas. The other two people's  
2 names were Taliesin Meche and Ricky Best.

3 I was the only person that survived  
4 this assault, and I'm immensely nervous today  
5 because the unfortunate fact of the matter, as far  
6 as I'm concerned, is that it is my responsibility  
7 to hold onto the legacy of what occurred that day.  
8 And the burden of that is not lost on me.

9 I want to tell you first about who the  
10 two men were. Taliesin, despite all accounts,  
11 though a very bright, vivacious, and happy young  
12 man, was also kind of a troublemaker according to  
13 his younger sister, in the most playful of ways.  
14 He was always the kind of person that had to get  
15 the last word in and he always wanted to make sure  
16 that his wit was heard.

17 Ricky Best was more than just a patriot  
18 and a veteran, he was a father of multiple  
19 children. And he was a good man. And I was just  
20 some kid on the MAX trying to get to work after  
21 getting off of school.

22 I apologize, I don't feel quite  
23 qualified to be sitting in this chair and I really  
24 do appreciate the time of the Committee today.  
25 Typically, I'm better at these sorts of things.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           The gentleman in question, Jeremy  
2 Christian, was a man suffering from severe mental  
3 illness, as well as alcoholism.

4           From what I've seen from the police  
5 reports, it has been seen on video record that he  
6 was pounding sangria from what is considered a wine  
7 bag, essentially, either during or before entering  
8 the train, I cannot remember exactly what the  
9 report said. And was known not only for having  
10 multiple incidences of arrests, but also for  
11 multiple incidences of mental and health.

12           Now, why this is important is because  
13 many times nowadays, what you will see with these  
14 incidences of what are considered hate crimes is  
15 that the perpetrators are mentally unwell and, as  
16 somebody who's mental health is not the best, I can  
17 understand how that would cause trouble.

18           I'm here today to talk about the fact  
19 that I do not believe that pursuing hate crimes is  
20 going to be an effective methodology for dealing  
21 with this problem.

22           Though the federal government may need  
23 to get involved, I do not believe that allocating  
24 even more resources to police departments all over  
25 across America that are already understaffed and

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 overwhelmed with the amount of crime occurring in  
2 their cities and trying to deal with their cities'  
3 problems is the answer.

4 I believe that police and federal  
5 organizations are already far stretched too thin  
6 and that the best course of action would be to  
7 institute methodologies of youth intervention, so  
8 that youth are able to have a wider range of  
9 experiences to different kinds of people.

10 I took part, for instance, in a program  
11 called Caldera, which was an all-year program,  
12 after school program, that allowed children access  
13 to multiple different art disciplines taught by  
14 various professionals. It also put us in the same  
15 room as people from all over Oregon once a year for  
16 seven days.

17 People from parts of Eastern Oregon,  
18 which would be considered mainly red, people from  
19 Portland, which is considered mainly blue, would  
20 come together and be forced to work together as a  
21 unit and get to know each other as a unit via  
22 mentorship and arts projects.

23 Now, does it necessarily need to be an  
24 arts-based program? No. But I believe that at a  
25 fundamental level, the only way we're going to be

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 able to deal with hatred in America is by making  
2 sure that we understand each other, making sure the  
3 communities talk.

4 And unfortunately, there comes to a  
5 point at a certain age where you cannot force  
6 people to listen any more, but our most pliable  
7 asset is our children.

8 I have been lucky enough to be raised  
9 mainly by people that did not look like me. I'm  
10 not going to sit here and pretend that this is an  
11 intellectual debate.

12 Quite frankly, I could give a damn less  
13 about politics. This matters to me because most of  
14 the people that allowed me to be a semi-functioning  
15 human being today don't look like me. That's it.

16 I have a vested interest in this and I  
17 have no interest in pretending that this is a  
18 matter of morality to me, these are my loved ones  
19 that are being threatened to some extent by the  
20 four, at minimum, known hate groups that exist near  
21 and around my city.

22 Those groups being American Front,  
23 European Kindred, Volksfront, and another, which I  
24 cannot remember the name of, and those are just the  
25 major players that we know of today.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1                   Now, the only way to combat this is on  
2 a communal level. And in a short minute, I hope to  
3 explain that.

4                   Essentially, I would like to talk about  
5 instituting funding for schools and helping them  
6 create programing that allows children from  
7 different parts of America, different backgrounds,  
8 and different cultures to be able to spend time,  
9 bond, and get to know one another in an effort to  
10 create more unity amongst communities.

11                   I'm not sure whether me, Taliesin, and  
12 Ricky were heroes, but we were trying to do the  
13 right thing. Thank you for your time.

14                   CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you very much.  
15 Thank you to each of the panelists, and I will now  
16 open up this panel for questions from my fellow  
17 Commissioners. To start us off, if each of you  
18 could speak to the ways that hate incidents affect  
19 an entire community, not only the individuals  
20 directly impacted, we would benefit from that.

21                   MS. RAGHUNATHAN: I'm happy to begin. I  
22 think that the wave of violence and of fear and  
23 intimidation that our communities are currently  
24 experiencing is felt throughout the fabric of a  
25 community.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1           When you have houses of worship that  
2           are being targeted with fire-bombing attacks or  
3           with arson or graffiti, that has an impact on a  
4           place of refuge or a place that is intended to be a  
5           place of refuge for a whole community.

6           Particularly for immigrant communities,  
7           these houses of worship and community centers are  
8           fundamental to really providing a sense of welcome  
9           and refuge in this country.

10          Similarly, I will also note that the  
11          two most prevalent targets of hate violence that we  
12          have documented in our reports are women wearing  
13          hijabs and youth. And those two individuals are  
14          really the anchor of so many of our communities and  
15          families. Youth were assaulted not only, or were  
16          targeted not only in their schools, but on the  
17          streets.

18          And so, the impact that that has on a  
19          community, which, as I mentioned, is incredibly  
20          diverse racial, religiously, socioeconomically, is  
21          deep and fundamental.

22          And the impact ultimately on our  
23          communities is really questioning the understanding  
24          or the belief that our very communities have a  
25          place in this country. And I perhaps cannot even

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 begin to characterize it in words the impact that  
2 that has on a community, or a huge swath of our  
3 communities in the U.S.

4 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you.

5 MS. GARLICK: I'll just add briefly to  
6 that, all of which I strongly agree, that hate  
7 crimes, as we describe them, are unique crimes  
8 because of both their special impact on a victim,  
9 but also the community.

10 And the only thing that I would add is  
11 that hate crimes, everybody in the community that  
12 identifies themselves with the victim, or the  
13 broader community as we've seen play out on the  
14 national scale and the local community scale as  
15 hate incidents are occurring more frequently, they  
16 have the potential to cause an isolated incident to  
17 explode into widespread community tension if  
18 they're not handled correctly.

19 So, when we talk about hate crimes, we  
20 talk about the fact that they can't just be  
21 measured in terms of dollars or cents, but they  
22 make -- and they're intended to make the targeted  
23 communities feel isolated, feel intimidated, and  
24 feel suspicious of other groups.

25 They're intended to divide. And so, if

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 law enforcement are not trained or if elected  
2 officials or if community leaders are not  
3 effectively preventing and responding to those hate  
4 crimes when they occur, it can cause that isolated  
5 hate crime to explode more widely into more  
6 community tension as a result.

7 MS. JORWIC: I sit here as a  
8 professional, but I also sit here as a sister of my  
9 brother Chris, who has autism, and my other brother  
10 Luke, who happens to be a gay man. So, on a  
11 personal level, the hate I have seen in different  
12 experiences can be suffocating.

13 And I know that the history of the  
14 disability rights movement and the disability  
15 community, people were warehoused in institutions  
16 because so often, not the families themselves, but  
17 individuals with disabilities were seen as less  
18 than human.

19 And I think that the -- when we see  
20 that the under-reporting and the not frequent  
21 enough appropriate characterizations of hate crimes  
22 against people with disabilities as hate crimes,  
23 not as pranks, not as things like that, then it  
24 shows that that fear continues to escalate.

25 And it keeps people behind closed

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 doors, and that's where dangerous things happen.  
2 It isolates people. It makes families, families  
3 like my own family, feel that individuals with  
4 disabilities may be better off if they're all  
5 together somewhere, because maybe they're safe.

6 And that's the wrong message. And  
7 that's the importance of prosecuting hate crimes  
8 and looking and really seeing the humanity of  
9 everyone else. That's one of the many wonderful  
10 things that Micah said, that I think we really have  
11 to do more to see the humanity of others.

12 And I think prosecuting and looking --  
13 words matter, calling a hate crime a hate crime,  
14 that's how we begin to come together and see the  
15 humanity of everyone, no matter what their  
16 background is.

17 MS. PRESCOTT: Yes. So, to speak  
18 specifically of the transgender community, the risk  
19 of suicide and murder among that community is  
20 extremely high, such that the life expectancy of a  
21 transgender individual is extremely reduced by  
22 many, many, many years.

23 I cannot express, I don't have the  
24 statistics off the top of my head, but the risk of  
25 suicide and murder, the murder rate of transgender

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 individuals is horrifying. And yet, I don't want  
2 to say that I'm speaking only of this group, I'm  
3 speaking of all groups that are being targeted by  
4 hate and bias.

5 So, it matters to have federal  
6 guidance, to prevent these attitudes in the  
7 beginning. So, I had the opportunity to meet with  
8 the Obama administration about six months after my  
9 son's death, and we discussed what schools could do  
10 to better serve, in particular, what I discussed  
11 was transgender, in our schools.

12 And the Obama administration had put  
13 guidelines in place to help schools understand what  
14 their responsibilities are. And I think this was  
15 incredibly critical and it immediately had  
16 beneficial effects to transgender students across  
17 the nation.

18 Many schools suddenly understood what  
19 their responsibilities were simply because there  
20 were federal guidelines in place. It wasn't even a  
21 new law, it was as simple as putting in guidelines.

22 And I am devastated to say that one of  
23 the very first actions of our new administration,  
24 within a couple of weeks of coming into the office,  
25 the Trump administration rescinded those

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 guidelines, took away those basic recommendations  
2 of how to best protect those students in our  
3 schools.

4 And immediately, the situation for  
5 transgender students in our schools across the  
6 nation deteriorated rapidly. Therefore, I just  
7 want to reiterate the importance it is to have  
8 basic federal guidelines established about what is  
9 expected of our administrators.

10 And I don't just mean in schools, but  
11 that's in particular what my experience speaks to.  
12 It matters, it absolutely matters, and it made a  
13 difference.

14 And why the current administration  
15 chose to take away basic guidelines of protection  
16 for those among us who are most vulnerable, a  
17 student body that's at an extremely high risk of  
18 suicide, I will never understand. Thank you.

19 MS. BRO: Micah has indicated I should  
20 go next. I addressed my situation, I did not talk  
21 about Charlottesville's reality now.  
22 Charlottesville was a case of a community-wide  
23 attack.

24 The statues were brought to the  
25 forefront by a high schooler who requested in a

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 petition that they be removed due to them being  
2 brought to the community during the time of Jim  
3 Crow laws, into the prominent black neighborhoods.

4 So, this became a focal point for the  
5 white supremacist groups from around the country  
6 and the word went out over the internet that a  
7 gathering was to happen. So, players from 35  
8 states came.

9 They got off the buses with shields,  
10 they got off the buses with assault rifles, they  
11 got off the buses with their fists wrapped, they  
12 were ready to fight and they planned to fight.  
13 That sort of violence leaves a scar.

14 Due to previous incidents, when the KKK  
15 came to town and the police and the local  
16 population had issues, the police chose, for a  
17 number of reasons, to step back. Their hands were  
18 tied in some ways, when a state of emergency was  
19 called and state troops were called in.

20 I've talked with both the police and  
21 local citizenry and there's a great deal of  
22 mistrust on both sides, a great deal of pain on  
23 both sides. Any outside help that comes in right  
24 now is viewed as unwelcome, not helpful, and very  
25 bitterly received.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           So, I'm here to tell you that the hate  
2 crimes not only affect individuals in pain, but  
3 they can draw tremendous impacts for the  
4 community's health as well.

5           I spoke with the pastor from Ferguson,  
6 Missouri just a couple of weeks ago and he said  
7 that in Ferguson, four years later, they're still  
8 having a great deal of pain.

9           So, it's not that hate crimes only  
10 affect individuals, they have tremendous impacts on  
11 communities and decision making policies and in  
12 just so many ways. It's just an ever-spreading  
13 effect.

14           CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you. Commissioner  
15 Yaki, I think you had a question?

16           COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes. Going back to  
17 a statement made by, I think the official from the  
18 Justice Department, who said that he did not  
19 believe that you could exculpate anyone who  
20 committed a hate crime simply because there was a  
21 climate or an atmosphere of hate speech in there.

22           And I think that's right, but I also  
23 believe that we have an issue here, more than any  
24 other time in our country, of the acceptance of  
25 hate speech in the atmosphere, being part of a new

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 normal, which cannot be a new normal for this  
2 country.

3           What is -- I'd like to get your  
4 reaction to this, but what is fascinating, not  
5 fascinating, I shouldn't say that, what is  
6 extremely disturbing to me is that I read earlier a  
7 series of statements made by the President, and I  
8 won't go into them again, but then, the corollary  
9 that follows is you have a number of incidents that  
10 have been reported by the press and they all follow  
11 a very similar pattern, whether you are gay,  
12 whether you are Jewish, whether you are Latino,  
13 whether you are African American, where the name of  
14 the President becomes a punctuation mark to the,  
15 we're going to get rid of you, and then they  
16 mention the President's name, or the President is  
17 going to get rid of you.

18           This is -- the title of this briefing  
19 is In the Name of Hate, but when hate is being  
20 spewed in the name of Trump, that's something that  
21 is extremely troubling to me.

22           Micah, I was really moved by what you  
23 said and I think what I want to get at from panel  
24 here is, is this something that just tracking hate  
25 crimes is going to be enough?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           It seems like we need to do more in  
2 terms of the kinds of bridge building, the  
3 interconnections between people, the things that  
4 bind us as a nation together, that is not being  
5 said, is not being done, is not being exalted as it  
6 should be.

7           And all of you have views on this and I  
8 would just very quickly love to hear what you have  
9 to say about it and where you think we can be part  
10 of that. And I see Micah would like to go first  
11 and I will give you the honor.

12           MR. FLETCHER: Thank you. A lot of my  
13 fear comes from the fact that so much of this is  
14 tied up in politics and the morality behind it. So  
15 very often, we paint issues into a matter of,  
16 pardon the pun, but black and white. And I don't  
17 mean racially speaking necessarily, I mean in  
18 extremes. I'm sorry.

19           MS. RAGHUNATHAN: Perhaps I can jump in.  
20 I can't underestimate, and I think it's critical  
21 for us to note that the current normalization of  
22 hate speech and divisive rhetoric that is coming  
23 from the administration, and in particular from the  
24 White House, has been buttressed by a raft of  
25 policies that operationalize that climate of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 division and that single out particular  
2 communities, either before they enter the U.S. or  
3 upon their arrival in the U.S., for disparate  
4 treatment.

5 The list is very long, from the  
6 rescission of DACA, to specify only seven largely  
7 Muslim Arab nations as fountains of extremism and  
8 as threats to the U.S., to the decision on the part  
9 of Attorney General Sessions and the Department of  
10 Justice to penalize, and indeed target, states that  
11 have chosen to protect their immigrant residents,  
12 to the targeting of the movement for Black Lives  
13 Matter activists.

14 I think that the list goes on and on  
15 and on with respect to the statements that are  
16 emanating from the White House being implemented or  
17 sought to be implemented by the actual policies  
18 that are far more lasting, in my opinion, from the  
19 current administration that continue to have a real  
20 impact on our communities.

21 The day after the Muslim ban was  
22 announced, we had a huge spike in hate violence  
23 incidents targeting our communities. And  
24 certainly, the cast of the wide net of violence was  
25 not limited to Muslim, Arab, Sikh, Hindu, and South

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Asian communities, right?

2 The idea that it was open season,  
3 frankly, on most of the communities and survivors  
4 represented at this table cannot be underestimated,  
5 and it certainly has not ebbed.

6 MS. GARLICK: So, I'll just add, the  
7 federal government, in my opinion, has an essential  
8 leadership role to play in confronting hate crimes.

9 And I've said this a couple of times,  
10 but it can't do so effectively if it's scapegoating  
11 Muslims, refugees, and other marginalized  
12 communities, both through rhetoric and through  
13 policies that were mentioned.

14 Simply put, the well-documented  
15 reluctance to addressing the rise in anti-Semitism,  
16 Islamophobia by the administration and hate, has  
17 helped to create this environment in which  
18 extremists have felt emboldened.

19 And that's what we have seen and what  
20 we've tracked with respect to the resurgence of  
21 white supremacy and white supremacists, but also  
22 the unprecedented outreach efforts that they're  
23 suddenly engaged in on places like college  
24 campuses, which were relatively low in number until  
25 late 2016.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           We also see a clear spike from our  
2 reports on incidents in anti-Semitic incidents that  
3 we track in the first quarter of 2017, for  
4 instance, and also immediately after  
5 Charlottesville, a spike in anti-Semitic incidents.

6           So, as Suman noted, sort of in response  
7 to these incidents in rhetoric and policies, we do  
8 see spikes in incidents. Thank you.

9           MS. JORWIC: I think that the inundation  
10 that we get on a daily basis of hateful language  
11 from all aspects of society, including the  
12 administration, has a threat to desensitize all of  
13 us, which is why we must be steadfast in  
14 documenting, prosecuting, and reporting hate  
15 crimes.

16           However, we do need to be -- more needs  
17 to be done, so that more voices are valued and  
18 heard and that we can move from stunned and  
19 overwhelmed silence, because it's all so much, to  
20 action.

21           I think the way that we tried -- a way  
22 that The Arc tried to do that in the past year, as  
23 Director of Rights Policy, I also cover Medicaid,  
24 and for example, there's video that's widely spread  
25 of then-candidate Trump mocking a reporter with a

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 disability.

2           And that's terrible and yes, but we  
3 need to move -- we took that and said, okay, well  
4 then, what do we need to do to engage Congress?  
5 What do we need to do to engage the general public?  
6 Because that's what we see as the disability  
7 community in general.

8           It's not the 1980s, when Geraldo Rivera  
9 did his big expose on institutions, hey, those are  
10 still open. We need to be able to do more, as all  
11 communities that are under-served and under-  
12 represented need to do more, but we can't just get  
13 stuck in outrage, we have to shift that to action.

14           MS. BRO: I think in my own hometown,  
15 which is not Charlottesville, not hometown, but  
16 where I've lived the last 25 years or so, when the  
17 sheriff there offered four years ago a class on the  
18 Muslim threat, and would not allow for anyone who  
19 was pro-Muslim to even participate in the classes,  
20 and my daughter and he had quite the verbal battle  
21 on social media about that.

22           So, I think that we have to remember  
23 that, although the current administration is  
24 definitely adding to the problem, the problem  
25 existed prior to the current administration.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1                   And dealing with the public and  
2                   educating the public, allowing people to have a  
3                   broader understanding of who everyone is and get to  
4                   know more people outside their own little social  
5                   sphere. But it is difficult when those in charge,  
6                   as sheriffs or the President or anyone else, fans  
7                   that rhetoric.

8                   But we have to remember that the  
9                   current administration is in place because a great  
10                  deal of the American public goes along with that  
11                  concept. He didn't mince words when he was  
12                  campaigning, he very clearly laid out who he was,  
13                  and yet, people supported that.

14                  So, we have to deal with the  
15                  unfortunate reality that this is still very much a  
16                  public situation and not just a government  
17                  situation. And I find that kind of sad, because I  
18                  thought we'd moved past that.

19                  CHAIR LHAMON: Commissioner Kirsanow?

20                  COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Thank you very  
21                  much, Madam Chair. And thank you to the witnesses,  
22                  very compelling testimony. We've heard testimony  
23                  that words matter, and they do, and that the words  
24                  of the administration officials may have  
25                  exacerbated the climate in this country.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           A review of Bureau of Justice  
2           Statistics data shows that, with respect to the  
3           commission of hate crimes, certain groups are more  
4           likely to commit hate crimes than others. And I'd  
5           like to see if I can get your input as to how we  
6           can maybe reduce the number of hate crimes.

7           We've heard about this rhetoric, but  
8           the Bureau of Justice Statistics shows that blacks,  
9           for example, are five and a half times more likely  
10          to commit hate crimes than whites.

11          Other intra-ethnic hate crimes are  
12          committed, for example, by certain Central  
13          Americans against other Central Americans at a  
14          higher rate than committed by other perpetrators.  
15          Same with certain Asian groups.

16          What, if any, data, studies, evidence,  
17          show that this kind of hate crime can be stopped by  
18          a reduction in rhetoric or attachment of a hate  
19          crime designation or a federal hate crime  
20          designation?

21          MS. BRO: My understanding, and I can't  
22          provide you the exact names of the studies,  
23          unfortunately, my understanding as a mother of a  
24          white male and a grandmother of white males is that  
25          many of the white males who act out are doing so

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 because their identity is threatened.

2 I had been previously led to believe  
3 that economic conditions were the primary cause of  
4 people acting out in fear and hate. It was, we're  
5 losing jobs because of the other, whoever the other  
6 might be at that given moment.

7 And I think that is part of the  
8 problem, but the latest studies seem to indicate  
9 that as gender identity and racial identity, fear  
10 of being lost in the crowd, fear of being  
11 marginalized yourself is what causes you oftentimes  
12 to lash out at someone else.

13 But then, there's also the case of the  
14 easy target, particularly when it's someone with  
15 disability who maybe can't defend themselves or a  
16 gender identity child who can't defend themselves.

17 As with most everything, there's no  
18 single answer, it's a complicated issue that needs  
19 to be dealt with on a number of fronts. I don't  
20 think dealing with speech alone is going to stop  
21 it.

22 I think that, as a classroom teacher  
23 where we didn't allow it, we thought that kind of  
24 squashed it, but what it does is it forces it  
25 underground. It's not okay to force it out into

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the light, but in some ways, it's easier to know  
2 what you're dealing with when it's out in the light  
3 than it is when it's underground.

4 MS. GARLICK: Thanks for your questions  
5 and this is exactly why I say the law is a blunt  
6 instrument and it's better to prevent these crimes  
7 from happening in the first place. And I think, to  
8 your question, prevention, cross-cultural  
9 understanding, and all of that is key.

10 So, some best practices that we put  
11 forth in our, for instances, Mayors Compact Against  
12 Hate, where local mayors are taking the lead in  
13 sort of implementing these best practices in their  
14 cities across the country, are encouraging schools  
15 to implement anti-bias and anti-hate content into  
16 their curricula in schools.

17 Promoting advanced partnerships among  
18 community-based organizations, civil rights, and  
19 religious groups to build trust amongst groups, and  
20 also between law enforcement as well. And also,  
21 supporting the successful integration of immigrants  
22 into communities and society and improving that  
23 trust too.

24 So, focusing on education, focusing on  
25 cross-cultural understanding, and those best

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 practices, those have to complement anything that  
2 our government, our society does, in order to  
3 effectively respond to hate crimes, to prevent them  
4 from happening in the first place.

5 MS. JORWIC: I only was able to hear the  
6 last little bit of the panel before me, but what I  
7 did hear and in reviewing the materials in advance  
8 of the hearing today, it does seem that a lot more  
9 training needs to be done in order to get a better  
10 representation in the data.

11 So, I don't have a data study to cite  
12 to, but I do think that more time does need to come  
13 out, so that we get a real picture, we get data  
14 that really bears a real picture, particularly for  
15 people with disabilities, since that's only been  
16 included in data collection in recent years.

17 But as far as for people with  
18 disabilities, what I can say and what we have data  
19 to support, is that as attitudes change in societal  
20 views of people with disabilities and all people  
21 change, that we're able to move.

22 We have data that supports that people  
23 move back into the community once they weren't seen  
24 as an other. And I think that that's the broader  
25 reason why data is important, but it's not going to

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 give the full picture when we have to look at the  
2 full view of why as a society different groups are  
3 seen different ways.

4 And that's also why, as I did state and  
5 as you mentioned before, words do matter and why  
6 it's important that things that are hate crimes are  
7 labeled as such and that we're continuing to track  
8 data.

9 MS. PRESCOTT: For this moment, I'll  
10 speak as an educator, rather than as a parent,  
11 because I am also a teacher. I teach at a  
12 community college. And I too noticed sort of an  
13 increase in biased speech in the last couple of  
14 years.

15 But how I have dealt with it as an  
16 educator is to talk about it extensively in my  
17 classroom and to make everything that we're talking  
18 about here today is something that we discuss in  
19 the classroom on a daily basis.

20 Whether it's race, religion, gender  
21 identity, sexual orientation, all of those things  
22 are things that I think we all need to talk about,  
23 in particular, understanding individual stories.

24 I can't say enough that, that's how I  
25 began what I said, my remarks today, but I truly

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 believe that when you get to know individuals, you  
2 don't hate them, right? You get to know them as  
3 real human beings.

4 One of the books that I consistently  
5 teach my class is Bryan Stevenson's Just Mercy,  
6 that speaks specifically about the criminal justice  
7 system and all of our issues. And Bryan Stevenson  
8 is quite a remarkable man.

9 But one of the things that is so  
10 powerful about that book is it delves specifically  
11 into individual stories, to help people understand  
12 that we are all people and we are all here and need  
13 to support each other and we are all human and to  
14 stop being scared of anyone that is different than  
15 ourselves.

16 And I think that as a society, we need  
17 to take the same approach, no matter what our role  
18 is, is we need to talk, we need to be open, and we  
19 need to hear each other's stories.

20 MS. RAGHUNATHAN: If I can just briefly  
21 respond. I think also, we cannot underestimate the  
22 level of under-reporting.

23 The National Crime Victimization  
24 Survey, which is an arm of the federal government  
25 itself, estimates itself that under-reporting of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 hate crimes to the FBI is at a factor of 40 to 1.  
2 So, for every one hate crime that is reported to  
3 the FBI, the federal government itself estimates  
4 that 40 go under-reported.

5 And so, onto that layer, I would also  
6 add the reality of over-policing and over-  
7 criminalization in particular of black men in our  
8 society, which I'm sure leads to an over-  
9 representation, and an extremely small sample of  
10 those individuals who are perpetrating hate crimes.

11 Clearly, any individual who perpetrates  
12 a hate crime should be addressed and it should be  
13 addressed as such, regardless of the racial or  
14 ethnic background of the person who perpetrates  
15 that incident.

16 But I think we cannot underestimate the  
17 extent to which in particular black and Latino men  
18 in our community, in our society are explicitly  
19 being disproportionately targeted by law  
20 enforcement officers and law enforcement agencies  
21 often, and seen as agents of criminality from the  
22 beginning.

