U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS

+ + + + +

BUSINESS MEETING

+ + + + +

FRIDAY, APRIL 21, 2023

+ + + + +

The Commission convened at 12:13 p.m. in Suite 1150 at 1331 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Washington, D.C., Mauro Morales, Staff Director, presiding.
PRESENT:

J. CHRISTIAN ADAMS, Commissioner STEPHEN GILCHRIST, Commissioner ROCHELLE GARZA, Commissioner GAIL HERIOT, Commissioner MONDAIRE JONES, Commissioner PETER N. KIRSANOW, Commissioner GLENN MAGPANTAY, Commissioner VICTORIA NOURSE, Commissioner

MAURO MORALES, Staff Director DAVID GANZ, General Counsel

STAFF PRESENT:
CODY BOWLER
MARIK-XAVIER BRIER
SHERYL COZART
PAMELA DUNSTON, CHIEF ASCD
HYUNG KIM
JULIAN NELSON-SAUNDERS, ASCD
ESSENCE PERRY, ASCD
JOHN RATCLIFFE
ANGELIA RORISON
MICHELE YORKMAN-RAMEY, ASCD

COMMISSIONER ASSISTANTS PRESENT:
ALEXIS FRAGOSA
JOHN K. MASHBURN
CARISSA MULDER
THOMAS SAMUEL
IRENA VIDULOVIC

May 19 USCCR Business Meeting to Thursday,

May 18.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA	5
BUSINESS MEETING	
Discussion and Vote on Presidential Designation of Commissioner Rochelle Mercedes Garza as Chairperson and Victoria Frances Nourse as Vice Chair of the U.S. Commission on Civil	
Rights	5
Discussion and vote on Changing Friday,	

AGENDA

Neal R. Gross and Co., Inc. Washington DC

1	P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S
2	(12:12 p.m.)
3	MR. MORALES: Good afternoon and welcome
4	to everybody, and welcome to the business meeting for
5	the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights.
6	This meeting comes to order at I'll get
7	the time correct here at 12:12 Eastern Standard
8	Time on Friday, April 21, 2023.
9	I am Staff Director Mauro Morales. I am
10	not substantively participating in this meeting, but
11	because of the current absence of a chair and vice
12	chair, I am administering it pursuant to our
13	administrative functions set out in 42 U.S.C. 1975(b).
14	And I would like to confirm the commissioners present
15	and will take a roll call. Please say present when I
16	say your name. Commissioner Adams?
17	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Present.
18	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Garza.
19	COMMISSIONER GARZA: Present.
20	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Gilchrist?
21	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Present.
22	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Heriot?
23	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I'm here.
24	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Jones?
25	COMMISSIONER JONES: Present.

5

1	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Kirsanow?
2	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Here.
3	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Magpantay?
4	COMMISSIONER MAGPANTAY: Here.
5	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Nourse?
6	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: I'm here.
7	MR. MORALES: Based on the response, a
8	quorum of commissioners is present. Is the court
9	reporter present?
LO	COURT REPORTER: Present.
L1	I. APPROVAL OF AGENDA
L2	MR. MORALES: I am the staff director, and
L3	I am present. The meeting will now come to order.
L4	The first order of business is a vote to approve the
L5	agenda.
L6	MR. MORALES: All those in favor say
L7	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No. No, I move to
L8	amend the agenda.
L9	MR. MORALES: Well, let's approve okay.
20	Yes, are there any amendment to amend the
21	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. Yes, there is
22	one.
23	MR. MORALES: Please state your motion.
24	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I move to amend the
25	proposed agenda to put first that is under I got it

1	here, under Section 2, Business Meeting, before what
2	is currently A, I would move to include a discussion
3	and vote of our 30/30/10 Policy and a discussion and
4	vote of the Crime Victims Report, including the
5	discovery documents and the proposed schedule.
6	MR. MORALES: Is there a second?
7	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Second.
8	MR. MORALES: It is open for discussion.
9	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: A point of personal
10	privilege, my microphone doesn't turn on.
11	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: Mine doesn't either.
12	I guess they don't like us.
13	MR. MORALES: You've got to push it hard.
14	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: There we go. Thank
15	you.
16	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: Oh, I see.
17	MR. MORALES: You have the floor.
18	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Thank you. The
19	reason for this motion is fairly simple and hopefully
20	the action of the Commission will reflect its
21	simplicity. Regarding the 30/30/10, I will reserve to
22	other commissioners to talk about it. But in the last
23	Commission, two meetings or three meetings ago, we
24	approved the second paper that we are required to do
25	by Congress as part of our regular business. We had

1	a statutory report we were working on. We had
2	hearings on. And we approved the second one.
3	And we had an agreement to approve the
4	discovery plan, which the staff drew up. I would note
5	that Commissioner Heriot's motion reflects a staff
6	proposal, not a proposal that Commissioner Adams
7	wrote. And we had an agreement to approve that
8	discovery plan last fall, and we were double-crossed,
9	plain and simple.
10	And we need to do, as some have said, I
11	agree, the work of the Commission and do the work for
12	the people. It related to an issue that I think has
13	broad agreement. It is an important issue in the
14	United States.
15	This is not a difficult lift. And that is
16	what I think is behind Commissioner Heriot's motion to
17	amend the agenda to take this up and approve it and
18	get about the Commission's business. It's not tough.
19	I don't think it's even controversial.
20	MR. MORALES: Thank you. Any other
21	discussion?
22	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yeah.
23	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Heriot?
24	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yeah. I mean, we
25	all know the thing that has been noticed that is most

significant on our agenda is the approval of President
Biden's nominations for chair and vice chair. I think
I speak for three other colleagues of mine,
Commissioner Adams, Commissioner Gilchrist and
Commissioner Kirsanow, we would very much like to be
able to vote in favor of those nominations. But
before we do so, we feel that it is very important to
set certain ground rules, and we didn't think this
would even be controversial. We thought this was
going to be easy stuff here.

We've had previous negotiations with previous chairs and vice chairs, and they have all gone, I think, ultimately quite smoothly. This one seems to be an exception in that we are being required to vote before we have been able to resolve these ground rules.

And we actually pared down what we needed to what we thought would be really uncontroversial. The 30/30/10 policy, I think, is really one of the most significant things about this Commission. Under our 30/30/10 policy, when a report is approved by the Commission, each commissioner then has 30 days to write a statement that will be part of that report.

Those reports are then -- those statements are then traded so that we then have an additional 30

2.2

1	days to respond to things that the other commissioners
2	have said. And I think these statements have been
3	extremely valuable in the Commission reports, often
4	far more valuable than the report itself, the part
5	that is generated by the staff, because it allows us
6	to flesh out arguments from all sides in addition, in
7	rare occasions, and I think this has only been invoked
8	once, we have an additional 10 days for surrebuttal if
9	new material has been brought up during the rebuttal
10	period, and three commissioners agree that there ought
11	to be a 10 day surrebuttal. And I think that has
12	worked out extremely well.

Previous chairs have readily accepted this and have gone on the record saying that they will always vote in favor of retaining the policy. And that way even though, you know, Commission majorities, you know, come and go, there will always be a majority in favor of retaining the policy.

You know, I don't think that should be controversial. And yet because we have been hurried in this case, we haven't gotten that guarantee. I would very much like to see that. And I think there is a problem that the policy was adopted some time And I believe there was a controversy over whether or not the policy should take the form of an

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

AI or whether given that it applies to the
commissioners rather than to the staff that it doesn't
need to be an AI.

I think it will be nice to have it codified in some way whether you call it an AI or call it Fred. I mean, I don't much care what it's called as long as it is in writing, and it can all be clear for everyone.

The other issue is, of course, what Commissioner Adams brought up, and that is the Crime Victims Report. We're frankly, you know, the four of us feel that like we were chumps, that we agreed to the anti-Asian briefing on the condition that we also have a crime victims.

This is 4/4 Commission. You would expect that, you know, when you have a 4/4 Commission there is going to be a one for you, one for me. Both of these reports were approved. And then much to our shock, while we happily voted in favor of the discovery plan and accompanying documents for the anti-Asian, the accompanying documents for the discovery plan and accompanying documents for the Crime Victims Report were voted down.

We felt that we were double-crossed. And that doesn't make for a happy Commission. So that is

2.2

2.2

why I have moved to put these things first. If we could agree on these things and get all that settled, then we could have, you know, a much easier meeting. But otherwise, I don't see how we can approve the nominations at this time.

I would hope that at least we can get them done by notational vote in the coming days because I think that once members of the Commission focus on the notion that these requests are really very, very fair. We are just trying to ensure that we will be treated fairly on the Commission. I think once that is clear, this is going to be smooth sailing.

MR. MORALES: Turn off your mics, please. Commissioner Heriot, has this proposed AI that you're asking for codification, has it been submitted to general counsel's office, OCRE, for a review?

COMMISSIONER HERIOT: This was voted on a decade ago. This was a failure of that office to codify it in the past, not that that makes much difference here. The thing is, we need these to be done. We cannot vote in favor of these nominations until this is done.

The agenda, which made this the issue for the agenda, was not promulgated properly with our rules. It is not up to the staff director to

1	promulgate an agenda.	
2	In the case of our last chair, Norma	
3	Cantu, it was two months and almost three weeks before	
4	the nomination was confirmed because it was necessary	
5	to undergo these negotiations. And suddenly the staff	
6	director, who has no authority to promulgate an	
7	agenda, is telling us we absolutely must vote on this	
8	now.	
9	You know, that means unnecessary	
10	embarrassment to everybody. We don't want to vote	
11	down these nominations. What we would like to do is	
12	be able to happily approve these, but with these very	
13	fair proposals of ours. They haven't been acted on,	
14	and they need to be acted on before we can vote.	
15	MR. MORALES: So your answer is they have	
16	not been submitted to the general counsel's office.	
17	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: They were submitted	
18		
19	MR. MORALES: Please don't talk over me.	
20	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: a decade ago.	
21	MR. MORALES: Please don't talk over me.	
22	You can answer when I am finished. So your answer is	
23	they have not been submitted	
24	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No, it's not.	

MR. MORALES: -- to the general counsel's

	1
	2
	3
	4
	5
	6
	7
	8
	9
1	0
1	1
1	2
1	.3
1	4
1	5
1	6
1	.7
1	.8
1	9

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

office, and they have not been submitted to the Office of Civil Rights Evaluation for review, which is the minimum for all AIs that should be accomplished. And so that has not been done.

These were just sent to our office or to me or to the staff less than three days ago. So I'm not sure why you have the rush to put this through without a thorough evaluation and making sure that it follows and adheres to the AIs and the statutes so.

COMMISSIONER HERIOT: This has been our policy since November of 2011.

MR. MORALES: It was never acted upon, so it is not the policy of the Commission.

COMMISSIONER GARZA: I'm going to exercise a point of personal privilege here -- Commissioner Garza. I just want to back up a little bit and make it very clear that there are four new commissioners on this Commission.

I was sworn in on March 17. We had a briefing on March 24. We received the designation from President Biden's office for chair and vice chair on April 6. And there has been plenty of time to have a conversation about these issues and yet notice wasn't given until this week prior to our meeting today.

1	I am sorry to hear about the things that
2	have happened in the past that I had nothing to do
3	with. You know, I am here in good faith. I would
4	like to have the opportunity to work across the aisle
5	with all commissioners to enact the mission of this
6	Commission, which is to serve the American public, to
7	inform the President and Congress of the status of
8	civil rights in this country. And all we are asking
9	for is an opportunity to serve and to work together at
10	this point.
11	You know, I myself do not have a special

You know, I myself do not have a special assistant and neither do two of my colleagues on the Democratic side. We are at a blatant disadvantage when it comes to understanding the rules and what goes into this process.

So to me, considering that, it is inappropriate to consider this kind of amendment. I would like for us to wrap this portion up so that we can get to what we are really here about, which has been duly notified to the public, which is the vote on the President's designation of chair and vice chair and to also change our meeting for May.

So I would like to move us forward on this point. I want to reiterate to all of my colleagues that I am here to work in good faith across the aisle,

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

2.4

1	but I cannot do that unless we move forward with these
2	designations. So thank you very much.
3	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I would just point
4	out
5	MR. MORALES: Any further discussion?
6	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.
7	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Heriot, please.
8	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes. I would just
9	point out that as of Tuesday of last week,
10	Commissioner Garza was aware that we did have two
11	issues that we wished to discuss. I discussed them
12	last week with Commissioner Nourse. My understanding
13	is that she shared those with you.
14	And, again, in the past we have had some
15	time to negotiate before such a vote. I am not aware
16	of any case before where the staff director usurped
17	the power to make an agenda and move forward this
18	issue before the commissioners have had an opportunity
19	to negotiate on the vote. I think this is highly
20	improper, and I therefore support my own motion that
21	we amend the agenda.
22	COMMISSIONER GARZA: I would just like to
23	correct the record on that point. I did not have a
24	conversation with anyone from the Republican caucus
25	until Tuesday and was not given anything in writing as

to what was being requested until Wednesday. And there has been no time to check how this would impact the function of this Commission. So I take umbrage with falsifying the facts. That is not what happened.

As I said, we had over a month to have a conversation about this. I have been reaching out since my appointment to each of the individual commissioners to introduce myself, to say, you know, I am here to work with all of you. And I mean that. I understand that there have been issues in the past. But I am not privy to them. And I don't believe my colleagues on the Democratic side are as well.

And we need to have a clean slate and move forward if we're going to get anything done. So I wanted to make sure that that was correct. That it was on the record. That we have not had ample opportunity. And I do not want to be forced into a vote just because we haven't been given ample opportunity to discuss these things.

COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Speaking of not wanting to be forced into a vote, we don't want to be forced into a vote either. We would prefer not to have to vote down your nomination, but you seem to want that. I would correct the record. You were nominated to be chair not a month ago, but on April 6.

2.2

That was just before the Easter weekend.

Our caucus promptly met on what we were going to do in response to that. I emailed on Tuesday to Commissioner Nourse what our -- that we had two plans. You were forwarded that email on that day so you knew that that was the case.

I am sorry that you did not have an opportunity to talk in person with Commissioner Kirsanow until Tuesday, but it was last week that these issues came out, not this week.

Even so, even if it had been this week, the point is, we are the ones who are being rushed into voting upon your nomination and that I think is highly inappropriate. As I said before, last time with Commissioner Cantu when she was made chair, we conducted negotiations over the course of two months and almost three weeks. I think we actually moved very promptly in this case, but there was no way that we could negotiate this prior to knowing who was being nominated.

COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Very briefly, whomever I should ask for recognition.

MR. MORALES: Please.

