U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS

+ + + + +

BUSINESS MEETING UNEDITED

+ + + + +

FRIDAY, OCTOBER 21, 2022

+ + + + +

The Commission convened via

Teleconference at 10:32 a.m. EDT, Norma V. Cantu,

Chair, presiding.

PRESENT:

NORMA V. CANTU, Chair

J. CHRISTIAN ADAMS, Commissioner

DEBO P. ADEGBILE, Commissioner

STEPHEN GILCHRIST, Commissioner

GAIL HERIOT, Commissioner

PETER N. KIRSANOW, Commissioner

DAVID KLADNEY, Commissioner

MICHAEL YAKI, Commissioner

MAURO MORALES, Staff Director

DAVID GANZ, General Counsel

STAFF PRESENT:

CODY BOWLER, OGC Pathways Intern

SHERYL COZART

PAMELA DUNSTON, Chief ASCD

PATRICIA FLETCHER

GERALD FOSTEN, (CSSBMB)

ALFREDA GREENE

JULIA GRIECO

ALEXES HARRIS, Washington State Advisory Chair

TINALOUISE MARTIN, Chief, OM

DAVID MUSSATT, Director, RPCU

PILAR McLAUGHLIN

JULIAN NELSON, ASCD Pathways Intern

ESSENCE PERRY, ASCD Pathways Intern

MICHELE RAMEY

MARK SPENCER, (CSSBMB)

COMMISSIONER ASSISTANTS PRESENT

JAMES DANSBY

ALEC DUELL

ALEXIS FRAGOSA

JOHN K. MASHBURN

CARISSA MULDER

JUANA SILVERIO

THOMAS SIMUEL

IRENA VIDULOVIC

A G E N D A

I. A	PPROVAL OF AGENDA6
II. B	USINESS MEETING7
	A. Presentations by State Advisory Committee Chairs on Released Reports and Memorandums
	B. Discussion and Vote on Advisory Committee Appointments
	C. Discussion and Vote on Advisory Committee (SAC) Report
	D. Discussion and Vote on FY 2023 SE Anti-Asian Racism Planning
	Documents
	Staff Director's Report47
ADJOUI	RN MEETING49

PROCEEDINGS 1 2 10:32 a.m. 3 CHAIR CANTU: Welcome to the business 4 meeting for the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights. 5 meeting comes to order at 10:32 Eastern Standard Time 6 on Friday, October 21st, 2022. 7 I am Chair Norma V. Cantu. We thank the 8 staff who completed the public notice needed for this 9 meeting, and arranged for today's business meeting. 10 We thank the general public for their interest in 11 attending. 12 Due to respect for health and safety 13 during the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic and to the 14 brevity of today's agenda, the Commissioners are in 15 attendance via conference call. We are hosting the 16 general public by phone conference. 17 I would like to confirm the commissioners 18 present on the line and will take a roll call vote. 19 Please say present or aye when I say you name. 20 Commissioner Adams. 21 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Present. 22 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Adequile. 23 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Present.

CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Gilchrist.

1	
2	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Present.
3	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Heriot.
4	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I'm here.
5	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kirsanow.
6	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Here.
7	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kladney.
8	COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Here.
9	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Yaki.
10	COMMISSIONER YAKI: Present.
11	CHAIR CANTU: Based on the response, a
12	quorum of commissioners is present.
13	Is the court reporter present?
14	COURT REPORTER: I am.
15	CHAIR CANTU: Thank you.
16	Is the staff director present?
17	MR. MORALES: I am present.
18	CHAIR CANTU: Thank you.
19	The meeting will now come to order.
20	
	I. APPROVAL OF AGENDA
21	I. APPROVAL OF AGENDA CHAIR CANTU: First I will begin by asking
21 22	
	CHAIR CANTU: First I will begin by asking

1	proceed to vote on approving the agenda.
2	All those in favor of the posted agenda,
3	say aye.
4	(Chorus of aye.)
5	CHAIR CANTU: Are any commissioners
6	opposed?
7	Do any commissioners abstain?
8	The agenda is approved.
9	II. BUSINESS MEETING
10	CHAIR CANTU: For our first order of
11	business we will turn to presentations from our
12	Advisory Committee to the Commission on recent
13	reports.
14	A. PRESENTATIONS BY STATE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
15	CHAIRS ON RELEASED REPORT AND MEMORANDUMS
16	CHAIR CANTU: Our presentation today will
17	be by Washington State Advisory Chair Alexes Harris on
18	the Committee's Report on Barriers to Accountability
19	for Law Enforcement Officers' Use of Excessive Force.
20	Ms. Harris, we're going to give you 10
21	minutes. And I, and I have enjoyed reading your
22	report. So you have the floor.
23	MS. HARRIS: Thank you so much. I
24	appreciate the time to speak with you today. I'd like

to begin by very briefly acknowledging Brooke Perry and Hela Catravino and, in particular, Kelly McGrath, who is a civil rights intern at the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights. And this report definitely would not have been made possible without her dedication and support, and also from my committee members.