23 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: I'm not sure  
24 that that really answered the question. I think  
25 we've been appropriately directing attention toward

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the commission of hate crimes by, I hope,  
2 everybody. But it seems to be focused on just one  
3 segment.

4 And when you have five and a half times  
5 more hate crimes or it's five and a half times more  
6 likely that marginalized groups are committing hate  
7 crimes, what are we doing wrong? What's going on  
8 here?

9 It seems to me there's this  
10 presumption, there's this kind of stereotypic view  
11 of who's perpetrating the hate crime, when the  
12 Bureau of Justice Statistics shows a  
13 disproportionate number of hate crimes being  
14 committed by the marginalized groups, which are  
15 also the victims of hate crimes.

16 MS. JORWIC: With all due respect, the  
17 ethnic background of a perpetrator for a person  
18 with a disability, it doesn't matter who is  
19 actually doing those hateful things to them.

20 Just in Chicago, there was a recent  
21 example, it doesn't matter the race of the person,  
22 when I read about them cutting into the person's  
23 skull, the person with the disability.

24 So, I think -- and, again, if we don't  
25 have -- we do not -- I can safely say that we do

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 not have a full scope of accurate data.

2 I don't believe -- I personally am not  
3 casting aspersions on the background of the  
4 perpetrator, it's about the crime that's happening  
5 and what we're calling it that's so important for  
6 the disability community and for, I would imagine,  
7 all marginalized communities.

8 MS. PRESCOTT: Just to add to that and  
9 to try and clarify, not only what I was trying to  
10 refer to, but I think the other panelists, is that  
11 creating an atmosphere of bias and hate, that is  
12 something that happens throughout the society.

13 So, who becomes the perpetrator is --  
14 it's whether -- sorry, I'm trying to clarify my own  
15 thoughts. But if you were to look at, for example,  
16 who commits domestic violence. Often, those are  
17 people who have experienced violence upon  
18 themselves.

19 So, people who commit acts of  
20 discrimination might have also experienced a lot of  
21 biased and hateful incidents upon themselves. So,  
22 it's really more of a society-wide thing.

23 I don't think of bias related incidents  
24 coming from any specific group. To me that -- who  
25 commits the crime is not -- I don't see this as

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 only done by white males, for example, I really  
2 don't.

3 I think it's more just an atmosphere of  
4 intolerance that gets perpetuated and then it gets  
5 expressed, and that people who have experienced  
6 intolerance might also then perpetrate intolerance.  
7 So, we need to deal with it as a society as  
8 something that impacts all of us.

9 CHAIR LHAMON: Commissioner Narasaki --  
10 oh, sorry.

11 MS. BRO: Oh, I'm sorry, I was just  
12 going to say, that is kind of my point, is that  
13 when white males commit this, it's because they  
14 feel marginalized. Groups that are marginalized  
15 definitely are acting out on that feeling.

16 Whoever is feeling or being  
17 marginalized is the one who is acting out. So, if  
18 we can find a way to lessen that society  
19 marginalization of people, whether it's with jobs,  
20 training, education, housing, whatever we can do to  
21 improve quality of life overall and recognize  
22 people for who they are, I think is going to help  
23 stop the hate crime.

24 CHAIR LHAMON: Commissioner Narasaki?

25 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Thank you, Madam

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Chair. First of all, I want to thank the witnesses  
2 for bringing home that today is not just about an  
3 intellectual policy debate, but that we're talking  
4 about the lives of real people and real loved ones,  
5 so I appreciate that, because I feel bad that we  
6 are asking all of you to relive experiences that  
7 are very painful. But it is so important and I  
8 really thank you.

9 I also wanted to acknowledge the Anti-  
10 Defamation League for your long work, both on  
11 moving policy, but also the work on teaching  
12 tolerance, because as we've heard so eloquently  
13 today, laws alone will not solve the problem, we  
14 really do need other interventions that bring us  
15 together as communities, that help us see the  
16 humanity in each individual. So, I just wanted to  
17 acknowledge that, because I learned a lot from ADL  
18 when I started out.

19 So, there's been this morning some  
20 witnesses who've implied that the rise in the FBI  
21 data and the various reports that groups are doing  
22 may not be actual rises, but may be just a matter  
23 of better reporting or changes in reporting. And I  
24 wanted to ask you, does that matter and are they  
25 right?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MS. RAGHUNATHAN: What I can say,  
2 because SAALT has been documenting hate violence  
3 incidents that we have sourced, not through the  
4 FBI, but through our community members and also  
5 through media searches and through the information  
6 from our community partners, we've been looking at  
7 this data for the better part of a decade, as I  
8 mentioned earlier.

9 What I can certainly tell you is that  
10 there has been a steady escalation that has been  
11 incredibly troubling. From 2014 to 2015, we saw a  
12 67 percent increase in hate violence incidents  
13 affecting our community members. And from 2016 to  
14 2017, we saw a 45 percent increase in hate violence  
15 affecting our community members.

16 Even as we continue to get the word out  
17 to community members, we continue to forge  
18 partnerships with enlightened law enforcement  
19 officers on the need to address under-reporting in  
20 particular of hate crimes and hate violence.

21 So, from our perspective, which I think  
22 has been amply bolstered by FBI crime statistics as  
23 well as hate crime statistics, is that the problem  
24 continues to escalate.

25 And I think it would be far from the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 reality of our communities or from the data that we  
2 have collected for us to say that the issue of hate  
3 crimes has been a blip or there has not been a  
4 continued, sustained, and troubling escalation of  
5 hate violence spanning, frankly, two  
6 administrations.

7 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Thank you. So,  
8 there's also been, as you can tell from some of the  
9 questions coming from some of the Commissioners, a  
10 belief by some that federal law doesn't matter,  
11 that the federal government doesn't really have a  
12 role, that federal hate crimes are somehow  
13 displacing state hate crimes.

14 And I'm wondering whether you can  
15 respond to explain how federal law or programs may  
16 matter and how they may be complementary to what  
17 happens on the state level?

18 MS. JORWIC: Yes. Federal law, and more  
19 importantly, federal law enforcement, plays a large  
20 role for the disability community. And  
21 particularly when it comes to guidance and  
22 additional support, whether it's for federal,  
23 state, or local law enforcement or stakeholders  
24 themselves, it plays a very important role.

25 In a meeting that we had with the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 acting head of the Civil Rights Division of the  
2 DOJ, Mr. Gore, I was very clear that pulling back  
3 these guidances is just as dangerous as not  
4 pursuing the lawsuits. The lawsuits matter, we  
5 have to continue.

6 We have to continue prosecuting, but we  
7 also have to keep the guidance coming from the  
8 federal government because, for stakeholders, for  
9 families, for administrations when we're talking  
10 about the education system, that shows not only the  
11 investment, but the commitment, and it's much  
12 easier for stakeholders, families, and individuals  
13 to access that information and it's an imperative  
14 continued role of the federal government.

15 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Thank you.

16 MS. BRO: I think some of the evidence  
17 has shown that, left to their own devices, some  
18 states have extremely lax standard when it comes to  
19 civil rights, particularly in the Deep South, it's  
20 been shown, but perhaps in others.

21 And I think that by having some federal  
22 guidelines, to say the least, although I'm not a  
23 big fan of unfunded mandates, but at the very least  
24 to have some guidelines that are enforced, would  
25 make a big difference in continuity and in

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 consistency.

2 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Thank you. I  
3 note that I'm very disappointed that the Department  
4 of Education chose not to send someone to the  
5 hearing.

6 I do want to acknowledge that we have a  
7 former head of the Office of Civil Rights for the  
8 Department of Education, who is the reason why the  
9 policies did improve over the last several years.  
10 So, Chair Katherine, I just want to acknowledge it.

11 CHAIR LHAMON: Very much a group effort,  
12 but thank you.

13 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: So, I want to  
14 ask you, what do you see that the Department of  
15 Education is doing well and what do you think the  
16 Department of Education needs to do better?

17 CHAIR LHAMON: And we're going to try to  
18 be speedy in that response, because there are two  
19 other people who have questions and we're past our  
20 time.

21 MS. PRESCOTT: Very briefly, again, the  
22 Department of Education is critical in this fight,  
23 because the most important place to begin to  
24 address these problems is clearly in our schools.

25 This is the place where we educate our

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 children, this is the place where the tone is set,  
2 begins in our schools. So, providing schools with  
3 clear guidelines of what is expected of them is  
4 critical.

5 MS. JORWIC: It's the role of the  
6 Department of Education to be the resources for all  
7 local education agencies on how to better serve  
8 individuals with disabilities and individuals in  
9 all populations that may be marginalized in the  
10 school setting.

11 MS. GARLICK: I would agree. The  
12 message that was sent when the Title IX guidance  
13 was rescinded, I agree wholeheartedly, it can't be  
14 overstated.

15 The Department of Education has a huge  
16 role -- and thanks for everything that you did,  
17 Chair, in your role at the Department of Education  
18 to put in guidance -- to not only encourage and  
19 promote anti-bullying education, anti-bias  
20 education, but also to reform school discipline  
21 policies and other things that disproportionately  
22 impact students of color, marginalized communities,  
23 et cetera.

24 And so, to your previous question, the  
25 federal government has a huge role to play in

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 preventing and responding to hate crimes, not only  
2 on the legal side, where oftentimes states have  
3 inadequate hate crime laws, many states still don't  
4 protect LGBT communities for instances, five states  
5 still don't have hate crime laws, but our other  
6 federal agencies also have a role to play in  
7 preventing and responding to hate, calling out hate  
8 where it happens, and working with other agencies  
9 to establish best practices.

10 Which is why our recommendation for an  
11 inter-agency task force, I'll again just reiterate,  
12 is so important to us.

13 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Thank you.

14 CHAIR LHAMON: Commissioner Kladney?

15 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Thank you, Madam  
16 Chair. I just wanted to clear up, when  
17 Commissioner Kirsanow was asking you questions  
18 about why minorities could commit these acts, I  
19 just -- an African American can commit a hate crime  
20 against a Muslim, a disabled person, or a Latino,  
21 is that correct?

22 I mean, isn't that what he was speaking  
23 to? Or you were speaking to him about? I just  
24 want to get the record pretty straight on that.

25 MS. RAGHUNATHAN: That was my

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 understanding of the question at hand, as well as  
2 the reality in some cases. Certainly not all.

3 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: So, I mean, a  
4 white KKK person could commit a crime against a  
5 white Jewish person?

6 MS. RAGHUNATHAN: They are, with  
7 increasing frequency across the country.

8 MS. GARLICK: Right. And I'll just  
9 refer to the bomb threats against the Jewish  
10 community that Mr. Moossy referenced from the  
11 Department of Justice. The identity -- and I know  
12 you have a legal panel later, but it's hard,  
13 because I'm a lawyer --

14 (Laughter.)

15 CHAIR LHAMON: We sympathize.

16 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Congratulations.

17 MS. GARLICK: Yes, thank you. The  
18 identity of the perpetrator doesn't matter for the  
19 purposes of hate crimes, as long as the victim was  
20 specifically targeted because of who they are,  
21 that's what a hate crime is.

22 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: I just wanted to  
23 clear that up. Thank you very much.

24 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you. And our last  
25 question will be from the Vice Chair.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1                   VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Thank you  
2 very much, Madam Chair. And I'm not sure how much  
3 of this is a question, but I was so intrigued by  
4 Micah's thought that the best course of action  
5 would involve not a whole lot of financial  
6 resources, but exposing kids to all kinds of people  
7 and forcing them to come together and to work as a  
8 unit.

9                   And that at a fundamental level, he  
10 says, you deal with hatred by talking to one  
11 another. And then, I thought, listened to what  
12 we've said thus far about the federal government's  
13 role in combating hate crimes.

14                   And so, in putting those together, I  
15 wonder if perhaps the solution is in not allowing  
16 the resegregation of our schools, where young  
17 people are going or people, children, are going to  
18 come together, be forced to come together each day  
19 as they learn and they'll be exposed to all kinds  
20 of different people.

21                   And perhaps the solution is not in  
22 allowing the resegregation of our public housing.  
23 And you have to deal with one another, you have to  
24 come together. And so, I'm not sure, Madam Chair,  
25 that there's a question in there, but I invite any

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 --

2 MS. BRO: Can I make a comment --

3 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: --

4 comments.

5 MS. BRO: -- to that?

6 CHAIR LHAMON: Yes, I was going to  
7 reconstruct it as a question, but go right ahead.

8 (Laughter.)

9 MS. BRO: I did learn in education,  
10 working with fourth graders and fifth graders and  
11 third graders for a number of years that no matter  
12 how much I teach at school, the bottom dollar is  
13 what's happening at home, because the home has them  
14 far longer than I do.

15 And I can teach them and expose them to  
16 all kinds of things, but if I'm not also reaching  
17 the home and the family, I'm not really making the  
18 change that I want to see.

19 So, we have to think broader than just  
20 schools, broader than just the children working  
21 together. We need to find ways to have families  
22 come with other families.

23 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: But might  
24 schools be a place to begin?

25 MS. BRO: School is definitely a place

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to begin, we just need to think in addition to  
2 that.

3 MS. JORWIC: I think that schools are a  
4 great -- or unfortunately, we've seen schools have  
5 been a breeding ground for hate. But I think that  
6 schools are a very fertile ground.

7 As someone who used to practice special  
8 education law myself and someone who ran an  
9 organization when I was in high school that was all  
10 about people with disabilities and people without  
11 disabilities coming together, I think it's a  
12 breeding ground too. And that's why it's so  
13 important that we continue to move forward.

14 The Arc has a case in Georgia, because  
15 the same schools that were used to segregate  
16 students by their race in the early part of the  
17 20th century are now being used to segregate people  
18 with disabilities from their peers. A troubling  
19 example of the reality of moving backwards and that  
20 segregation.

21 Housing is another area that people  
22 with disabilities are often segregated. So, I  
23 think between the education system and the service  
24 systems that are in place for people that the  
25 federal government oversees, there's a huge

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 breeding ground for coming together and, again,  
2 seeing that humanity of one another and learning  
3 each other's stories.

4 MS. RAGHUNATHAN: If I could just jump  
5 in, I would also reiterate that we need many  
6 different tools to address bias in our community.

7 We need strong laws from the federal  
8 government, as well as strong state level laws that  
9 protect our communities and that enshrine, frankly,  
10 the moral compass or the moral compact of our  
11 society.

12 We need regulations that are not  
13 required by legislation that will make a  
14 difference, either by allocation of resources or by  
15 clarifying how specific policies and laws should be  
16 implemented.

17 We need strong fabric between law  
18 enforcement, between community-based organizations,  
19 and between communities, to ensure that laws and  
20 policies that are already on the books make sense  
21 and are implemented effectively for community  
22 members and that the relationship is two-way  
23 between community members and those who that  
24 implementing and enforcing the laws.

25 And then, certainly, of course, we need

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to change the sort of arena of public opinion, to  
2 make sure that all communities are welcomed and  
3 respected.

4 But I think that if you do not have one  
5 of those many legs of the stool, then you are not  
6 able to actually make sure that all communities are  
7 protected, respected, and that we can all live  
8 lives of dignity and full inclusion in the nation  
9 that sort of advanced the basic idea of core  
10 unalienable rights.

11 MS. GARLICK: I was going to say --

12 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Who's going  
13 to follow that?

14 MS. GARLICK: -- that sounded a lot  
15 better --

16 (Laughter.)

17 MS. GARLICK: But in our education  
18 programs around schools around the country where we  
19 do implement peer-led anti-bias training programs,  
20 we actually use a tool called Pyramid of Hate.

21 And what it is is to demonstrate that  
22 in all sectors of our society, communities,  
23 schools, that if we allow discrimination, if we  
24 allow stereotypes, if we allow prejudice to go  
25 unchecked and to breed, they can escalate to

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 further levels.

2 And so, yes, we need to address those  
3 lower levels, if you will, or building blocks of  
4 hate, but at all levels as well. And so, that tool  
5 goes directly to your comment.

6 CHAIR LHAMON: With that, I thank this  
7 very powerful panel for your testimony. I really  
8 appreciate it. If there's follow-up, we would  
9 certainly welcome it. And for all of us present,  
10 we'll take a break until 1:00 p.m. and we'll start  
11 promptly at 1:00.

12 (Whereupon, the above-entitled matter  
13 went off the record at 12:11 p.m. and resumed at  
14 1:01 p.m.)

15 **PANEL THREE: POLICY AND LEGAL EXPERTS**

16 CHAIRMAN LHAMON: Thank you for your  
17 continued attention to this important topic. And,  
18 we're going to now proceed with our third panel of  
19 policy and legal experts in the order in which they  
20 will speak.

21 Our panelists are Lena Masri who's the  
22 National Litigation Director and Acting Civil  
23 Rights Director at the Council on American-Islamic  
24 Relations, CAIR.

25 Shelby Chestnut, the National

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Organizing and Policy Strategist at Transgender Law  
2 Center.

3 Kristen Clarke who is the President and  
4 Executive Director of the Lawyers Committee for  
5 Civil Rights Under Law.

6 Andrea Senteno, Legislative Staff  
7 Attorney with the Mexican American Legal Defense  
8 and Educational Fund.

9 And, Aviva Vogelstein, Director of  
10 Legal Initiatives at the Brandeis Center.

11 Just as a reminder to all, I will cut  
12 you off after seven minutes, so I encourage to stay  
13 within the seven minutes and to watch the system of  
14 lights that we have going.

15 And, Ms. Masri, please begin.

16 MS. MASRI: Thank you, respected  
17 Commissioners.

18 The Council on American-Islamic  
19 Relations is America's largest Muslim civil  
20 liberties and advocacy organization. Its mission  
21 is to enhance the understanding of Islam, protect  
22 civil rights, promote justice and empower American  
23 Muslims.

24 CAIR is dedicated to the foundational  
25 ideal of affording all Americans the freedom and

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 dignity to practice their religion.

2 In fact, CAIR is the only Muslim civil  
3 rights organization that provides legal services to  
4 all cases reported to CAIR that fall within its  
5 mission.

6 Nationwide, CAIR employs more than 40  
7 attorneys who provide free legal and advocacy  
8 services to individuals who experience religious  
9 discrimination and bias.

10 In the process of providing its  
11 services, CAIR also assembles data regarding  
12 incidents of harassment against American Muslims,  
13 the only report of its kind.

14 In April of 2018, CAIR released our  
15 annual civil rights report entitled Targeted, a  
16 copy of which is attached to the written form of  
17 this testimony.

18 The report documents that the Trump  
19 Administration's Muslim ban has succeeded in  
20 stigmatizing Muslims and demonizing Islam leading  
21 to an unprecedented increase in anti-Muslim  
22 activity to never before seen levels.

23 The American Muslim community has  
24 witnessed an increase in the onslaught of  
25 institutional and individualized prejudice against

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 American Muslims in 2017.

2 Since 2014, CAIR has received reports  
3 of 16,800 incidents of targeted hate against  
4 American Muslims.

5 Between 2016 and 2017, CAIR's records  
6 show a 17 percent increase in incidents of anti-  
7 Muslim bias and a 15 percent increase in hate  
8 crimes.

9 Those sharp increases themselves  
10 accumulate a top surge in recent years. From 2014  
11 through 2016, CAIR recorded a 65 percent increase  
12 in incidents of anti-Muslim bias and a staggering  
13 584 percent increase in hate crimes targeting  
14 American Muslims.

15 In 2017 alone, CAIR tracked 300 anti-  
16 Muslim hate crimes.

17 The incidents are becoming not only  
18 more frequent, but also more violent. Mosques  
19 burned down to the ground by arsonists, American  
20 Muslim's homes and businesses smeared with  
21 threatening graffiti, women harassed on the streets  
22 for wearing the hijab or the religious head  
23 covering worn by Muslim women, sometimes by  
24 aggressors forcibly yanking their hijabs off their  
25 heads.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           In 2017 alone, CAIR recorded 144 anti-  
2 mosque incidents.

3           The rise of anti-Muslim sentiment has  
4 cost us lives. Two men were murdered in Portland  
5 as they sought to defend a Muslim youth from a  
6 knife-wielding aggressor on a train, one of whom we  
7 heard testimony from earlier today.

8           There have been Muslims threatened at  
9 gunpoint, Muslim children are afraid to go to  
10 school not only because of student on student  
11 bullying, but teachers on student bullying has  
12 significantly increased in 2017, teachers bullying  
13 them as terrorists.

14           The chief culprit for this rise in  
15 anti-Muslim hate crimes is the Trump  
16 Administration's various efforts to exclude Muslims  
17 from the United States.

18           Courts have recognized the Trump  
19 Administration's Muslim ban as the fulfillment of  
20 then candidate Trump's call for a total and  
21 complete shutdown of Muslims entering the United  
22 States.

23           In the aftermath of this Muslim ban,  
24 CAIR recorded a deluge of 464 incidents pertaining  
25 to it in the last year.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           Even as CAIR has developed its own data  
2 set documenting the rise in anti-Muslim activity,  
3 CAIR's experience in the community makes clear that  
4 incidents of bias are severely under reported.

5           American Muslims often do not report  
6 incidents either to CAIR or to law enforcement for  
7 two significant reasons.

8           First, members of the American Muslim  
9 community fear mistreatment and retaliation from  
10 the government itself. Thirty-five percent of  
11 incidents of bias reported to CAIR last year  
12 concerned mistreatment by the government,  
13 principally by CBP and the FBI.

14           Community members are often afraid to  
15 invite the government to probe into the details of  
16 private hate discrimination they experience because  
17 that very invitation is perceived as making them  
18 vulnerable to even worse consequences by the  
19 government itself.

20           It doesn't help, as BuzzFeed News  
21 recently documented that politicians in 49 states  
22 have attacked Muslims openly in speeches and with  
23 proposed legislation since 2015.

24           Second, members of the American Muslim  
25 community consider every day harassment to be so

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 common that they are desensitized.

2 CAIR staff regularly hear of cases in  
3 which individuals are harassed but report the  
4 incident to CAIR and not to government authorities.

5 This often happens because the victim  
6 feels that the treatment is expected and normal,  
7 that nothing can be done, that they will not be  
8 believed or sympathized with by their broader  
9 community or constant anti-Muslim harassment is to  
10 be expected in the United States today.

11 Programs and policies, including the  
12 Muslim ban, the terrorist screening database, the  
13 extreme vetting initiative and censorship of  
14 Palestinian advocacy must be systematically  
15 documented and challenged.

16 Laws aimed at suppressing Islam must be  
17 rejected and the fact that politicians, law makers  
18 from city councils and state legislatures to  
19 Congress and the President of the United States  
20 regularly consider anti-Muslim measures is as good  
21 an indication as any that anti-Muslim sentiment in  
22 this country has run amuck.

23 The government has a significant role  
24 to play in combating hate crimes, but it must first  
25 establish trust in the American Muslim community

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that bias and discrimination will not be embodied  
2 by the government itself.

3 For the sake of time, our written  
4 testimony does include additional recommendations  
5 to the Commission, our annual civil rights reports  
6 also contains additional recommendations.

7 Thank you.

8 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you very much.

9 Just a reminder to all panelists that  
10 we do have a policy against defamation and  
11 degradation so we need to be careful to link our  
12 statements to fact. Thank you.

13 MX. Chestnut?

14 MX. CHESTNUT: Good afternoon, my name  
15 is Shelby Chestnut, a staff member at the  
16 Transgender Law Center.

17 Before I begin, I just want to extend a  
18 big thank you for convening all of these panelists  
19 today.

20 TLC is the largest national trans-led  
21 organization in the United States advocating self-  
22 determination for all people. Grounded in legal  
23 expertise and committed to racial justice, TLC  
24 employs a variety of community driven strategies  
25 that keeps transgender and gender nonconforming

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 people alive, thriving and fighting for liberation.

2 In the last decade, transgender people  
3 and gender nonconforming people have gone from the  
4 shadows to the covers of magazines, courtrooms and  
5 television.

6 This increased visibility has also come  
7 with increased public debate, legislative attacks  
8 on the rights of transgender people and, sadly,  
9 deadly violence.

10 Violence against lesbian, gay,  
11 bisexual, transgender, queer people, especially  
12 transgender and gender nonconforming people is one  
13 of the key civil right issues of our time. And,  
14 one that we can no longer ignore.

15 In 2017, according to the National  
16 Coalition of Anti-Violence Programs, we lost 28  
17 transgender and gender nonconforming people across  
18 the United States to violence. A majority of whom  
19 are black, transgender women making 2017 the  
20 deadliest year on record for transgender people.

21 To date in 2018, this epidemic  
22 continues with the murders of at least eight  
23 transgender people.

24 In a moment where society is seeing the  
25 increase in intersections of racism, misogyny,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 classism and anti-LGBT policies on the state and  
2 federal level, it seems clear that addressing this  
3 violence transgender people are facing should be a  
4 top priority for everyone, especially the federal  
5 government. Yet, no one seems to be hearing the  
6 battle cry.

7 Before we can look at solutions, we  
8 must understand some of the sources of this  
9 violence.

10 Extreme discrimination and employment  
11 education in housing lead many trans-people to see  
12 sex work as their best option to survive. But, the  
13 criminalization of sex work and legislation like  
14 SESTA-FOSTA make sex work extremely dangerous for  
15 transgender people contributing to the fatal  
16 violence people face.

17 We must stop advancing policies that  
18 put the lives of sex workers in danger and we must  
19 address the discrimination that limits  
20 opportunities for trans-people and forces them into  
21 situations where they're vulnerable to trafficking  
22 and violence.

23 Violence at the hands of law  
24 enforcement remains a persistent issue impacting  
25 the lives of trans-people across the country. Law

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 enforcement routinely profile transgender people,  
2 especially black transgender women and criminalize  
3 their survival.

4 And, worse, add to the violence and  
5 mistreatment when handling the homicides of  
6 transgender people, and often times misgendering  
7 them and perpetuating the narrative that they are  
8 criminal and deserving of deadly violence.

9 Intimate partner violence or domestic  
10 violence, while an epidemic in many people's lives  
11 in this country, is an issue of grave concern  
12 impacting many transgender people.

13 Stigma and lack of public awareness  
14 that IPV can impact people regardless of their  
15 gender identify and sexual orientation often time  
16 leads transgender survivors with limited option for  
17 support despite the fact that federal protections  
18 like the Violence Against Women Act includes LGBT  
19 survivors.

20 State sanctioned anti-trans legislation  
21 which seeks to dehumanize and limit trans-peoples'  
22 access to public accommodations. Much of this  
23 legislation is known as the trans-bathroom bills,  
24 seeks to limit people's access to public restrooms.

25 Far being bathroom access, this type of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 legislation targets trans-people's civil rights and  
2 opens up the floodgates for broader anti-trans  
3 legislation and increases violence towards trans-  
4 people.