COMMISSIONER ADAMS: On the issue of surprise, look, we and everyone on this Commission

2.2

1	knows this, as soon as we had an opportunity to talk
2	about this, this was the first thing out of my mouth
3	with every new nominee was this issue. And it went
4	back months.
5	And I don't think there were surprises. I
6	endeavored probably to the point of boorishness of
7	explaining to every new nominee that I could talk to
8	about this, this was the issue. This is a big issue.
9	And there is no surprise that I have a Washington
10	Times opinion piece about this from two months ago.
11	So I just want to make sure that from my
12	perspective, I bent over backwards to make sure
13	everybody knew this was a deal breaker before this
14	meeting.
15	MR. MORALES: Thank you. Any further
16	discussion? Hearing none
17	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: I'm still here.
18	MR. MORALES: Oh, go ahead.
19	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Very briefly, I
20	echo what Commissioners Heriot and Adams had to say,
21	and simply know this. That these two issues, the one
22	with respect to 30/30/10 frankly should be a no
23	brainer. It is to the benefit of all commissioners,
24	and it is not heavy lift to understand what it means.
25	We simply have 30 days in which to write the

1	statements related to whatever report the Commission.
2	It is 30 days for rebuttal and 10 days for
3	surrebuttal. That is not complicated.
4	In most cases, most attorneys could figure
5	that out within 5 to 10 minutes and agree or disagree.
6	With respect to the concept papers, again, a no
7	brainer. I like to give you as much advanced notice
8	as possible that this is something that had been
9	decided on by the Commission in the past. It is
LO	fairly simple. We like to examine the issue of crime
L1	victims. It is not a difficult task in terms of
L2	assessing what precisely this mission is.
L3	So we hope it would be nice to have a
L 4	year to think about these things, but in truth these
L5	are issues that can be resolved or thought about
L6	within, frankly, 10, 15 minutes.
L7	MR. MORALES: Thank you. Any further
8.	comment?
L9	COMMISSIONER JONES: Yes.
20	MR. MORALES: Mr. Jones?
21	COMMISSIONER JONES: Let me start by
22	saying what a pleasure it is to be here with all of
23	you today and how I'm looking forward to serving with
24	you and fulfilling the purpose of this Commission,
25	which as the chair designee has said is to inform

1 Congress, the President and the public about the 2 status of civil rights in this country. And I am very 3 hopeful that we can agree on a definition of civil rights that is consistent with what I've always 4 5 understood it to be and what I think history teaches us and certainly what our civil rights laws reflect. 6 7 I also would like to think that I have served in more contentious environments than even this 8 9 And so I am optimistic that we can get through one.

one. And so I am optimistic that we can get through this probably with continued deliberation. Maybe some of it won't even happen today. We'll see how that goes.

As we develop the record today, which is clear that some people are trying to do, Commissioner Heriot has said repeatedly now that the staff director has usurped the authority of the Commission in setting the agenda.

And I just wanted to know, Mauro, if there is some general counsel opinion or other text that you have relied on in setting the agenda so that is abundantly clear to people who are either ready the transcript or who are paying attention to this proceeding today?

MR. MORALES: Thank you, Mr. Jones. You are correct. And I will let general counsel opine,

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

2.4

1 2

2.4

but under our administrative instructions and our statute, the chair and the staff director create the agenda for the Commission for each business meeting.

And therefore since we don't have a chair, I consulted with a variety of commissioners as to what the agenda should be. And we received a letter, which I have sent to all commissioners, from the President, which has designated and requested that the Commission, and I'll read it, consistent with 42 U.S.C. 1975, the President seeks concurrence from the majority of the members of the U.S. Commission to designate Rochelle Mercedes Garza as chairperson and Victoria Frances Nourse as vice chair of the Commission. It would be appreciated if you could inform of the Commission's decision at your earliest convenience.

While this business had been scheduled over a year ago by commissioners, and this was the first opportunity, I was requested to withhold a business meeting by commissioners on March 6. So this was the earliest and quickest that we could create an agenda. And I was requested to also add to that agenda the movement of a Commission business meeting from May 19 to May 18.

So those were the two items. They were

presented to commissioners well over a week in
advance. I had received no objections at that time
until Monday afternoon, I received an email saying
that they wanted from Commissioner Adams,
Gilchrist, Heriot and Kirsanow, they wanted the
meeting cancelled because they were either not going
to come to the meeting or they were going to vote
against the President's request.

So I don't have the authority to unilaterally cancel the meeting. And so we are holding this meeting now. If you want to amend, as Commissioner Heriot has, the agenda then so be it. But the meeting should take place, and the vote should take place. And the President deserves a vote on yes or no of his designation. There is no reason not to hold the vote.

If you feel that you want to negotiate and have time to negotiate, so be it. You will have a new chair, and you can sit down with her and the rest of the new commissioners and work out an opportunity. But you shouldn't force them into a corner. You shouldn't coerce them to take your orders --

COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Point of order -- objection to the term coerce. Point of order.

MR. MORALES: Well, I withdraw coerce. I

2.2

would say force them to, you know, take these two 1 2 amendments or else you are going to vote no. 3 just not right. COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Point of order. 4 5 Staff director --MR. MORALES: I don't recognize the point 6 7 of order. 8 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: May I ask the 9 question of staff director? 10 MR. MORALES: Thank you. 11 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Staff director, I 12 have a question, please. You indicated, and I think you lay out a sound argument, that the statute and the 13 14 quiding regulations designate the chair and the staff director to set the agenda. That's essentially what 15 16 you said --That's not true. 17 MR. MORALES: 18 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: But that's what you 19 said. Was there a regulation that prevented you from 20 putting 30/30/10 or the crime discovery plan on the 21 agenda today, prevented? 2.2 MR. MORALES: Yes. There is an AI that 23 requires the -- there is a seven day notice in order 24 to post on the website and in the Federal Register. 25 And so when I received the request, I believe one of

1	the special assistants to add two items to the agenda,
2	I informed all commissioners at that time that it was
3	inappropriate to add those two items, but they could
4	be added if you amend the agenda.
5	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Okay. I don't think
6	you understand my question.
7	MR. MORALES: That's where we are now.
8	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: I don't think you
9	understood my question. Let me restate it. Prior to
LO	last week, could you have done it on your own volition
L1	is my question?
L2	MR. MORALES: If I had been requested,
L3	yes, we could have, but it wasn't.
L4	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: I would like to
L5	I have not spoken yet. And I am delighted to be here
L6	with such amazing people, Commissioner Magpantay and
L7	Mondaire Jones, Commissioner Jones and the future
L8	chair, Rochelle Garza.
L9	It is no secret that I worked for the
20	President in the White House when he was Vice
21	President as his chief lawyer, the year his son died.
22	And why did they ask me to do that? Well, I've known
23	him since I was a baby lawyer, even younger than our
24	esteemed commissioners here.

And I worked with him when he was on the

Senate. And he taught me everything I know about
bipartisanship. I know that we can work together.
I've done it before on the first duty of a state,
which is to keep people safe. But I want to remind
everyone that the statute and the regulations depend
upon statutes that provide protections, as
Commissioner Jones said, for civil rights.
So I need the time. I don't have an

office. I don't have a lawyer. These last two weeks

-- I'm a professor at Georgetown. You know, I haven't
had time to look at these documents in a way that
would be consistent with the statute and regulations.
And I know that the President has asked me to be
Rochelle's veep because I'm a stickler for the rule of
law. Thank you.

COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I need to correct the record on the issue of who promulgates the agenda. The rule actually says the chairperson, after consulting with the staff director, shall establish the agenda, not that the chairperson and the staff director establish the agenda. That's what the rule actually says.

Chairperson is defined as chairperson or acting chairperson. And that means, okay, who is the acting chairperson? And as of last month, we showed

2.2

that Pete, as the most senior person in the absence of any other decision by the Commission, is the person who assumes the chair. The Commission can then appoint someone else as acting chair. But the staff director is not authorized to establish the agenda.

But most importantly, nobody is authorized to say, look, we're going to shove this down your throat. We have people now telling us that they don't have time to consider these things. Well, but they need to be considered before we vote on who is going to be confirmed as chair or vice chair. Why? Because this is the only moment at which we have any leverage and that is important here.

We feel that we have been outrageously double-crossed on the issue of the Crime Victims Report. For some reason, the members of the Commission, who have now rotated off, thought that it was okay to make such a deal and then to back away from the deal by, you know, after we had already committed to allowing the Anti-Asian Report.

That's pretty bad mistreatment of the four of us, I believe. Therefore, it shouldn't be a surprise that we would want some commitment before we vote. And the reason that we suggested that this meeting be postponed is we didn't want to embarrass

ving to st like to e, the
e, the
the
ir. And
rent
st like to
omination
ole.
tution
tution
approve.
k we've
e question
ion to add
oll call
ly.
t t

1	you vote?
2	COMMISSIONER GARZA: No.
3	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Gilchrist, how
4	do you vote?
5	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Yes.
6	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Heriot, how do
7	you vote?
8	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I vote yes.
9	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Jones, how do
10	you vote?
11	COMMISSIONER JONES: No. Commissioner
12	Jones votes no for the record. I'm sorry. My mic is
13	off. I turned my mic off.
14	MR. MORALES: I'll get it right.
15	Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?
16	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.
17	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Magpantay, how
18	do you vote?
19	COMMISSIONER MAGPANTAY: Nay, no.
20	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Nourse, how do
21	you vote?
22	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: No.
23	MR. MORALES: It's a 4-4 tie. The motion
24	fails. We move to the first order of business as
25	noted in the agenda in the Federal Register. We will

1	turn to a discussion of the vote on the designation of
2	the designation of Rochelle Mercedes Garza
3	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Point of order. We
4	still have to vote to approve the agenda.
5	MR. MORALES: Good point. Thank you. Is
6	there a motion?
7	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: So moved.
8	MR. MORALES: Is there a second?
9	COMMISSIONER MAGPANTAY: I'll second it.
LO	COMMISSIONER JONES: Seconded.
L1	MR. MORALES: We have two seconds, but
L2	we'll go with the first one. Any discussion on the
L3	agenda, the two items, which are the vote on the
L4	President's designation of the chair and the vice
L5	chair and the motion to change the meeting date from
L6	May 19 to May 18.
L7	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Discussion.
L8	MR. MORALES: Please, Commissioner Adams.
L9	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: I hope we can change
20	the meeting date to accommodate Commissioner Jones if
21	by no other means by a notational vote. I will
22	certainly vote yes on that. I will certainly vote yes
23	on future Chairman Garza's chairmanship.
24	We have bent over backwards to try to
25	avoid conflict here. I cannot wait to vote for the

1	vice chair. But unfortunately, this is a good lesson
2	for everyone watching how this Commission,
3	unfortunately, can frequently devolve into something
4	that reminded me of when I was in high school.
5	So I will I want to emphasize how
6	enthusiastic I am to vote for these two designations
7	despite all the other votes that might happen. That's
8	all.
9	MR. MORALES: Anybody else? Vote on the
10	agenda. All those in favor, aye?
11	(Chorus of aye.)
12	MR. MORALES: All those opposed?
13	(Chorus of nay.)
14	MR. MORALES: Okay. Call the question.
15	Commissioner Adams, how do you vote?
16	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: No, no.
17	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Garza, how do
18	you vote?
19	COMMISSIONER GARZA: I'm sorry.
20	MR. MORALES: On approving the agenda.
21	COMMISSIONER GARZA: Yes.
22	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Gilchrist, how
23	do you vote?
24	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: No.
25	MR. MORALES: Gilchrist votes no.

1	Commissioner Heriot, how do you vote?
2	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No.
3	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Jones, how do
4	you vote?
5	COMMISSIONER JONES: Yes.
6	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Kirsanow, how
7	do you vote?
8	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: No.
9	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Magpantay, how
10	do you vote?
11	COMMISSIONER MAGPANTAY: Yes.
12	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Nourse, how do
13	you vote?
14	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: Yes.
15	MR. MORALES: No agenda is the agenda
16	fails. There is no agenda. There is nothing left to
17	discuss at this meeting.
18	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Move to adjourn.
19	MR. MORALES: Before we adjourn, I would
20	like to make a comment.
21	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: It is not debatable.
22	It is not a debatable motion.
23	MR. MORALES: Is that correct?
24	COMMISSIONER GARZA: I have a point of
25	order.

	MR. MORALES. Point of order.
2	COMMISSIONER GARZA: I am under the belief
3	that since this agenda was duly notified to the public
4	that this is duplicative that we vote it down. You
5	know, I would like an opinion from legal counsel on
6	whether or not this has been appropriately done.
7	MR. GANZ: Just for the record, I am David
8	Ganz. I am the general counsel here at the
9	Commission. I understand it is the past practice of
10	USCCR to vote for agendas. However, it is not
11	consistent with the regulation that provides that the
12	agenda is set by the chair and the staff director. It
13	does not do that. So it is simply a past practice
14	that has been done here, but it is not consistent with
15	our regulations.
16	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: I move to vitiate
17	the vote.
18	COMMISSIONER GARZA: Second.
19	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Nourse, I'm
20	sorry. I couldn't hear what you said.
21	(Simultaneous speaking.)
22	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: I withdraw.
23	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: There is a motion to
24	adjourn that was seconded. Now that we have a ruling
25	from the general counsel

1	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: A motion to adjourn
2	is in order now.
3	MR. MORALES: The motion to adjourn on the
4	Robert's Rules is not debatable.
5	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: So let's vote.
6	MR. MORALES: Nevertheless, it needs a
7	majority vote in order to adjourn.
8	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: So let's vote.
9	MR. MORALES: How do you vote to adjourn?
10	Hold on. Let me get my Commissioner Adams, how do
11	you vote
12	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Yes.
13	MR. MORALES: to adjourn?
14	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Yes.
15	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Garza, how do
16	you vote to adjourn?
17	COMMISSIONER GARZA: No.
18	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Gilchrist, how
19	do you vote to adjourn?
20	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Yes.
21	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Heriot, how do
22	you vote to adjourn?
23	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.
24	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Jones, how do
25	you vote to adjourn?

1	COMMISSIONER JONES: No.
2	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Kirsanow, how
3	do you vote to adjourn?
4	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.
5	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Magpantay, how
6	do you vote to adjourn?
7	COMMISSIONER MAGPANTAY: No.
8	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Nourse, how do
9	you vote to adjourn?
10	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: No.
11	II. BUSINESS MEETING
12	DISCUSSION AND VOTE ON PRESIDENTIAL DESIGNATION OF
13	COMMISSIONER ROCHELLE MERCEDES GARZA AS CHAIRPERSON
14	AND VICTORIA FRANCES NOURSE AS VICE CHAIR OF THE
15	U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS
16	MR. MORALES: The motion fails. We are
17	still in a meeting. So with that in mind, I would say
18	we should turn to a discussion and a vote on the
19	designation of Rochelle Mercedes Garza to serve as the
20	chair and Victoria Frances Nourse to serve as the vice
21	chair for the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights pursuant
22	to the request of President Joseph Biden.
23	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: So moved.
24	MR. MORALES: I will proceed to open the
25	floor for discussion. Any debate?

COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: So moved.

COMMISSIONER GARZA: I would like to make a few comments for the record.

MR. MORALES: Please

COMMISSIONER GARZA: So I want to just start off by saying that it is an honor of a lifetime to be President Biden's nominee for chair of the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights. It is also an honor to serve the American public alongside my fellow commissioners, who have incredible life journeys of their own that represent the American spirit of progress, resilience and determination.

As someone who has dedicated my life to advocating for justice and equality, I take the responsibility we have been tasked with to heart. And I want to reflect on my personal -- on what the personal significance of this nomination means for me and for my family.

My family is from deep south Texas, on the border with Mexico. On my father's side, my grandmother married as a teenager. She bore 13 children and worked the land picking cotton, okra and tomatoes. She would give birth at home with the help of my great grandmother, a midwife. She would rest for a few days and then continue working the land and

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

making food for the family.

She often told me especially during my teen years and even after I graduated from college to continue my education, to not get married, to keep working towards the life that I wanted. And I don't believe for a second that my grandmother regretted her life, as hard as it was. She just didn't have the choices or opportunities that she fought so hard to have for her children, grandchildren and every generation after her.

And as I sit here today, I am reminded of the responsibility that I carry for my 13-month-old daughter and for every generation that follows her.

My hope for this Commission is that together we can continue the legacy of bipartisan progress that has been made possible by the resilience of many generations of Americans before us.

I sought President Biden's nomination.

And I promise to work tirelessly alongside my

colleagues on both sides of the aisle to ensure that

the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights remains a powerful

force for change and progress in our country.

MR. MORALES: Thank you. Commissioner Nourse, do you have a comment?

COMMISSIONER NOURSE: Thank you so much.

2.4

And I am so delighted to be Commissioner Garza's veep, having worked for a veep. She inspires me every day. I have had a life, you know, that spans far more than hers. I am old enough so that when I was born in Florida, not only could my mother -- she would have to apply to sit on a jury, and yet her daughter became counsel to the Vice President of the United States.

A lot has changed. And I know, and I have worked in the past across the aisle to do things that sometimes my liberal colleagues don't like. But I am delighted to be here. And I know that with Commissioner Garza's tremendous story and with Commissioner Jones and Magpantay, that we will come to agreement on the nature of civil rights. We will forge forward.

And I know that the folks in the White
House are watching. There is a reason they asked me
to be here. The President has spent many years
thinking, oh, man -- you know how he talks -- I didn't
do enough during the '60s. He goes to Selma every
year. So I know we can get this done. And we just
have to follow regular order. And good fences make
great neighbors. Thank you.

MR. MORALES: Any further discussion? I call the question.

COMMISSIONER ADAMS: There was. We just can't turn our mics on.

MR. MORALES: Go ahead.

COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Mr. Chairman, I just want to first of all welcome our four new commissioners and the nominees for both vice chair and chair.

Let me just say for the record that I have had the pleasure of talking to all of you. And in no way have I sensed any nefarious attempt on your part to stifle the business of the American people to the Civil Rights Commission.

I want to echo my colleagues concerns about the issues we have brought to this discussion today regarding 30/30/10 and the Crime Victims Report. You know, both of these things were negotiated -- well, at least the Crime Victims Report was negotiated in good faith -- I had the pleasure of being on the negotiating team during that time -- all but to be very disappointed at the eleventh hour that we operated in good faith and then did not receive the same type of consideration for our proposal. And so I think my colleagues are fair in their assessment of what occurred and more specifically what we think should occur going forward.

I would also echo my colleagues regarding the nominees for chair and vice chair. I don't think anybody on our side wants to delay or deny that. But we also want to make sure that in good faith, and I know we are going to use that term a lot, in good faith, that we come together, and we find ways to make sure that we are working good faith. And the presumptive chair, I want to thank you for, you know, your willingness to acknowledge that.

Unfortunately today, I am somewhat disappointed that we did not have an opportunity to amend our agenda to include those two items going forward. So I wanted to make those comments, and I will defer to my colleague to my left.

MR. MORALES: Please proceed.

COMMISSIONER ADAMS: I want to echo what Commissioner Gilchrist said. The question right now on the table is, I believe, the nomination, is that correct, parliamentary procedure?

MR. MORALES: Yes.

COMMISSIONER ADAMS: We will have a chair in short order, but the issue that we are facing right now is one that is supported by enormous poll majorities to examine how minority communities around the country are being victimized by the increasing

2.4

crime. Now who is responsible, but are we collecting the right data? Is it disproportionately affecting minorities?

This is not some sort of bizarre quest to pin blame for any crime increase. So let's be clear about that. I know some of you haven't had time to read the materials. So this is not this bipolar or binary fight between law and order versus civil rights.

We carefully crafted a proposal. The staff did, too, by the way. What we are arguing about is staff work right now. Not Christian Adams's work. It is staff work, whether that becomes a discovery plan.

So we have attempted to bend over backwards today with procedural motion after procedural motion to avoid a vote because nobody wants to vote no. We all want to vote yes. And we are hung up over a discovery plan and a right of the commissioners to voice an opinion. Just so the record reflects that for all of those watching.

COMMISSIONER NOURSE: Well, for all of those watching, crime has gone down. This motion was a year ago. We had a pandemic. And we have an entire Justice Department that investigates crime. My intern

2.4

is now the Deputy Attorney General. She has a Crime Commission. I need the time, Commissioner Adams, to look at that discovery plan given the change of events.

COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Well, that would infer that you are going to be against voting on the discovery plan in the future.

COMMISSIONER GARZA: No. If I may interject, I just want to be very, very clear, and this has been communicated to Commissioner Kirsanow. I communicated this with Commissioner Gilchrist. I have made it very clear, we are not here to undo anything that the Commission has already decided upon.

They decided upon a concept paper and what was missing was a discovery plan. To my knowledge, okay, as someone who has only been on this Commission for about a month, I do not know all the things I need to know. You don't know what you don't know. And I think that it is unfair to hold this vote hostage just so you can get what you want.

And I want to make that very clear. We are happy to work with you. I am not here to obstruct the work of this Commission. But by not voting for a chair and vice chair at this point in time, it is obstruction.

1	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Why couldn't we move
2	on a discovery plan without a chair?
3	MR. MORALES: Your mic, please.
4	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: How would it be
5	obstruction? We could still work on a discovery plan
6	without a chair. There is nothing that this
7	Commission is limited in doing by not having a chair
8	unless I'm missing something.
9	MR. MORALES: But you can't vote on a
10	discovery plan without it
11	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: With it being on the
12	agenda.
13	MR. MORALES: And without the
14	commissioners. But it wasn't on the agenda.
15	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Because you chose not
16	to put it on.
17	MR. MORALES: No. Because it wasn't
18	submitted.
19	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Yes. You could have
20	put it on of your own volition.
21	MR. MORALES: But it wasn't submitted.
22	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Well, put it on the
23	next one then.
24	MR. MORALES: It wasn't submitted.
25	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Put it on the next

1	one then. Motion to table the motion that is on the
2	table right now. Motion to table the nominations.
3	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Second.
4	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: It's debatable.
5	MR. MORALES: You've got to have a
6	majority. Do you want to take a vote?
7	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: No. It's debatable.
8	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: It's debatable, yes.
9	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: We made a motion.
10	MR. MORALES: Then debate it.
11	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Recognized?
12	MR. MORALES: Recognized.
13	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Okay. We're doing
14	everything procedurally possible to get a
15	confirmation. Now, somebody said, I'm not here to
16	oppose what the Commission has already done. Others
17	have voiced, well, the discovery plan is out of date.
18	All these are ominous warnings for our ability to do
19	the discovery plan.
20	So I would move to table the nominations
21	until we have time to sort this out in a collegial
22	bipartisan way, and there is no doubt that we will
23	sort this out and that the chair will be voted on and
24	the vice chair will be voted on.
25	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Recognized?

MR. MORALES: Please proceed,

Commissioner.

COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Just getting back to what I consider to be the core issue here and that is that I don't see how any of us can vote on a chair or a vice chair. We have a responsibility under our statute to vote on whether or not to accept the President's nomination.

We have independent duties as individual commissioners to satisfy ourselves that the nominations are for people who will do a good job.

That's why it is in statute.

I anticipate being able to do this, but my doubts are greater now than they were at the beginning of this meeting. I can't vote in good faith for any nomination for chair or vice chair unless I know that they are willing to support our basic rule that each commissioner has an opportunity to file a statement, given 30 days to write that statement, given an additional 30 days after they have had an opportunity to see other commissioners' statements to respond to that. That's how we flesh out arguments on civil rights issues.

And it is extremely important that we have commissioners who understand that these are our basic

1 ground rules, and this is how the Commission proceeds. 2 You know, if you need more time, you know, we have 3 always been happy to give more time. But that means that we have to put the vote off. I can't vote in 4 5 favor of someone who isn't in favor of the 30/30/10 6 rule. It is as easy as that. 7 And I will note that the Commission 8 usually moves much, much faster than the United States 9 Senate in their role as confirming the President's 10 various nominations. Our Commission works a little 11 bit differently. We are not Senate confirmed. The 12 chair and vice chair have to be confirmed by the Commission as a whole. 13 14 We have a duty to take that role seriously 15 and not to have the issue rammed down our throats 16 before we have had an opportunity to negotiate. You 17 are conceding -- the nominees have conceded that they 18 don't feel they are ready to negotiate on that issue. 19 Well, then we are not ready to vote on the 20 nominations. It is as easy as that. 21 COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: May I be 22 recognized? 23 MR. MORALES: I will recognize 2.4 Commissioner Nourse and then Commissioner Gilchrist. 25 COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Okay.

1	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: I defer to
2	Commissioner Gilchrist.
3	MR. MORALES: Please, Commissioner
4	Gilchrist.
5	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Okay. I just
6	wanted to ask staff director, I mean, the general
7	counsel, if there is anything within our rules that
8	prevent us from being able to take these nominations
9	up through a notational vote.
10	MR. GANZ: Please repeat the question so
11	I got it.
12	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Is there anything
13	in our rules that prevent us from being able to take
14	these nominations up through a notational vote?
15	MR. GANZ: It is my view that the AIs
16	aren't limited to any subject matter. So, you know,
17	a vote for chair or vice chair could be done via a
18	notational vote as per our policies and administrative
19	instructions.
20	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Thank you.
21	MR. GANZ: I would add that the AI does
22	require, I believe, it's not in front of me, but it
23	requires that no one objects to a vote being held on
24	a paper ballot or electronically. So there are some
25	requirements for it, I believe. But

1	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: So it would
2	MR. GANZ: nothing in the AI limits it.
3	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: So it would
4	require the full Commission in favor or against those
5	votes, is that right?
6	MR. GANZ: It doesn't require a unanimous
7	vote as far as the subject matter. It is just that if
8	someone objects to the vote being held
9	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: I one person
10	MR. GANZ: in a notational vote.
11	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: if one
12	commissioner objects, right.
13	MR. GANZ: In that format, yes
14	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Right, right.
15	Okay. Thank you.
16	MR. GANZ: versus person.
17	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Thank you.
18	MR. GANZ: Sure.
19	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Magpantay, you
20	had a question?
21	COMMISSIONER MAGPANTAY: No.
22	MR. MORALES: I'm sorry. Any further
23	discussion?
24	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: I would just like to
25	make one note for the record with the analogy to a

2.4

concept of a confirmation. Forgive me for being very law professorial about this, but I did work for the Senate Judiciary Committee, and it is generally not the practice.

And I am just stating a fact. It is not the practice of senators who are confirming judges to require substantive matters that they will be deciding. The confirmation is on the qualifications of the nominees and to advise and consent our President, President Biden, on whether you think we are qualified.

COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I have also worked for the Senate Judiciary Committee. And I think that the Commissioner is correct that it would not be appropriate to do that with judicial officers. But it is frequently done with executive officers.

There are understandings between members of the Senate and executive officers about how they intend to go about their work. And that is a lot more analogous to what we are doing here. And, again, there is a reason this is in the statute.

The statute does not say that commissioners must vote yes. They need not vote yes. There wouldn't be any point in putting the confirmation in the statute if Congress did not fully

2.4

intend that we indeed work hard to make sure that the Commission will be run properly.

And it is part of what makes a nominee qualified to be chair or vice chair that they are in fact willing to make sure that this bipartisan

Commission will have in its reports the issues fully fleshed out and that each commissioner get the opportunity to state their case about how the issues should be resolved. This is fundamental to who we are.

COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: May I speak?
MR. MORALES: Yes, please.

COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: I would like to make an amended motion to Commissioner Adams's motion to defer to also defer to a notational vote to allow the Commission as a whole to work on some of the concerns regarding the two issues that some of the commissioners have indicated they need more time to consider and to move that we vote in a notational manner regarding the chair and vice chair going forward.

COMMISSIONER ADAMS: I view that as a friendly amendment to my motion to table. And I would therefore rewrite my motion to table to include the idea of resolving this through a notational vote

through what I am sure will be a unanimous vote if it 1 were a notational vote. 2 3 COMMISSIONER NOURSE: Could I have a 4 parliamentary inquiry? Given the fact that, and this 5 really is a question of procedure. So a notational vote allows any individual to bar -- you know, you can 6 7 say it requires unanimity. 8 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: It does. 9 COMMISSIONER NOURSE: So the question for me is whether you are actually re-writing the statute, 10 11 which is to say it requires the concurrence of the 12 majority, the word majority is there. If you change 13 it to a notational vote, have you changed it to a 14 single negative vote? 15 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: And being the author of the amendment, both the original motion supporter, 16 17 I don't have an answer for you. I don't know. 18 COMMISSIONER NOURSE: All right. 19 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No, under the rules, 20 any commissioner can object to a notational vote so 21 that it can't be taken as a notational vote. But that 22 would at most delay it until the next meeting. I 23 don't think anybody wants to object to the notational 2.4 vote. I'm sure nobody wants to object to that. 25 Whether or not -- are you saying you do want to object

to a notational --1 COMMISSIONER MAGPANTAY: I'm putting my 2 3 hand up, when you're done. COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay, okay. 4 5 We all want to get this done, but we also want 6 to make sure that our two requirements for a yes vote 7 are -- you know, we get that. We believe that these 8 are more than fair and are frankly quite shocked that 9 this has become the least bit controversial. But, 10 okay. COMMISSIONER NOURSE: I still don't have 11 12 an answer to the question about whether you changed 13 the statute. The statute uses the word majority. 14 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No, no. No, it 15 would not change the statute and that what you object to is not whether or not to confirm but whether or not 16 to hold a notational vote. So it would mean the vote 17 18 hasn't yet been taken. That's all. 19 COMMISSIONER NOURSE: I really don't quite 20 understand this. It seems like a lot of procedural -you know, there is a possibility, given what the 21 22 general counsel said, that any single commissioner can 23 then say we don't do a notational vote. So that 2.4 changes the voting rules that should apply --25 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: It just delays.