As you see before you in the report, our focus was on excessive use of force by law enforcement officers. We had five hearings in 2021, all via Zoom, throughout March, May, and June.

We heard testimony from a number of people, including law enforcement agencies, law enforcement unions, representatives from the legal community, academics, advocacy organizations, and also individuals who are directly affected by the use of excessive force in our state.

Many of the issues that we were interested in focusing on were the community impacts from cases of excessive force, the ways in which law enforcement have policies around the use of excessive force in the communities that they are mandated to have, issues around collective bargaining agreements, also, arbitration procedures following discipline for use of excessive force.

And then, also, different types of proposals for reform, thinking about policies and procedures that might address police accountability and discipline when excessive use of force is alleged and found to have occurred.

We found there's a host of findings. And I won't go through all of them in the report because we've outlined them in really good detail for you. But I'll highlight a few of the emergent themes that we had.

We really found a need for comprehensive data collection across our state, also across the nation, but particularly within Washington State.

We found a need for increased transparency for the handling of police discipline cases. One, for people who are victims to understand what's happening with their specific case, but also to increase the trust of our law enforcement officers. We found that in our state we need to understand what's happening to police officers and how they're being evaluated.

We found a perception that current procedures did not adequately protect the public from the use of force. And we heard this message clearly from community members.

And we also, an emergent theme was the need to prevent appropriate discipline procedures related to use of force or discrimination from being obstructed as a result of the collective bargaining process. We learned a lot about the collective bargaining process and the ways in which different people feel that their rights are not being allowed to be explored because of the different things that had been negotiated with the labor union.

We have six recommendations or six that I'll highlight, again briefly here.

The first recommendation is the creation and maintenance of a national registry of officers who have been decertified as a result of misconduct.

Second, a creation and maintenance of a database that tracks incidents of serious injury or death resulting from police action. Right now we have neither of the two in Washington State and nationally that would allow for certain individuals who have a record of proven excessive use of force to no longer work for various law enforcement agencies.

Number 3, formulation and dissemination by the Department of Justice of best practices so there isn't a need for use of force by law enforcement

officers. What are the alternatives?

Fourth, allocation of increased resources for alternatives to the use of force, such as mental health intervention.

Five, exclusion from collective bargaining agreements of provisions that would obstruct the ability of law enforcement agencies to comply with federal prohibitions against excessive force or discrimination.

One of our people that testified noted that doctors and attorneys have higher protections, they can't bargain away the ability of people who hire them to explore or reprimand for excessive use of force. And many people felt that police should not be able, unions should not be able to bargain away who gets to overview and review their cases of excessive use of force.

And then, six, narrowly tailored safeguards regarding arbitration of disciplinary actions based on use of force or discrimination, in order to share that law enforcement agencies retaining the ability to fully comply with the federal prohibitions against the excessive use of force and discrimination.

1	So these are the recommendations. And I
2	think I did that definitely under 10 minutes.
3	CHAIR CANTU: Very succinct. Thank you.
4	We now have time for commissioner
5	questions for Chair Harris.
6	I will, I will tell you that I was
7	surprised that there was not a database of decertified
8	personnel. We have databases for teachers who have
9	been decertified.
10	MS. HARRIS: Oh, yeah.
11	CHAIR CANTU: And you can look on any
12	education website and find whose license has been
13	removed. So I was surprised by that.
14	Thank you for bringing that up today.
15	MS. HARRIS: That was surprising, yeah.
16	CHAIR CANTU: Thank you.
17	Well, thank you, Chair Harris. You've
18	impressed us. Your presentation was succinct. And
19	your reading itself, the report itself is very well
20	worded.
21	I also compliment you that you got to the
22	recommendations right away on page 24, so if I were
23	your professor I would have given you an A for being
24	concise. Thank you so much.

1	MS. HARRIS: I'm actually a professor
2	myself. So I'll give myself an A. Thank you.
3	CHAIR CANTU: Thank you so much.
4	So there being no further questions
5	MS. HARRIS: Thank you.
6	CHAIR CANTU: if you wish to stay on the
7	line, please. But I know this is a busy time in
8	higher ed, so I would not be at all offended if you
9	move on to your next work assignment. So, thank you.
10	MS. HARRIS: Perfect. Thank you. Have a
11	good day.
12	CHAIR CANTU: And particularly for your
13	service and leadership. I mean, what you've done with
14	the Washington State Advisory Committee is very
15	commendable. So, thank you.
16	MS. HARRIS: Thank you. And I do need to
17	say that's because of your staff support. So, thank
18	you for that.
19	CHAIR CANTU: Oh, I will tell them that.
20	Oh, that's terrific. Thank you for mentioning.
21	Great.
22	So our next item is a discussion and vote
23	on state and territorial advisory committee
24	appointments.