5 We've seen it in North Carolina,  
6 Washington State, Texas, Anchorage, Alaska and now,  
7 Montana and Massachusetts.

8 When we look at the source of violence  
9 and we start to think about solutions, it's clear  
10 we have a great deal of work to do to ensure that  
11 transgender and gender nonconforming people are  
12 central to this conversation.

13 While state and federal hate crime laws  
14 were a hard won battle aiming to protect many  
15 vulnerable populations, we have done very little to  
16 increase public awareness or why LGBT people,  
17 especially transgender people, are in need of  
18 respect and legal protections.

19 State and federal hate crime laws and  
20 prosecution are not the answer to protecting  
21 transgender communities from violence. Charging  
22 one person with a hate crime does nothing to  
23 prevent the next murder or increase public  
24 awareness on why transgender people are deserving  
25 of respect.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           To take this violence seriously, our  
2 country must look at solutions to address  
3 conditions transgender people face, especially  
4 state and federal elected officials who daily  
5 create laws and executive orders that strip  
6 transgender people of their rights and dignity.

7           We must work towards a world that  
8 values transgender people and one in which the  
9 media is uplifting their success and contributions  
10 to society when they are alive and not dead.

11           City, state and federal funding must be  
12 made available to ensure transgender people have  
13 access to jobs, housing, education and we must  
14 prioritize prevention programs that promote  
15 communities to be accepting and welcoming of  
16 transgender people versus criminalizing people.

17           We must denounce the rollbacks and  
18 attacks of transgender people's rights and we  
19 ensure protections like the Violence Against Women  
20 Act, HUDs Equal Access Rule and all federal  
21 protections remain in place.

22           Right now, as we speak, hundreds of  
23 migrants in a highly publicized caravan wait at the  
24 U.S. Mexico border seeking entry into the U.S.

25           Among the caravan are a number of LGBT

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 migrants, most of whom are trans-women and minors  
2 who are fleeing violence in their countries of  
3 origin.

4 The group was turned away from the port  
5 of entry for several days and experienced  
6 harassment and extreme violence in Mexico.

7 This past weekend, the LGBT group was  
8 repeatedly turned away from refugee shelters due to  
9 transphobia and homophobia.

10 After finally being allowed into a  
11 shelter, this group was awoken in the middle of the  
12 night by armed men who robbed them, threatened  
13 them, and then set the shelter on fire.

14 Where is the public outcry for this  
15 horrific violence? Why isn't our government  
16 intervening?

17 All of us should demand the customs  
18 border patrol and immigration customs enforcement  
19 allow the remaining members of this caravan entry  
20 immediately or we risk them being killed.

21 I want to close today by offering some  
22 of the highlights of the amazing work happening  
23 around the country to ensure transgender people are  
24 not only protected, but thriving.

25 Last year, TLC represented Ash Whitaker

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to challenge the Kenosha, Wisconsin school district  
2 who denied him access to the boys' restroom in high  
3 school because he was transgender. We fought and  
4 won.

5 Ash is now a freshman in college and  
6 living his authentic life.

7 Last month, in Anchorage, Alaska  
8 transgender people worked with their allies to  
9 defeat an anti-trans bathroom measure despite high  
10 levels of opposition.

11 Recently, national domestic and sexual  
12 violence advocates across the country called for  
13 the continued support for transgender rights and  
14 shared steps advocates can take locally to ensure  
15 transgender people have access to services and are  
16 respected when seeking services.

17 Right here in our nation's capital,  
18 Ruby Corado, a transgender Latino woman runs Casa  
19 Ruby and provides housing and services to  
20 transgender people 365 days a year.

21 In Montana --

22 CHAIR LHAMON: Sorry, the time is up.

23 MX. CHESTNUT: Oh, thank you.

24 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you very much.

25 Ms. Clarke?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MS. CLARKE: Good afternoon, my name is  
2 Kristen Clarke. I'm here on behalf of the Lawyers  
3 Committee for Civil Rights Under Law which is one  
4 of the nation's oldest racial justice and civil  
5 rights organizations.

6 Founded in 1963 at the request of  
7 President John F. Kennedy, our principle mission is  
8 to secure equal justice for all through the rule of  
9 law, targeting, in particular, the inequities  
10 confronting African-Americans and other racial  
11 minorities.

12 Over the course of the past year, our  
13 work to confront our nation's growing hate crime  
14 crisis has been one of our top priorities.

15 We know that the hate crime crisis we  
16 see today is not new and is rooted in our country's  
17 long and tortured history when it comes to racial  
18 animus and hatred faced by African Americans and  
19 other racial minorities.

20 Our work is carried out with  
21 sensitivity to the legacy of white supremacy and  
22 the history of racial violence that loom heavy  
23 throughout our nation's history.

24 Our Stop Hate project works to  
25 strengthen the capacity of communities to confront

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 hate by connecting them to existing legal and  
2 social resources and by creating new resources to  
3 fill gaps.

4 Our 8-4-4-9-NOHATE hotline serves as a  
5 resource for individuals and organizations who have  
6 experienced or witnessed hate.

7 And, our [www.8449nohate.org](http://www.8449nohate.org) website  
8 provides know your rights materials and tool kits  
9 to support communities combating hate and includes  
10 information on hate crime laws and relevant  
11 statutes in all 50 states.

12 I want to use my time this afternoon to  
13 talk about the unique challenges that we face in  
14 terms of the spike in hate activity online.

15 Violent white supremacists and the alt-  
16 Right are using online platforms to plan, incite,  
17 promote and generate violence at an unrelenting  
18 pace.

19 At the Lawyers Committee for Civil  
20 Rights Under Law, part of our work to address this  
21 crisis has entailed a concerted focus on how white  
22 supremacists exploit racial divisions to reach  
23 broader audiences online and, in turn, incite  
24 unlawful, hateful activity.

25 And, I want to be clear that there is,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 indeed a meaningful distinction between hate speech  
2 and hate activity, especially in the context of the  
3 internet.

4           Hateful activity is inciting or  
5 engaging in threats, harassment, violence,  
6 defamation, intimidation or other illegal action  
7 with bigoted animus.

8           Unlike mere speech these forms of  
9 unlawful conduct are not protected by the First  
10 Amendment. They cause tangible and real injury to  
11 victims and communities.

12           We believe it is critical to hold  
13 private service providers accountable. And, I want  
14 to talk about some examples of the work that we  
15 have been doing in this space.

16           Richard Spencer's alright.com stands  
17 as one of the darkest examples of websites that  
18 celebrates and encourages racial violence.

19           In the course of our investigation into  
20 alright.com, we observed that Go Daddy was  
21 providing domain registration services for the  
22 site.

23           Alright.com was, in our view, in clear  
24 violation of Go Daddy's own terms of service which  
25 clearly prohibit violence, particularly against

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 racial and ethnic minorities.

2 Go Daddy's universal terms of services  
3 agreement require that consumers not use their  
4 services in a manner that is illegal or that  
5 promotes or encourages illegal activity.

6 Yet, we observed countless examples of  
7 published content and postings on the site that  
8 directed people to, for example, use live  
9 ammunition at the border with the substantial  
10 chance that they, they being immigrants crossing  
11 the border, might lose their life in the process.

12 There were other postings on this site  
13 which encouraged violence against women and  
14 violence against people on the basis of their  
15 religion.

16 We went after Go Daddy and pushed them  
17 to enforce their own terms of service, which they  
18 did and altright.com went dark last week.

19 We took similar action against  
20 Stormfront, the oldest and largest white  
21 supremacist hate site online. For more than 25  
22 years, this is a site that has been tied to the  
23 deaths of individuals and other violent activities.

24 The Southern Poverty Law Center aptly  
25 describes this site as, quote, "the murder capital

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 of the internet."

2 Following our action, Network Solutions  
3 enforced its own terms of service agreement and  
4 pulled Stormfront offline.

5 Stormfront eventually was resurrected  
6 by a private services provider, Tucows, and we urge  
7 this company to closely examine how its services  
8 are being manipulated by Stormfront today to incite  
9 violence in the U.S. and abroad.

10 In addition to these hate sites, Daily  
11 Stormer is a site that has had a particularly  
12 devastating impact on young people.

13 In 2018, we filed a law suit against  
14 the publishers of the Daily Stormer for actions  
15 that led to the targeting of an African-American  
16 student at American University who had been  
17 recently elected as student body president.

18 In this instance, the publishers of the  
19 site facilitated a massive campaign of racist  
20 trolling activity that disrupted the student's  
21 life, impeded her educational experience, made her  
22 fearful for her safety and caused significant  
23 physical and emotional trauma.

24 The vicious targeting of this student  
25 incited unlawful activity by others online.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           Using local human rights law here in  
2 D.C., we are now pursuing a legal challenge against  
3 the Daily Stormer and other online trolls for  
4 denying the student an equal opportunity to  
5 participate in the very aspects of life we take for  
6 granted, including taking full advantage of  
7 educational institutions right here in D.C.

8           Where do we go from here? We believe  
9 that action must be taken to encourage more victims  
10 to report, to push law enforcement to do a better  
11 job investigating hate incidents that arise in  
12 their community and that the Justice Department  
13 must play a critical role here as well.

14           Fifty years after the tragic  
15 assignation of Dr. Martin Luther King, we are still  
16 working to fulfill the goals which animated his I  
17 have a Dream speech.

18           We know that nonprofit organizations  
19 can't do all of the work on its own and we thank  
20 the Commission for focusing on this very important  
21 issue today.

22           CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you, Ms. Clarke.

23           Ms. Senteno?

24           MS. SENTENO: Good afternoon and thank  
25 you for having me.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 My name is Andrea Senteno and I'm a  
2 legislative staff attorney with MALDEF, the Mexican  
3 American Legal Defense and Educational Fund.

4 Founded in 1968, MALDEF is the nation's  
5 leading Latino legal civil rights organization.  
6 MALDEF has worked for almost 50 years to confront  
7 discrimination and bias where ever they occur.

8 We know intimately how an agenda  
9 motivated by hate creates the space for anti-Latino  
10 laws, policies and practices.

11 The rhetoric and messaging that cast  
12 Latinos and other underrepresented communities as  
13 outsiders and threats are the root of the policies  
14 and actions that MALDEF challenges every day.

15 This briefing on the role of the  
16 federal government in responding to hate crimes  
17 comes at a critical time.

18 In 2016, reported hate crimes reached a  
19 five year high. The rise in anti-immigrant  
20 sentiment and the efforts by state and local  
21 governments to enforce immigration laws or to  
22 create hostile environments for immigrants leave  
23 the Latino community to attack and make it more  
24 difficult for our community members to seek  
25 protection.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           Time and again, our community and  
2 others have warned the impact that hate rhetoric  
3 can have and how it can lead to violent  
4 consequences.

5           The federal government and local law  
6 enforcement must work to investigate and  
7 prosecute hate crimes when they occur and must send  
8 a powerful message to those who might perpetrate  
9 hate crimes that these actions will not be  
10 normalized.

11           The continual depiction of Latinos as  
12 criminals, rapists and drug dealers and as threats  
13 to the American workforce and the dominant culture  
14 provide those who wish to do us harm the cover that  
15 they seek to carry out these biased attacks.

16           The rise in hate crimes against Latinos  
17 is certainly motivated by the anti-Latino and  
18 exclusionary laws and policies that have long  
19 marked a political discourse and that are gaining  
20 new steam today.

21           According to the federal government,  
22 reported hate crimes in 2016 -- of those reported  
23 hate crimes in 2016, approximately half were  
24 motivated by racial bias and one-third of those --  
25 one-third motivated by ethnic discrimination.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           However, as you all know, federal  
2 reporting of hate crimes provides an incomplete  
3 picture of the problem that we are dealing with.  
4 Local law enforcement are encouraged but not  
5 required to report hate crimes annually to the FBI.

6           But, since these law enforcement  
7 agencies are the largest source of information,  
8 their nonparticipation presents a real barrier to  
9 truly understanding the scope of this problem.

10           In addition to underreporting, many  
11 times hate crimes are incorrectly identified which  
12 adds to the limitation that this data -- that is  
13 current collected.

14           For example, if a police officer  
15 arrives to the scene of a location and sees  
16 vandalism with a slur or a hate image, they may  
17 report that incident as vandalism but not as a hate  
18 crime.

19           It's important that everybody does  
20 better to ensure that the jurisdictions and the FBI  
21 are correctly identifying hate crimes in our  
22 communities.

23           There have been some outside efforts to  
24 track and document these hate crimes by news  
25 outlets and others. However, this presents many

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 limitations as many crimes are not reported in the  
2 news or made viral on social media.

3 As hate crimes are going up for many  
4 racial and ethnic minorities, we must also discuss  
5 how race intersects with gender, gender identity,  
6 sexual orientation and disability and the  
7 heightened risk that certain members of our  
8 community face.

9 For instance, Los Angeles County noted  
10 that after the 2016 presidential election, there  
11 were 31 anti-transgender hate crimes, a 72 percent  
12 increase and that 97 percent of those were violent  
13 crimes.

14 In 2012 and 2016, hate crime rate of  
15 violence rose by 96 percent against transgender  
16 people and by 76 percent against LGBTQ individuals.

17 Transgender women of color are  
18 particularly vulnerable and are disproportionately  
19 targeted with deadly violence.

20 In order to have an inclusive  
21 discussion about anti-Latino hate crimes in  
22 America, we must also recognize and talk about how  
23 racial discrimination intersects with sexism,  
24 homophobia and transphobia in our society which can  
25 lead to deadly results for members of our

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 community.

2 MALDEF is also particularly concerned  
3 with hate crimes and hate rhetoric in our schools.  
4 Immigrant and Latino and other underrepresented  
5 students are particularly susceptible to bullying  
6 based on their identity.

7 One recent study from 2016 revealed  
8 that immigrant youth in the U.S. experience greater  
9 rates of bullying than do native born youth. Even  
10 when controlling for other factors like age,  
11 gender, race and ethnicity, grade level and family  
12 affluence.

13 The Latino students who experience  
14 bullying in high school also suffer from  
15 significant GPA drops compared to other students.

16 There have been numerous reports of  
17 anti-bullying incidents during and after the  
18 presidential election. After then candidate Trump  
19 called Mexican immigrants racists and criminals,  
20 Latino students in Sioux City, Iowa reported being  
21 harassed and bullied during school hours as other  
22 students changed Trump's name in their presence.

23 Students at the Rosa Parks Elementary  
24 School in Berkeley, California reported statements  
25 like -- reportedly made statements like, you live

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 in a Taco Bell and you'll get deported to other  
2 students.

3 And, the day after the election, middle  
4 school students in Royal Oak, Michigan chanted,  
5 "Build the wall," referencing the President's  
6 desire to build a border wall between the U.S. and  
7 Mexico, bringing several Latino students to tears.

8 The ASBLC reported 201 incidents of  
9 harassment and intimidation two days after that  
10 presidential election alone with anti-immigrant  
11 sentiments being the second most reported  
12 motivation.

13 MALDEF has created a resource material  
14 to educate students, teachers, administrators and  
15 parents about anti-immigrant and anti-Latino  
16 bullying and what their rights are.

17 At this critical time, MALDEF is  
18 prepared to provide leadership and to work to  
19 oppose discrimination and hate against the Latino  
20 community living in the United States.

21 We bring cases across the country to  
22 resist the tide of anti-Latino sentiment that  
23 infiltrates our communities.

24 We have brought litigation on behalf of  
25 Latinos that were violently assaulted and detained

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 at work and against anti-Latino agendas at the  
2 state and local level and we remain committed to  
3 this fight.

4 MALDEF is ready to meet that challenge  
5 before us and to give -- to work with you to end  
6 hate in our communities and to realize a vision for  
7 America that protects that protects every  
8 individual from being targeted because of who you  
9 are.

10 Thank you very much for the opportunity  
11 to speak today.

12 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you, Ms. Senteno.

13 Ms. Vogelstein?

14 MS. VOGELSTEIN: Chair Lhamon and  
15 distinguished members of the Commission, it's an  
16 honor to appear before you today.

17 I'm Aviva Vogelstein, I'm the Director  
18 of Legal Initiatives at the Brandeis Center, an  
19 independent nonpartisan institution for public  
20 interests, advocacy, research and education.

21 Our mission is to advance the civil and  
22 human rights of the Jewish people and promote  
23 justice for all.

24 In the course of my work as a civil  
25 rights lawyer, I've closely studied religiously

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 motivated hate and bias incidents with a particular  
2 focus on anti-Jewish incidents.

3 Religiously motivated hate is  
4 undeniably on the rise in our country and  
5 religiously motivated harassment is infiltrating  
6 our nation's schools. Some recently reported  
7 incidents help illustrate the problem.

8 Last May, a Muslim student was  
9 assaulted at a New York City public school. The  
10 assailant spit on her and attempted to pull off her  
11 hijab.

12 Last November, in Washington State, a  
13 14-year-old Sikh boy wearing a turban was punched  
14 and knocked down by a classmate.

15 Just two weeks ago, two members of a  
16 Jewish fraternity at a Maryland university were  
17 followed by suspects shouting "F" the Jews and  
18 calling them an ethnic slur.

19 The suspects then followed the victims  
20 and began punching one of the victims in the face.

21 At the Brandeis Center, we have  
22 assisted students who've been physically assaulted,  
23 spit on, verbally harassed and harassed on social  
24 media because of their actual or perceived Jewish  
25 identity.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1            Significant data as many panelists  
2 today have mentioned demonstrate that the numbers  
3 of anti-religious hate incidents are high and  
4 potentially rising. It's also important to  
5 remember the likelihood that many incidents are not  
6 even reported.

7            This problem in our schools has been  
8 almost entirely ignored until very recently. Until  
9 last month, the Department of Education's Office  
10 for Civil Rights did not collect data on  
11 religiously motivated harassment and bullying,  
12 although it amassed data on sex, race, color,  
13 national origin and disability.

14           The Brandeis Center has long encouraged  
15 data gathering on hate against religious  
16 minorities. We explained how it's a tremendously  
17 important first step to provide an accurate  
18 portrait of the problem and necessary to compel an  
19 effective governmental response.

20           In 2016, under the leadership of then  
21 Assistant Secretary for Civil Rights, Catherine  
22 Lhamon, the Department of Education announced that  
23 they would be expanding their mandatory civil  
24 rights data collection of American's public schools  
25 to include religious based bullying.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           OCR's new report just released proved  
2           the importance of this collection.    An alarming  
3           10,848 incidents, 8 percent of the total incidents  
4           in 2015 through 2016 were harassment or bullying  
5           based on religion.

6           Now that OCR has finally gathering this  
7           information, it has provided us with over 10,000  
8           reasons to take action.    It's unconscionable that  
9           this category of hate averaging approximately 30  
10          incidents per school day, 150 per school week and  
11          602 incidents per school month has, up until now,  
12          been largely unaddressed.

13          Our federal civil rights laws do not  
14          properly protect students from harassment based on  
15          religion.

16          Harassment and bullying is likely to  
17          have lasting psychological and emotional effects on  
18          students.    Bullying has been linked to many  
19          negative outcomes.

20          Kids who are bullied can experience  
21          negative physical, school and mental health issues.  
22          And, kids who bully others can engage in violent  
23          and other risky behaviors into adulthood.

24          The federal government needs to take  
25          action to better protect Muslims, Sikh, Jewish and

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 all students from religiously motivated harassment.

2 Title 6 of the Civil Rights Act of 1964  
3 which prohibits discrimination on the basis of  
4 race, color or national origin in federally  
5 assisted programs and activities has a glaring  
6 omission. It does not prohibit harassment based on  
7 religion.

8 The Department of Education has made  
9 incremental improvements. In a 2004 Dear Colleague  
10 Letter written by then Assistant Secretary for  
11 Civil Rights, Ken Marcus, who is currently the  
12 President of the Brandeis Center, OCR clarified  
13 that Title 6 protected students from certain  
14 religious groups that also have ethnic or ancestral  
15 component such as Judaism, Islam or Sikhism.

16 This guidance was largely unenforced  
17 for about six years but, in 2010, it was reaffirmed  
18 by both the Department of Justice and the  
19 Department of Education.

20 Though this guidance is currently in  
21 effect, there are several concerns.

22 As it's informal guidance, it may not  
23 endure through subsequent administrations.

24 Further, OCR could achieve a clearer,  
25 more transparent understanding of what is permitted

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 and what is not through providing more guidance.

2 By properly defining what  
3 discrimination based on ethnicity or ancestry  
4 entails, OCR could more easily identify address and  
5 prevent such incidents from recurring.

6 OCR should also discuss in guidance as  
7 recommended by the Commission in 2011 the First  
8 Amendment implications of anti-bullying policies.

9 The guidance should include that the  
10 Department's Title 6 policies should not be  
11 construed in ways that will limit free speech.

12 Moreover, OCR's policies do not protect  
13 students from harassment based on religion alone.  
14 They require an ethnic or ancestral component.

15 By prohibiting religion -- by  
16 prohibiting discrimination based on ethnicity or  
17 ancestry without also banning purely religious  
18 based discrimination, Title 6 extends greater  
19 protections to members of religious groups with  
20 shared ethnic or ancestral characteristics than to  
21 groups without.

22 All students deserve the same  
23 protections.

24 Congress must pass legislation to  
25 protect religious minorities from harassment.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           The new data on religious harassment  
2 reveals the extent of the problem. Now that OCR  
3 has taken this important first step, we urge OCR to  
4 use the new data for its intended purpose, to  
5 provide technical assistance where there are  
6 patterns of harassment, to assist with  
7 investigations in response to complaints and to  
8 compel an effective governmental response.

9           To do so, OCR must both disaggregate  
10 the data that has been collected and collect more  
11 data, particularly with regards to individual  
12 religions, type of harassment or bullying by  
13 religion, where the incidents are occurring and the  
14 context behind each incident.

15           This data could be useful for federal  
16 investigations and NGO research, but only if more  
17 details are added.

18           To help curb religious harassment and  
19 bullying, we urge the Commission to make the  
20 following recommendations.

21           Perhaps most importantly, Congress must  
22 act to prohibit religious harassment in federally  
23 assisted programs and activities. This could be  
24 achieved through amending existing legislation such  
25 as Title 6 of the Civil Rights Act or the Higher

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 Education Opportunities Act or, alternatively,  
2 Congress could introduce new standalone legislation  
3 to protect students from harassment based on  
4 religion.

5 For OCR, OCR should disaggregate  
6 existing data and collect additional data on what  
7 types of harassment and bullying are occurring by  
8 religion, where the incidents are occurring and the  
9 nature and severity of each incident.

10 OCR should also provide clarification  
11 and more definitions. And, in lieu of time, we  
12 urgently need more data, federal legislation and  
13 strong enforcement.

14 With over 10,000 incidents of religious  
15 hate in our public schools, the federal government  
16 must act. Religiously motivated hate is  
17 unacceptable and should be combated just as  
18 vigorously as all other forms of bigotry.

19 I thank you very much for your time.

20 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you to each  
21 panelist. I'll open it up to my fellow  
22 commissioners for questions.

23 Commissioner Yaki?

24 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Thank you, Madam  
25 Chair and thank all of you for your very powerful

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 testimony.

2 We had a lot of discussion earlier in  
3 the day about the need for better data collection,  
4 for greater participation in that data collection.  
5 And, of course, I'm not going to talk about any of  
6 that.

7 I'm going to -- I have been more  
8 concerned about how the -- how our country has  
9 treated both the media and the politicians, the  
10 whole notion of what constitutes hate crimes and  
11 what helps cultivate the environment for that.

12 And, I have a question for you and it  
13 has a legal and it has a, I want to call it, it has  
14 a public connotation.

15 When there's an organized pattern of  
16 action against a protected group, whether it's the  
17 folks at the Daily Stormfront or whatever the heck  
18 it's called and/or other organizations, it seems  
19 like the media has difficulty in calling it -- they  
20 call it a hate crime but part of, to me, it seems  
21 like it's a form of domestic terrorism.

22 Now, we don't have a domestic terrorism  
23 criminal part of the statute. It's in the Patriot  
24 Act defined for other reasons, but we've been quick  
25 -- we've only really called, I think, maybe Timothy

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 McVeigh a domestic terror.

2 But, there seems to be some reluctance  
3 to use that in the context of hate crimes  
4 perpetrated against protected classes.

5 And, I'd like to get the opinion of Ms.  
6 Masri and certainly Ms. Clarke about what you think  
7 about using that nomenclature more readily for the  
8 kinds of activities being perpetrated against  
9 protected individuals as well as whether or not the  
10 law -- the criminal law itself is sufficient to  
11 bring all the tools of the federal government to  
12 bear on these sorts of activities?

13 MS. MASRI: Thank you, Commissioner, I  
14 appreciate your question.

15 It is true, let's take a step back,  
16 terrorism is any violent activity whose purpose is  
17 to terrorize a community.

18 And, what we do know is the way that  
19 the word terrorism has been used has been  
20 disproportionately used against the Muslim  
21 community, both in the media, by politicians, but  
22 also it's resulted in disproportionate prosecutions  
23 against the Muslim community.

24 And, what that has done is it has fed  
25 into the narrative that the false narrative that

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 all terrorism is committed by Muslims.

2 We also have a larger problem and that  
3 is that the federal government has, in essence,  
4 criminalized the Muslim community by created a  
5 Terror Watch List whose standard in being included  
6 into the Terror Watch List is so low that  
7 reasonable suspicion alone is enough to land  
8 somebody on the Terror Watch List.

9 We do know that over 1 million people  
10 are on the Watch List and thousands upon thousands  
11 of Muslims potentially are on the Watch List.

12 And, having Muslims being named as  
13 known or suspected terrorists without even having  
14 ever been charged or committed -- or convicted of a  
15 crime related to terrorism, that also feeds into  
16 the public perception that terrorists are all  
17 committed --

18 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Whereas, hate  
19 groups, as defined by the Southern Poverty Law  
20 Center don't get that in Appalachia they're just  
21 called hate groups.

22 MS. MASRI: Yes, and the problem is, is  
23 that when terrorism or violence against a community  
24 is committed by a non-Muslim, there tends to be a  
25 focus on the actual reasons behind that crime.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           What are the mental health issues that  
2 might be in play? The way under that particular  
3 individual grew up in his home and his  
4 neighborhood, whether he's been bullied in school.

5           Those are the types of discussions that  
6 we really should be having if we want to combat  
7 terrorism, if we want to combat hate crimes is to  
8 really look at the root cause as opposed to wanting  
9 to fall into a false narrative.

10           MS. CLARKE: Thank you for this very  
11 important question, Commissioner Yaki.

12           Hate crimes are unique. They have a  
13 devastating impact on the individuals targeted and  
14 on communities as well.

15           And, for that reason, domestic  
16 terrorism feels like an appropriate way to  
17 categorize the level of impact and harm that flow  
18 from hate crimes when they occur.