1	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: under the
2	statute.
3	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: It just delays,
4	that's all. And I'm quite willing to say I am not
5	going to object to a notational vote.
6	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: Well, all of the
7	commissioners would have to agree on the record that
8	you wouldn't object to a notational vote, otherwise
9	there is the possibility that we would have one person
10	who would in effect negate the President's, your
11	President's nominations.
12	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No, it would just
13	delay it, that's all because it's not a vote on the
14	actual matter. I am sure you can get everybody, at
15	least everybody on this side of the aisle, to say
16	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: Well, I would like
17	to hear it on the record.
18	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I will not be
19	objecting to a notational vote.
20	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Kirsanow doesn't
21	object to taking a notational vote.
22	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Gilchrist
23	certainly does not object.
24	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: It's my motion.
25	COMMISSIONER MAPANTAY: Chair, Glenn

2.4

Magpantay. So, I'm sorry, I think to echo
Commissioner Adams's point, I actually am very
interested in talking about the two proposals. And I
have questions. Actually, I need just more time to
study it. I don't know everything. I do have some
ideas. So I am very much looking forward to voting on
these two issues.

So I want to echo that and say that my only concern with the notational vote, especially on the two issues, the 30/40 rebuttal and the discovery plan is I don't know if we have an opportunity to discussion. And I just have some questions. And I don't know if I have to ask questions on that research plan in a notational vote.

It just seems that if we move forward on a notational plan, there wouldn't be even any conversation on the substance of that plan. And I would actually ask for some conversation, you know, and just try to understand it better. And the 20/40 dissenting -- which I very much support a dissenting opinion.

I was on the New York Advisory Committee, and we very much encouraged dissenting opinions on both sides. So I really do think that it is an appropriate procedural matter.

2.4

I don't understand the form of it, and I don't understand why it is a rebuttal as opposed to a dissent. And I'm not opposed to it conceptually. I just don't understand the history and why. So it's a good faith, I don't understand, and I don't think that is getting answered in a notational vote. But if you can do it, I'll listen.

COMMISSIONER HERIOT: That is why I wanted to amend the agenda to have a discussion of that, you know. And I feel like we are trying to get this done and get these nominations, you know, through. Then, you know, what we need to do is not vote on it today because if we reject the nominations, which is what I think we are going to have to do until these issues are resolved, that means the White House has to go through and do all of this again. And I don't see the point in throwing the ball back to the White House.

COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Which is why I made a motion to table, right, which is still the live motion. I'm going to withdraw the part that I accepted as a friendly amendment as a notational vote just to simplify things and make this a motion to table so we can all avoid doing what everybody has pointed out will happen.

COMMISSIONER GARZA: I just have a point

1	of order because you are making a motion to table the
2	first agenda item on our agenda. And I don't believe
3	that is appropriate under the rules.
4	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Of course, it is.
5	COMMISSIONER GARZA: But I could be wrong.
6	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: It is totally
7	COMMISSIONER GARZA: I'm going to ask for
8	
9	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: totally
10	acceptable.
11	COMMISSIONER GARZA: I'm going to ask
12	for legal counsel.
13	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: It's not a close
14	call. You can table anything by a majority vote.
15	MR. MORALES: Mr. Ganz?
16	MR. GANZ: Robert's Rules state that a
17	motion may be taken from the table after one item of
18	business has been conducted.
19	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: This is not a motion
20	to take from the table. This is a motion to lay on
21	the table. Those are different motions.
22	COMMISSIONER GARZA: This is a motion to
23	table the first agenda item.
24	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: But what the general
25	counsel just cited was the motion to take off the

1	table, not to take off the agenda. Those are two
2	different things. This was a motion to table Item 2A,
3	to table, not to pick up from the table.
4	MR. GANZ: Yes. I only have to go by the
5	Robert's Rules I have in front of me, you know. So
6	I'm not sure I can provide much more clarity than
7	motions may be taken from the table after one item of
8	business has been conducted.
9	COMMISSIONER GARZA: Can we take a recess?
10	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: My understanding is
11	
12	MR. MORALES: Let's take a 10 minute
13	recess.
14	(Whereupon, the above-entitled matter went
15	off the record at 1:18 p.m. and resumed at 1:31 p.m.)
16	MR. MORALES: We are under a discussion on
17	the motion to table. Any further discussion? I call
18	the question on the motion to table. All in favor say
19	aye.
20	(Chorus of aye.)
21	MR. MORALES: All those opposed?
22	(Chorus of nay.)
23	MR. MORALES: We'll do a division.
24	Commissioner Adams, how do you vote?
25	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Yes, table.

1	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Garza, how do
2	you vote?
3	COMMISSIONER GARZA: No.
4	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Gilchrist, how
5	do you vote?
6	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Yes, table.
7	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Heriot, how do
8	you vote?
9	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I vote yes.
10	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Jones, how do
11	you vote?
12	COMMISSIONER JONES: I vote no.
13	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Kirsanow, how
14	do you vote?
15	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.
16	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Magpantay, how
17	do you vote?
18	COMMISSIONER MAGPANTAY: No.
19	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Nourse, how do
20	you vote?
21	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: No.
22	MR. MORALES: The motion fails. Now we
23	are back on the motion, discussion, and now call a
24	question on the vote to designate Rochelle Mercedes
25	Garza to serve as the chair, Victoria Frances Nourse
	l l

1	to serve as the vice chair of the U.S. Commission of
2	Civil Rights pursuant to the request of President
3	Joseph Biden.
4	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Divide the motion.
5	MR. MORALES: I call for the vote.
6	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Motion to divide.
7	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Second.
8	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Well, you are very
9	familiar with this motion, Mr. Staff Director, because
10	we did it a lot the last two years. This is a dual
11	motion. I'm suggesting we divide the motion as we did
12	multiple times in recent Commission meetings to
13	segregate the vote.
14	MR. MORALES: So you are proposing that we
15	have two separate votes?
16	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: You know full well
17	what I am proposing because we did it over and over
18	again in previous Commission meetings, and you backed
19	it up.
20	MR. MORALES: I am asking you to explain
21	it for the record.
22	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: But you know, don't
23	you?
24	MR. MORALES: I don't know.
25	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Okay.

1 COMMISSIONER NOURSE: Parliamentary inquiry. Commissioner Adams, you have to state what 2 3 the motion is. COMMISSIONER ADAMS: All right. So I am 4 5 moving that the two issues be divided. It is not debatable. In fact, we learned from Mr. Mauro and 6 7 perhaps even the general counsel. 8 MR. MORALES: My name is not Mr. Mauro. 9 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Staff Director Mauro. 10 MR. MORALES: It is Mauro Morales. I am 11 Staff Director Morales, please. You may not like me, 12 but please respect me. Please respect the office. 13 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Apologies. We 14 learned last year and the year before that when a 15 motion is bundled with multiple items, for which there are here, that it is perfectly appropriate, in fact, 16 17 we learned that it is not even debatable. That it 18 must be divided upon request. Remember all that? Remember all those or should we --19 20 MR. MORALES: I don't know what you are 21 talking about. 22 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Okay. There were 23 multiple motions, in fact, in the October meeting, I 2.4 believe, one occurred, where we had items related to 25 the concept paper and the crime report appearing

1	together, and Commissioner Kladney was very good at
2	the motion to divide. He usually made it. And the
3	issue was divided. I mean, surely you remember this.
4	MR. MORALES: Commissioners agreed to
5	that, I didn't.
6	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: But surely you
7	remember it happening. And it wasn't one instance.
8	MR. MORALES: It can't be because it is
9	one letter on the agenda.
10	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Okay. But there are
11	two so it was one item on the agenda previously
12	that got divided. You debundled it repeatedly.
13	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: What are you asking,
14	Commissioner Adams?
15	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Separate motions.
16	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: Votes on the chair
17	and me, is that what you are asking? There are
18	several things on this agenda
19	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Well, the question
20	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: I mean, that you
21	have wanted to be on the agenda.
22	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: before us right
23	now, the pending question that has been called is the
24	motion on the vote. Perhaps the general counsel could
25	refresh everyone's recollection.

2 counsel to opine. 3 MR. GANZ: According to our Rober 4 Rules, a motion to divide is not debatable an	nd
	nd
Rules, a motion to divide is not debatable as	
	مام المسام
5 requires a majority vote.	
6 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: For the reco	ora, this
7 is the first time the motion to divide requir	red a
8 majority vote on this Commission. The last	two years,
9 it was just done.	
MR. MORALES: You asked for a leg	gal
opinion of the general counsel.	
COMMISSIONER ADAMS: All right.	I'm sure
the practice will change eventually, but I'll	l withdraw
the motion to divide.	
MR. MORALES: Okay then. Then we	e call the
question to vote again on the designation of	Rochelle
Mercedes Garza to serve as chair, Victoria Fr	rances
Nourse to serve as vice chair of the U.S. Cor	mmission
on Civil Rights pursuant to the request of Pr	resident
Joseph Biden. I will proceed to the vote.	
Commissioner Adams, how do you vote?	
COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Under the au	uthority
of 42 U.S.C. 1975(d), I vote no.	
MR. MORALES: It's a no vote.	
25 Commissioner Garza	

1	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: Could you clarify
2	parliamentary inquiry why under 1975(d) you are
3	voting no?
4	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: No, I can't. At
5	least, I choose not to.
6	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: I would like 1975(d)
7	to be read into the record. Counsel, could you do
8	that?
9	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Or perhaps we could
10	get the general counsel's opinion on what 1975(d) says
11	because it was offered last week in writing to the
12	commissioners.
13	MR. MORALES: One moment.
14	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: I need a better
15	citation because there are several d's.
16	MR. GANZ: The president shall, with the
17	concurrence of a majority of the Commission's members,
18	fill a vacancy by designating a chairperson or vice
19	chairperson among the Commission's members.
20	The President may, with the concurrence of
21	a majority of the Commission members, designate a
22	chairperson or vice chairperson as may be from the
23	Commission's members. That is various parts.
24	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: That doesn't apply
25	here. I seek further clarification from Commissioner

1	Adams on the precise textual language.				
2	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Well, we had an				
3	opinion of general counsel last week that I am relying				
4	on. And we can argue about this until the cows come				
5	home, but my vote is no pursuant to the powers I have				
6	under 42 U.S.C. 1975(d).				
7	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: D is what you are				
8	saying? Well, I think you should really well.				
9	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: I have it front of				
10	me, it's D, delta.				
11	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: Could you read that				
12	into the record?				
13	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: No. We are taking a				
14	vote. That would be out of order.				
15	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: The public is not				
16	well served by this.				
17	MR. MORALES: So your vote is no. Okay.				
18	Moving along, Commissioner Garza, how do you vote?				
19	COMMISSIONER GARZA: Yes.				
20	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Gilchrist, how				
21	do you vote?				
22	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Before I cast my				
23	vote, I want to just say to my colleagues how				
24	disappointed I am that we have not been able to, in my				
25	opinion, handle some various simplified business here				

1	today, particularly with regard to some of the issues				
2	that my colleagues on the other side have brought up				
3	regarding 30/30/10 and the Crime Victims Report.				
4	COMMISSIONER GARZA: Point of order. I am				
5	sorry to interrupt you. I think we are just in the				
6	middle of a vote, and we should just vote.				
7	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Okay. Well				
8	COMMISSIONER GARZA: I think we had enough				
9	time.				
10	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: I vote no.				
11	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Heriot, how do				
12	you vote?				
13	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I cannot in good				
14	faith vote for anyone who cannot commit to support our				
15	policy of allowing each commissioner to file a dissent				
16	with each				
17	MR. MORALES: Just a vote. We are just				
18	asking for a yes or no vote.				
19	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Nope, nope, nope.				
20	MR. MORALES: Nope, nope is not a				
21	vote. That means no?				
22	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Mr. Staff				
23	Director, under what authority are you directing				
24	Commissioner Heriot to vote?				
25	MR. MORALES: Because we are asking for				

1	the vote, yes or no.				
2	(Simultaneous speaking.)				
3	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: staff director,				
4	not the Commission director.				
5	MR. MORALES: Then go ahead and speak all				
6	you want.				
7	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: In any event, I vote				
8	no. I am shocked that this has come to this, but I do				
9	vote no.				
10	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Jones, how do				
11	you vote?				
12	COMMISSIONER JONES: I vote yea.				
13	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Kirsanow, how				
14	do you vote?				
15	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Well, what do we				
16	no.				
17	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Magpantay, how				
18	do you vote?				
19	COMMISSIONER MAGPANTAY: I vote yea.				
20	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Nourse, how do				
21	you vote?				
22	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: Yes.				
23	MR. MORALES: The motion fails, 4-4.				
24	Should we attempt to pass the change of the date for				
25	commissioners?				

COMMISSIONER GARZA: I will move that --1 2 DISCUSSION AND VOTE ON CHANGING FRIDAY, MAY 19 3 USCCR BUSINESS MEETING TO THURSDAY MAY 18 MR. MORALES: Yeah, okay. Yeah, so we 4 5 would like to have a discussion and vote on changing the Friday, May 19, USCCR business meeting to 6 7 Thursday, May 18, 2023. 8 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Second. 9 MR. MORALES: Any discussion? 10 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Yes. 11 MR. MORALES: Please proceed. COMMISSIONER ADAMS: This is an example of 12 how the Republican members of this caucus have voted 13 14 to be accommodating, to be respectful, to move the 15 ball to vote for reports over and over again. 16 Over and over again. So I -- I have no more 17 discussion on that. COMMISSIONER JONES: Staff director. 18 19 MR. MORALES: Yes, Commissioner Jones? COMMISSIONER JONES: Yes. I would like to 20 21 express my deep gratitude for the indulgences of my 22 Republican colleagues on this Commission and to 23 reiterate my excitement about working through the 2.4 issues that have been identified today that have not 25 yet been resolved. Thank you.