B. DISCUSSION AND VOTE ON

ADVISORY COMMITTEE APPOINTMENTS

CHAIR CANTU: As you know, the Commission depends on advice from highly qualified persons who serve in each of our 50 states, plus the District of Columbia and, most recently, the U.S. Virgin Islands, Puerto Rico, the Northern Mariana Islands, Guam, and American Samoa.

I will start by making a motion.

I move to correct the record from last month's meeting and appoint Devin, D-E-V-I-N, Wiser, as a new appointee based on the recommendation of the staff director so he can join the other members appointed last month to the Utah State Advisory Committee.

This is my responsibility. I inadvertently left him out of last month's list that we voted upon. His name was cut off. It was right next to the header, and when the header was cut off I did not notice that his name was cut off as well.

So he's qualified. And I, and I own my mistake.

So he, along with the other previously appointed members will serve as uncompensated

1	government employees. And if the motion passes, the
2	Commission will authorize the staff director to
3	execute the appropriate paperwork.
4	Can I have a second for this motion?
5	COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Kladney seconds.
6	CHAIR CANTU: Thank you, Commissioner
7	Kladney. I'll open the floor for discussion.
8	I thought you would discuss my getting a
9	new printer. Thank you.
10	Unless there's further discussion, I'll
11	call the question and take a roll call.
12	Commissioner Adams, how do you vote?
13	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Aye.
14	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Adegbile.
15	COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Aye.
16	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Gilchrist.
17	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Aye.
18	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Heriot.
19	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Aye.
20	CHAIR CANTU: I couldn't hear you.
21	Commissioner Heriot?
22	I'll come back to you.
23	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I voted aye.
24	CHAIR CANTU: Oh, I'm sorry. Thank you. I

1	couldn't hear you.
2	Okay. Commissioner Kirsanow.
3	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.
4	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kladney.
5	COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.
6	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Yaki.
7	COMMISSIONER YAKI: Aye.
8	CHAIR CANTU: And I vote aye.
9	The motion passes. Thank you, all.
10	The third item on today's agenda is a
11	discussion and vote on the Advisory Committee Report
12	of the State and Territorial Advisory Committees.
13	C. DISCUSSION AND VOTE ON ADVISORY COMMITTEE
14	(SAC) REPORT
15	CHAIR CANTU: The Commission voted in March
16	
	2022 to update the 2018 survey and a subsequent report
17	called Contemporary Civil Rights Challenges, a View
17 18	
	called Contemporary Civil Rights Challenges, a View
18	called Contemporary Civil Rights Challenges, a View from the State Advisory Committees. We did this in
18 19	called Contemporary Civil Rights Challenges, a View from the State Advisory Committees. We did this in the hopes of capturing the ever-evolving civil rights
18 19 20	called Contemporary Civil Rights Challenges, a View from the State Advisory Committees. We did this in the hopes of capturing the ever-evolving civil rights challenges across the 50 states and the U.S.
18 19 20 21	called Contemporary Civil Rights Challenges, a View from the State Advisory Committees. We did this in the hopes of capturing the ever-evolving civil rights challenges across the 50 states and the U.S. territories.

work conducted over the last 9 months.

1	I also would like to thank the State
2	Advisory Committee members for sharing their
3	perspectives and contributions to ensuring the
4	Commission stayed apprised of what is happening
5	outside the Beltway.
6	I move to open up the floor for discussion
7	and to vote on approving the Contemporary Civil Rights
8	Challenges, a View from the State Advisory Committees,
9	the 2022 survey of the State Advisory Committee to the
10	U.S. Commission on Civil Rights.
11	Do I have a second?
12	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Madam Chair,
13	Gilchrist, second.
14	COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Kladney, second.
15	CHAIR CANTU: I'm sorry. Again, please.
16	COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Kladney, second.
17	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Gilchrist, second.
18	CHAIR CANTU: We have co-seconds from
19	Commissioners Gilchrist and Kladney. Thank you both.
20	COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.
21	CHAIR CANTU: The floor is now open for
22	discussion.
23	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Madam Chair, this
24	is Gilchrist.