19           The challenge, however, is that, in  
20 this era, we have seen domestic terrorism, the  
21 concept conflated with other things.

22           By way of example, the FBI's domestic  
23 terrorism analysis unit recently issued a report on  
24 so-called black identity extremism in our country.

25           This appears to be an effort that takes

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 aim on the work of civil rights advocates. It  
2 appears to be an effort that harkens back to the  
3 era in which the FBI and our federal government  
4 placed a target on the back of Dr. Martin Luther  
5 King and other activists.

6 So, we need to make sure that, if we  
7 have an agreement that domestic terrorism is an  
8 appropriate way to describe hate crimes that are  
9 playing out in our country, that we are very clear  
10 and have a shared understanding about what we're  
11 talking about.

12 And, what we should be directing our  
13 administration's limited resources to focus on is  
14 the rising tide of violent white supremacy in our  
15 country and the increase of hate incidents that are  
16 perpetrated against historically protected minority  
17 groups like African-Americans and Latinos,  
18 immigrants, religious minorities and others.

19 And, we need to make sure that we have  
20 agreement that we are not talking about African-  
21 American activists and that we put rest this black  
22 identity extremism designation which really should  
23 have no place in our democracy today.

24 CHAIR LHAMON: Commissioner Narasaki?

25 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Thank you,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Madam Chair.

2 Hello, Ms. Clarke, your testimony noted  
3 that the FBI can support efforts to increase  
4 reporting by engaging special agents in charge.  
5 What would that look like?

6 MS. CLARKE: Law enforcement must do  
7 more to more effectively combat, investigate and  
8 address hate incidents when they arise.

9 One of the things that we've done at  
10 the lawyers committee is we forged a partnership  
11 with the International Association of Chiefs of  
12 Police to help strengthen the way in which local  
13 police and sheriffs offices go about combating hate  
14 today.

15 But, to your question, we think that  
16 training, better training for FBI and our federal  
17 law enforcement agencies that are tasked with  
18 investigating hate incidents when they arise in our  
19 country is key.

20 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Great, thank  
21 you.

22 Also, there's been a debate all morning  
23 about whether the federal government should have a  
24 role or has a role in addressing hate crimes either  
25 in the education space or in the general space.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           And, I'm interested in hearing what you  
2 think the federal -- whether there should be a  
3 federal role and, if so, what is that federal role?

4           MS. CLARKE: So, Commissioner Narasaki,  
5 I would just, to amplify my prior response and  
6 address your second question, talk very  
7 specifically about the role of federal agencies  
8 from A to Z.

9           The U.S. Attorney should be supporting  
10 the Civil Rights Division to address and clamp down  
11 on hate incidents, whether they are in plain sight  
12 of our nation's schools or in our college campuses  
13 and universities.

14           The FBI should be supporting these  
15 efforts as well and there should be a special agent  
16 in charge tasked to respond to hate incidents when  
17 they occur.

18           The FBI's Criminal Justice Information  
19 Services should also be supporting U.S. Attorneys  
20 Offices in this effort, the DOJ's, the Justice  
21 Department's Bureau of Justice Statistics plays an  
22 important role here as well.

23           But, we are at a moment where we  
24 observe the federal government retreating from this  
25 space, not bringing enough cases and not activating

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 the vast resources of the federal government to  
2 address these incidents, whether they play out at  
3 schools, on campuses or elsewhere in our country.

4 MS. SENTENO: I just wanted to add to  
5 that, that while I, you know, understand that  
6 question to mean what would be the role of the  
7 federal government in perhaps prosecuting or  
8 reviewing cases against hate crime and certainly  
9 echo the remarks by Ms. Clarke.

10 I also would, you know, encourage there  
11 to be some discussion about the role of funding to  
12 encourage prevention of hate crimes in schools and  
13 in other areas of our community to make sure that  
14 law enforcement offices make sure that federal  
15 agencies are equipped to provide that kind of  
16 support at the local level to prevent these types  
17 of crimes from occurring or the type of behavior  
18 that can lead to those types of crimes occurring.

19 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Thank you.

20 Ms. Vogelstein? Is it Stein or Stein?  
21 Sorry.

22 So, unfortunately, the Department of  
23 Education didn't -- Office of Civil Rights didn't  
24 send a witness. So, we don't have an opportunity  
25 to explore from them what's going on.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 I'm wondering if you have some thoughts  
2 about what they're doing well and what they need to  
3 do better?

4 And, also, what the impact is of the  
5 reported closure of numerous education, civil  
6 rights education complaints on addressing and  
7 preventing bias motivated bullying and harassment  
8 in schools might be having on the issue?

9 MS. VOGELSTEIN: Sure, thank you,  
10 Commissioner.

11 So, the OCR just released their data  
12 about two or three weeks ago. And, we were so  
13 pleased that for the first time, they included  
14 their data collection, a mandatory data collection  
15 on religious harassment and bullying in public  
16 schools. So, this is great.

17 The -- what the Office for Civil  
18 Rights, what we're recommending they do now is they  
19 take this one step further and disaggregate the  
20 data that they have collected and also collect more  
21 data.

22 So, right now, there was a question on  
23 the form that said, you know, was there religious  
24 harassment or bullying based on religion. And  
25 then, the respondees wrote how many incidents.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           But, it wasn't separated by religion.  
2           So, we don't know what percentage of those  
3           incidents were anti-Jewish, anti-Muslim, anti-Sikh,  
4           anti-Christian, any type of breakdown like that.

5           We also -- we don't know by the report  
6           that was released what types of incidents are  
7           occurring by religion.

8           So, we don't know, for example, if they  
9           were violent assaults or verbal harassment or  
10          assault with a weapon or whatever it was.

11          We also don't know the context behind  
12          the incident.

13          So, these are all important things for  
14          our federal government to be able to use to take  
15          this a step further and fully address the problem.

16          COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Have they given  
17          a reason for why they didn't ask the question in a  
18          more disaggregated way?

19          MS. VOGELSTEIN: There was -- I think  
20          that because this was the first year that they did  
21          it, they were just collecting on religious  
22          incidents in general. And, I believe there was  
23          some debate when they were asking about whether  
24          they were going to be collecting data in 2013,  
25          about whether it was disclosing the private

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 information of individuals to be asking these  
2 questions.

3 Chair Lhamon would probably --

4 CHAIR LHAMON: I can speak to that if  
5 you would like.

6 (LAUGHTER)

7 MS. VOGELSTEIN: So, what I would like  
8 to say is that, it's really necessary for our  
9 government to be disaggregating by religion and  
10 providing this additional information.

11 It's not a question about necessarily  
12 what the religion is of the students, but on what  
13 religious grounds they were targeted. And, that's  
14 a really important clarification for proper  
15 guidance and enforcement by the government.

16 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Well, I'd also  
17 like to ask that throughout the day, those who  
18 oppose hate crime laws, particularly on the federal  
19 level, have been questioning whether hate crimes  
20 are actually on the rise.

21 In your testimony you said it's  
22 undeniably, at least anti-religious is undeniably  
23 on the rise.

24 Some people have said, well, maybe it's  
25 just that there's more people reporting because of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 all the good work that's being done trying to  
2 encourage people to report as opposed to there's an  
3 actual rise or if they've looked at, oh gee, other  
4 crimes are rising and this is rising too. And,  
5 unless it's rising at a faster rate, then I guess,  
6 apparently, we shouldn't be worried.

7 I don't really quite understand that  
8 because I think then you should be worried about  
9 any crime that's on the rise.

10 But, I wanted to get your take on that.

11 MS. VOGELSTEIN: Yes, thank you.

12 So, I've looked at a whole bunch of  
13 studies on this across the board. And, you are  
14 absolutely right that since there is so much that's  
15 unreported, we don't necessarily know 100 percent.

16 But, I can say that based on the date,  
17 the FBI data, I believe, this year there was -- I  
18 think someone said earlier there was a 5 percent  
19 increase in hate crimes overall.

20 There was about a 13 percent increase  
21 on hate crimes by religion.

22 There was -- there were 50 -- I think  
23 it was 54 -- over 54 percent of these hate crimes  
24 were anti-Jewish. I think 24 percent were anti-  
25 Muslim, the rest were against everyone else.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           The anti-Jewish and anti-Muslim  
2 incidents have risen significantly since the  
3 previous year.

4           I have also looked at surveys by the  
5 ADL, by the Sikh Coalition and it appears that the  
6 numbers are rising, whether it's -- if it's because  
7 there's more reporting than previously, I think  
8 it's, you know, it's a good thing that there's more  
9 reporting.

10           But, every survey that I looked at  
11 shows that the numbers are on the rise.

12           COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Madam Chair, am  
13 I allowed to ask --

14           CHAIR LHAMON: Go ahead.

15           COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: So, when I  
16 looked at the data, I have to say I was a little  
17 surprised at what the data was for Latinos, given  
18 what's going on in the world.

19           But then, I was thinking -- I'm  
20 wondering how much of that is maybe attributable to  
21 the increase in fear of the community, not just  
22 undocumented but those who live with undocumented.  
23 Because, we know many live in mixed households.

24           So, I'm wondering if you could tell me  
25 whether my instincts are correct or am I totally

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 off base?

2 MS. SENTENO: Well, I think that is  
3 correct. And, I think that to, you know, go to the  
4 earlier point when we're looking at whether or not  
5 there's a rise in reporting of hate crimes, you  
6 know, when you're looking at a population like  
7 Latinos and those individuals who live in a mixed  
8 status family, a decrease in hate crimes being  
9 reported isn't necessarily going to mean that there  
10 is a decrease in crimes overall.

11 But, rather, as you've pointed out,  
12 there is a very, very probably sense of fear  
13 running through our community everywhere. Part of  
14 that is attributed to the broader attacks on Latino  
15 and immigrant communities across the country, the  
16 attacks on sanctuary jurisdictions.

17 In Texas in the wake of SB-4, there  
18 were drops in reporting to police of all crimes in  
19 Latino communities.

20 And so, because people are afraid to  
21 come forward for fear of either -- of some sort of  
22 negative retaliation from the federal government  
23 that they might be subject to removal, that a  
24 family member may be subject to removal or, in  
25 other instances, that are probably very common for

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 many other communities not wanting to report a hate  
2 incident in the workplace for fear of losing your  
3 job which might have different repercussions for  
4 you and your family.

5 We are going to see depressed levels of  
6 reporting. I think not just of reporting crimes  
7 overall, but also of reporting hate crimes.

8 But, I think that, you know, looking at  
9 the reports that MALDEF has seen, particularly in  
10 the wake of the election, the type of violence  
11 that's being perpetrated against Latinos certainly  
12 indicates and is consistent with the reports that  
13 we have seen that, you know, in certain areas,  
14 Latino hate crimes are being reported are  
15 increased, inconsistently reported.

16 And so, I think that, you know, seeing  
17 those incidents across the country where someone is  
18 targeted because they're Latino and the rhetoric  
19 that is used is -- used to cast them as an outsider  
20 because they may or may not be perceived to be an  
21 immigrant and that is, you know, unpopular from our  
22 federal government.

23 I think certainly it contributes to all  
24 of that.

25 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: And, one more?

2 CHAIR LHAMON: Okay, this is your last  
3 one.

4 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Okay, sorry.

5 ~~MxMs~~. Chestnut, so, I'm struck by your  
6 very strong statement that, from your perspective,  
7 a hate crime law doesn't help. And, anti-Asian  
8 violence is something that actually brought me into  
9 the movement.

10 And, one of my frustrations was that,  
11 really, it was hard to get people to see those  
12 kinds of crimes committed against Asians as a hate  
13 crime. Because, at the time, Asian Americans  
14 weren't really being even thought about because it  
15 was a small population.

16 And, on top of that frustration was the  
17 media did not cover those hate crimes. You would  
18 not see it on Good Morning America, you would not  
19 see it on nightly news. At best, you would see it  
20 in a local paper and probably not even on  
21 television.

22 I worked very hard to get those crimes  
23 seen because I thought it was very important for  
24 people to understand that, in fact, you're being  
25 targeted as a group. Right? It's not you being

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 targeted as an individual.

2 And, to force people to see, in fact,  
3 that that was happening and to get those stories  
4 told.

5 So, I wanted to kind of better  
6 understand because I will say that, having worked  
7 with victims of anti-Asian violence I do feel that,  
8 you know, it's more important to work on trying to  
9 stop it from the beginning because I learned that  
10 even if you prosecute someone and put them away,  
11 you can't put the family back together. Right?  
12 That family, that community is irretrievably  
13 broken.

14 So, I get the fact that laws enough are  
15 not enough alone. But, I just wanted to probe a  
16 little bit more sort of where that comes from.

17 MX. CHESTNUT: Yes, I think that's a  
18 great question and it sounds like a lot of our work  
19 had similarities.

20 And, I think, from a trans perspective,  
21 it's important to note that like we don't even know  
22 how many trans-people exist in the United States,  
23 and certainly the media is doing very little to  
24 sort of cover trans people in a healthy manner.

25 You ask sort of most Americans what

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 they think, how they've seen trans-people  
2 portrayed, it's a sex worker, it's when they're  
3 dead, it's as a criminal.

4 You know, and much of our work at the  
5 Trans Law Center is, how do we make sure that  
6 society understands the value of trans-people and  
7 sort of what they're adding to this society as a  
8 whole.

9 You know, and that said, it's -- it  
10 needs to come from an abolitionist framework. And,  
11 for me, something that I think really shifted  
12 personally for me in my mind was, a number of years  
13 ago, there was a young woman, her name as Islan  
14 Nettles. She was a 20-something transgender woman  
15 in Harlem, New York and she was killed because she  
16 was trans.

17 She had been on the street at night, a  
18 young man, Islan Nettles was African-American as  
19 was the man who killed her.

20 He saw her on the street, he cat called  
21 her, thought she was really cute. He didn't know  
22 that she was trans. She died.

23 He started getting made fun of by his  
24 friends and he pushed her to the ground and she  
25 died of a trauma to her head.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           You know, the police arrived. They  
2           didn't realize that she was trans. So, the hate  
3           crimes unit wasn't called at all immediately. They  
4           figured out she was trans by the time they got her  
5           to the hospital.

6           This woman, young woman, was on life  
7           support and it took about six months to find the  
8           man who had harmed her and ultimately killed her.

9           And, I remember sitting in the  
10          courtroom with the victim's mother the day that the  
11          sentence came for this young man. He's 24 years  
12          old, he's going to spend 12 years in prison.

13          He was not charged with a hate crime,  
14          he was charged with second degree murder, I  
15          believe.

16          You know, and some of the communities  
17          outraged, they're like why isn't this a hate crime.  
18          And, in my mind, I'm thinking, this young man's  
19          going to go to prison for 12 years.

20          He's known to have killed a trans-  
21          person so he's not going to be targeted that he  
22          killed a trans-person, he'll be targeted that he  
23          was attracted to a trans-woman and he got busted  
24          for it.

25          They'll probably get raped in prison.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 He'll get harassed the whole time he's there by  
2 other inmates and he'll get released and he'll,  
3 one, not think any differently of trans-people to  
4 value them.

5 His friends will probably taunt him for  
6 the rest of his life. And, if anything, escalate  
7 violence when they see another trans-person in  
8 their neighborhood.

9 So, for me, I think what was most  
10 devastating of that, is that it was a community  
11 that was impacted by it. It wasn't, you know, it  
12 wasn't a white man attacking a community of color,  
13 it was a young black man attacking another young  
14 black woman.

15 And, what are we doing as a whole, and  
16 I don't want to target at one specific community,  
17 this is an epidemic. How do we think about that  
18 education and, you know, make people understand  
19 that violence against trans-people is harming us  
20 all and that trans-people, they're not making  
21 national news at all, I mean, anywhere.

22 And, it's kind of our responsibility to  
23 start talking about that and at a very young age.  
24 Young kids who are trans should be able to go to  
25 school and be safe and they're not. And then,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 they're living up to be, you know, to grow up and  
2 be killed.

3 So, I guess, to me, it's all very  
4 connected in how do we start that early  
5 intervention?

6 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Thank you.

7 CHAIR LHAMON: Commissioner Adegbile?

8 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Yes, thank you  
9 for your testimony. This question is open to  
10 anybody who wants to take a cut at it.

11 I'm trying to understand what the root  
12 cause, what we understand the root cause or causes  
13 of underreporting to be. Because, I don't think  
14 that we can really move the dial until we have a  
15 deeper understanding about why it is that  
16 jurisdictions don't report these types of crimes.

17 And so, if you all can help us  
18 understand what those causes are, we might be  
19 better able to recommend things that can move the  
20 dial.

21 But, if we don't know, if we don't have  
22 an understanding of what those root causes are, I  
23 think the pattern is probably going to continue.

24 MX. CHESTNUT: I mean, I can quickly  
25 just say this, I think there's fear of reporting to

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 law enforcement or official government agencies of  
2 not being believed or being mistreated as you're  
3 reporting.

4 But, I think the reality of it is, is  
5 find me an LGBT person who hasn't at some time in  
6 their life been called an anti-LGBT epithet or  
7 worse and just normalized it and started to sort  
8 say like, well, you know, at least I wasn't like  
9 beat up today, I was just called like an anti-LGBT  
10 epithet while walking to work.

11 So, I think part of its shifting how  
12 society wants to think about these things but also  
13 encouraging people not to normalize constant  
14 harassment.

15 MS. MASRI: And, I can add to that as  
16 well. From the Muslim community's perspective, a  
17 lot of the hate crimes that are occurring are a  
18 direct response to a lot of the sentiment that's  
19 been pushed by politicians and elected officials by  
20 the government.

21 And, there's also a perception of  
22 government policy specifically targeting the Muslim  
23 community.

24 And so, as a result, there is a genuine  
25 fear among Muslims of reporting any hate crime that

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 occurs because they fear additional consequences  
2 from their interaction with government officials.

3 On the other hand, anti-Muslim  
4 sentiment and hate crimes, harassment, intimidation  
5 has become so commonplace that people underestimate  
6 it or they set it aside as a common occurrence.  
7 They don't think that their individual  
8 circumstances are important enough to report it or  
9 to bring it to anybody's attention.

10 So, it is important that the government  
11 first establish trust in order to increase the  
12 reporting. There is also other mechanisms of  
13 getting reports and that is through state and local  
14 agencies that do reporting but are not -- their  
15 records are not being transferred into any type of  
16 central database.

17 There should be a focus on the federal  
18 government to create a central database from all  
19 the rights commissions, state agencies that are  
20 collecting that will at least increase the numbers  
21 that are coming in.

22 MS. VOGELSTEIN: I can add to that.  
23 So, our federal civil rights laws don't properly  
24 protect students from religious harassment.

25 OCR has extended the protections of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 Title 6 to protect students based on ethnicity or  
2 ancestry, but not specifically religion.

3 So, through clearer guidance from the  
4 Department of Education and through legislation  
5 that protects religious students from harassment,  
6 there could be better reporting as well as better  
7 enforcement of incidents.

8 MS. CLARKE: Yes, thank you for that  
9 question, Commissioner Adegbile.

10 I think that this is a very important  
11 issue that requires work from a few different  
12 angles. Building trust with communities that tend  
13 to be targeted by hate crimes is key.

14 And, one way for law enforcement  
15 agencies to build that trust is to ensure that  
16 their ranks reflect the diversities of -- the  
17 diversity of the communities that they endeavor to  
18 protect and serve.

19 They should meet and convene regularly  
20 with communities. Hear from them, understand them,  
21 understand the ways in which they are impacted. Law  
22 enforcement stands to learn a lot from communities  
23 through meaningful and real engagement.

24 I also think that it is important to be  
25 very intentional about wanting to hear from

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 victims.

2 Through our work with the International  
3 Association of Chiefs of Police, we've had law  
4 enforcement share that they had not done enough to  
5 make fighting hate crimes a priority.

6 And, last summer, through our work with  
7 that group, they passed a resolution that made  
8 fighting hate crimes a priority which, by itself,  
9 sends a strong message to the communities that you  
10 care about hate crimes and want to hear from people  
11 when they are victimized.

12 But, a more micro level, I think it's  
13 important when we're talking about hate crimes  
14 inflicted on undocumented and immigrant communities  
15 to have a very clear and unmistakable policy that  
16 someone's status will not be used against them if  
17 they call to report a crime or an incident.

18 So, there are many ways that we can  
19 work to attack this issue, trust is paramount but  
20 policies, training and engaging with communities I  
21 think are equally important parts of the strategy  
22 as well.

23 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Ms. Clarke, if  
24 I could follow up for a moment. Earlier, I think  
25 the DOJ representative shared some of this notion

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 about engaging with communities as did some of the  
2 other law enforcement officers.

3 But, my understanding is, and I don't  
4 know if I have this right, but my understanding is  
5 that the future of the community relation service  
6 and DOJ is in some doubt at this point.

7 And, I'm wondering if that is  
8 consistent with this notion that in order to  
9 discharge the duty of connecting with communities  
10 taking apart an apparatus that was established as  
11 part of the 1964 Civil Rights Act for purposes of  
12 having outreach into communities and providing a  
13 mechanism for positive discussion that is not just  
14 treating DOJ as only an enforcement tool.

15 I'm trying to figure out how this lines  
16 up with that professed need of law enforcement?

17 MS. CLARKE: The U.S. Department of  
18 Justice is our nation's largest and most important  
19 federal law enforcement agency. And, for sure, the  
20 community relation services the one part of this  
21 vast agency that has been tasked for decades with  
22 connecting with communities, resolving conflicts,  
23 bringing communities that are divided together.

24 We deemed it devastating to hear that  
25 the budget has been wiped out for this critical

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 part of DOJ. And, we think that it turns the clock  
2 back decades and efforts to ensure that the Justice  
3 Department is able to step into communities that  
4 have been impacted and devastated by hate crimes  
5 and really get in there and work together to bring  
6 people together to promote unity in a way that is  
7 so needed on the heels of a hate crime.

8 This is the peacekeeping arm of the  
9 Justice Department and we hope that in the weeks  
10 ahead, we'll see Congress working with DOJ to  
11 reverse the decision to wipe away what truly is one  
12 of the most critical parts of our U.S. Department  
13 of Justice.

14 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Thank you.

15 CHAIR LHAMON: Commissioner Kladney?

16 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Thank you, Madam  
17 Chair.

18 I have a question only because we  
19 talked a lot about data in the last couple of years  
20 and the reporting going up in the last couple of  
21 years.

22 What do those numbers and reports look  
23 like say for the last 10 years or 20 years? Have  
24 they been on the increase or have been on the  
25 decline? Was the -- are you talking about the last

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 two years because there was such a tremendous  
2 percentage increase?

3 If I could have some answers, I'd  
4 appreciate that if you know what the numbers are or  
5 what the percentages have been or if you can lay  
6 your hands on those numbers?

7 Okay.

8 MS. SENTENO: So, I'll just say, you  
9 know, from our review, according to BJS statistics  
10 from 2004 to 2015, the average number of hate  
11 crimes reported was about a quarter of a million.

12 And that --

13 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Annually?

14 MS. SENTENO: Annually, each year.  
15 Wait, that can't be.

16 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Sounds like a  
17 lot.

18 MS. SENTENO: I'll review if that was  
19 actually annually.

20 But, we saw that it looked as though,  
21 you know, from 2004 to 2015, there were changes.  
22 There were fluctuations up. Our understanding is  
23 that hate crime reporting didn't dip significantly  
24 or there were no significant kind of decreases, but  
25 rather there were changes particularly for Latinos

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that there were periods of increased reporting but  
2 never kind of dramatic drops.

3 And so, we were always looking at a  
4 rate of either a steady level of reporting for hate  
5 crimes against Latinos or an increased level for  
6 the past 10 years.

7 And, we're certainly able to follow up  
8 on that one statistic.

9 And then, our other understanding is  
10 that for the period between 2011 and 2015, the most  
11 common motivation for hate crimes was racial bias.

12 CHAIR LHAMON: Ms. Vogelstein, it  
13 looked like you maybe took out some data.

14 MS. VOGELSTEIN: Yes, I'll just add  
15 something. Well, I took out the FBI data and I do  
16 know that FBI hate crime reporting, what was  
17 reported, there were something like 500 more  
18 victims in 2016 than in 2015, 7,615 victims in 2016  
19 and I don't have the 2015 data right in front of  
20 me. But, it was about 500 less.

21 I will also say with anti-Semitic  
22 hatred specifically, the ADL released a study in  
23 January. And, I believe that they found that anti-  
24 Semitic incidents increased by 59 percent from 2015  
25 through 2016, or sorry, 2016 through 2017.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1                   COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Right. Well, I  
2 understand that. I was just trying to see what the  
3 results were the last ten years.

4                   MS. VOGELSTEIN: Oh, so, I don't know  
5 all of the data but I do know that this past year  
6 of the ADL's report was the second highest number  
7 since they started reporting in the 1970s.

8                   COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Ms. Masri, I'm  
9 sure you have something to say.

10                  MS. MASRI: Yes, in terms of our  
11 internal statistics, I can't give you the numbers  
12 off hand, but I can tell you that generally what we  
13 saw was a spike and an increase of hate crimes  
14 post-9/11. And, a second spike was post-election  
15 last year.

16                  Post-election last year, we saw a  
17 significant spike in bullying as well. And, as I  
18 mentioned earlier, specifically teachers on  
19 students bullying has spiked in the last year.

20                  Generally speaking, since 9/11 hate  
21 crimes has been pretty much steadily increasing  
22 with the exception of the spikes that I just  
23 mentioned.

24                  COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: I was wondering  
25 if, because we're running out of time and I know

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that the Chair is very strict.

2 CHAIR LHAMON: True, and I have some  
3 questions, too.

4 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: So my question  
5 is, do you have charts for your individual groups  
6 that you represent in this regard that you can  
7 submit?

8 Because I think it -- a chart,  
9 especially if we could put it in the report of say  
10 10 or 20 years of reporting for like religious or  
11 Latino or African-American, transgender, Muslim  
12 would be very effective in terms of seeing what  
13 exactly is happening because everybody's been  
14 talking about data all day and it would be nice to  
15 see it.

16 Thank you.

17 MS. SENTENO: Can I just, you know,  
18 just to go back to the earlier point, the statistic  
19 that I cited, it is indeed 250,000 average each  
20 year from 2004 to 2015. The data is based on BJS  
21 statistics as well as the National Crime  
22 Victimization surveys and other data that the  
23 federal government pulled together. And, we'd be  
24 happy to provide this information.

25 CHAIR LHAMON: Thanks very much.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 Ms. Clarke, you testified earlier that  
2 we are at a moment where we observe the federal  
3 government retreating its hate crime enforcement  
4 work and bringing up cases and not addressing hate  
5 crimes.