1	MR. MORALES: Any further discussion?				
2	Hearing none, I will proceed to the vote. Do we want				
3	to do this do you want to divide or do you want to				
4	just have it a voice vote?				
5	COMMISSIONER GARZA: Let's divide.				
6	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Adams, how do				
7	you vote?				
8	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Microphone, I can't				
9	I vote yes.				
10	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Garza, how do				
11	you vote?				
12	COMMISSIONER GARZA: Yes.				
13	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Gilchrist, how				
14	do you vote?				
15	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Yes.				
16	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Heriot, how do				
17	you vote?				
18	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I vote yes.				
19	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Jones, how do				
20	you vote?				
21	COMMISSIONER JONES: Yes.				
22	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Kirsanow, how				
23	do you vote?				
24	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.				
25	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Magpantay, how				
I.					

1	do you vote?
2	COMMISSIONER MAGPANTAY: Yea.
3	MR. MORALES: Commissioner Nourse, how do
4	you vote?
5	COMMISSIONER NOURSE: Yea.
6	MR. MORALES: Thank you. The motion
7	passes. The business meeting has been changed to
8	Thursday, May 18. We'll have to circle back and find
9	out what time works best for all commissioners. We
10	can do it at noon again or earlier if that works out.
11	We are open to whatever works best for commissioners
12	so with that
13	COMMISSIONER GARZA: Motion to adjourn.
14	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Second.
15	MR. MORALES: All in favor of adjourning
16	say aye.
17	(Chorus of aye.)
18	MR. MORALES: All those opposed?
19	The meeting is adjourned.
20	(Whereupon, the above-entitled matter went
21	off the record at 1:42 p.m.)
22	
23	
24	
25	

II A I	ac
ability 43:18	
able 8:6,15 12:12 44:13	ac
46:8,13 63:24	ac
above-entitled 56:14 68:20	ac
absence 4:11 26:1	A
absolutely 12:7	ac
abundantly 20:21	af ag
accept 44:7 acceptable 55:10	u
accepted 9:13 54:21	
accommodate 29:20	
accommodating 66:14	
accompanying 10:20	
10:21,22 accomplished 13:3	
acknowledge 39:9	
acted 12:13,14 13:12	
acting 25:24,25 26:4	20
action 6:20 actual 52:14	ag ag
Adams 1:9 4:16,17 6:9	
6:14,18 7:6 8:4 10:10	
17:21,24 18:20 22:4	ag
22:23 23:4,8,11,18	ag
24:5,8 27:23,24 29:3 29:7,17,18,19 30:15	ag
30:16 31:18,21 32:23	Ī
33:10,12,14 38:1	ah
39:16,21 41:2,5 42:1	ΑI
42:4,11,15,19,22,25	ΑI
43:4,7,11,13 49:22 50:8,15 52:24 54:18	ais
55:4,6,9,13,19,24	
56:10,24,25 58:4,6,8	Al
58:16,22,25 59:2,4,9	al al
59:13,22 60:6,10,14	al
60:15,19,22 61:6,12 61:21,22 62:4,9 63:1	al
63:2,9,13 66:8,10,12	ar
67:6,8 68:14	an
Adams's 40:12 49:14	
53:2 add 21:22 24:1,3 27:20	an
46:21	ar
added 24:4	
addition 9:6	an Ar
additional 8:25 9:8	ΑI
44:20 adheres 13:9	Αı
adjourn 3:8 31:18,19	an
32:24 33:1,3,7,9,13	ar
33:16,19,22,25 34:3,6	ar Al
34:9 68:13 adjourned 68:19	ar
adjourning 68:15	
administering 4:12	ar

I

```
dministrative 4:13
21:1 46:18
dopted 9:23
dvance 22:2
dvanced 19:7
dvise 48:9
dvisory 53:22
dvocating 35:14
ternoon 4:3 22:3
genda 3:2 5:11,15,18
5:25 7:17 8:1 11:23
11:24 12:1,7 15:17,21
20:17,20 21:3,6,22,23
22:12 23:15,21 24:1,4
25:17,20,21 26:5
27:21 28:25 29:4,13
30:10,20 31:15,15,16
32:3,12 39:12 42:12
42:14 54:9 55:2,2,23
56:1 60:9,11,18,21
gendas 32:10
90 6:23 9:24 11:18
12:20 13:6 16:25
18:10 21:18 40:24
gree 7:11 9:10 11:2
19:5 20:3 52:7
greed 10:12 60:4
greement 7:3,7,13
37:14
nead 18:18 38:3 65:5
I 10:1,3,5 11:14 23:22
46:21 47:2
Is 13:3,9 46:15
sle 14:4,25 36:20 37:9
52:15
LEXIS 2:7
llow 49:15
lowing 26:20 64:15
lows 9:5 50:6
ongside 35:9 36:19
mazing 24:16
mend 5:18,20,24 7:17
15:21 22:11 24:4
39:12 54:9
mended 49:14
mendment 5:20 14:17
49:23 50:16 54:21
mendments 23:2
merican 14:6 35:9.11
38:11
mericans 36:17
nple 16:16,18
nalogous 48:20
nalogy 47:25
NGELIA 2:5
nswer 12:15,22,22
50:17 51:12
nswered 54:6
```

```
anti-Asian 10:13,21
  26:20
anticipate 44:13
anybody 30:9 39:3
  50:23
Apologies 59:13
appearing 59:25
applies 10:1
apply 37:6 51:24 62:24
appoint 26:4
appointment 16:7
appreciated 21:14
appropriate 48:15
  53:25 55:3 59:16
appropriately 32:6
approval 3:2 5:11 8:1
approve 5:14,19 7:3,7
  7:17 11:4 12:12 27:16
approved 6:24 7:2 8:21
  10:18 27:12
approving 30:20
April 1:5 4:8 13:22
  16:25
argue 63:4
arguing 40:11
argument 23:13 27:17
arguments 9:6 44:22
ASCD 2:3,4,4,6
asked 25:13 37:17
  61:10
asking 11:15 14:8
  58:20 60:13,17 64:18
  64:25
assessing 19:12
assessment 38:23
assistant 14:12
assistants 2:7 24:1
assumes 26:3
attempt 38:10 65:24
attempted 40:15
attention 20:22
Attorney 41:1
attorneys 19:4
author 50:15
authority 12:6 20:16
  22:9 27:7 61:22 64:23
authorized 26:5,6
Avenue 1:7
avoid 29:25 40:17
  54:23
aware 15:10,15
aye 30:10,11 56:19,20
  68:16,17
          В
baby 24:23
```

```
44:3 54:17 57:23 68:8
backed 58:18
backwards 18:12 29:24
 40:16
bad 26:21
ball 54:17 66:15
ballot 46:24
bar 50:6
based 5:7 27:5
basic 44:17,25
beginning 44:14
belief 32:2
believe 9:24 16:11
 23:25 26:22 36:6
 39:18 46:22,25 51:7
 55:2 59:24
bend 40:15
benefit 18:23
bent 18:12 29:24
best 68:9,11
better 53:19 62:14
Biden 34:22 48:10 58:3
 61:20
Biden's 8:2 13:21 35:7
 36:18
bia 18:8
binary 40:8
bipartisan 36:15 43:22
 49:5
bipartisanship 25:2
bipolar 40:7
birth 35:23
bit 13:16 45:11 51:9
bizarre 40:4
blame 40:5
blatant 14:13
boorishness 18:6
border 35:20
bore 35:21
born 37:4
BOWLER 2:1
brainer 18:23 19:7
breaker 18:13
briefing 10:13 13:20
briefly 17:21 18:19
BRIER 2:2
broad 7:13
brought 9:9 10:10
 38:14 64:2
bundled 59:15
business 1:3 3:3,7 4:4
 5:14 6:1,25 7:18 21:3
 21:17,20,23 28:24
 34:11 38:11 55:18
 56:8 63:25 66:3,6
 68:7
           C
```

back 13:16 18:4 26:18

call 4:15 10:5,5 27:19
27:21 30:14 37:25
55:14 56:17 57:23
58:5 61:15
called 10:6 60:23
cancel 22:10
cancelled 22:6
candidates 27:1,2
Cantu 12:3 17:15
care 10:6
care 10.6 carefully 40:10
CARISSA 2:8
carry 36:12
case 9:21 12:2 15:16
17:6,18 49:8
cases 19:4
cast 63:22
caucus 15:24 17:2
66:13
certain 8:8
certainly 20:6 29:22,22
52:23
chair 3:5 4:11,12 8:2,2
12:2 13:21,21 14:21
14:21 16:25 17:15
19:25 21:2,4,13 22:19
23:14 24:18 26:3,4,11
26:11 27:7,7 29:14,15
30:1 32:12 34:14,20
34:21 35:7 38:6,7
39:2,2,8,21 41:24,24
42:2,6,7 43:23,24
44:5,6,16,16 45:12,12
46:17,17 49:4,4,20,20
52:25 57:25 58:1
60:16 61:17,18
Chairman 29:23 38:4
chairmanship 29:23
chairperson 3:4 21:12
25:18,20,23,23,24,25
34:13 62:18,19,22,22
chairs 8:12,12 9:13
change 14:22 29:15,19
36:22 41:3 50:12
36:22 41:3 50:12 51:15 61:13 65:24
36:22 41:3 50:12 51:15 61:13 65:24 changed 37:8 50:13
36:22 41:3 50:12 51:15 61:13 65:24 changed 37:8 50:13 51:12 68:7
36:22 41:3 50:12 51:15 61:13 65:24 changed 37:8 50:13 51:12 68:7 changes 51:24
36:22 41:3 50:12 51:15 61:13 65:24 changed 37:8 50:13 51:12 68:7 changes 51:24 changing 3:6 66:2,5
36:22 41:3 50:12 51:15 61:13 65:24 changed 37:8 50:13 51:12 68:7 changes 51:24 changing 3:6 66:2,5 check 16:2
36:22 41:3 50:12 51:15 61:13 65:24 changed 37:8 50:13 51:12 68:7 changes 51:24 changing 3:6 66:2,5 check 16:2 chief 2:3 24:21
36:22 41:3 50:12 51:15 61:13 65:24 changed 37:8 50:13 51:12 68:7 changes 51:24 changing 3:6 66:2,5 check 16:2 chief 2:3 24:21 children 35:22 36:9
36:22 41:3 50:12 51:15 61:13 65:24 changed 37:8 50:13 51:12 68:7 changes 51:24 changing 3:6 66:2,5 check 16:2 chief 2:3 24:21
36:22 41:3 50:12 51:15 61:13 65:24 changed 37:8 50:13 51:12 68:7 changes 51:24 changing 3:6 66:2,5 check 16:2 chief 2:3 24:21 children 35:22 36:9 choices 36:8 choose 62:5
36:22 41:3 50:12 51:15 61:13 65:24 changed 37:8 50:13 51:12 68:7 changes 51:24 changing 3:6 66:2,5 check 16:2 chief 2:3 24:21 children 35:22 36:9 choices 36:8 choose 62:5
36:22 41:3 50:12 51:15 61:13 65:24 changed 37:8 50:13 51:12 68:7 changes 51:24 changing 3:6 66:2,5 check 16:2 chief 2:3 24:21 children 35:22 36:9 choices 36:8
36:22 41:3 50:12 51:15 61:13 65:24 changed 37:8 50:13 51:12 68:7 changes 51:24 changing 3:6 66:2,5 check 16:2 chief 2:3 24:21 children 35:22 36:9 choices 36:8 choose 62:5 Chorus 30:11,13 56:20 56:22 68:17
36:22 41:3 50:12 51:15 61:13 65:24 changed 37:8 50:13 51:12 68:7 changes 51:24 changing 3:6 66:2,5 check 16:2 chief 2:3 24:21 children 35:22 36:9 choices 36:8 choose 62:5 Chorus 30:11,13 56:20

chumps 10:12 **circle** 68:8 citation 62:15 cited 55:25 civil 1:1 3:5 4:5 13:2 14:8 20:2,3,6 25:7 34:15,21 35:8 36:21 37:14 38:12 40:8 44:22 58:2 61:19 clarification 62:25 clarify 62:1 clarity 56:6 clean 16:13 clear 10:7 11:11 13:17 20:14,21 40:5 41:9,12 41:21 close 55:13 codification 11:15 codified 10:5 **codify** 11:19 **CODY** 2:1 coerce 22:22,24,25 colleague 39:14 **colleagues** 8:3 14:12 14:24 16:12 36:20 37:10 38:13.23 39:1 63:23 64:2 66:22 collecting 40:1 college 36:3 collegial 43:21 come 5:13 9:17 22:7 37:13 39:6 63:4 65:8 comes 4:6 14:14 coming 11:7 comment 19:18 31:20 36:24 comments 35:3 39:13 **Commission** 1:1,7 3:5 4:5 6:20,23 7:11 8:20 8:22 9:3,16 10:15,16 10:25 11:8,11 13:13 13:18 14:6 16:3 17:25 19:1,9,24 20:16 21:3 21:9,11,14,23 26:2,3 26:17 27:6,12 30:2 32:9 34:15,21 35:8 36:14,21 38:12 41:2 41:13,16,23 42:7 43:16 45:1,7,10,13 47:4 49:2,6,16 58:1 58:12,18 61:8,18 62:21 65:4 66:22 Commission's 7:18 21:15 62:17,19,23 commissioner 1:9,10 1:10,11,11,12,12,13 2:7 3:4 4:16,17,18,19

5:1,2,3,4,5,6,17,21,24 6:7,9,11,14,16,18 7:5 7:6,16,22,23,24 8:4,4 8:5,22 10:10 11:14,17 12:17.20.24 13:10.14 13:15 15:3,6,7,8,10 15:12,22 16:20 17:4,8 17:15,21,24 18:17,19 19:19,21 20:14 22:4 22:12,23 23:4,8,11,18 24:5,8,14,16,17 25:7 25:16 27:4,10,13,15 27:20,23,24,25 28:2,3 28:5,6,8,9,11,11,15 28:16,17,19,20,22 29:3,7,9,10,17,18,19 29:20 30:15,16,17,19 30:21,22,24 31:1,2,3 31:5,6,8,9,11,12,14 31:18,21,24 32:2,16 32:18,19,22,23 33:1,5 33:8,10,12,14,15,17 33:18,20,21,23,24 34:1,2,4,5,7,8,10,13 34:23 35:1,2,5 36:23 36:25 37:1,12,13 38:1 38:4 39:16,17,21 40:22 41:2,5,8,10,11 42:1,4,11,15,19,22,25 43:3,4,7,8,9,11,13,25 44:2.3.18 45:21.24.24 45:25 46:1,2,3,5,12 46:20 47:1,3,9,11,12 47:14,17,19,21,24 48:12,14 49:7,11,13 49:14,22 50:3,8,9,15 50:18,19,20 51:2,4,11 51:14,19,22,25 52:1,3 52:6,12,16,18,20,22 52:24,25 53:2 54:8,18 54:25 55:4,5,6,7,9,11 55:13,19,22,24 56:9 56:10,24,25 57:1,3,4 57:6,7,9,10,12,13,15 57:16,18,19,21 58:4,6 58:7,8,16,22,25 59:1 59:2,4,9,13,22 60:1,6 60:10,13,14,15,16,19 60:20,22 61:6,12,21 61:22,25 62:1,4,6,9 62:14,24,25 63:2,7,9 63:11,13,15,18,19,20 63:22 64:4,7,8,10,11 64:13,15,19,22,24 65:3,7,10,12,13,15,17 65:19,20,22 66:1,8,10 66:12,18,19,20 67:5,6 67:8,10,12,13,15,16