6 At an earlier panel and also in written  
7 testimony that we received from DOJ, we heard that  
8 combating hate crimes is among the highest  
9 priorities for the Civil Rights Division in the  
10 Justice Department and a commitment for the  
11 Department to use all of our investigative and  
12 prosecutorial authority to bring perpetrators to  
13 justice.

14 We also heard touting that since  
15 January 2017, the Department has brought hate  
16 crimes charges against more than two dozen  
17 defendants and obtained 22 convictions.

18 I note that that does contrast with the  
19 prior administration's record with respect to hate  
20 crimes charges, on average about 32 and a quarter  
21 charges per year. So, it does look like there may  
22 be some decline but -- in those in one year.

23 I'm just curious from your perspective  
24 from this work that you've been doing if you could  
25 characterize what you mean about seeing the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Department of Justice now retreating from hate  
2 crimes enforcement.

3 Because that stands in pretty stark  
4 contrast to the testimony received.

5 MS. CLARKE: Thank you very much for  
6 that question, Commissioner Lhamon, and for your  
7 leadership and focusing the Commission's attention  
8 on this crisis.

9 Words must be backed by action. And,  
10 from our perspective, many of the new hate  
11 incidents and hate crimes that have been happening  
12 across our country over the past year, past year  
13 and a half have been ones in which we've seen  
14 silence from the Justice Department and silence  
15 from our Attorney General.

16 I think that these moments are moments  
17 that really require leadership, require that we  
18 have an Attorney General prepared to stand up and  
19 use the bully pulpit of the office to condemn hate,  
20 to condemn the impact that hate has on communities.

21 An Attorney General who can sympathize  
22 with the victims and communities that have been  
23 targeted.

24 It is my observation that Attorney  
25 General Jeff Sessions has not done enough to use

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the bully pulpit and unique powers of the office to  
2 speak out, confront hate and to support local law  
3 enforcement in investigating these incidents when  
4 they arise or in taking concerted action to have  
5 the federal government lead and spearhead more  
6 investigations at the federal level and to hate  
7 incidents that are taking place in our country.

8 That said, I will give credit to the  
9 Justice Department for completing investigations  
10 that were initiated and started during the prior  
11 administration.

12 And, I think that those have provided  
13 some moments for this administration to essentially  
14 take credit for work that was already well underway  
15 before the clock started on this new  
16 administration's efforts.

17 It is our goal and intention to bring  
18 pressure to bear on this Justice Department to  
19 stand up to hate. And, we feel that it is  
20 important for the Justice Department to do more  
21 than it has presently.

22 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you very much.

23 Mx. Chestnut, you made, I thought, a  
24 very compelling argument for focusing on prevention  
25 and I wonder if you could give us some

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 recommendations for what kinds of prevention areas  
2 you think are most fruitful or most necessary?

3 MX. CHESTNUT: There's been a number of  
4 campaigns that have started ahead of sort of states  
5 pushing anti-trans ballot measures and really just  
6 public education.

7 Because, most of Americans when polled,  
8 they aren't against anti-discrimination  
9 protections, but when they go to vote, they don't  
10 know what they're voting on and they don't  
11 understand what transgender people, who they are  
12 and what they mean.

13 So, simply like public education  
14 campaigns. And, I know a number of years ago, D.C.  
15 ran one that was quite successful and it really was  
16 just like putting trans-people sort of in the day  
17 to day life like, hey, I'm trans and I work with  
18 you.

19 California has run a very successful  
20 campaign thinking that they were going to have a  
21 ballot measure called Transform California and it  
22 was about educating local business owners on like  
23 who transgender people are, what they might look  
24 like and that it doesn't really matter that they're  
25 transgender just like don't violate their rights.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           You know, and I think part of it is  
2 pushing the media around these narratives and  
3 moving away from this like only talk about trans-  
4 people when they're dead. You know, certainly  
5 people like Janet Mock and Laverne Cox have done  
6 wonders to sort of bolster this like image of  
7 trans-people.

8           But, the reality of it is, not everyone  
9 is a Janet Mock or a Laverne Cox and understanding  
10 that you might have trans-people working at Bank of  
11 America or at McDonald's or right here at the  
12 Commission.

13           And, educating people, you know, like  
14 asking peoples pronouns at work is a huge step. I  
15 was impressed when coordinating this, a staff  
16 member was like, can I ask your pronouns? You  
17 know, that's uncommon in my experience.

18           So, things like that which are just  
19 simple and actions that people really overlook, the  
20 healthcare component is huge. You know, like, what  
21 we might lose with healthcare for trans-people,  
22 it's like, never mind transition related care, it's  
23 like people's ability to go to the doctor and be  
24 safe is what's the priority here.

25           So, you know, general education that

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 can start in elementary school and go all the way  
2 up. And, frankly, young people are leading the  
3 charge here right now. There's amazing young  
4 people around the country organizing and adults  
5 need to catch up to them.

6 CHAIR LHAMON: Thanks very much.

7 Commissioner Kirsanow, you're the last  
8 question.

9 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Great, thank  
10 you.

11 Thanks to everybody. Just one quick  
12 question. Is there any better database for  
13 assessing the rate and number of hate crimes than  
14 the FBI's Hate Crime Statistics database?

15 Or, putting it another way, the Bureau  
16 of Justice Statistics database?

17 Either from a quantitative or  
18 qualitative perspective?

19 MX. CHESTNUT: I mean, an initiative  
20 that a number of groups in this room are part of  
21 with the Communities Against Hate which was an  
22 initiative that started right after the election, I  
23 think did a much better job at bringing groups  
24 together.

25 I mean, I'll be frank, that the FBI

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 statistics don't include trans-people so we don't  
2 have any idea how many trans-people are harmed.

3 And, part of it's like including  
4 communities that might otherwise be excluded from  
5 this information.

6 So, I don't know the website but I'm  
7 sure one of these groups, which I'm sure, I think,  
8 all of these -- some of groups would know the web  
9 address.

10 MS. VOGELSTEIN: I'll just add that  
11 OCR's mandatory civil rights data collection could  
12 be tremendously helpful, especially if more data is  
13 added for religious harassment.

14 CHAIR LHAMON: I'm certainly a fan of  
15 that database, I will say. But, Mx. Chestnut, if I  
16 could, having said that was going to be the last  
17 question that was I'm going to ask you one more.

18 Robert Moossy, I think testified  
19 earlier today about the regular receipt of data  
20 about trans hate crimes or potential hate crimes  
21 coming in, I think, on a quarterly basis to the  
22 DOJ.

23 And, I wonder if you have any  
24 information about whether the DOJ then collects and  
25 reports out in way that is accessible to others or

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 usable for the DOJ itself?

2 MX. CHESTNUT: I can't speak to how it  
3 is, but my guess is that it's coming from local law  
4 enforcement agencies. And, the problem with it is,  
5 is one, I -- there's grave concern that law  
6 enforcement should be collecting information on  
7 gender identity or sexual orientation to some  
8 matter give that the nature in which trans-people  
9 are targeted by many different aspects of the  
10 community.

11 But then, two, often times, they're not  
12 collecting information on gender identities. So,  
13 like, it might be a bias crime related to their  
14 LGBT identity, but we have no sense of knowing how  
15 it's then broken down.

16 So, the data, when you start counting  
17 trans-people in the first place before like in  
18 other areas of the world before we can then assume  
19 that that information's actually making it because  
20 it's not.

21 CHAIR LHAMON: Thanks very much.

22 Thank you, again, to this very powerful  
23 panel. We really appreciate it.

24 We are going to come back in ten  
25 minutes at 2:30 for our next panel today.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 (Whereupon, the above-entitled matter  
2 went off the record at 2:20 p.m. and resumed at  
3 2:30 p.m.)

4 CHAIR LHAMON: Okay. I'm getting us  
5 started on time for our fourth panel of the day.

6 **PANEL FOUR: CURRENT AND FORMER FEDERAL OFFICIALS**

7 CHAIR LHAMON: It's a panel of current  
8 and former federal officials in the order in which  
9 they will speak. Our panelists are Dr. Lynn  
10 Langton, Chief of the Victimization Statistics Unit  
11 at the Bureau of Justice Statistics, at the U.S.  
12 Department of Justice.

13 Roy Austin, who's a Partner at Harris,  
14 Wiltshire & Grannis, LLP, and a former Deputy  
15 Assistant Attorney General of the Civil Rights  
16 Division at the U.S. Department of Justice.

17 Cynthia Deitle, Programs and Operations  
18 Director at the Matthew Shepard Foundation and  
19 Former Civil Rights Unit Chief at the Federal  
20 Bureau of Investigation.

21 Debbie Osgood, who is a Partner at  
22 Hogan Marren Babbo & Rose, and former National  
23 Enforcement Director at the Office for Civil  
24 Rights, at the U.S. Department of Education.

25 And Olabisi Okubadejo of Counsel at

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Ballard Spahr and former Supervisory General  
2 Attorney at the U.S. Department of Education's  
3 Office for Civil Rights.

4 Dr. Langton, please begin.

5 MS. LANGTON: Good afternoon. Thank  
6 you for inviting me here today to discuss the  
7 Bureau of Justice Statistic's efforts to understand  
8 the level and nature of hate crime experienced by  
9 residents of our country.

10 As Deputy Assistant Attorney General  
11 Robert Moossy noted in his earlier remarks, the  
12 Department of Justice and the Bureau of Justice  
13 Statistics have long recognized the importance of  
14 having accurate and reliable data on hate crime.  
15 And we continually work to improve our efforts to  
16 provide better and more timely data.

17 As you know, the Department of Justice  
18 administers the country's two primary collections  
19 of statistical data on hate crime. The first is  
20 the FBI's hate crime statistics program which of  
21 course is part of the UCR.

22 And these data are compiled by local  
23 law enforcement agencies and reflect crimes that  
24 are known to police. And recorded as hate crimes  
25 by police.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           The second source of statistical data,  
2           which I'll focus more on today, is the Bureau of  
3           Justice Statistics National Crime Victimization  
4           Survey. The NCVS is a nationally representative  
5           household-based survey that asks residents age 12  
6           or older about their experiences with crime,  
7           including crimes motivated by hate or bias.

8           Both of these collections, the NCVS and  
9           the UCR define hate crime according to the Hate  
10          Crime Statistics Act. Including crimes motivated  
11          by bias against the victim because of his or her  
12          race or ethnicity, gender or gender identity,  
13          sexual orientation, religion, or disability.

14          Now the way this is operationalized in  
15          the NCVS is that when a respondent answers  
16          affirmatively that they experienced a violent or a  
17          property crime, that respondent is then asked a  
18          series of questions about the nature of the  
19          incident. Including whether they believe the  
20          incident was motivated by bias against them.

21          The survey also asks victims whether  
22          they had any evidence that the crime was motivated  
23          by hate. And in order to be classified as a victim  
24          of hate crime in the NCVS, the victim has to state  
25          that the offender either used hate language, left

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 hate symbols at the scene of the crime, or that  
2 police investigators confirmed that it was a hate  
3 crime.

4 Next. The NCVS and the UCR are  
5 designed to be complementary but different. So,  
6 despite the fact that they're both aligned with the  
7 Hate Crime Statistics Act, there are differences  
8 between them in the types of crime that they cover,  
9 in the types of victims that they cover, in the  
10 fact that the NCVS is based on residents'  
11 perceptions of hate crime.

12 Which may be a different standard of  
13 proof than what's required for law enforcement to  
14 record a crime as a hate crime. And another major  
15 difference is that the NCVS captures hate crimes  
16 both reported and not reported to the police.

17 And we can see the impact of these  
18 differences in the data. So, this figure here  
19 compares the annual average number of hate crimes  
20 according to the NCVS with those captured by the  
21 UCR.

22 So if you start on the left with the  
23 light blue column, based on NCVS data there were  
24 over 210,000 hate crimes occurring annually from  
25 2014 to 2016. Slightly different than the number

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that was cited by the earlier panel just because of  
2 the difference in the time frame.

3 But of those 210,000, 211,000 hate  
4 crimes, about 110,000, about 50 percent, were  
5 reported to the police. So based on NCVS data  
6 collected from the victims, we have 110,000  
7 reported to the police.

8 Now of those about 14 percent were  
9 confirmed by police investigators to be a hate  
10 crime. So about 16,000, which gets us much closer  
11 to the UCR annual average for this same period.  
12 Which is about 7,000, that last bar there at the  
13 end.

14 So this figure illustrates that the  
15 hate crimes captured in the UCR data represent a  
16 small portion of the total number of hate crimes  
17 occurring annually. Because the NCVS is capturing  
18 a substantially larger number of hate crimes than  
19 the UCR, the two collections also show a somewhat  
20 different picture of the types of bias motivating  
21 these crimes.

22 In both collections, as you can see on  
23 the far left, the largest proportion of hate crimes  
24 are motivated by racial or ethnic bias. However,  
25 the NCVS shows a larger proportion of hate crimes

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 motivated by gender bias, sexual orientation bias,  
2 or disability bias.

3 This figure shows the number, trends in  
4 the number of hate crimes reported, the red line,  
5 and not reported, the darker line, to police from  
6 2009 to 2016. Overall during this period, there  
7 was no statistically significant change in the  
8 number of hate crimes occurring each year.

9 But the estimate does appear to be  
10 trending downward. This is particularly true among  
11 hate crimes not reported to the police. Which seem  
12 to be driving any apparent decline in the total  
13 number of hate crimes during this period.

14 Using NCVS data, we can also examine  
15 trends in the type of bias behind the hate crimes.  
16 So from 2009 to 2016, the percent of hate crimes  
17 believed to be motivated by gender bias, that's the  
18 purple line, the second line there, doubled.

19 The percentage of hate crimes motivated  
20 by sexual orientation bias, that's the light blue  
21 line, also appeared to increase. But was not  
22 statistically significant.

23 And then the other thing to note here  
24 is that from 2009 to 2015, the percentage of hate  
25 crimes motivated by religious bias declined. But

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 appeared to tick upward in 2016. And it remains to  
2 be seen whether it will continue on that  
3 trajectory.

4 So through the NCVS and the UCR the  
5 Department of Justice provides important indicators  
6 of the patterns and trends in hate crime  
7 victimizations. But as I mentioned earlier,  
8 efforts are underway to build upon and improve  
9 those efforts.

10 For instance, in 2016 the NCVS shifted  
11 to a sample design that will eventually allow for  
12 estimates of crime to be generated not just at the  
13 national level, but also for the 22 most populous  
14 states. Which account for about 80 percent of the  
15 population.

16 Both the NCVS and the UCR are also  
17 focused on increasing the timeliness of data and  
18 data reporting. NCVS estimates are typically  
19 reported, released eight to ten months after the  
20 year ends.

21 So, we anticipate releasing 2017 data  
22 in the fall of 2018. And part of that lag is due  
23 to the complexity of the survey and the work that  
24 the Census Bureau had to do to process the files.

25 And part of that is for BJS

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 statisticians to analyze the data, verify the  
2 results, produce the report. So, those aspects of  
3 the processing time are difficult to reduce.

4 But BJS is exploring other options for  
5 making the data available sooner. Such as  
6 publishing preliminary half year estimates based on  
7 the first six months of the year.

8 These efforts are also just one part of  
9 the work being undertaken by the DOJ hate crimes  
10 statistics working group, which was established  
11 through the attorney general's task force on crime  
12 reduction and public safety to improve the  
13 compilation and aggregation of hate crime  
14 statistics.

15 So, in summary hate crime  
16 identification, enforcement and prevention is a  
17 priority for the DOJ.

18 CHAIR LHAMON: Ms. Langton, I have to  
19 stop you. I'm sorry. I wasn't paying enough  
20 attention. And we're way over time.

21 MS. LANGTON: All right.

22 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you. Mr. Austin?

23 MR. AUSTIN: Well, thank you and good  
24 afternoon. I come to you as a former hate crime's  
25 prosecutor and a supervisor of hate crime's

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 prosecutor.

2 I personally prosecuted a cross burning  
3 in Illinois, and a pistol whipping in Mississippi.  
4 I was a supervisor at the time that the first  
5 prosecutions under the Shepard/Byrd Hate Crimes  
6 Prevention Act were being brought.

7 A major problem with respect to hate  
8 crimes statistics is quite obvious. We do not have  
9 the slightest idea how many hate crimes there are  
10 in America. And we have never known.

11 The numbers currently kept by the FBI,  
12 and I'm speaking primarily of the FBI and not to  
13 insult my former colleague, Lynn Langton, the  
14 numbers currently kept by the FBI are largely  
15 useless.

16 While a small handful of states and law  
17 enforcement agencies seem to take the collection of  
18 hate crime numbers seriously, the majority of  
19 states and the vast majority of law enforcement  
20 agencies do not seriously report hate crime's  
21 numbers. And the handful of numbers that are  
22 reported are released late and unaudited.

23 Basically the FBI has little choice but  
24 to get whatever it gets from jurisdictions. And  
25 they put those number out publically without any

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 meaningful analysis.

2 But what do these numbers mean? What  
3 policy decisions can be made based on these  
4 numbers? What enforcement decisions can be made  
5 based on these numbers?

6 Sadly, the answer to all these  
7 questions is, almost nothing. The importance of  
8 collecting good data could hardly be overstated.

9 While every crime is significant, the  
10 harm can be exponential when the subject targeted  
11 the victim based on his or her actual or perceived  
12 race, ethnicity, religion, national origin, gender,  
13 sexual orientation, gender identity, or disability.

14 The pain or fear from hate crime  
15 reaches a broader community. The act is anathema  
16 to who we are as a nation built on diversity.

17 Now my criticism of the numbers is not  
18 meant to criticize the individuals who work for the  
19 FBI's Criminal Justice Information Services  
20 Division, CJIS. As someone who worked with this  
21 team, both when I was at the Department of Justice  
22 and at the White House, I know it to be a team of  
23 smart and hardworking individuals who cared deeply  
24 about their work collecting crime data.

25 The team is willing to provide

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 individualized training to any agency that needs  
2 it. Or that needs help reporting hate crime  
3 numbers. But few take them up on this offer.

4 The problems are structural. The team  
5 is under-resourced for work this important. And  
6 where there are no incentives for providing this  
7 data, their task is largely impossible.

8 This problem would be relatively easy to fix.  
9 Make federal government funding contingent on  
10 providing accurate hate crime data.

11 But where we do not even mandate that  
12 law enforcement agencies provide general crime  
13 statistics, it will require serious leadership to  
14 move the ball in this direction on hate crime  
15 statistics. Now what exacerbates the problem is  
16 the fact that the federal government does not even  
17 publish its own hate crime numbers.

18 The FBI works on hate crimes' cases  
19 across the country with the Civil Rights Division  
20 and the U.S. Attorneys' Offices. And none of those  
21 DOJ components regularly publishes in an easily  
22 accessible location any data about those cases.

23 Now I understand that Robert Moossy  
24 came here and testified earlier. I am very  
25 familiar with Robert. And very familiar with the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 work that was done by the Civil Rights Division.

2 And I know that we did not regularly  
3 publish those numbers in the Obama Administration.  
4 Now, how can the federal government expect state  
5 and local law enforcement to publish data when it  
6 does not do so itself?

7 Now it only requires a quick look at  
8 the FBI hate crime statistics to realize just how  
9 unhelpful they are. The first thing one might  
10 notice is that the most up to date statistics are  
11 from 2016. We are now almost half way through 2018  
12 and we still do not have national statistics for  
13 2017.

14 There are approximately 18 thousand law  
15 enforcement agencies in the United States. And  
16 almost three thousand agencies did not even bother  
17 to respond to the FBI request for hate crime  
18 information. And they suffer no consequences for  
19 not doing so.

20 Now from the 15 thousand agencies that  
21 at least responded, there were only 6,121 reported  
22 incidents. Of these incidents, California reported  
23 931, New York reported 595. But Alabama reported  
24 just 14 incidents. And Mississippi reported just  
25 seven.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           Now for reasons unknown to me, the  
2 state of Hawaii doesn't participate at all. And  
3 then what also stands out are the number of large  
4 and good sized cities that report that they did not  
5 have a single hate crime in 2016.

6           Mobile, Alabama, Corona, California,  
7 Wilmington, Delaware, Savannah/Chapman metropolitan  
8 area, Georgia, Cedar Rapids, Iowa, Evansville,  
9 Indiana, Topeka, Kansas, Shreveport, Louisiana,  
10 Springfield, Missouri, Patterson, New Jersey,  
11 Winston Salem, North Carolina, Fargo, North Dakota,  
12 Charleston South Carolina, Columbia, South  
13 Caroline, Corpus Christi, Texas, Laredo, Texas,  
14 Lubbock, Texas, Provo, Utah, Roanoke, Virginia,  
15 Kenosha, Wisconsin, and Cheyenne, Wyoming, I guess  
16 did not have a single hate crime in 2016.

17           Here are just some thoughts on ways  
18 that the federal government could improve the  
19 current system. One, make reporting mandatory.  
20 Congress could pass a law that made law enforcement  
21 agencies that do not provide hate crime data  
22 ineligible for law enforcement grants from the  
23 Department of Justice or any other federal agency.

24           Two, audit reports. The FBI should  
25 have a team that audits the reports provided by law

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 enforcement agencies to ensure accuracy.

2 Three, publish the data quarterly. I'm  
3 happy to hear that Lynn noted that there's thoughts  
4 about publishing the data at least twice a year.

5 But there's no reason why it shouldn't  
6 be reported quarterly. The FBI's hate crime  
7 statistics are collected quarterly.

8 If the FBI actually published  
9 quarterly, it would not only provide data in a more  
10 timely fashion, but it would give more transparency  
11 to the effort. By publishing quarterly,  
12 individuals who are aware of hate crimes would be  
13 better equipped to force their jurisdiction to  
14 correct mistakes.

15 Fourth, work with affinity groups to  
16 encourage reporting. Hate crime collection can be  
17 challenging because it requires work with  
18 communities that are often distrustful of law  
19 enforcement because of bad prior experiences or  
20 lack of language access.

21 Affinity groups may be better  
22 positioned to collect the information and report it  
23 to law enforcement even in situations where the  
24 victim does not want to participate in prosecution.

25 It is sad the numbers that Lynn put up

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 there showing that probably less than 10 percent of  
2 the hate crimes that are reported to law  
3 enforcement even show up in the UCR.

4 Number five, get federal agencies to  
5 report. Number six, just have better reports. If  
6 you try to look at this time at the paperwork that  
7 is presented by the UCR, it is unbelievably hard to  
8 read in this day and age. Thank you.

9 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you Mr. Austin.  
10 Ms. Deitle.

11 MS. DEITLE: Good afternoon. I'm  
12 grateful to the U.S. Commission for inviting me to  
13 participate in this discussion with such  
14 distinguished panelists.

15 From 1995 until 2017 I was employed as  
16 a Special Agent with the Federal Bureau of  
17 Investigation. I was extremely fortunate to be  
18 able to devote my career to the civil rights  
19 program as a street agent in New York City for 12  
20 years, as the Chief of the Civil Rights Unit, and  
21 as a Supervisor in Boston.

22 I specifically joined the Bureau to  
23 investigate allegations of police brutality and  
24 violence motivated by hate and bias. As a civil  
25 rights agent, I was honored to use the power of the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 FBI to protect those most vulnerable in our  
2 communities, investigate the police officers who  
3 use excessive and unreasonable force, and hold  
4 accountable those individuals who target certain  
5 folks for violence based on race, religion,  
6 ethnicity, disability or sexual orientation.

7           Upon my retirement, I joined the  
8 Matthew Shepard Foundation to continue their  
9 mission to erase hate through law enforcement  
10 training, community outreach, and youth  
11 programming. The Foundation was founded 20 years  
12 ago by Dennis and Judy Shepard whose son Matt was  
13 targeted, attacked and murdered because he was gay.

14           As you are aware, they fought for  
15 passage of the Matthew Shepard and James Byrd, Jr.  
16 Hate Crime Prevention Act of 2009 which greatly  
17 expanded the jurisdiction of the FBI and the  
18 Department of Justice to investigate bias crimes.

19           In my 22-year career I learned a few  
20 things along the way, which I'd like to share.  
21 Street credibility is imperative. If you're a law  
22 enforcement official, prosecutor, or victim's  
23 advocate, or community leader, you must be a  
24 believer and a doer.

25           You must believe that hate crime laws

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 are necessary to keep communities safe. You must  
2 believe that enforcement of these laws is  
3 mandatory. And you must believe that reporting  
4 hate crimes to your state and to the FBI is one of  
5 the most effective ways to mitigate hate fueled  
6 violence.

7 If you are not a believer and you are  
8 not experienced and passionate about eradicating  
9 bias crimes, your law enforcement and special  
10 interest partners will not have confidence in your  
11 commitment to join them in their quest for equality  
12 and justice.

13 Spend the time to learn about hate  
14 crimes. Investigate a good number of them. And  
15 earn some street credibility.

16 You must be honest and transparent.  
17 The federal government actors tasked with the  
18 responsibility of investigating and prosecuting  
19 hate crimes must be honest and transparent when  
20 they carry out their mission.

21 While everyone understands that there  
22 are some well-established laws and policies  
23 requiring confidentiality in the law enforcement  
24 arena, agents and prosecutors must keep an open  
25 line of communication with the victim and the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 community. And share what they can. Timely  
2 transparency builds trust. And trust leads to safe  
3 communities.

4 All the players must start from the  
5 same place. Building trust between minority  
6 communities and law enforcement officers was one of  
7 my goals as Chief of the Civil Rights Unit in the  
8 FBI, as well as my mission as a Program and  
9 Operations Director for the Matthew Shepard  
10 Foundation.

11 If officers trust civilians to report  
12 crimes in an honest and timely manner, and the  
13 victims have confidence that the officers will  
14 conduct a thorough and professional investigation,  
15 everyone is safer.

16 This symbiotic relationship however,  
17 assumes that each player starts at the same place.  
18 This equation takes for granted that the officers  
19 have been trained to recognize a hate crime, how to  
20 collect evidence of bias, and how to use that  
21 evidence to successfully prosecute the perpetrator.

22 It also assumes that law enforcement  
23 agencies believe that their jurisdiction should  
24 enact and enforce hate crime laws. If the bias  
25 motivation of the crime is ignored, the victim will

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 not feel validated, safe, or protected in her  
2 community.

3 Accept and acknowledge the past. We  
4 are all aware that it wasn't that long ago that law  
5 enforcement officers were some of the very people  
6 who initiated and facilitated lynchings of African-  
7 Americans, targeted LGBTQ community members for  
8 harassment and violence, and intentionally failed  
9 to protect many other minorities from hate crimes.

10 If the FBI agents working civil rights  
11 violations do not accept and acknowledge these  
12 facts, they will not earn the trust and respect of  
13 the children of these victims, some of whom are  
14 facing the potential for the same victimization.