67:18,19,21,22,24,25 68:2.3.5.13.14 commissioners 4:14 5:8 6:22 9:1,10 10:2 13:17 14:5 15:18 16:8 18:20,23 21:5,7,18,20 22:1,20 24:2,24 35:10 38:6 40:20 42:14 44:10,25 48:23 49:18 52:7 60:4 62:12 65:25 68:9.11 commissioners' 44:21 **commit** 64:14 commitment 26:23 committed 26:20 **Committee** 48:3,13 53:22 communicated 41:10 41:11 communities 39:24 complicated 19:3 conceded 45:17 conceding 45:17 concept 19:6 41:14 48:1 59:25 conceptually 54:3 concern 53:9 concerns 38:13 49:17 concurrence 21:10 50:11 62:17,20 condition 10:13 conducted 17:16 55:18 56:8 confirm 4:14 51:16 confirmation 43:15 48:1.8.25 confirmed 12:4 26:11 45:11,12 **confirming** 45:9 48:6 conflict 29:25 Congress 6:25 14:7 20:1 48:25 consent 48:9 consider 14:17 26:9 44:4 49:19 consideration 38:22 considered 26:10 considering 14:16 consistent 20:4 21:9 25:12 32:11,14 **Constitution** 27:8,13,15 consulted 21:5 consulting 25:19 contentious 20:8 continue 35:25 36:4,15 continued 20:10 controversial 7:19 8:9 9:20 51:9

4:20,21,22,23,24,25

controversy 9:24 convened 1:7 convenience 21:16 conversation 13:23 15:24 16:6 53:17,18 core 44:4 corner 22:21 correct 4:7 15:23 16:15 16:24 20:25 25:16 31:23 39:19 48:14 correctly 27:22 **cotton** 35:22 counsel 1:14 20:19,25 32:5,8,25 37:7 46:7 51:22 55:12,25 59:7 60:24 61:2,11 62:7 63:3 counsel's 11:16 12:16 12:25 62:10 country 14:8 20:2 36:22 39:25 course 10:9 17:16 55:4 **court** 5:8.10 cows 63:4 COZART 2:2 crafted 40:10 create 21:2,21 **crime** 6:4 10:10,14,23 19:10 23:20 26:15 38:15,17 40:1,5,23,25 41:1 59:25 64:3 current 4:11 27:8 currently 6:2

D

D 3:1 63:7,10 **d's** 62:15 **D.C** 1:8 data 40:2 date 29:15,20 43:17 65:24 daughter 36:13 37:6 **David** 1:14 32:7 day 9:11 17:5 23:23 37:2 days 8:22 9:1,8 11:7 13:6 18:25 19:2,2 35:25 44:19,20 deal 18:13 26:18,19 **debatable** 31:21,22 33:4 43:4,7,8 59:6,17 61:4 debate 27:19 34:25 43:10 debundled 60:12 decade 11:18 12:20 decided 19:9 41:13,14 deciding 48:8

decision 21:15 26:2 dedicated 35:13 deep 35:19 66:21 defer 39:14 46:1 49:15 49:15 defined 25:23 definition 20:3 delay 39:3 50:22 52:13 delays 51:25 52:3 deliberation 20:10 delighted 24:15 37:1,11 delta 63:10 **Democratic** 14:13 16:12 deny 39:3 Department 40:25 depend 25:5 Deputy 41:1 deserves 22:14 designate 21:12 23:14 57:24 62:21 designated 21:8 designating 62:18 designation 3:3 13:20 14:21 22:15 29:1,2,14 34:12,19 61:16 designations 15:2 30:6 designee 19:25 despite 30:7 determination 35:12 develop 20:13 devolve 30:3 died 24:21 difference 11:20 different 55:21 56:2 differently 45:11 difficult 7:15 19:11 directing 64:23 director 1:8,14 4:9 5:12 11:25 12:6 15:16 20:15 21:2 23:5,9,11 23:15 25:19,21 26:5

32:12 46:6 58:9 59:9

59:11 64:23 65:3,4

disadvantage 14:13

disappointed 38:20

discovery 6:5 7:4,8

42:5,10 43:17,19

discuss 15:11 16:19

discussion 3:3,6 6:2,3

discussed 15:11

10:20,22 23:20 40:13

40:19 41:3,7,15 42:2

66:18

53:10

31:17

disagree 19:5

39:11 63:24

doubts 44:14 drew 7:4 dual 58:10 duly 14:20 32:3 **DUNSTON 2:3** duplicative 32:4 **duties** 44:9 duty 25:3 45:14 Ε **E** 3:1 earlier 68:10 earliest 21:15,21 **easier** 11:3 Easter 17:1 Eastern 4:7 easy 8:10 45:6,20 echo 18:20 38:13 39:1 39:16 53:1.8 education 36:4 **effect** 52:10 either 6:11 16:22 20:21 22:6 electronically 46:24 eleventh 38:20 email 17:5 22:3 emailed 17:3 embarrass 26:25 27:2 embarrassment 12:10 emphasize 30:5 **enact** 14:5 encouraged 53:23 endeavored 18:6 enormous 39:23 ensure 11:10 36:20 enthusiastic 30:6 **entire** 40:24

6:8 7:21 15:5 18:16 29:1,12,17 34:12,18 34:25 37:24 38:14 47:23 53:12 54:9 56:16,17 57:23 66:2,5 66:9,17 67:1 disproportionately 40:2 dissent 54:3 64:15 dissenting 53:20,20,23 **divide** 58:4,6,11 60:2 61:4,7,14 67:3,5 divided 59:5,18 60:3,12 division 56:23 documents 6:5 10:20 10:21,22 25:11 doing 42:7 43:13 48:20 54:23 double-crossed 7:8 10:24 26:15 doubt 43:22

environments 20:8 equality 35:14 especially 36:2 53:9 **ESSENCE** 2:4 essentially 23:15 establish 25:19,21 26:5 esteemed 24:24 evaluation 13:2.8 event 65:7 events 41:4 eventually 61:13 everybody 4:4 12:10 18:13 52:14,15 54:23 everyone's 60:25 examine 19:10 39:24 example 66:12 exception 8:14 excitement 66:23 **executive** 48:16,18 exercise 13:14 **expect** 10:15 explain 58:20 explaining 18:7 **express** 66:21 extremely 9:3,12 44:24

facing 39:22 fact 48:5 49:5 50:4 59:6 59:16.23 **facts** 16:4 fails 28:24 31:16 34:16 57:22 65:23 failure 11:18 fair 11:9 12:13 38:23 51:8 **fairly** 6:19 11:11 19:10 faith 14:3,25 38:18,21 39:4,6,7 44:15 54:5 64:14 **fall** 7:8 falsifying 16:4 familiar 58:9 family 35:18,19 36:1 far 9:4 37:3 47:7 faster 45:8 father's 35:20 **favor** 5:16 8:6 9:15,18 10:19 11:21 30:10 45:5,5 47:4 56:18 68:15 Federal 23:24 28:25 feel 8:7 10:12 22:17 26:14 45:18 54:10 **fellow** 35:9 felt 10:24

fences 37:22

fight 40:8

	0.123.		12
figure 19:4	46:15,21 47:2,6,10,13	grandchildren 36:9	hung 40:18
file 44:18 64:15	47:16,18 55:15,16	grandmother 35:21,24	hurried 9:20
fill 62:18	56:4 61:3 62:16	36:6	HYUNG 2:3
find 39:6 68:8	Garza 1:10 3:4 4:18,19	gratitude 66:21	
finished 12:22	13:14,16 15:10,22	great 35:24 37:23	I
first 5:14,25 11:1 18:2	21:12 24:18 27:25	greater 44:14	idea 49:25
21:19 25:3 28:24	28:2 29:2 30:17,19,21	ground 8:8,16 45:1	ideas 53:6
29:12 38:5 55:2,23	31:24 32:2,18 33:15	guarantee 9:21	identified 66:24
61:7	33:17 34:13,19 35:2,5	guess 6:12	II 34:11
flesh 9:6 44:22	41:8 54:25 55:5,7,11	guiding 23:14	impact 16:2
fleshed 49:7	55:22 56:9 57:1,3,25		important 7:13 8:7
floor 6:17 34:25	61:17,25 63:18,19	Н	26:13 44:24
Florida 37:5	64:4,8 66:1 67:5,10	hand 51:3	importantly 26:6
focus 11:8	67:12 68:13	handle 63:25	improper 15:20
folks 37:16	Garza's 29:23 37:1,12	happen 20:11 30:7	inappropriate 14:17
follow 37:22	general 1:14 11:16	54:24	17:14 24:3
follows 13:9 36:13	12:16,25 20:19,25	happened 14:2 16:4	include 6:2 39:12 49:24
food 36:1	32:8,25 41:1 46:6	happening 60:7	including 6:4
force 22:21 23:1 36:22	51:22 55:24 59:7	happily 10:19 12:12	increase 40:5
forced 16:17,21,22	60:24 61:1,11 62:10	happy 10:25 41:22 45:3	increasing 39:25
forge 37:15	63:3	hard 6:13 36:7,8 49:1	incredible 35:10
Forgive 48:1	generally 48:3	hear 14:1 32:20 52:17	independent 44:9
form 9:25 54:1	generated 9:5	Hearing 18:16 67:2	indicated 23:12 49:18
format 47:13	generation 36:10,13	hearings 7:2	individual 16:7 44:9
forward 14:23 15:1,17	generations 36:17	heart 35:15	50:6
16:14 19:23 37:15	Georgetown 25:10	heavy 18:24	indulgences 66:21
38:25 39:13 49:21	getting 44:3 54:6	held 46:23 47:8	infer 41:6
53:6,15	Gilchrist 1:10 4:20,21	help 35:23	inform 14:7 19:25 21:15
forwarded 17:5	6:7 8:4 22:5 28:3,5	Heriot 1:11 4:22,23	informed 24:2
fought 36:8	30:22,24,25 33:18,20	5:17,21,24 7:22,23,24	inquiry 50:4 59:2 62:2
four 10:11 13:17 26:21	34:23 35:1 38:4 39:17	11:14,17 12:17,20,24	inspires 37:2
38:5	41:11 45:21,24,25	13:10 15:3,6,7,8	instance 60:7
FRAGOSA 2:7	46:2,4,5,12,20 47:1,3	16:20 18:20 20:15	instructions 21:1 46:19
Frances 3:4 21:13	47:9,11,14,17 49:11	22:5,12 25:16 27:10	intend 48:19 49:1
34:14,20 57:25 61:17	49:13 52:22,22 57:4,6	27:15 28:6,8 31:1,2	interested 53:3
frankly 10:11 18:22	63:20,22 64:7,10	33:1,5,8,21,23 43:3,8	interject 41:9
19:16 51:8	67:13,15	43:25 44:3 48:12	intern 40:25
Fred 10:6 frequently 30:3 48:16	give 19:7 35:23 45:3 given 10:1 13:24 15:25	50:19 51:4,14,25 52:3 52:12,18 54:8 57:7,9	interrupt 64:5
Friday 1:5 3:6 4:8 66:2	16:18 41:3 44:19,19	58:7 64:11,13,19,24	introduce 16:8
66:6	50:4 51:21	65:7 67:16,18	investigates 40:25 invoked 9:7
friendly 49:23 54:21	Glenn 1:12 52:25	Heriot's 7:5,16 27:20	IRENA 2:9
front 46:22 56:5 63:9	go 6:14 9:17 18:18	high 30:4	issue 7:12,13 10:9
fulfilling 19:24	29:12 38:3 48:19	highly 15:19 17:14	11:23 15:18 17:24
full 47:4 58:16	54:15 56:4 65:5	history 20:5 54:4	18:3,8,8 19:10 25:17
fully 48:25 49:6	goes 14:14 20:12 37:20	hold 22:16 33:10 41:19	26:15 39:22 44:4
function 16:3	going 8:10 10:17 11:12	51:17	45:15,18 60:3
functions 4:13	13:14 16:14 17:3 22:6	holding 22:11	issues 13:23 15:11
fundamental 49:9	22:7 23:2 26:7,10	home 35:23 63:5	16:10 17:10 18:21
further 15:5 18:15	38:25 39:5,12 41:6	honor 35:6,8	19:15 38:14 44:23
19:17 37:24 47:22	49:20 52:5 54:14,20	hope 11:6 19:13 29:19	49:6,8,17 53:7,10
56:17 62:25 67:1	55:7,11	36:14	54:14 59:5 64:1 66:24
future 24:17 29:23 41:7	good 4:3 14:3,25 29:5	hopeful 20:3	item 55:2,17,23 56:2,7
	30:1 37:22 38:18,21	hopefully 6:19	60:11
G	39:4,5,7 44:11,15	hostage 41:19	items 21:25 24:1,3
G 3:1	54:5 60:1 64:13	hour 38:20	27:21 29:13 39:12
GAIL 1:11	gotten 9:21	House 24:20 37:17	59:15,24
Ganz 1:14 32:7,8 46:10	graduated 36:3	54:15,17	
	1	1	I

J **J** 1:9 iob 44:11 **JOHN** 2:5.8 Jones 1:11 4:24,25 19:19,20,21 20:24 24:17.17 25:7 28:9.11 28:12 29:10,20 31:3,5 33:24 34:1 37:13 57:10,12 65:10,12 66:18,19,20 67:19,21 **Joseph** 34:22 58:3 61:20 journeys 35:10 **judges** 48:6 judicial 48:15 **Judiciary** 48:3,13

K

justice 35:14 40:25

JULIAN 2:4

jury 37:6

K 2:8 keep 25:4 36:4 **KIM** 2:3 kind 14:17 Kirsanow 1:12 5:1,2 8:5 17:9 18:17,19 22:5 28:15,16 31:6,8 34:2 34:4 41:10 43:9 52:20 52:20 57:13,15 64:22 65:3,13,15 67:22,24 Kladney 60:1 knew 17:6 18:13 know 7:25 9:16.17.19 10:11,16 11:3 12:9 14:3,11 16:8 18:21 20:18 23:1 25:1,2,10 25:13 26:19 27:3 32:5 37:3,8,11,16,19,21 38:16 39:5,8 40:6 41:17.18.18.18 44:16 45:2,2 46:16 50:6,17 51:7,21 53:5,11,13,18 54:10,11,12 56:5 58:16,22,24 59:20 **knowing** 17:19 knowledge 41:15 known 24:22

L

knows 18:1

land 35:22,25 language 63:1 law 25:15 27:11 40:8 48:2 laws 20:6 lawyer 24:21,23 25:9 lay 23:13 55:20 learned 59:6,14,17 **left** 31:16 39:14 **legacy** 36:15 legal 32:5 55:12 61:10 lesson 30:1 **let's** 5:19 33:5,8 40:5 56:12 67:5 letter 21:6 60:9 leverage 26:12 liberal 37:10 life 35:10,13 36:5,7 37:3 lifetime 35:6 lift 7:15 18:24 limited 42:7 46:16 **limits** 47:2 list 27:22 listen 54:7 little 13:16 45:10 live 54:19 long 10:7 look 17:25 25:11 26:7 41:3 looking 19:23 53:6 lot 37:8 39:5 48:19

<u>M</u> Magpantay 1:12 5:3,4

24:16 28:17.19 29:9

51:20 58:10

31:9,11 34:5,7 37:13 47:19,21 51:2 53:1 57:16,18 65:17,19 67:25 68:2 majorities 9:16 39:24 majority 9:17 21:11 33:7 43:6 50:12,12 51:13 55:14 61:5,8 62:17,21 making 13:8 36:1 55:1 man 37:19 manner 49:20 **MAPANTAY** 52:25 March 13:19.20 21:20 **MARIK-XAVIER** 2:2 married 35:21 36:4 MASHBURN 2:8 material 9:9 materials 40:7 matter 46:16 47:7 52:14 53:25 56:14 68:20 matters 48:7 Mauro 1:8,14 4:9 20:18 59:6,8,9,10 mean 7:24 10:6 16:9 27:17 46:6 51:17 60:3 60:20 means 12:9 18:24

meeting 1:3 3:3,7,8 4:4 4:6,10 5:13 6:1 11:3 13:24 14:22 18:14 21:3,20,23 22:6,7,10 22:11,13 26:25 29:15 29:20 31:17 34:11,17 44:15 50:22 59:23 66:3,6 68:7,19 meetings 6:23,23 58:12 58:18 members 11:8 21:11 26:16 48:17 62:17,19 62:21,23 66:13 Mercedes 3:4 21:12 29:2 34:13,19 57:24 61:17 met 17:2 **Mexico** 35:20 mic 28:12,13 42:3 MICHELE 2:6 microphone 6:10 67:8 mics 11:13 38:2 middle 64:6 midwife 35:24 mind 34:17 mine 6:11 8:3 minimum 13:3 minorities 40:3 minority 39:24 minute 56:12 minutes 19:5,16 missing 41:15 42:8 **mission** 14:5 19:12 mistreatment 26:21 moment 26:12 62:13 **Mondaire** 1:11 24:17 Monday 22:3 month 16:5,25 25:25 41:17 months 12:3 17:16 18:4 18:10 Morales 1:8,14 4:3,9,18 4:20,22,24 5:1,3,5,7 5:12,16,19,23 6:6,8 6:13,17 7:20,23 11:13 12:15,19,21,25 13:12 15:5,7 17:23 18:15,18 19:17,20 20:24 22:25 23:6,10,17,22 24:7,12 27:18,25 28:3,6,9,14 28:17,20,23 29:5,8,11 29:18 30:9,12,14,17 30:20,22,25 31:3,6,9 31:12,15,19,23 32:1 32:19 33:3,6,9,13,15 33:18,21,24 34:2,5,8

25:24 29:21 35:17

45:3 54:15 64:21

34:16.24 35:4 36:23 37:24 38:3 39:15,20 42:3,9,13,17,21,24 43:5,10,12 44:1 45:23 46:3 47:19,22 49:12 55:15 56:12,16,21,23 57:1,4,7,10,13,16,19 57:22 58:5,14,20,24 59:8,10,10,11,20 60:4 60:8 61:1,10,15,24 62:13 63:17,20 64:11 64:17,20,25 65:5,10 65:13,17,20,23 66:4,9 66:11,19 67:1,6,10,13 67:16,19,22,25 68:3,6 68:15,18 mother 37:5 motion 5:23 6:19 7:5,16 15:20 27:20 28:23 29:6,15 31:22 32:23 33:1,3 34:16 40:16,17 40:23 43:1,1,2,9 49:14,14,23,24 50:16 52:24 54:19,20,22 55:1,17,19,20,22,25 56:2,17,18 57:22,23 58:4,6,9,11,11 59:3 59:15 60:2,24 61:4,7 61:14 65:23 68:6,13 motions 55:21 56:7 59:23 60:15 **mouth** 18:2 move 5:17,24 6:2 14:23 15:1,17 16:13 28:24 31:18 32:16 42:1 43:20 49:19 53:15 66:1.14 moved 11:1 17:17 29:7 34:23 35:1 movement 21:23 **moves** 45:8 moving 59:5 63:18 MULDER 2:8 multiple 58:12 59:15,23

N

N 1:12 3:1 name 4:16 27:7 59:8 nature 27:6 37:14 nay 28:19 30:13 56:22 necessary 12:4 need 7:10 10:3 11:20 12:14 16:13 25:8,16 26:10 41:2,17 45:2 48:23 49:18 53:4 54:12 62:14 needed 8:17 needs 33:6

nefarious 38:10 negate 52:10 negative 50:14 **negotiate** 15:15,19 17:19 22:17,18 45:16 45:18 negotiated 38:16,17 negotiating 38:19 negotiations 8:11 12:5 17:16 neighbors 37:23 neither 14:12 **NELSON-SAUNDERS** 2:4 never 13:12 Nevertheless 33:6 new 9:9 13:17 18:3,7 22:18,20 38:5 53:22 nice 10:4 19:13 nominated 16:25 17:20 **nomination** 12:4 16:23 17:13 27:11 35:17 36:18 39:18 44:8,16 **nominations** 8:2,6 11:5 11:21 12:11 43:2.20 44:11 45:10.20 46:8 46:14 52:11 54:11,13 nominee 18:3.7 35:7 49:3 nominees 38:6 39:2 45:17 48:9 **noon** 68:10 **nope** 64:19,19,19,20,20 64:20 Norma 12:2 notational 11:7 29:21 46:9,14,18 47:10 49:15,19,25 50:2,5,13 50:20,21,23 51:1,17 51:23 52:5,8,19,21 53:9,14,16 54:6,21 note 7:4 27:5 45:7 47:25 noted 28:25 notice 13:23 19:7 23:23 noticed 7:25 notified 14:20 32:3 **notion** 11:9 Nourse 1:13 3:4 5:5.6 6:11,16 15:12 17:4 21:13 24:14 27:4,13 28:20,22 31:12,14 32:16,19,22 34:8,10 34:14,20 36:24,25 40:22 45:24 46:1 47:24 50:3,9,18 51:11 51:19 52:1,6,16 57:19 57:21,25 59:1 60:13

60:16,20 61:18 62:1,6 62:14,24 63:7,11,15 65:20,22 68:3,5 November 13:11 NW 1:7

0 object 50:20,23,24,25 51:15 52:5,8,21,23 objecting 52:19 objection 22:24 objections 22:2 objects 46:23 47:8,12 obstruct 41:22 obstruction 41:25 42:5 occasions 9:7 occur 38:25 occurred 38:24 59:24 **OCRE** 11:16 **October** 59:23 offered 62:11 office 11:16,18 12:16 13:1,1,5,21 25:9 59:12 officers 48:15,16,18 **oh** 6:16 18:18 37:19 okay 5:19 24:5 25:24 26:18 30:14 41:16 43:13 45:25 46:5 47:15 51:4,4,10 58:25 59:22 60:10 61:15 63:17 64:7 66:4 okra 35:22 **old** 37:4 ominous 43:18 once 9:8 11:8.11 ones 17:12 open 6:8 34:24 68:11 operated 38:21 opine 20:25 61:2 opinion 18:10 20:19 32:5 40:20 53:21 61:11 62:10 63:3,25 opinions 53:23 opportunities 36:8 opportunity 14:4,9 15:18 16:17,19 17:8 18:1 21:19 22:20 39:11 44:18,20 45:16 49:8 53:11 oppose 43:16 **opposed** 30:12 54:2,3 56:21 68:18 optimistic 20:9 order 4:6 5:13,14 22:23 22:24 23:4,7,23 28:24

29:3 31:25 32:1 33:2

33:7 37:22 39:22 40:8

55:1 63:14 64:4 orders 22:22 original 50:16 ought 9:10 outrageously 26:14

P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S **p.m** 1:7 4:2 56:15,15 68:21 PAMELA 2:3 pandemic 40:24 paper 6:24 41:14 46:24 59:25 papers 19:6 **pared** 8:17 parliamentary 39:19 50:4 59:1 62:2 part 6:25 8:23 9:4 38:10 49:3 54:20 participating 4:10 particularly 64:1 parts 62:23 pass 65:24 **passes** 68:7 paying 20:22 pending 60:23 Pennsylvania 1:7 people 7:12 20:14,21 24:16 25:4 26:8 38:11 44:11 perfectly 59:16 period 9:10 **PERRY** 2:4 person 17:8 26:1,2 47:9 47:16 52:9 personal 6:9 13:15 35:16,17 perspective 18:12 **Pete** 26:1 **PETER** 1:12 pick 56:3 picking 35:22 piece 18:10 **pin** 40:5 place 22:13,14 plain 7:9 plan 7:4,8 10:20,22 23:20 40:14,19 41:3,7 41:15 42:2,5,10 43:17 43:19 53:11,14,16,17 **plans** 17:5 please 4:15 5:23 11:13 12:19,21 15:7 17:23

23:12 29:18 35:4

39:15 42:3 44:1 46:3

46:10 49:12 59:11,12

59:12 66:11 pleasure 19:22 38:9,18 **plenty** 13:22 **point** 6:9 13:15 14:10 14:24 15:3,9,23 17:12 18:6 22:23,24 23:4,6 27:11 29:3,5 31:24 32:1 41:24 48:24 53:2 54:17,25 64:4 pointed 54:24 policies 46:18 policy 6:3 8:19,21 9:15 9:18,23,25 13:11,13 64:15 poll 39:23 portion 14:18 possibility 51:21 52:9 possible 19:8 36:16 43:14 post 23:24 postponed 26:25 power 15:17 27:16 powerful 36:21 **powers** 63:5 practice 32:9,13 48:4,6 61:13 precise 63:1 precisely 19:12 **prefer** 16:22 present 1:9 2:1,7 4:14 4:15,17,19,21,25 5:8 5:9.10.13 presented 22:1 president 8:1 13:21 14:7 20:1 21:7.10 22:14 24:20,21 25:13 27:6,9 34:22 35:7 36:18 37:7,18 48:10 48:10 58:2 61:19 62:16.20 **President's** 14:21 22:8 29:14 44:8 45:9 52:10 52:11 Presidential 3:3 34:12 presiding 1:8 presumptive 39:8 **pretty** 26:21 prevent 46:8,13 prevented 23:19,21 previous 8:11,12 9:13 58:18 previously 60:11 prior 13:24 17:19 24:9 **privilege** 6:10 13:15 **privy** 16:11 **probably** 18:6 20:10 problem 9:23

procedural 40:16,17

represent 35:11

Republican 15:24

51:20 53:25 procedurally 43:14 **procedure** 39:19 50:5 **proceed** 34:24 39:15 44:1 61:20 66:11 67:2 proceeding 20:23 proceeds 45:1 **process** 14:15 professor 25:10 professorial 48:2 progress 35:12 36:15 36:22 **promise** 36:19 **promptly** 17:2,18 promulgate 12:1,6 promulgated 11:24 promulgates 25:17 properly 11:24 49:2 proposal 7:6,6 38:22 40:10 **proposals** 12:13 53:3 proposed 5:25 6:5 11:14 **proposing** 58:14,17 protections 25:6 provide 25:6 56:6 provides 32:11 **public** 14:6,20 20:1 32:3 35:9 63:15 purpose 19:24 pursuant 4:12 34:21 58:2 61:19 63:5 **push** 6:13 put 5:25 11:1 13:7 42:16,20,22,25 45:4 putting 23:20 48:24 51:2

Q

qualifications 48:8 qualified 48:11 49:4 quest 40:4 question 23:9,12 24:6,9 24:11 27:19 30:14 37:25 39:17 46:10 47:20 50:5,9 51:12 56:18 57:24 60:19,23 61:16 questions 53:4,12,13 quickest 21:21 quite 8:13 51:8,19 52:4 quorum 5:8

R

rammed 45:15 rare 9:7 RATCLIFFE 2:5 re-writing 50:10

reaching 16:6 read 21:9 40:7 62:7 63:11 readily 9:13 ready 20:21 45:18,19 really 8:18,19 11:9 14:19 50:5 51:19 53:24 63:8 reason 6:19 22:15 26:16,24 37:17 48:21 rebuttal 9:9 19:2 53:10 54:2 receive 38:21 received 13:20 21:6 22:2,3 23:25 recess 56:9,13 recognition 17:22 recognize 23:6 45:23 recognized 43:11,12,25 45:22 recollection 60:25 record 9:14 15:23 16:16 16:24 20:13 25:17 27:5 28:12 32:7 35:3 38:8 40:20 47:25 52:7 52:17 56:15 58:21 61:6 62:7 63:12 68:21 reflect 6:20 20:6 35:16 reflects 7:5 40:21 refresh 60:25 regard 64:1 regarding 6:21 38:15 39:1 49:17,20 64:3 Register 23:24 28:25 regretted 36:6 regular 6:25 37:22 regulation 23:19 32:11 regulations 23:14 25:5 25:12 32:15 reiterate 14:24 66:23 **reiect** 54:13 related 7:12 19:1 59:24 **relied** 20:20 relying 63:3 remains 36:21 remember 59:18,19 60:3,7 remind 25:4 reminded 30:4 36:11 repeat 46:10 repeatedly 20:15 60:12 report 6:4 7:1 8:21,23 9:4 10:11,23 19:1