15 Be a leader in the fight for equality  
16 and justice. As an FBI agent or government actor  
17 involved in eradicating hate, you must be a leader  
18 in the fight for justice and equality.

19 Not only must you uphold the rule of  
20 law and the Constitution, but you must find new and  
21 innovative ways to build relationships, earn the  
22 trust of community leaders and minority groups, and  
23 you must promote professionalism and integrity.

24 For countless people I met in my  
25 career, I was the first and only FBI agent they

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 ever encountered. I had the honor and duty to  
2 ensure that they were left with the belief and the  
3 impression that the FBI was an honorable and honest  
4 institution.

5 No one wins. Hate destroys everyone it  
6 touches, the victim, the perpetrator, their  
7 families and the community. When a hate crime is  
8 committed, the victim is hurt, traumatized,  
9 fearful, and is forever changed.

10 The perpetrator and his family however,  
11 are often overlooked when it comes to examining the  
12 fallout from a bias incident. In many cases I  
13 investigated, the family of the perpetrator was  
14 forever changed as well as they learned that they  
15 would be seen as bigots regardless of their claims  
16 of innocence or tolerance.

17 Oftentimes the perpetrator acted in a  
18 violent and biased manner because of their own  
19 trauma, their upbringing, and their substance  
20 addiction. Federal investigators and prosecutors  
21 must be mindful of these factors. And must  
22 appreciate that the ripples of hate extend far  
23 beyond the targeted victim.

24 Thank you for allowing me to share my  
25 thoughts. I look forward to hearing from the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 others today.

2 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you very much Ms.  
3 Deitle. Ms. Osgood?

4 MS. OSGOOD: Thank you. Good  
5 afternoon. I had the privilege of serving for the  
6 Office of Civil Rights for 25 years, both in  
7 Headquarters with the current Commission Chair, and  
8 in the Chicago Regional Office.

9 And I am very proud of my service,  
10 public service for the federal government. And  
11 very proud of OCR'S long stated mission of ensuring  
12 equal access to education, and promoting  
13 educational excellence throughout the nation  
14 through the vigorous enforcement of the federal  
15 civil rights laws.

16 What I'm going to focus on today, given  
17 my background, is the critical role that OCR and  
18 the Department of Education must continue to play  
19 in preventing and addressing the harassment of  
20 students in our schools.

21 I strongly believe that OCR has made a  
22 tremendous impact in this area both in its  
23 leadership and in the comprehensive approach it has  
24 taken to preventing and addressing harassment.

25 Through regulations, policy, guidance,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 investigations, and technical assistance, we have  
2 seen progress and greater compliance by educational  
3 institutions in the area of harassment.

4 And one example I want to give is that  
5 I think that because of OCR's policy guidance and  
6 strong robust enforcement work in the area of  
7 sexual harassment and sexual violence, we have a  
8 totally different culture at our schools.

9 And the expectations of parents and  
10 students and the communities, are different.  
11 People expect that schools will comply with Title  
12 IX, that they will prevent and address sexual  
13 harassment, sexual violence, when it occurs.

14 And they view that as part of the  
15 educational package, what they're getting from  
16 their schools when they go to that school. I think  
17 that's a tremendous sign of progress in our efforts  
18 to address harassment in our educational systems.

19 I have some specific recommendations  
20 for how I believe the department and OCR should  
21 provide leadership and guidance in this area going  
22 forward. And I make these remarks recognizing that  
23 we are in an important period in the history of  
24 civil rights educational law as the department is  
25 currently reviewing all of its regulations as part

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 of the administration's regulatory review and  
2 reform initiatives.

3 And the department itself plans to  
4 issue in September, a notice of proposed rulemaking  
5 regarding Title IX and sexual misconduct. I know,  
6 and I fully expect that the debates over possible  
7 changes to OCR's regulations will be exceptionally  
8 heated and raucous, and deservedly so given the  
9 stakes involved.

10 I think that as we go forward, my first  
11 recommendation is that we should use the current  
12 and upcoming debate as an opportunity for the  
13 federal government and the entire education  
14 community, including students, parents, advocates,  
15 teachers, faculty members, administration  
16 officials, to address harassment issues in a  
17 reasonable, collaborative, and equitable way.

18 As we move forward, and I do view us as  
19 moving forward, we need to recognize that  
20 regardless of what the policy and regulatory  
21 changes may be, the obligation and responsibility  
22 of schools at all levels to address harassment, is  
23 not going away. Schools must continuously affirm  
24 that they will not tolerate harassment and take the  
25 necessary steps to address harassment effectively.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           Our discussions need to focus on how to  
2 get better from this fundamental principal forward.  
3 And one of the ways to get better is to heed the  
4 lessons learned.

5           OCR, the Department of Education, and  
6 educational institutions across the country have  
7 learned a lot in the last 10 years, 20 years, about  
8 how to develop and implement effective anti-  
9 harassment policies and procedures.

10           We should also be looking to OCR's  
11 guidance as OCR has been working through the facts  
12 and specific cases alleging harassment, and  
13 becoming, in my view, more sophisticated, more  
14 nuanced in assessing the compliance issues related  
15 to harassment.

16           I think this body of administrative  
17 case law, including past and current OCR cases is  
18 very valuable and should be considered closely  
19 forward -- going forward.

20           In the spirit of continuous  
21 improvement, I really do believe that we should use  
22 this public debate as an opportunity to heed the  
23 lessons learned by our educational institutions and  
24 by OCR so that we can all assess what has been  
25 working, what has not been working, and get even

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 better at addressing these difficult roles.

2 As part of this conversation, I think  
3 it's critical that OCR provide clear and reasonable  
4 rules. And in my experience at the Department and  
5 at OCR, I always felt that we were our most  
6 effective as a federal civil rights agency when we  
7 were clear through our cases and through our  
8 guidance what compliance is, what compliance is  
9 not.

10 I encourage the Department to continue  
11 to provide clear reasonable rules going forward. I  
12 also recommend that we take greater advantage of  
13 what I refer to and what I view as kind of a  
14 treasure trove of guidance from OCR.

15 OCR has been doing these cases for a  
16 long time. The racial harassment guidance came out  
17 in 1994. The sexual harassment guidance in 2001.  
18 We're looking at decades of cases where OCR has  
19 looked at the specific facts of a case and said,  
20 yes, this is a violation, or no, this is not.

21 I recommend that OCR consider  
22 publishing, with all appropriate redactions, all of  
23 its compliance information that's related to  
24 harassment. Right now the website only includes  
25 resolution agreements and resolution letters, but

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 it does not include letters where the agency has  
2 said there was no violation.

3 Again, if our goal, our common goal is  
4 to increase compliance with the civil rights laws  
5 that OCR enforces, and reduce harassment of our  
6 students, greater understanding of the compliance  
7 requirements will, in my view, promote greater  
8 compliance.

9 Another recommendation is that OCR  
10 provide more technical assistance. This to me  
11 seems almost like a no-brainer. Helping schools  
12 understand, helping communities understand what the  
13 federal laws require, I think has always been very  
14 effective.

15 Agencies should continue to provide  
16 technical assistance and provide more than it has  
17 been in the past year.

18 Some specific suggestions were to  
19 update what was affectionately known as the NAAG  
20 guide, a comprehensive, multi-jurisdictional guide  
21 that was developed by OCR and the National  
22 Association of Attorneys Generals. Many schools  
23 found that guide to be very useful.

24 Developing a model grievance policy.  
25 This has been sort of a pet project that's been in

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the works at the agency for many years. And I  
2 think that it would be very helpful to schools.

3 And again, just providing more local  
4 assistance. Working directly with schools in the  
5 OCR region to help them come into compliance.

6 And then finally, I believe that the  
7 Department itself should take greater advantage of  
8 its own resources and data at the Institute of  
9 Educational Science and its National Center for  
10 Education Statistics. Thank you very much.

11 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you Ms. Osgood.  
12 Mr. Okubadejo?

13 MS. OKUBADEJO: All right. Thank you  
14 so much for inviting me today. I appreciate  
15 everything that we've heard today about statistics.

16 But I think like Debbie, I'm coming  
17 from a place where I was actively investigating  
18 complaints of discrimination and harassment.  
19 Actively investigating hate crimes and enforcing  
20 some of the laws.

21 And currently I work with colleges and  
22 university and educational institutions across the  
23 country to craft compliance programs. And I think  
24 what I'm seeing is that schools are really hungry  
25 for help and wanting to comply in this area.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           And are looking for guidance. Sort of  
2 the how to respond appropriately under the various  
3 civil rights laws.

4           You know, some of the cases I worked  
5 with have involved incidents like nooses being  
6 placed outside students' lockers or dorm rooms.  
7 They've involved sometimes really awful situations  
8 where LGBTQ students are harassed in schools and  
9 ultimately end up taking their own lives.

10           And helping schools rebuild after  
11 something like that happens, and helping students  
12 within those schools understand how, you know, a  
13 behavior that maybe wouldn't be called a hate  
14 crime, was just one more building block that may or  
15 may not have contributed to pushing somebody  
16 towards a really, really fatal and difficult  
17 decision.

18           So, you know, that's sort of the  
19 context in which I'm working. And at OCR we had a  
20 variety of civil rights laws, you know, Title VI,  
21 Title IX, Section 504 of the Rehab Act, that  
22 prohibited discrimination and harassment pretty  
23 broadly.

24           And that required schools to respond  
25 promptly and appropriately when they were incidents

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 at schools. One of the things that always struck  
2 me is that under Title VI it was less clear in  
3 terms of requirement for a grievance procedure.

4 And so sometimes that raised reporting  
5 issues at schools. And you know, unfortunately  
6 under Title VI, you know, the discrimination  
7 prohibited is based on race, based on national  
8 origin, based on color.

9 And these are some of the areas that  
10 we've heard people talk about throughout the day.  
11 And what we're seeing sometimes is that students  
12 and employees may not know what the process is for  
13 raising their hand and saying, this awful thing has  
14 happened to me on campus.

15 And if the statute itself, and the  
16 regulation, doesn't require that schools have in  
17 place a grievance procedure that's published, just  
18 like these other laws. So, you know, Debbie just  
19 talked about Title IX where there are clearly  
20 requirements about what needs to be in place and  
21 what's expected to be in place.

22 I think that there's less clarity  
23 around that under Title VI, which raises some  
24 issues, I think for schools in responding to  
25 serious incidents like this. I think it would be

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 really beneficial for schools to have more guidance  
2 documents about how to respond to incidents on  
3 campus where there are First Amendment  
4 implications.

5 So sometimes we, you know, schools  
6 aren't really aware that much student speech or  
7 employee speech may be protected. Particularly in  
8 public institutions.

9 And many private institutions have  
10 language in their policies and procedures that  
11 protect speech and expression in ways similar to  
12 the protections that public institutions are  
13 required to adhere to under the First Amendment.

14 And I think what would be helpful for  
15 schools, is if there could be some guidance that  
16 helped paint a little bit more of a picture of what  
17 to do when there are these incidents involving  
18 protected expression where the conduct is tearing  
19 the community apart.

20 So, you may have students of color  
21 feeling targeted. Feeling like they don't belong  
22 on a campus. Feeling excluded. At the same time  
23 that the conduct at issue is protected under the  
24 First Amendment.

25 And schools are having to navigate

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 these issues as they happen. And I think are  
2 looking for help in doing this.

3 So, I think it would be helpful if it  
4 were possible for agencies like OCR, like the DOJ  
5 to flesh out some of these issues. Give examples.

6 You know, what do you do? How do we  
7 expect you to respond when an incident like this  
8 occurs?

9 And then another piece is when there  
10 are incidents that don't quite rise to the level of  
11 a hate crime. But if you leave them and ignore  
12 them and let them fester, that's essentially where  
13 you'll be headed.

14 And in some schools there may, you  
15 know, if you do a close analysis, it may not appear  
16 to trigger an obligation to respond under Title VI  
17 or Title IX. But the absence of a response could  
18 lead to a more serious incident that could  
19 constitute a hate crime.

20 So I think also helping schools  
21 understand how to handle those types of incidents.  
22 So, you know, do you conduct an investigation? If  
23 you do, what does that look like?

24 How quickly are you doing it? Is the  
25 fact of your investigation chilling protected

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 speech? Is there a way to structure that  
2 differently?

3 And I think if there could be guidance  
4 around those types of areas, it would be incredibly  
5 beneficial to schools. And I see the clock  
6 ticking. So, I'll just raise one more point that I  
7 think is really important.

8 And I think in thinking about how  
9 schools and how agencies are interpreting what it  
10 means for conduct to be based on sex under Title  
11 IX, I think it would be helpful to be able to do  
12 that as broadly as possible.

13 I think getting some of the changes and  
14 the withdrawal of guidance that we've seen under  
15 Title IX, some schools may start to wonder the  
16 extent to which conduct involving LGBTQ students is  
17 protected. And I think if agencies, if OCR, if the  
18 DOJ can make clear that it's continuing to cover  
19 conduct aimed at students based on their -- based  
20 on sex stereotyping and gender non-conformance.

21 And the types of issues that OCR  
22 historically has covered, even as far back as 2001  
23 in that guidance, we're seeing language around sex  
24 stereotyping. And so I think if it can be made  
25 clear that those types of harassment and issues

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 continue to be covered.

2 And continue to be a priority, it would  
3 be really helpful in preventing some of the climate  
4 issues that we see for LGBTQ students on campus,  
5 where we're seeing really high suicide rates and  
6 students feeling excluded on campus.

7 And so those are the main points I  
8 wanted to raise. And I thank you for inviting me  
9 and for giving me a chance to hear the other  
10 panels.

11 CHAIR LHAMON: Thanks very much to all  
12 the panelists. We'll open it up for the  
13 Commissioners' questions. I understand  
14 Commissioner Kladney that you are.

15 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Thank you Madam  
16 Chair. My questions actually revolve around most  
17 of what you've spoken about and I think Mr.  
18 Austin's experience. And of course, anybody else,  
19 please chime in.

20 But, you said that schools need some  
21 guidance. And of course First Amendment  
22 implications are very important.

23 I believe one of our other witnesses on  
24 the Panel before said something about speech that  
25 leads to worse conduct. And I think you just

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 almost said the same thing.

2 Are there any procedures or model  
3 programs or regulations that can be used to help  
4 schools in this regard? Because all we've heard  
5 about, to me, today is I've heard a lot about data.

6 So, I'm data'ed out.

7 (Laugh)

8 MS. DEITLE: No disrespect.

9 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: I'm looking for,  
10 I'm actually looking for a few solutions because I  
11 know First Amendment is important to a lot of the  
12 Commissioners here. And --

13 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: All.

14 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: We've had cases  
15 -- thank you Commissioner. We've had cases, we've  
16 seen cases lately where someone wears a tee shirt  
17 to school that's got inappropriate sayings on it.  
18 And then the parents take it to court. And you  
19 know, there's a whole thing.

20 So, can you give us any guidance? Or  
21 do you know where we can look to find some of these  
22 types of regulations or approaches that are  
23 Constitutional yet helpful?

24 MS. OKUBADEJO: I mean, I think in  
25 truth this is what schools are asking for help

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 with. Because I think there isn't a lot of clear  
2 guidance and direction in this area.

3 And it would be incredibly helpful if  
4 there were examples of what to do in the instance  
5 where a student wears a tee shirt that another  
6 student thinks is offensive or a student feels  
7 micro aggressed by.

8 You know, how does a school handle  
9 that? And how do you balance, you know, the needs  
10 and the rights of both students?

11 And what schools are doing right now  
12 essentially is navigating really carefully through  
13 crucial conversations. And putting on educational  
14 programming at the beginning of the school year and  
15 at various points during the school year.

16 To help students understand yes, there  
17 is the First Amendment, but you know, we also  
18 really value certain students on campus.

19 But, you know, in terms of a particular  
20 program or a particular regulation, not that I have  
21 seen employed regularly.

22 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: And that's the  
23 problem. Right?

24 MS. OKUBADEJO: In my mind that's one  
25 of the issues.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1                   COMMISSIONER KLADNEY:  And in the cases  
2                   that you've tried, how has speech interacted with  
3                   conduct or hate crimes?

4                   MR. AUSTIN:  So, respectfully I don't  
5                   see this as even close to an issue in the criminal  
6                   conduct that I'm talking about.  I don't think that  
7                   the burning of a cross is a First Amendment Issue.

8                   COMMISSIONER KLADNEY:  Right.

9                   MR. AUSTIN:  It's a crime.

10                  COMMISSIONER KLADNEY:  That's right.

11                  MR. AUSTIN:  I don't think that the  
12                  assault of a person based on their race, religion,  
13                  national origin, sexual orientation, is a speech  
14                  issue.  It's a crime.

15                  COMMISSIONER KLADNEY:  It's factual.

16                  MR. AUSTIN:  It's factual.  Yeah, I  
17                  mean, I don't -- this isn't a close call for me  
18                  over whether or not you -- and I think it may be  
19                  different in the civil context or in the school's  
20                  context.

21                  But, for the numbers that I'm talking  
22                  about, and I'm sorry that you're data'ed out.  But  
23                  that's kind of something that I feel very  
24                  passionate about, is that --

25                  COMMISSIONER KLADNEY:  No, no.  It's

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 fine. I mean.

2 MR. AUSTIN: No. But I'm just saying  
3 that it's not -- this isn't an issue. It's already  
4 been determined, I think, by the Constitution, by  
5 the Supreme Court that when you actually injure  
6 someone, or do violence to someone, or you threaten  
7 someone based on their race, religion, national  
8 origin, sexual orientation that it is in fact a  
9 crime.

10 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Great. Thank  
11 you very much. That's actually an answer I had to  
12 another question.

13 CHAIR LHAMON: And we'll turn to  
14 Commissioner Kirsanow.

15 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Well thank you  
16 Madam Chair. And thanks to the witnesses. I'm not  
17 data'ed out. In fact I could use a lot more data.

18 So, the question I have to Ms. Langton  
19 is, in your PowerPoint, you have in there that  
20 approximately 50 percent of the National Crime  
21 Victimization Survey of crimes, hate crimes, are  
22 reported.

23 Compared to, I guess you've got a  
24 couple of different databases. How does that  
25 compare to overall crimes, the number of which are

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 reported?

2 CHAIR LHAMON: Commissioner Kirsanow,  
3 do you mind just moving your microphone up closer  
4 to you?

5 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yeah. I think  
6 I broke it.

7 CHAIR LHAMON: Oh, okay. You can  
8 switch with Commissioner Heriot.

9 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yeah.

10 MS. LANGTON: That's a great question.  
11 And it's actually pretty consistent with what we  
12 see for violent crime in general.

13 The percentage that's reported gets  
14 higher when you talk about serious violent crime.  
15 Which we define as rape, sexual assault, robbery,  
16 and aggravated assault.

17 Bu that is fairly consistent with what  
18 we see overall for violent crime.

19 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Okay. And then  
20 the second question is, in employment  
21 discrimination jurisprudence there's a concept  
22 known as mixed motive. That is, someone can make  
23 out a prima facie case that they were discriminated  
24 against or discharged on the basis of race.

25 The employer says no. He was

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 discharged because he burned down the warehouse.  
2 In other words, there could be two reasons.

3 But if the employer can establish that  
4 the person would have been discharged anyway, then  
5 that doesn't amount to racial discrimination.  
6 Okay?

7 In determining whether or not there's  
8 been a hate crime, you said there was corroborative  
9 evidence. Let's say somebody steals an iPhone, and  
10 in the midst of doing that utters a racial epithet.

11 How do you determine whether or not  
12 it's a hate crime or primarily motivated by  
13 economic crime?

14 MS. LANGTON: So, we're not making any  
15 determination. The NCVS classifies crimes based on  
16 their attributes.

17 So, if the victim says their phone was  
18 stolen, which -- and stolen from them physically,  
19 which could be a robbery. And they believe that  
20 the offender was motivated by a racial bias, and  
21 they say the evidence for that is that the offender  
22 used derogatory or hate language, we would classify  
23 that as a hate crime.

24 So, we're not making a judgement call.  
25 It's simply based on the attributes of the crime

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 based on the questions that we're asking.

2 I mean, to your point it is based on  
3 the victim's perception. So again, that may not  
4 rise to the level of evidence required for a law  
5 enforcement agency to record it as a hate crime.

6 But I think that there's still  
7 intrinsic value in understanding that that victim  
8 perceived that crime to be motivated by bias.

9 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Third, we've  
10 got victimization data. Do you have perpetrator or  
11 suspect data?

12 MS. LANGTON: So that would be on the  
13 FBI side, where they would collect. Especially  
14 through the NIBRS Program, the National Incident  
15 Based Reporting System, more detailed information  
16 about the offenders.

17 But the National Crime Victimization  
18 Survey is really focused on the victims. We do ask  
19 the victims about their offenders and their  
20 perceptions of the offenders.

21 But those can't be used to generate say  
22 rates of offending for particular groups.

23 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: And last, I  
24 posed this question to another Panel. Are there  
25 any studies, data, evidence that shows that

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 designating something a hate crime deters,  
2 prevents, or reduces the incidents of that crime?

3 And a subset to that is whether or not  
4 designating some as a federal hate crime reduces,  
5 deters or prevents such crime?

6 MS. LANGTON: So, I don't have anything  
7 in my survey data that I could point to, to answer  
8 that question. And I'm not sure of particular data  
9 sources that would be used to address that  
10 question.

11 Certainly the NCVS is a longitudinal  
12 survey. So we go back to victims or to respondents  
13 seven times over the course of three and a half  
14 years.

15 So, it would actually be an empirical  
16 question to see whether someone reports a hate  
17 crime in one wave of the survey. And whether they  
18 experience a hate crime in later waves of the  
19 survey.

20 I'm not sure you would be able to say  
21 that the actual reporting of that and their  
22 discussing that as a hate crime sort of would  
23 impact their behavior perhaps, or the preventative  
24 measures they would take personally.

25 I'm not sure you could go that far with

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 it. But, that's about all you could say with the  
2 NCVS data.

3 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Is there any  
4 evidence that it assists in the apprehension of a  
5 suspect? Designating something as a hate crime?

6 MS. LANGTON: We don't have any  
7 evidence of that from the NCVS that we could speak  
8 to.

9 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Thank you. I  
10 don't have any other questions.

11 CHAIR LHAMON: All right. So I also am  
12 not data'ed out. I saw that last month the BJS  
13 published a Federal Register Notice of a request to  
14 OMB to revise the NCVS to raise the minimum age  
15 from 16 to 18 in which respondents will be  
16 administered questions about their sexual  
17 orientation and gender identity.

18 And I wonder if you could explain to  
19 this Commission, what would be the value of knowing  
20 less about when youth are subject to crime based on  
21 sexual orientation or gender identity?

22 MS. LANGTON: So, just to be clear, we  
23 are not making any changes to the questions about  
24 hate crime and the questions about whether the  
25 crime was motivated by sexual orientation bias.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           Those questions will continue to be  
2 asked of all respondents age 12 or older. We have  
3 proposed raising the minimum wage -- oh, the  
4 minimum wage. The minimum age.

5           CHAIR LHAMON: The minimum wage also.  
6 Yeah.

7           MS. LANGTON: Different conversation.  
8 The minimum age at which we're asking respondents  
9 about their sexual orientation.

10           And the comment period on that Federal  
11 Registry Notice closes today. And we'll be  
12 reviewing the comments and assessing those and  
13 making a determination from there.

14           CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you. But that was  
15 non-responsive. So, my question is, what is the  
16 value of knowing less about the sexual orientation  
17 of victims of crimes? Or the gender identity?

18           MS. LANGTON: Well, the concerns are  
19 more about the sensitivities of the data and the  
20 sensitivities of asking respondents that are minors  
21 and maybe in the presence of their parents, those  
22 questions.

23           Less about the utility of the value --  
24 of the data, trying to balance potential  
25 sensitivity issues with collecting this data.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIR LHAMON: And I think you were  
2 present during the earlier panel when the earlier  
3 panelists were talking about the civil rights data  
4 collection, which as you may know, also collects  
5 that same data and manages the sensitivity while  
6 also getting the information.

7 So it's again, a surprise to me to see  
8 the suggestion to change it, which would diminish  
9 the value of the data that we've heard all day is  
10 substantially less valuable than it could be  
11 already.

12 MS. LANGTON: We'll be reviewing the  
13 comments that are received and taking those into  
14 consideration certainly.

15 CHAIR LHAMON: Okay. I see that there  
16 are more questions. But I'm just going to take the  
17 microphone while I have it and ask my long list of  
18 questions. Because I still can, we have another  
19 half an hour.

20 So, to our former education folks,  
21 thank you for coming. In your time at the  
22 Department, are you aware of any times when the  
23 Department took particular steps focused on bias  
24 incidents in schools?

25 Maybe creating a task force, or taking

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 steps to try to address those incidents? And if so,  
2 could you describe what those steps were, whether  
3 they were effective, and what your views were about  
4 them?

5 MS. Osgood: I think there have been a  
6 number of steps. Obviously the issuance of the  
7 policy guidance in racial harassment, sexual  
8 harassment, disability harassment, those have all  
9 been helpful.

10 After 9/11 the Department also issued a  
11 guidance or a letter reminding schools to take  
12 action not to discriminate against Arab-American  
13 students. I think that was helpful.

14 It was a very forceful leadership  
15 statement from the Department. So, I think that  
16 that was helpful.

17 I mentioned the NAAG Guide, which was a  
18 really remarkable accomplishment to get all of the  
19 National Attorney Generals and the OCR to publish  
20 this six hundred and something page document which  
21 provided some very specific guidance for schools  
22 about how to address this issue.

23 We also worked collaboratively with the  
24 Department of Justice, including one of the  
25 panelists here on a number of harassment cases

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 including a case in Anoka Hennepin, Minnesota  
2 involving gender stereotyping and the University of  
3 Montana sex harassment and sexual violence case.

4 So, there were those initiatives as  
5 well, which were part of the Agency's enforcement  
6 package.

7 CHAIR LHAMON: And am I to understand  
8 that those were particular targeted efforts? Or  
9 were they just part of the regular enforcement  
10 package?

11 And the distinction I'm trying to draw  
12 is whether you think that there's value in the  
13 Agency affirmatively focusing on a particular area  
14 in its enforcement efforts.

15 MS. OSGOOD: I think that any time the  
16 agency has focused on a particular area we've seen  
17 progress. We've seen -- I mentioned in the sexual  
18 violence area, we've seen schools handling this  
19 issue better.

20 So, I would say following that, in my  
21 experience, yes. Any type of increased attention  
22 generally leads to better compliance and better  
23 results.

24 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you.