26:16,20 38:15,17

reports 8:24 9:3 10:18

59:25 64:3

reporter 5:9,10

49:6 66:15

66:13,22 request 22:8 23:25 34:22 58:2 59:18 61:19 requested 16:1 21:8,19 21:22 24:12 requests 11:9 require 46:22 47:4,6 48:7 required 6:24 8:14 61:7 requirements 46:25 51:6 requires 23:23 46:23 50:7,11 61:5 research 53:13 reserve 6:21 resilience 35:12 36:16 resolve 8:15 resolved 19:15 49:9 54:15 66:25 resolving 49:25 respect 18:22 19:6 59:12.12 respectful 66:14 respond 9:1 44:21 response 5:7 17:3 responsibility 35:15 36:12 44:6 responsible 40:1 rest 22:19 35:24 restate 24:9 **resumed** 56:15 **retaining** 9:15,18 review 11:16 13:2 rewrite 49:24 right 23:3 27:18 28:14 39:17,22 40:2,12,19 43:2 47:5.12.14.14 50:18 54:19 59:4 60:22 61:12 rights 1:1 3:5 4:5 13:2 14:8 20:2,4,6 25:7 34:15,21 35:8 36:21 37:14 38:12 40:9 44:23 58:2 61:19 Robert's 33:4 55:16 56:5 61:3 Rochelle 1:10 3:4 21:12 24:18 29:2 34:13,19 57:24 61:16 Rochelle's 25:14 role 45:9,14 roll 4:15 27:21 RORISON 2:5 rotated 26:17 rule 25:14,18,21 44:17

45:6 rules 8:8,16 11:25 14:14 33:4 45:1 46:7 46:13 50:19 51:24 55:3.16 56:5 61:4 ruling 32:24 run 49:2 rush 13:7 rushed 17:12

safe 25:4 sailing 11:12 SAMUEL 2:9 satisfy 44:10 saying 9:14 19:22 22:3 35:6 50:25 63:8 says 25:18,22 27:11 62:10 schedule 6:5 scheduled 21:17 school 30:4 second 6:6,7,24 7:2 29:8,9 32:18 36:6 43:3 58:7 66:8 68:14 seconded 29:10 32:24 seconds 29:11 **secret** 24:19 Section 6:1 see 6:16 9:22 11:4 20:11 44:5,21 54:16 seek 62:25 seeks 21:10 segregate 58:13 Selma 37:20 **Senate** 25:1 45:9,11 48:3,13,18 senators 48:6 senior 26:1 sensed 38:10 sent 13:5 21:7 separate 58:15 60:15 seriously 45:14 serve 14:6,9 27:8 34:19 34:20 35:9 57:25 58:1 61:17,18 served 20:8 63:16 serving 19:23 set 4:13 8:8 23:15 32:12 setting 20:16,20 settled 11:2 seven 23:23 **shared** 15:13 SHERYL 2:2 **shock** 10:19 **shocked** 51:8 65:8

short 39:22

shove 26:7

tasked 35:15

showed 25:25 side 14:13 16:12 35:20 39:3 52:15 64:2 sides 9:6 36:20 53:24 significance 35:17 significant 8:1,20 silly 27:17 simple 6:19 7:9 19:10 simplicity 6:21 simplified 63:25 simplify 54:22 **simply** 18:21,25 32:13 Simultaneous 32:21 65:2 single 50:14 51:22 sit 22:19 36:11 37:6 slate 16:13 **smooth** 11:12 smoothly 8:13 somebody 43:15 somewhat 39:10 son 24:21 soon 18:1 **sorry** 14:1 17:7 27:22 28:12 30:19 32:20 47:22 51:5 53:1 64:5 sort 40:4 43:21,23 sought 36:18 sound 23:13 **south** 35:19 **spans** 37:3 **speak** 8:3 49:11 65:5 speaking 16:20 32:21 65:2 special 14:11 24:1 specifically 38:24 **spent** 37:18 **spirit** 35:11 **spoken** 24:15 **staff** 1:8,14 2:1 4:9 5:12 7:4,5 9:5 10:2 11:25 12:5 13:6 15:16 20:15 21:2 23:5,9,11,14 25:19,20 26:4 32:12 40:11,12,13 46:6 58:9 59:9,11 64:22 65:3 66:18 Standard 4:7 start 19:21 35:6 state 5:23 25:3 49:8 55:16 59:2 statement 8:23 44:18 44:19 **statements** 8:24 9:2 19:1 44:21 States 7:14 27:9 37:7

status 14:7 20:2 statute 21:2 23:13 25:5 25:12 27:5,14 44:7,12 48:21,22,25 50:10 51:13.13.15 52:2 **statutes** 13:9 25:6 statutory 7:1 STEPHEN 1:10 stickler 25:14 stifle 38:11 story 37:12 **study** 53:5 stuff 8:10 subject 46:16 47:7 submitted 11:15 12:16 12:17,23 13:1 42:18 42:21.24 substance 53:17 substantive 48:7 substantively 4:10 suddenly 12:5 suggested 26:24 suggesting 58:11 Suite 1:7 **support** 15:20 44:17 53:20 64:14 supported 39:23 supporter 50:16 sure 13:7,8 16:15 18:11 18:12 39:4,7 47:18 49:1.5 50:1.24 51:6 52:14 56:6 61:12 surely 60:3,6 surpasses 27:14 **surprise** 17:25 18:9 26:23 surprises 18:5 surrebuttal 9:8,11 19:3 sworn 13:19

<u>T</u> table 39:18 43:1,2,2,20

49:23,24 54:19,23

55:1,14,17,20,21,23
56:1,2,3,3,7,17,18,25
57:6

take 4:15 7:17 9:25 16:3
22:13,14,22 23:1
35:14 43:6 45:14 46:8
46:13 55:20,25 56:1,9
56:12

taken 50:21 51:18
55:17 56:7

talk 6:22 12:19,21 17:8
18:1,7

talking 38:9 53:3 59:21
talks 37:19
task 19:11

taught 25:1 teaches 20:5 team 38:19 teen 36:3 teenager 35:21 telling 12:7 26:8 term 22:24 39:5 terms 19:11 **Texas** 35:19 text 20:19 textual 63:1 thank 6:14,18 7:20 15:2 18:15 19:17 20:24 23:10 25:15 29:5 36:23,25 37:23 39:8 46:20 47:15,17 66:25 68:6 thing 7:25 11:20 18:2 things 8:20 9:1 11:1,2 14:1 16:19 19:14 26:9 37:9 38:16 41:17 54:22 56:2 60:18 think 7:12,16,19 8:2,8 8:13,19 9:2,7,11,19 9:22 10:4 11:8,11 15:19 17:13,17 18:5 19:14 20:5,7 23:12 24:5,8 27:18 38:23,24 39:2 41:19 48:10,13 50:23 53:1.24 54:5.14 63:8 64:5.8 thinking 37:19 **THOMAS** 2:9 thorough 13:8 thought 8:9,18 19:15 26:17 three 6:23 8:3 9:10 12:3 13:6 17:17 throat 26:8 **throats** 45:15 throwing 54:17 **Thursday** 3:7 66:3,7 68:8 tie 28:23 time 4:7,8 9:23 11:5 13:22 15:15 16:2 17:14 22:2,18 24:2 25:8.11 26:9 38:19 40:6 41:2,24 43:21 45:2,3 49:18 53:4

66:24 told 36:2 tomatoes 35:23 totally 55:6,9 touah 7:18 traded 8:25 transcript 20:22 treated 11:10 tremendous 37:12 true 23:17 truth 19:14 try 29:24 53:19 trying 11:10 20:14 54:10 **Tuesday** 15:9,25 17:3,9 turn 6:10 11:13 29:1 34:18 38:2 turned 28:13 two 6:23 12:3 14:12 15:10 17:4,16 18:10 18:21 21:25 23:1 24:1 24:3 25:9 27:21 29:11 29:13 30:6 39:12 49:17 51:6 53:3,7,10 56:1 58:10.15 59:5 60:11 61:8 type 38:22

U

U.S 1:1 3:5 4:5 21:11 34:15.21 35:7 36:21 58:1 61:18 U.S.C 4:13 21:10 61:23 63:6 ultimately 8:13 umbrage 16:3 unanimity 50:7 unanimous 47:6 50:1 uncontroversial 8:18 undergo 12:5 understand 16:10 18:24 24:6 32:9 44:25 51:20 53:19 54:1,2,4 54:5 understanding 14:14 15:12 56:10 understandings 48:17 understood 20:5 24:9 undo 41:12 unfair 41:19 unfortunately 30:1,3 39:10 unilaterally 22:10 United 7:14 27:9 37:7 45:8 unnecessary 12:9 **USCCR** 3:7 32:10 66:3 66:6

61:7 64:9 68:9

times 18:10 58:12

today 13:25 19:23

20:11,13,23 23:21

36:11 38:15 39:10

40:16 54:12 64:1

tirelessly 36:19

45:8

stating 48:5

use 39:5 uses 51:13 usually 45:8 60:2 usurped 15:16 20:16

V

vacancy 62:18 valuable 9:3,4 variety 21:5 various 45:10 62:23 63:25 veep 25:14 37:1,2 versus 40:8 47:16 vice 3:5 4:11 8:2,12 13:21 14:21 21:13 24:20 26:11 27:7 29:14 30:1 34:14,20 37:7 38:6 39:2 41:24 43:24 44:6,16 45:12 46:17 49:4,20 58:1 61:18 62:18,22 victimized 39:25 victims 6:4 10:11,14,23 19:11 26:15 38:15,17 64:3 Victoria 1:13 3:4 21:13 34:14.20 57:25 61:17 **VIDULOVIC** 2:9 view 46:15 49:22 vigorous 27:19 vitiate 32:16 voice 40:20 67:4 voiced 43:17 volition 24:10 42:20 **vote** 3:3.6 5:14 6:3.4 8:6,15 9:15 11:7,21 12:7,10,14 14:20 15:15,19 16:18,21,22 16:23 22:7,13,14,16 23:2 26:10,24 27:1,3 27:20,22,23 28:1,4,7 28:8,10,15,18,21 29:1 29:4,13,21,22,22,25 30:6,9,15,18,23 31:1 31:4,7,10,13 32:4,10 32:17 33:5,7,8,9,11 33:16,19,22,25 34:3,6 34:9,12,18 40:17,18 40:18 41:19 42:9 43:6 44:5,7,15 45:4,4,19 46:9,14,17,18,23 47:7 47:8,10 48:23,23 49:15,19,25 50:1,2,6 50:13,14,20,21,24 51:6,17,17,23 52:5,8 52:13,19,21 53:9,14

57:12,14,17,20,24
58:5,13 60:24 61:5,8
61:16,20,21,23,24
63:5,14,17,18,21,23
64:6,6,10,12,14,17,18
64:21,24 65:1,7,9,11
65:12,14,18,19,21
66:2,5,15 67:2,4,7,9
67:11,14,17,18,20,23
68:1,4
voted 10:19,23 11:17
43:23,24 66:13
votes 28:12 30:7 25

43:23,24 66:13 votes 28:12 30:7,25 47:5 58:15 60:16 voting 17:13 41:6,23 51:24 53:6 62:3

W

wait 29:25 want 12:10 13:16 14:24 16:17,21,24 18:11 22:11,17 25:4 26:23 26:25 27:2 30:5 35:5 35:16 38:5,13 39:4,8 39:16 40:18 41:9,20 41:21 43:6 50:25 51:5 51:5 53:8 63:23 65:6 67:2,3,3

wanted 16:15 20:18 22:4,5 36:5 39:13 46:6 54:8 60:21 wanting 16:21

wanting 16:21 wants 39:3 40:17 50:23 50:24

warnings 43:18 Washington 1:8 18:9 wasn't 13:24 24:13 42:14,17,21,24 60:7 watching 30:2 37:17 40:21,23

way 9:16 10:5 17:18 25:11 38:10 40:11 43:22

ways 39:6 we'll 20:11 29:12 56:23 68:8

we're 10:11 16:14 26:7 43:13

we've 8:11 27:18 website 23:24 Wednesday 16:1 week 13:24 15:9,12 17:9,10,11 22:1 24:10 62:11 63:3

weekend 17:1 weeks 12:3 17:17 25:9 welcome 4:3,4 38:5 went 18:3 56:14 68:20 White 24:20 37:16 54:15,17 willing 44:17 49:5 52:4 willingness 39:9 wished 15:11 withdraw 22:25 32:22 54:20 61:13 withhold 21:19

word 50:12 51:13 work 7:11,11 14:4,9,25 16:9 22:20 25:2 36:19 40:12,12,13 41:22,23 42:5 48:2,19 49:1,16

worked 9:12 24:19,25 35:22 37:2,9 48:12 working 7:1 35:25 36:5

39:7 66:23 **works** 45:10 68:9,10,11

wouldn't 48:24 52:8 53:16 wrap 14:18

write 8:23 18:25 44:19 writing 10:7 15:25

62:11 wrong 55:5 wrote 7:7

X

Υ

yea 65:12,19 68:2,5 Yeah 7:22,24 66:4,4 year 19:14 21:18 24:21 37:21 40:24 59:14,14 years 36:3 37:18 58:10 61:8

York 53:22 YORKMAN-RAMEY 2:6 younger 24:23

Z

0

1

1:18 56:15 1:31 56:15 1:42 68:21 10 9:8,11 19:2,5,16 56:12 1150 1:7 12:12 4:2,7 12:13 1:7

13 35:21 **13-month-old** 36:12 **1331** 1:7 **15** 19:16 18 3:7 21:24 29:16 66:3 66:7 68:8 19 3:7 21:24 29:16 66:2 66:6 1975 21:10 1975(b) 4:13 1975(d) 61:23 62:2,6,10 63:6

2

2 6:1 20/40 53:19 2011 13:11 2023 1:5 4:8 66:7 21 1:5 4:8 24 13:20 2A 56:2

3

30 8:22,25 18:25 19:2 44:19,20 **30/30/10** 6:3,21 8:19,21 18:22 23:20 38:15 45:5 64:3 **30/40** 53:10 **35** 3:5

4

4-4 28:23 65:23 **4/4** 10:15,16 **42** 4:13 21:9 61:23 63:6

5

5 3:2 19:5

6

6 13:22 16:25 21:20 **60s** 37:20 **65** 3:7 **68** 3:8

17 13:19

54:6,12,21 55:14

56:24 57:2,5,8,9,11

<u>C E R T I F I C A T E</u>

This is to certify that the foregoing transcript

In the matter of: Business Meeting

Before: US CCR

Date: 04-21-23

Place: teleconference

was duly recorded and accurately transcribed under my direction; further, that said transcript is a true and accurate complete record of the proceedings.

Court Reporter

near Nous 8