25 MS. OKUBADEJO: I agree.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           CHAIR LHAMON:    Succinct.    Thank you.  
2           Okay.    In that same vein Mr. Austin, I worked with  
3           you in our prior lives on some joint interagency  
4           task force work, in particular, focused on AAPI  
5           harassment in this area.

6                    And I wonder if you could describe that  
7           work, the value that you saw in the work, if any,  
8           and whether you know of a continuation of those  
9           efforts, and whether you think they should continue  
10          or not?

11                   MR. AUSTIN:    Yeah.    And let me just  
12          start by, and I apologize for this, but I do want  
13          to address --

14                   CHAIR LHAMON:    That's fine.

15                   MR. AUSTIN:    Commissioner Kirsanow's  
16          questions and whether or not there's any deterrent  
17          effect or assist in the apprehension.

18                   I would say, absolutely.    First of all,  
19          in a country where we believe that greater  
20          sentences have a deterrent effect, the fact that  
21          there is usually an increased sentence, an  
22          enhancement based on the fact that something is a  
23          hate crime, certainly has a deterrent effect to the  
24          extent any of our laws provide a deterrent effect.

25                   Whether it assists in the apprehension,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 absolutely. I had a chance to work with Cynthia  
2 Deitle, Agent Deitle on a number of investigations.

3 And if I can bring the FBI in to  
4 investigate a hate crime, the likelihood of  
5 apprehending the individuals who were perpetrating  
6 that crime has increased dramatically.

7 Not to mention just having the  
8 knowledge that a federal agency is going to be  
9 sitting on top of a local agency and demanding that  
10 that local agency actually do a proper  
11 investigation, is going to increase the  
12 apprehension or the likelihood of apprehension of  
13 the subjects.

14 And just, you can't understate the  
15 importance of public awareness over hate crimes.  
16 The condemnation, the shame that goes with that.  
17 And how that impacts whether or not someone is  
18 going to commit one in the future.

19 So I just want to be clear that I think  
20 that without question, calling something a hate  
21 crime actually matters. And in my personal  
22 experience it matters.

23 And sorry Chairwoman Lhamon --

24 CHAIR LHAMON: That's totally fine,  
25 thank you.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 MR. AUSTIN: But, with respect to the  
2 work that we did in Anoka Hennepin, I mean, we were  
3 -- it was incredibly important because not only did  
4 we identify a problem, but there was actually work  
5 between the Department of Education and the  
6 Department of Justice on fixing that problem.

7 On going into the school and working  
8 with the different communities that were impacted  
9 by it. On working with the teachers, the parents,  
10 everybody who was impacted by this.

11 By making a statement to schools around  
12 the country over what was permissible and what was  
13 not permissible, and what would be acceptable in  
14 this country and not acceptable in this country.

15 I think the work that we did was  
16 incredibly important, was noted by communities  
17 around the country.

18 And I haven't seen that work continuing  
19 today. That's really my answer.

20 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you. Separate and  
21 apart from the enforcement work that you just  
22 described, which I appreciate, I know you also led  
23 actual interagency task force focused on AAPI  
24 bullying and put out guidance and materials about  
25 it.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           But also that followed many, many  
2 listening sessions and interagency work together  
3 about understanding the scope of the problem and  
4 then trying to assess what appropriate next steps  
5 would be.

6           And in an earlier Panel we heard from  
7 Bob Moossy about intra-DOJ work toward those same  
8 ends now, which sounded very impressive and  
9 laudable.

10           He was not familiar with interagency  
11 work now continuing. And I wonder if you have a  
12 view about how valuable that work has been and  
13 whether it should continue?

14           MR. AUSTIN: And let me give credit to  
15 Jocelyn Samuels in large part. Because she was the  
16 head of a lot of the education work that was  
17 happening. And I had the opportunity to work very  
18 closely with her.

19           You know, having a group of people from  
20 inside of a particular agency meet to discuss an  
21 important issue is a meeting. Okay. That's the  
22 meeting we could have every -- any day at any time.

23           It is so important to bring in, first  
24 of all, others who have a different expertise, a  
25 different experience. To bring in the community,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to bring in the public to those meetings.

2 Because we don't know everything. If  
3 we're sitting in DOJ as important as we thought we  
4 were in DOJ, not working with the Department of  
5 Education, not working with the Department of  
6 Labor, not working with all these other  
7 departments, meant that we weren't getting all  
8 possible information.

9 It meant that we weren't doing the job  
10 that needed to be done. You must bring in other  
11 agencies and their expertise and their knowledge  
12 and their employees who are working so hard.

13 Or you're just not doing what needs to  
14 be done. And so having a meeting among DOJ people  
15 to congratulate DOJ people on the great job DOJ  
16 people are doing, is not really a useful adventure.

17 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you. I'm going to  
18 hold my other questions for the moment because I  
19 understand that other Commissioners have questions.

20 Commissioner Narasaki?

21 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Thank you Madam  
22 Chair. So my first question is about data. And  
23 I'm -- I get a little lost in all the acronyms and  
24 the different studies and who's doing them, and  
25 what.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           But one of the issues that came up in  
2 an earlier panel is the fact that many immigrant  
3 communities may not be reporting on hate crimes  
4 because particularly if they're undocumented, or  
5 someone in their family or life is undocumented,  
6 they may fear the risk of that.

7           My understanding is that potentially in  
8 at least one of the three databases, there's the  
9 NCVS, the ECR, and then NIBRS, or whatever that's  
10 called, they may actually have, because of the  
11 Patriot Act, the civil detainers.

12           Which is basically the list of people  
13 who should be deported if they're caught because  
14 they have violated the immigration laws.

15           Is that a correct understanding? Does  
16 that exist in any of the databases? Or is that  
17 just a rumor?

18           MS. LANGTON: I can't speak to the  
19 NIBRS data, which is the National Incident Based  
20 Reporting System, that's the FBI's. But not in the  
21 National Crime Victimization Survey, certainly not.

22           CHAIR NARASAKI: Mm-hmm. Does anybody  
23 know about the other ones?

24           MS. DEITLE: I do not. But I would  
25 make one point, which is if someone who's

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 undocumented goes to a non-governmental agency, so  
2 Catholic Charities or Bridge Refugee Services, and  
3 says, I was a victim of a hate crime, and that  
4 agency has a solid relationship with the FBI or the  
5 Department of Justice for example, and that's  
6 reported then to the FBI or DOJ, unless we initiate  
7 a case, that's not counted as a hate crime.

8 So, the FBI would never report that as  
9 one hate crime. We might agree that a crime was  
10 committed and write a report about that.

11 But if that's not investigated or  
12 prosecuted by DOJ, that's not even one. That  
13 doesn't go anywhere.

14 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: No, no. But  
15 I'm saying that the concern is that immigrants may  
16 not be going to actually report to the police.

17 MS. DEITLE: Right.

18 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Because they're  
19 afraid that if they do, A, they'll be detained  
20 because the police will ask.

21 Or B, if it ends up in a database, and  
22 it gets matched against a DHS list, they'll be  
23 deported. I'm just trying to understand the  
24 interaction between the various lists that exist in  
25 law enforcement land.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MS. DEITLE: The only thing I can say  
2 is that if that scenario happened when I was still  
3 with the FBI, there was no cross-pollination with  
4 Homeland Security.

5 So, if an undocumented immigrant came  
6 to the FBI and said, I've been a victim of a hate  
7 crime, and that went into our database, that  
8 information was not submitted, or had access to  
9 Homeland Security that then would act on the  
10 undocumented status of the victim.

11 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Great. That's  
12 helpful to know. Then the second thing is, so  
13 several people have remarked upon the fact that the  
14 federal government itself is not reporting data on  
15 hate crimes, but asking the states to.

16 And you were candid enough to note, Mr.  
17 Austin, that even in your administration that  
18 didn't happen. So, why is it not happening?

19 Are there barriers? What needs to  
20 happen to try to make that happen?

21 MR. AUSTIN: There's not a barrier that  
22 I'm aware of. I actually used to get monthly  
23 reports of the hate crime investigations that were  
24 being conducted by the FBI and the prosecutions  
25 that were being done by the Civil Rights Division.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           Those reports I would assume are still  
2 being done.   Someone decided not to make those  
3 things public.

4           But, people will come and testify on  
5 the Hill, before a Commission such as this.   And  
6 they will say what the numbers are.

7           But, we go all the way back, I want to  
8 say, like 15, 20 years of having these numbers  
9 across every piece of work that's done by the Civil  
10 Rights Division.   I know that the FBI also has  
11 similar numbers.

12           But they are never released publically.

13           COMMISSIONER NARASAKI:   So if our staff  
14 went and asked for the data, we wouldn't be told  
15 that there's some sort of privilege over it that  
16 would keep us from getting it?

17           MR. AUSTIN:   I am unaware of any  
18 privilege that would prevent you from getting it.  
19 But, I don't know what they might say.

20           COMMISSIONER NARASAKI:   Great.   Thank  
21 you.   Oh, I just have one more question --

22           CHAIR LHAMON:   Oh, I'm sorry.

23           COMMISSIONER NARASAKI:   About the  
24 interagency, sorry.

25           CHAIR LHAMON:   Go ahead.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1                   COMMISSIONER NARASAKI:    So, one of the  
2 things that struck me about the interagency task  
3 force that has existed in the past on hate crimes,  
4 and particularly, I believe it also was part of the  
5 effort to address bullying against Asian-American  
6 and Pacific Islander students, is the involvement  
7 of HHS.

8                   And particularly their mental health  
9 agencies. And I was intrigued by that, and I would  
10 like to understand why that's an important  
11 component of that kind of task force.

12                   MR. AUSTIN:   DOJ knows how to prosecute  
13 people.   HHS is much more in the world of mental  
14 health.

15                   You want those experts in there.   You want  
16 that expertise in there.   Just like again, DOJ is  
17 in the business of prosecuting people.

18                   And you want the Department of  
19 Education to say, well what makes a good  
20 educational environment?   This is why we have  
21 what's called crisis intervention training for law  
22 enforcement.

23                   The idea that law enforcement officers  
24 shouldn't be the ones necessarily always dealing  
25 with people who are in some kind of mental health

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 crisis. You actually want a social worker. You  
2 want someone who knows it, to save lives.

3 So, you want people's expertise. And  
4 that expertise does not sit in any one agency. It  
5 doesn't sit in any one body.

6 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: And is there, I  
7 mean, we heard also from a couple of witnesses,  
8 particularly some of our witnesses who were  
9 personally victims or connected to victims about  
10 the intersection of mental health issues, both in  
11 terms of being a victim but also being a  
12 perpetrator.

13 How much work is being done in the  
14 federal government to understand that? And to look  
15 at how can you address where the mental health  
16 issues are in terms of trying to help those who --  
17 so you can avoid an action coming in the form of a  
18 hate crime because you have failed to address the  
19 mental health issues?

20 MR. AUSTIN: I would actually pass to  
21 my education panelists. Because --

22 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yeah. No, I  
23 was asking everyone. It's not just --

24 MR. AUSTIN: Yeah. Okay. Sorry.

25 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: I'm not just

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 picking on you.

2 MR. AUSTIN: Sorry, sorry. No, I just  
3 think that that's where so much of this work can be  
4 done. Not from a law enforcement officer, but by  
5 an educator.

6 MS. OKUBADEJO: And I agree. I think  
7 that's one of the critical pieces that's missing  
8 is, you know, focusing on mental health issues  
9 among students.

10 And you know, as you know, many schools  
11 struggle to provide effective mental health  
12 services to students. Many are under-resourced.

13 You know, that's a topic that comes up  
14 often. And part -- from what I saw at OCR and even  
15 now, you know, part of an effective institutional  
16 response to hate crimes on campus or bullying or  
17 harassment on campus is making sure that students  
18 have resources.

19 So students on both sides of the issue,  
20 the person who's the target of the harassment or  
21 discrimination and then also the person who's  
22 perpetrating.

23 And schools -- for example this is one  
24 way that Title IX I think gets it right, is that  
25 schools are actively offering to students, as soon

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 as they come in the door, or to employees,  
2 connections to on campus and off campus resources  
3 to address mental health issues and to target that.

4 And I think that happens to a lesser  
5 degree under other statutes. So when there are  
6 issues of racial, or disability harassment coming  
7 up, we're seeing less of that.

8 But, I don't think there is the type of  
9 targeted and thoughtful response that you're  
10 talking about where, you know, educators and  
11 various groups at the government or at schools are  
12 getting together to think through how to address  
13 this systematically.

14 I don't think that's happening. But  
15 it's hugely needed.

16 MS. OSGOOD: I would say I agree, but  
17 also add that there has been talk for a number of  
18 years of the Department providing some guidance,  
19 perhaps with DOJ, on direct threat, students that  
20 pose a risk to themselves or others, and how should  
21 schools handle it: What type of accommodations?  
22 What type of leave policy should be in place?

23 And that never really came to any  
24 formal fruition. And so I would add that to the  
25 list of items that BZ mentioned in terms of where

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 greater clarity would be helpful.

2 CHAIR LHAMON: Okay. Thank you so  
3 much. So for example if that guidance were  
4 written, it would be good if it were released?

5 MS. OSGOOD: Yes, ma'am.

6 CHAIR LHAMON: Commissioner Adegbile?

7 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Dr. Langton, I  
8 have a question for you, understanding that you  
9 don't have this absolute power.

10 But, first I want to ask, what is your  
11 view about the quality of the data? Your former  
12 colleague had a view about the data not being of  
13 the highest quality.

14 I'm just wondering, you, as a  
15 statistician, what is your view of the quality of  
16 the data that you have to analyze?

17 MS. LANGTON: So, are you asking me  
18 about the quality of the FBI data? Or the quality  
19 of the National Crime Victimization Survey data?

20 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Well, both.

21 MS. LANGTON: So, I'll speak to the  
22 quality of the National Crime Victimization Survey.  
23 And you know, I think it's considered the gold  
24 standard in victimization surveys.

25 And plays a really important role. And

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the Census Bureau is our data collection agent, and  
2 we, BJS and the Census Bureau have policies and  
3 procedures in place at every stage to try to ensure  
4 that we're collecting data that are accurate and  
5 reliable.

6 So, starting from even the development  
7 of the questions and the process that we go  
8 through, working with folks with expertise to make  
9 sure that we're developing questions that are  
10 understood and are capturing the concepts that  
11 we're trying to measure.

12 The testing process that we go through  
13 with those questions, to then administer them to  
14 potential respondents and ensure that respondents  
15 can answer the questions in the way that we think  
16 they're going to answer them.

17 And that they're comprehending the  
18 question the way that we're intending. And then we  
19 have extensive testing that we do with our  
20 interviewers to ensure that they are administering  
21 the survey in a manner that's consistent for all  
22 respondents.

23 We have all sorts of data quality  
24 procedures and cleaning procedures that are put  
25 into place to ensure that the final data are high

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 quality and accurate and reliable.

2 And obviously, the National Crime  
3 Victimization Survey captures much higher counts of  
4 hate crime victimization than what you see in the  
5 UCR data.

6 And there are a number of reasons for  
7 that. And that's part of the reason that we have  
8 the National Crime Victimization Survey, to serve  
9 as that sort of complementary measure and to get at  
10 both the dark figure or the hidden figure of crime.  
11 And also to collect data that is not filtered  
12 through any sort of lenses.

13 Police data are filtered. Whether it's  
14 filtered at the law enforcement level, or it's  
15 filtered in what law enforcement agencies report to  
16 the UCR.

17 There is some potential there for that  
18 filter. And we're collecting information directly  
19 from residents.

20 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Do you think  
21 there is under-reporting in that data nevertheless?

22 MS. LANGTON: Absolutely. There's  
23 error in every data source. And there's absolutely  
24 going to be some under-reporting in the National  
25 Crime Victimization Survey.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           You're asking people about very  
2 sensitive topics. And so that's absolutely a  
3 problem.

4           But, you know, we try to put measures  
5 in place to ensure confidentiality, privacy of  
6 interviews. Putting all these procedures in place  
7 to encourage respondents to report on what  
8 happened.

9           But that's always a possibility.

10          COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Thank you. Mr.  
11 Austin, you suggested that perhaps one way to  
12 improve the FBI data, I take it, was to have  
13 mandatory reporting. Is that right?

14          MR. AUSTIN: That is correct.

15          COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Now, would that  
16 stand in contrast to general crime reports that the  
17 FBI gets? Meaning, aren't all of the crime reports  
18 voluntary?

19          MR. AUSTIN: They are.

20          COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: So, what would  
21 be the policy, how would we think about this as a  
22 policy justification to say that hate crimes are so  
23 important that they should be mandatory, and other  
24 crimes should be voluntary?

25          MR. AUSTIN: So, I actually wouldn't

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 make that distinction. And so my feelings are  
2 actually across all of our crime data.

3 I think most of our crime data is  
4 really bad. And we should be doing better. And  
5 for a country that values public safety as much as  
6 we do, it is actually embarrassing how bad our  
7 crime numbers are across the board.

8 And so, and I think it's just as easy  
9 to collect your hate crimes data at the same time.  
10 And I think that's what NCVS does, is collects  
11 their hate crimes data along with their regular  
12 crime data.

13 That's how the census does it. The  
14 same thing should be done with law enforcement  
15 agencies when you're seeking UCR data.

16 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: So, are you  
17 making a larger point than that perhaps the extent  
18 to which our crime data overall suffers the  
19 deficiency of being based on voluntary reporting,  
20 our criminal justice policies and investments may  
21 not be well put because they're based on garbage  
22 in, garbage out data?

23 MR. AUSTIN: Absolutely. But I would  
24 say the hate crimes data is particularly laughable.  
25 When you have, you know, states where you know more

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 than seven hate crimes have occurred reporting  
2 seven hate crimes, and using that to make any  
3 decision, I think is a real problem.

4 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Thank you. Ms.  
5 Osgood and Ms. Okubadejo, I definitely need to  
6 pronounce that name correctly with a name like  
7 Adegbile.

8 So, my sister here. So, my questions  
9 to you go to the impact in the higher ed space in  
10 particular, of having guidance and certain policy  
11 pronouncements put in place, and then taken away as  
12 they're starting to take root.

13 Obviously administrations have the  
14 opportunity to have their own view about their  
15 policy pronouncements. But particularly in some  
16 areas where the law is starting to become  
17 established or to bring greater protections to  
18 communities that have been found to be particularly  
19 susceptible to certain dangers in our schools.

20 I'm just wondering what the policy --  
21 or forget the policy. What are the real world  
22 implications of that whipsaw effect for our kids?

23 MS. OSGOOD: So I do a lot of  
24 presentations where I talk about the protections  
25 for transgender students and the changes in federal

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 policy, changes in federal law. I always remind  
2 schools that they can do more than is actually  
3 required by the laws.

4 That they can protect even if it's not  
5 specifically with -- protected under OCR guidance  
6 or the like.

7 I think you're suggesting that there's  
8 kind of almost a whipsaw effect of when a policy is  
9 issued, it's starting to sort of blossom and we're  
10 seeing some progress. And then it's withdrawn.

11 I think that's a fair observation. I  
12 do think even with the withdrawal of the  
13 transgender guidance and the issuance of the  
14 interim guidance for sexual violence, we have made  
15 progress.

16 I think students are better protected  
17 than they were. And now in my view we're in this  
18 kind of period of recalibration where there's an  
19 agreement as to principle maybe, but how we get  
20 there, we're going to have pretty robust debates  
21 about it.

22 MS. OKUBADEJO: I mean, I think it  
23 really depends on the context. And for some  
24 students, I would say withdrawal of the -- and  
25 employees also, withdrawal of the transgender

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 guidance in particular was devastating for some.

2 And in some cases dangerous. Because I  
3 think the message that some heard was that it is  
4 now okay again to discriminate and to treat people  
5 differently.

6 And to, you know, impose discipline if  
7 somebody uses quote unquote the wrong restroom.  
8 And so I think those types of changes can be really  
9 difficult.

10 Luckily though, I think what Debbie is  
11 saying is true that schools for the most part, and  
12 none of the schools with which I work made any  
13 kinds of changes to their internal policies or  
14 procedures when that guidance was withdrawn.

15 Because I think they were recognizing  
16 that all students are important members of their  
17 communities. And all students will be protected.  
18 And the rights of all students will be respected.

19 And so, you know, I didn't see  
20 immediate changes. But, you know, I can imagine  
21 circumstances, in, you know, cases where maybe I  
22 wasn't involved in a rural school district where a  
23 school district made maybe a different decision  
24 than they would have made pre-withdrawal of  
25 guidance.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           So, I think that can be challenging and  
2 can be confusing to schools sometimes if there's a  
3 lot of back and forth.

4           COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Thank you.

5           CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you for that also.

6           COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: One last  
7 question to Agent Deitle, or former Agent Deitle.  
8 I want your view of the relationship between the  
9 federal government and local law enforcement.

10           You're somebody who had a long career  
11 enforcing some of these laws, investigating these  
12 laws, shall I say, in the context of the federal  
13 power and the federal law.

14           And obviously there are many state  
15 laws, as we all know. And as a general matter,  
16 very often the states go first. But sometimes  
17 there is a helpful, as we've heard from Mr. Austin,  
18 collaboration and a federal presence.

19           So I'm wondering, for example, had you  
20 been at the FBI at the time of Charlottesville, how  
21 would you have understood the relationship between  
22 the federal government and the local officials that  
23 were responding to the events that we all witnessed  
24 and some of our earlier witnesses in very tragic  
25 ways?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MS. DEITLE: Thank you for your  
2 question. The FBI would not be able to do its job  
3 without information and intelligence.

4 We would also fail miserably without  
5 having relationships in place, not just with local  
6 law enforcement, but with so many people in the  
7 community. With community leaders, with education  
8 leaders. We would fail miserably.

9 I think one of the things the FBI does  
10 well in all of our field offices is to establish  
11 and strengthen the relationships with local law  
12 enforcement. So, every special agent in charge has  
13 a very solid, healthy, strong relationship with all  
14 of the police chiefs and sheriffs, the state police  
15 officers, school resource officers oftentimes, too.

16 To make sure that when there is  
17 something like Charlottesville, or another tragedy,  
18 there's already those relationships in place to be  
19 able to have a very quick conversation. To have a  
20 dialog very quickly about Mr. Police Chief, Ms.  
21 Police Chief, what do you need?

22 This is what we can do to help you, do  
23 you want us to hang back for a little while? Just  
24 tell us what you need.

25 Because this is what we can help you

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 with. If those relationships are all -- if they're  
2 not already established, it makes it really  
3 difficult to respond effectively to, whether it's a  
4 hate crime tragedy or a police misconduct  
5 situation, it's very difficult to respond with  
6 trust and transparency if those relationships are  
7 not already solid.

8 So I think the FBI does a really good  
9 job with partnering with local law enforcement and  
10 establishing those relationships before there's a  
11 problem.

12 I think what we can always offer is,  
13 we're here. And I think that Roy talked about that  
14 too. We're here, we can help.

15 We have a lot of tools. We have a lot  
16 of resources. We have a lot of money and a lot of  
17 very committed and passionate people that are here  
18 to help in a variety of ways.

19 But we like it to be collaborative. We  
20 don't want to impose the will of the FBI on a local  
21 law enforcement agency without it being a  
22 collaborative partnership. That just works more  
23 effectively.

24 So, I do think we do a good job with  
25 that. And especially if those relationships are

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 already set, I think we respond more effectively.

2 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Are there ever  
3 circumstances where the feds go first?

4 MS. DEITLE: There are. So, I've had a  
5 number of cases when I was an agent and a  
6 supervisor and unit chief that, for a particular  
7 hate crime situation it was the decision not just  
8 of the FBI, but also the Department of Justice that  
9 the interests of justice were to be served if the  
10 FBI and DOJ went first.

11 Those are very rare circumstances. And  
12 I think Roy and I have had numerous conversations  
13 about this, I think the power of the federal  
14 government in this area is most effective if we  
15 serve as that backstop.

16 So we are here if you need resources.  
17 We are here if maybe we need to go first. But we  
18 like all those decisions and discussions to be  
19 again, collaborative.

20 We certainly don't want to make a  
21 decision with DOJ to go first in a hate crime  
22 situation without the agreement and participation  
23 of that local law enforcement agency. And the  
24 victim too.

25 We want it to be a very transparent

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 decision-making process with the victim and the  
2 community as well. So, we do go first. But that's  
3 a very rare circumstance.

4 Sure. Thank you.

5 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you. Commissioner  
6 Yaki?

7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Thank you very  
8 much. Thank you all, the panel for your discussion  
9 today.

10 To me there seems to be two sort of  
11 under-reporting issues that we're talking about  
12 today. One is on the victim's side.

13 And as much as, since we are almost out  
14 of time, I'm not going to go into that other than  
15 to say that part of me believes that when you have  
16 rhetoric from policy leaders that diminishes the  
17 worth of those groups who would want, or  
18 individuals who want to report because they are  
19 Mexican-American, because they are an immigrant,  
20 because they see that the consent decree for the  
21 police department is no longer in place, it  
22 diminishes the confidences of people to do that.

23 But I'm not going to talk about that.  
24 What I want to talk about, because we have very  
25 little time, is that there is -- one of the persons

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 this morning said, I'm going to direct this at Mr.  
2 Austin and Ms. Langton.

3 When I asked the question about, how do  
4 you get at the issue of under-reporting by state  
5 agencies? Which is a different issue than the  
6 under-reporting by victims, which can be, you know,  
7 impacted by outside factors.

8 The answer this person gave was,  
9 resources. That they have antiquated, for lack of  
10 a better word, it sounded like antiquated computers  
11 that couldn't process data and get the data to DOJ  
12 in the appropriate form or whatever.

13 I want to know whether or not A, you  
14 believe that's -- how believable that is. I'm not  
15 saying it isn't believable.

16 But, in terms of importance, is it lack  
17 of will? Is it lack of interest? Or is it lack of  
18 capital infrastructure?

19 MS. DEITLE: I'm just going to make one  
20 quick point to answer your question. I've had  
21 those conversations with police chiefs and sheriffs  
22 in my career, the ones that do not report.

23 And I've asked them, why don't you  
24 report? And I get every answer that you just gave  
25 just now. I get answers of, I don't have time for

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that.

2 I don't have an intern that can do  
3 that. My computer broke. Why do I have to do  
4 that? My state agency doesn't mandate that I do  
5 that.

6 I've gotten every response you possibly  
7 can think of.

8 COMMISSIONER YAKI: My canine unit ate  
9 the paperwork, or something like that.

10 MS. DEITTLE: Right. I don't have  
11 paperwork that can -- I've heard many. And I think  
12 I gave this answer right before the hearing  
13 started.

14 But, I think one way to address that,  
15 the answer of, I just can't get that done, is to  
16 put -- to continue to put the onus back on the FBI.  
17 To say, look FBI, you collect all the data.

18 This is your data. You put out the  
19 data. You analyze the data. You collect the data.  
20 The FBI has to do a much better job getting the  
21 data. And convincing sheriffs and police chiefs to  
22 put their information into a system that then the  
23 FBI and that Lynn can access.

24 But in response to the questions of, I  
25 just can't get that done, there's always an answer.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 And the answer could be, what do you need?

2 Do you need an intern? Well, let's  
3 look at the local community college and get a  
4 criminal justice intern to help you, Mr. Police  
5 Chief. And she can take that data down and enter  
6 it into your system.

7 Do you not have the money to upgrade  
8 your computer system? We're going to go back to  
9 DOJ and we're going to get you a grant. It's going  
10 to fund your system and make it better.

11 Do you not see value in reporting?  
12 Well, let's talk about that too. There was always  
13 an answer. But the issue is, you had to have that  
14 conversation.

15 So the special agent in charge, not  
16 that I ever was one, but the FBI had to have that  
17 conversation with local law enforcement to find  
18 out, why are you not reporting? Help us.

19 We want the data. And we want the  
20 information. If you're having a problem, we're  
21 going to help you fix it.

22 MR. AUSTIN: And just really quickly.  
23 First of all I need to correct Cynthia. She kept  
24 speaking of the FBI and DOJ, because she's an FBI  
25 agent.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           DOJ is actually over the FBI. But,  
2 sometimes they forget that.

3           (Laughter)

4           MR. AUSTIN: The only other thing I  
5 would point out is just the fact that really,  
6 there's not a law enforcement agency in this  
7 country that is worth its salt that does not  
8 collect data on the crimes that are happening.

9           For them to say they can't release it  
10 is actually, usually it's pretty silly. Okay?

11           They have it. They know their homicide  
12 numbers. They know the vandalism numbers. They  
13 know the shoplifting numbers. They have those  
14 numbers.

15           It is really in most cases, a lack of  
16 will. And a decision not to have their agents,  
17 their agents, their officers, their deputies ask  
18 the question, you know, why do you think this  
19 happened to you?

20           Well, I think it happened to me because  
21 of the color of my skin. I think it happened to me  
22 because of my sexual orientation.

23           And then checking a box to say that  
24 that is the reason. And then putting that  
25 information into whatever system they currently

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 use.

2 There certainly isn't a major law  
3 enforcement agency in this country that doesn't  
4 collect data across the crimes and then sit down  
5 and tell everybody what that is.

6 Because if they didn't, the sheriffs  
7 wouldn't be elected, or the police chiefs wouldn't  
8 be appointed.

9 MS. LANGTON: And just to take this in  
10 a slightly different direction, moving away from  
11 the infrastructure issues, I think you know, the  
12 big improvement that we're making to the National  
13 Crime Victimization Survey right now, which is a  
14 major undertaking beginning in 2016, is to change  
15 our sample design so that we can collect state  
16 level, or produce state level estimates of  
17 victimization, including hate crime, for the 22  
18 most populous states as I mentioned earlier.

19 And that gives the ability to at least  
20 then triangulate at the state level between the FBI  
21 data and the NCVS. And potentially even local law  
22 enforcement data too, to be able to piece together  
23 this picture of where there are these discrepancies  
24 in terms of, we have 110,000 victims saying that  
25 they're reporting to police that they experienced a

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 hate crime.

2 When we drill down then at the state  
3 level, what does that mean in terms of how many  
4 victimizations are getting recorded and reported by  
5 law enforcement.

6 CHAIR LHAMON: Okay. So we are past  
7 time. But the Vice Chair is going to take us home  
8 with the last question of the day.

9 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: All right  
10 then. Thank you very much Madam Chair. And I  
11 thank our panelists for being with us today, it's  
12 been absolutely wonderful.

13 Through the materials that I read in  
14 preparation for this hearing, and from the  
15 testimony that I've received, at this point I've  
16 been convinced that the collection of good data is  
17 absolutely imperative to combating hate crimes.

18 And yet we've heard repeatedly today  
19 information that causes us to question the validity  
20 and the value of the data. Through other panelists  
21 and through you, Mr. Austin, we've heard ways to  
22 improve the system of collecting data.

23 One of our earlier panelists said that  
24 one of the ways that we can improve the data  
25 collection is for us to have our communities

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 require that our law enforcement agencies, or their  
2 local law enforcement agencies are accountable.

3 So hold them accountable. You send up  
4 the information saying there wasn't a single hate  
5 crime committed in your jurisdiction, folks in the  
6 community ought to be up in arms saying, huh? Or  
7 how in the world could you possibly come up with  
8 that?

9 I'd like to get your thoughts from  
10 anyone that wants to offer, on whether that is in  
11 fact a valid way to approach this? And if there  
12 are any other ways that communities, that we can  
13 bring our communities into this so as to improve  
14 our data collection?

15 MR. AUSTIN: Sure. I very much  
16 appreciate your question. And that was part of the  
17 reason why I read the lengthy list of large  
18 communities that do not report.

19 Because the millions of people who  
20 watch CSPAN, hopefully at least one of them is in  
21 one of those communities, and heard that, and will  
22 say, I need to make a move on this.

23 Look, I think communities drive most of  
24 our change. And communities are the ones who can  
25 decide who's going to be the next mayor, the next

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 police chief, the next sheriff and what not.

2 The problem is that, you know, some  
3 things the federal government is just better at.  
4 And it needs to take ownership of this problem and  
5 do something about it.

6 And our Congress needs to take  
7 ownership of this problem and do something about  
8 it. Yes, I would love if our communities stepped  
9 up and forced their jurisdictions to do so.

10 But, our communities are worried about  
11 getting their kids to school and their health care,  
12 and the food on the table. And just, you know,  
13 making sure that their kids are all right.

14 Data about hate crimes is not  
15 necessarily in their top ten list. And I think it  
16 is something which a federal government needs to  
17 step forward and take ownership of.

18 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Thank you.  
19 Do you want to say something?

20 MS. DEITLE: I always hate when I agree  
21 with you.

22 (Laughter)

23 MS. DEITLE: So, I would just -- where  
24 I thought you were going with that was where you  
25 went. So, I hate to put that responsibility on a

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 community.

2 I hate to make people have to think  
3 about, is my kid safe in school? Do we have  
4 healthcare? And then also, I think the hate crime  
5 stats are inadequate.

6 I hate to put that on them. But, I  
7 would love someone to take up that cause in every  
8 community. And make Honolulu, who doesn't report  
9 anything, I would love to make the community in  
10 Honolulu report their data or force their law  
11 enforcement agency to report.

12 But, I do think that at the end of the  
13 day it is the responsibility of the FBI. They  
14 collect it. I think they have to do a much better  
15 job to go out and get it.

16 And I hope that that's something that  
17 changes in due time.

18 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you very much to  
19 this panel for the day. This is amazing testimony.  
20 We really appreciate it.

21 We are going to break and reconvene at  
22 5:00 p.m. for the open public comment period. All  
23 participants in the open public comment period  
24 should report back at 4:45 p.m.

25 And this is a brief reminder that

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 registration for that open public comment period is  
2 still open. So we'll recess now until 5:00. Thank  
3 you very much.

4 (Whereupon, the above-entitled matter  
5 went off the record at 3:58 p.m. and  
6 resumed at 5:00 p.m.)

7 **OPEN AND PUBLIC COMMENT**

8 CHAIR LHAMON: So, welcome back,  
9 everyone. We're now going to proceed with the open  
10 public comment session.

11 A few opening instructions which have  
12 been provided to each participant already, please  
13 tailor your remarks to the topic of today's  
14 briefing which is hate crimes and bias-motivated  
15 incidents.

16 Please state your name for the record.  
17 Please note that the U.S. Commission on Civil  
18 Rights has a policy not to defame, degrade, or  
19 incriminate any person.

20 Also, this comment period is a time for  
21 the Commissioners to listen, not to engage in  
22 questions or discussion with presenters. So we  
23 appreciate your testimony, we're very eager to hear  
24 it, and we will not take your short time with  
25 questions or with dialog.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           You'll have three minutes to speak,  
2           which will be measured by a timer. The box with  
3           the three lights here reflects that time and when  
4           the light turns from green to yellow, that means  
5           that one minute remains.

6           And when the light turns red, you  
7           should conclude your statement, and if you do not  
8           conclude it, I will conclude it for you.

9           If you've not finished or would like to  
10          submit additional information, we encourage you to  
11          do so by mailing or emailing your written  
12          submission to us at the address provided on your  
13          information sheet. And that should be provided by  
14          June 11, 2018.

15          While waiting for your turn, please sit  
16          in the numbered chair that corresponds with your  
17          ticket. Thank you all for coming up to the  
18          microphones already.

19          And if you need to step out briefly  
20          before it is your time to speak to use the restroom  
21          or otherwise, please let a Staff person know. It  
22          doesn't seem like a very good idea in three  
23          minutes. And if you have any questions, please ask  
24          a Staff Member.

25          At least one of our Commissioners has a

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 flight to catch and so might have to step out a few  
2 minutes early, but I hope we will all be here. So  
3 I will now begin public comment with our first  
4 speaker.

5 MR. ESTRIN: Hello, my name is David  
6 Estrin. I'm here with you today because all four  
7 of my grandparents survived the Holocaust.

8 I'm the grandson of Jew Number 67245  
9 and when I was 13, my grandfather brought me to the  
10 Mauthausen Concentration Camp in Austria to show me  
11 what that truly meant.

12 That day, he sparked a fire in me which  
13 would go on to reveal my responsibility to fulfil  
14 the promises of never forget and never again, not  
15 just for the Jewish people but for all people.

16 After he passed away, I founded  
17 Together We Remember, a nonprofit that combines  
18 technology, art, and activism to transform  
19 remembrance into action to end identity-based  
20 violence around the world.

21 Each April, genocide awareness and  
22 prevention month, we organize interactive vigils  
23 that commemorate the victims of genocide and  
24 atrocities throughout history and celebrate the  
25 stories of heroes who have saved countless lives

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 time and again.

2 This past April, we organized over 40  
3 vigils across nine countries and high schools,  
4 universities, museums, houses of worship and public  
5 spaces.

6 In Charlottesville, Virginia, we  
7 brought together city leaders across identity  
8 groups to build relationships of trust and  
9 solidarity which will be critical to keep the peace  
10 in August, the one-year mark of the Unite The Right  
11 rally.

12 In Brooklyn, New York, we united  
13 survivors, activists, and tech innovators to  
14 explore immersive technologies like virtual reality  
15 and portals by shared studios, which can foster  
16 empathy, empower vulnerable communities and inspire  
17 collective action.

18 In Boca Raton, Florida, an interfaith  
19 coalition and the ADL organize an evening of art,  
20 activism, and dialog on the meaning of never again,  
21 and commemorated the victims of the Marjory  
22 Stoneman Douglas school shooting.

23 And here in Washington, Congresswoman  
24 Ann Wagner led a series of bipartisan floor  
25 speeches in honor of genocide awareness and

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 prevention month. The list goes on, including  
2 communities in Zambia, D.R. Congo, Rwanda,  
3 Cambodia, Canada, Germany, France, and the U.K.

4 One of the most common pieces of  
5 feedback we've heard from participants is that they  
6 don't have many opportunities to connect face to  
7 face and work alongside people from across the  
8 fault lines in their communities.

9 In countries with a recent history of  
10 mass atrocities, networks of non-political peace-  
11 building organizations often emerge to mend racial,  
12 religious, and political divisions. That sort of  
13 network needs to be more fully developed here in  
14 America.

15 Our experience has revealed that we  
16 already have the technology, know-how, and  
17 willpower to end bias-motivated violence, but we  
18 need more opportunities to connect, collaborate,  
19 and put these puzzle pieces together.

20 Now imagine peaceful rapid response  
21 vigils wherever white supremacists seek to achieve  
22 silence or violence. Imagine a global counter-  
23 narrative campaign every April, in partnership with  
24 Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, and YouTube to  
25 amplify inspiring voices standing up to hate across

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the globe.

2 We believe that if we can create enough  
3 of these opportunities to unite, we will turn the  
4 tide to rising extremism in the U.S. and make never  
5 again a reality worldwide by 2048, the 100-year  
6 anniversary of the UN genocide convention.

7 By remembering humanity at its worst,  
8 we can inspire humanity to be its best one  
9 community at a time. Thank you.

10 MR. WATKINS: I am Devin Watkins,  
11 attorney at law. First of all, I wish to inform  
12 the Commission that pursuant to 42 U.S.C. 1975(d),  
13 it appears that the statutory authority of this  
14 Commission has terminated.

15 Returning to the topic of hate crimes.  
16 I wish to speak today to oppose the violation of my  
17 civil liberties. The Hate Crimes Prevention Act  
18 was passed under the purported authority of the  
19 Thirteenth Amendment. That amendment prohibits  
20 slavery and involuntary servitude.

21 Violence based on a person's race,  
22 color, religion, national origin are not slavery  
23 nor are they involuntary servitude. It demeans  
24 those that had to live in slavery to say otherwise.

25 Slavery legally allowed people to beat,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 rape, and murder other human beings. Slavery was  
2 an evil beyond anything we experience today and  
3 thank God we stopped it in this country.

4 Congress has the power to stop slavery  
5 using any reasonable means, but this is not even  
6 intended to stop slavery. Does anyone really  
7 believe this is the purpose of the law? It isn't  
8 even claimed to be doing so.

9 The only valid use of the Thirteenth  
10 Amendment is for the end of prohibiting slavery and  
11 the involuntary servitude. Slavery and involuntary  
12 servitude are already illegal and there is no fear  
13 of them occurring again.

14 It is wrong to do violence based on a  
15 person's race, color, religion, or national origin,  
16 which is why those acts are prohibited in every  
17 state. But there is no basis in our Constitution  
18 for a Federal prohibition.

19 Our civil liberties are based on the  
20 respect of the rule of law, especially the supreme  
21 law of the land, the Constitution. It violates  
22 everyone's civil liberties to threaten people with  
23 an unconstitutional law beyond the enumerated  
24 powers of the Federal Government.

25 The reality is these acts are already

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 prohibited under state law. This statute is  
2 instead being used to subject politically disparate  
3 minorities to double jeopardy, in violation of the  
4 Fifth Amendment.

5 This is done by prosecuting them twice  
6 for the same act, once at the state level and again  
7 at the Federal level. Justice properly understood  
8 requires that all people be given a fair trial in  
9 which they are to be released if they are found not  
10 guilty.

11 I will leave you with the words of  
12 George Washington: the best and only safe road to  
13 honor, glory, and true dignity is justice.

14 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you. Next  
15 speaker?

16 MR. LEVIN: Hello, my name is Jake  
17 Levin and I am speaking on behalf of the  
18 organization Shared Studios.

19 We are a collective of artists,  
20 community organizers, and former lawyers who are  
21 working to connect diverse communities around the  
22 world through live, full-body video environments  
23 called portals. When you enter a portal, you come  
24 face to face with someone in a similar portal  
25 somewhere else around the world and can speak as if

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 standing in the same room.

2 Participants have expressed feeling as  
3 though they are breathing the same air as someone  
4 who may be thousands of miles away.

5 We are working to create a world where  
6 people from a tech hub in Rwanda and a community  
7 center in Milwaukee can engage one another in  
8 intimate dialog, collaborate on new ideas, create  
9 art, and play.

10 More than 150,000 portal participants  
11 have experienced a connection over the last three  
12 years. Conversations have ranged from the deeply  
13 personal to the every day.

14 Here in Washington, a drone pilot for  
15 the U.S. Air Force met an Afghan man for the first  
16 time through the portal, only days after flying  
17 drones through Afghan air space.

18 A group of Palestinian women shared a  
19 portal conversation with an Israeli entrepreneur  
20 and an Iranian artist discussing their inability to  
21 receive proper cancer care in Gaza City.

22 Iraqi students and their teacher met  
23 with Members of Congress before a scheduled vote on  
24 the Education for All Act, which directed funds to  
25 education and emergency zones. All of those

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Members of Congress voted yes.

2 For the last two year, portals have  
3 also connected heavily police communities across  
4 America and Mexico. Residents in a number of  
5 cities have come together in portals to strategize  
6 about how to improve police community relations.

7 And on the ground in Milwaukee, our  
8 portal curator used his position to bring together  
9 rival gangs to create local truces, which led to  
10 the creation of a neighborhood watch coalition.

11 While polarization seems to be on the  
12 rise, study after study reinforces the idea that  
13 hate is reduced through deliberate dialog between  
14 diverse groups. Individuals and groups on opposing  
15 sides of conflict rarely find opportunities to  
16 connect face to face, let alone collaborate.

17 We believe that if we can create enough  
18 opportunities for different individuals to share  
19 the same physical space, they will quickly realize  
20 that their similarities outnumber their  
21 differences.

22 We have allowed social media and new  
23 technologies to drive us deeper into our own  
24 tribes. In these insulated social groups, hatred  
25 can thrive but portals created spaces for dialog

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 outside our tribes that challenged stereotypes and  
2 brought in world views.

3 Portals demonstrate how technology, if  
4 constructed well, can thrive as a vehicle for  
5 peace. Innovations and immersive technology are  
6 fundamentally reshaping how we counter hatred and  
7 violence, and I hope you'll remember portals as we  
8 all seek new solutions to these enduring problems.

9 Thank you.

10 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you. Our fourth  
11 speaker?

12 MS. KIM: Good evening.

13 My name is Jiny Kim and I am the Vice  
14 President for Policy and Programs at Asian-  
15 Americans Advancing Justice, AAJC. Our mission is  
16 to advance civil and human rights for Asian-  
17 Americans and to build and promote a fair and  
18 equitable society for all.

19 For over 25 years, we've served as the  
20 leading civil rights voice for the Asian-American  
21 community, the fastest-growing population in the  
22 U.S., fighting for our civil rights through policy  
23 advocacy, education, and litigation.

24 Following the disturbing rise in  
25 hateful rhetoric and hate incidents across the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 country leading up to and following the 2016  
2 election, the Asian-Americans Advancing Justice's  
3 national affiliation launched,  
4 standagainsthate.org, a website to track and  
5 report hate incidents against Asian-Americans.

6 Since a significant number of Asian-  
7 Americans have limited English proficiency,  
8 approximately one in three, we've ensured that this  
9 site is accessible in multiple languages, including  
10 Chinese, Korean, and Vietnamese.

11 We've also partnered with the Lawyer's  
12 Committee on Civil Rights Under Law to provide  
13 assistance through their stop-hate hotline in  
14 Cantonese, Mandarin, Korean, and Vietnamese.

15 Since the launch of this site, we have  
16 received more than 200 reports from across the  
17 country, covering anti-Asian and anti-immigrant  
18 incidents that range from hateful slurs, bullying,  
19 harassment, and violence.

20 Asian-Americans have been the targets  
21 of violent hate crimes and one widely reported  
22 incident that was also shared with our site was the  
23 shooting in Olathe, Kansas, which killed Srinivas  
24 Kuchibhotla. And the shooter reportedly yelled get  
25 out of my country as he attacked.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           It is also important to document and  
2 share stories of every day hate, including racial  
3 slurs and street harassment. While these may not  
4 meet the definition of a hate crime, such incidents  
5 are still harmful, not only to the impacted  
6 individual but also to the community at large.

7           We have received many reports to our  
8 site of people being told to go back to your  
9 country or you don't belong here, often with curses  
10 and racial slurs.

11           We already know that hate crimes are  
12 under-reported and the Federal Government must do  
13 more to incentivize better collection and reporting  
14 of this data.

15           We must do more to invest in outreach  
16 and education to encourage reporting and at the  
17 same time, ensure that this is accessible, that our  
18 communities are not fearful of those whose job it  
19 is to keep them safe, and that translations and in-  
20 language assistance are available.

21           And in this political climate, we face  
22 even greater challenges with assuring immigrants  
23 that they should feel safe reporting hate crimes  
24 and hate incidents, community safety and community  
25 trust suffer when local law enforcement officials

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 are also tasked with immigrant enforcement.

2 We'll continue to work to report and  
3 raise our communities' voices. Thank you.

4 CHAIR LHAMON: Thanks very much. Our  
5 next speaker?

6 MR. STACY: Thank you. I'm David  
7 Stacy, Government Affairs Director for the Human  
8 Rights Campaign, the nation's largest LGBTQ  
9 organization working on civil rights.

10 Matthew Shepard lost his life to  
11 violence in the fall of 1998. He was brutally  
12 beaten with the butt of a 357 magnum, tied to a  
13 fence, and left to die in freezing temperatures  
14 because he was gay.

15 This October will mark two decades  
16 since Matthew's murder and the public reckoning  
17 that followed culminated in the passage of the  
18 Matthew Shepard and James Byrd Jr. Hate Crimes  
19 Prevention Act. This law has served as an  
20 essential Federal tool to combat and prosecute  
21 bias-motivated crimes.

22 However, it's far from a cure-all.  
23 Since 2016, we have seen a significant increase in  
24 violence against LGBTQ people, particularly  
25 transgender people and in communities of color.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           In 2017, it proved to be the deadliest  
2 year for transgender people on record. At least 28  
3 transgender people lost their lives to violence.

4           Ally Steinfeld was a 17-year-old  
5 transgender girl living in rural Missouri. Her  
6 lifeless body was found partially burned with stab  
7 wounds to her genitals and with her eyes gouged  
8 out. Mercedes Williamson was also only 17  
9 when she was stabbed multiple times and beaten to  
10 death by a hammer while trying to flee. Her  
11 attacker admitted to killing her because she was  
12 transgender. This extreme violence is often seen  
13 with hate crimes.

14           There are also survivors who must live  
15 with the emotional and physical scars like Anthony  
16 Gooden and Marquez Tolbert. Anthony, who had  
17 recently come out as gay to his family, was  
18 sleeping next to Marquez after working a long day.

19           A family friend staying at the house  
20 saw them sleeping together, boiled a pot of water,  
21 poured the scalding water of the couple while they  
22 slept, screaming get out of my house with all that  
23 gay. Anthony was placed in a medically-induced  
24 coma for weeks; over 60 percent of his body burned.

25           Although we know the reported incidents

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701



1 of hate are on the rise, we also know that the  
2 statistics are drastically under-counted.

3 State and local police departments are  
4 not federally mandated to record hate crimes and  
5 many lack the training necessary to recognize them  
6 and to work with survivors and their families.

7 17 percent of jurisdictions across the  
8 country had not reported a single hate crime to the  
9 FBI for the last 6 years.

10 This means that major cities like  
11 Mobile, Alabama, Savannah, Chatham, a metro area in  
12 Georgia, and Irving, Texas, report they have  
13 consistently had zero hate crimes within their  
14 borders. Those numbers are just not credible.

15 Violence against any member of the  
16 community sows a culture of fear and otherness that  
17 prevents them from living full lives. However,  
18 some members bear the disproportionate brunt of  
19 this unspeakable violence.

20 The intersection of racism, sexism,  
21 homophobia, and transphobia have conspired to drive  
22 too many of these women -- employment, housing,  
23 transgender housing, healthcare and otherness, as  
24 it is making this transgender community more  
25 vulnerable to fatal violence.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           In addition, people living in the  
2 intersection of marginal communities feel less safe  
3 going to police.

4           No one should have to fear for their  
5 safety because of who they are or who they love.  
6 Training is essential and we also believe that  
7 mandatory reporting of hate crimes should be  
8 required across the country.

9           Thank you.

10           CHAIR LHAMON: Thanks very much. Our  
11 next speaker?

12           MR. THOMAS: Good afternoon, and I want  
13 to thank the Commission for allowing me to be here  
14 this afternoon to comment on hate crimes and other  
15 incidents that are bias-related.

16           My name is Juan Thomas and I'm the  
17 President of the National Bar Association. The  
18 National Bar Association is the largest association  
19 of African-American lawyers, judges, and law  
20 students in the country.

21           We represent a network of over 65,000  
22 across this country and we historically have been  
23 opposed to the proliferation of hate crimes and  
24 bias-motivated cases. And in many instances, we  
25 continue to be ineffective, unfortunately

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 ineffective, in our responses.

2 Today I come before you as many of my  
3 colleagues have already spoken to bring attention  
4 to the issue of hate crime nationally, as well as  
5 in my home city of Chicago.

6 The NBA believes that the protection of  
7 fair housing rights and -- I'm sorry, the NBA  
8 believes in the protection of fair housing and fair  
9 housing rights.

10 We defend against complaints of  
11 discrimination based upon the 16 protected classes  
12 including race, sex, religion, sexual orientation,  
13 discrimination in employment, housing, public  
14 accommodations, credit, and bonding.

15 The NBA stands united with our  
16 collaborative bar associations, the civil rights  
17 community, and the community at large in condemning  
18 hate crimes, white supremacy, and bigotry in every  
19 form. And we stand in solidarity with people of  
20 color who find ourselves targeted by hate speech  
21 and hate crimes.

22 Congress and all civic-minded  
23 individuals and entities must explore how our  
24 Government is investigating the rooting out of hate  
25 crimes and those violent white supremacist groups

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that are perpetuating these heinous crimes.

2 As we examine the Federal Government's  
3 role in responding to hate crimes, we should also  
4 urge Congress to oppose the introduction and<sup>19</sup> the  
5 co-sponsorship of the Protect and Serve Act of  
6 2018, which would extend hate crime protection to  
7 law enforcement officers.

8 We believe it is imperative and  
9 counterproductive to consider this legislation as  
10 it would further erode police and community  
11 relationships.

12 I respectfully submit this statement,  
13 urging the Commission to diligently examine best  
14 practices for preventing, investigating, and  
15 prosecuting, including reporting practices by local  
16 law enforcement officials, and efforts by the U.S.  
17 Departments of Justice and Education and institute  
18 all mechanisms to bring forth a more timely and  
19 accelerated remedy to the victims of hate crimes.  
20 Thank you.

21 CHAIR LHAMON: Thank you very much and  
22 thank you to all of our public speakers. This will  
23 close our public comment period. We appreciate  
24 your time, thank you.

25 And that will bring us to the end of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 our briefing; I thank all of our panelists, all of  
2 our public participants, and today has been  
3 tremendously informative.

4 Just to be clear, as I said earlier,  
5 the record for the briefing remains open until  
6 Monday, June 11, 2018.

7 Panelists and members of the public who  
8 would like to submit materials for Commission  
9 consideration, which we welcome, can mail them to  
10 the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights, Office of  
11 Civil Rights Evaluation, 1331 Pennsylvania Avenue  
12 Northwest, Suite 1150, Washington, D.C., 20425, or  
13 email them to [hatecrimes@usccr.gov](mailto:hatecrimes@usccr.gov).

14 If there's nothing further, I hereby  
15 adjourn our briefing. Thank you very much.

16 (Whereupon, the above-entitled matter  
17 went off the record at 5:19 p.m.)

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