1 CHAIR CANTU: Yes, Commissioner? 2 COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: I just want to 3 echo your sentiments earlier by thanking the staff for 4 their hard work with the survey. This information is 5 extremely important, particularly when we hear the 6 voices from across the country. And so I just wanted 7 to also echo those sentiments as well. 8 Thank you. 9 CHAIR CANTU: Appreciate the commentary. 10 Thank you. 11 Any other discussion? 12 Just for the record, they collected data, 13 they had focus group work, and were just so diligent 14 and so attentive to being sure that the voices came 15 through of each of the State Advisory Committees. 16 that is difficult to do, considering that they did 17 have a good turnout response on the survey. 18 So commendations to the staff. 19 well done. 20 Unless there's further discussion, 21 going to call the question and take a roll call vote 22 for the Contemporary Civil Rights Challenges, a View 23 from the State Advisory Committees, the 2022 Survey State Advisory Committees to the U.S. 24 the

1	Commission on Civil Rights.
2	Commissioner Adams, how do you vote?
3	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Yes.
4	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Adegbile.
5	COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Aye.
6	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Gilchrist.
7	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Aye.
8	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Heriot.
9	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I'm going to have to
10	abstain. I apologize. I haven't gotten to the end of
11	it yet.
12	CHAIR CANTU: Thank you.
13	Commissioner Kirsanow.
14	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Same with me, I'd
15	have to abstain.
16	CHAIR CANTU: Thank you.
17	Commissioner Kladney.
18	COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.
19	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Yaki.
20	COMMISSIONER YAKI: Aye.
21	CHAIR CANTU: And I vote yes.
22	We have 6 ayes, and 2 abstaining. The
23	motion passes.
24	Thank you all very much.

1 On a personal note, I would like to write 2 a letter thanking the staff and the SAC. So, staff director, please remind me to do that. MR. MORALES: Certainly. 5 CHAIR CANTU: The fourth -- Thank you, sir. 6 D. DISCUSSION AND VOTE ON FY 2023 SE ANTI-ASIAN 7 RACISM PLANNING DOCUMENTS 8 CHAIR CANTU: The fourth item on today's 9 agenda is a discussion and vote on Fiscal Year 2023, a 10 statutory enforcement report. And it's entitled Anti-11 And it has a longer title. Asian Racism. 12 apologize I don't have the whole title. 13 It's called Anti-Asian Hate Crimes. Ιs 14 that correct? Anti-Asian Racism and Hate Crimes. 15 So let me get the whole thing in for the 16 record. 17 In line with fulfilling our statutory 18 obligation to Congress and to the President, as well 19 as our responsibility to the American public to ensure 20 civil rights across our federal government are being 21 enforced with equity, the Commission will vote --22 voted last month on the Fiscal Year 2023 Statutory 23 Enforcement Report, Anti-Asian Racism in the United

States.

1 Together today we're going to be voting on 2 the report's outline, its timeline, and its research facts. So to begin the discussion, I'll start by 5 making a motion to open the floor for discussion and a 6 vote on the Anti-Asian Racism in the United States 7 report's planning materials. 8 Do I have a second to my motion? 9 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Kladney, second. 10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner Yaki has a 11 But I have an amendment. 12 CHAIR CANTU: Yes. Commissioner Yaki, I'll 13 stop for a second and see. Please read your 14 amendment. 15 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Well, I distributed a 16 revised timeline, a discovery plan to the, to my 17 fellow commissioners on Tuesday. It would change what 18 was proposed by the staff in only one key area, and 19 that is to add to say that there is a field briefing 20 in San Francisco as well as a briefing in the District 21 The date and time, obviously, would be of Columbia. 22 at the discretion of the staff, although I proposed 23 that it occur a week before or a week after the field

briefing in San Francisco.

1	That's my, that's my amendment.
2	COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Kladney seconds.
3	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Madam Chair, I'd
4	like to offer a friendly amendment to Commissioner
5	Yaki's motion.
6	CHAIR CANTU: Am I Commissioner, would
7	you state your name for the record.
8	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: This is
9	Commissioner Kirsanow.
10	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kirsanow, would
11	you please say what you propose?
12	COMMISSIONER YAKI: I couldn't figure that,
13	Commissioner Kirsanow. His voice changes all the
14	time.
15	(Laughter.)
16	CHAIR CANTU: I've got two good ears but
17	I've not spent enough time with you all in person.
18	COMMISSIONER YAKI: Well, Commissioner
19	Kirsanow and I have spent 17 years together. So we're
20	either a common law couple or, or we just know each
21	other pretty well.
22	CHAIR CANTU: Very good. Very good.
23	Please proceed, Commissioner Kirsanow.
24	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Sure. Thank you,

Madam Chair.

My caucus would like to confirm the --in addition to Commissioner Yaki's motion, with the number and location of briefings for all reports at this time, including the crime victims or the crime increase report. And since we're amending the anti-Asian racism planning documents to add a briefing to D.C., that would be a total of two briefings, I would move that the Commission hold an in-person briefing in New York City and one in D.C., whether it's in-person or virtual, for the crime increase report.

And that would provide two briefings for each report. And, in addition, the Commission would direct the staff to begin planning for these briefings and to incorporate these briefings into the planning documents.

So that's my friendly amendment.

COMMISSIONER YAKI: This is Commissioner Yaki. I have no objection to that amendment.

CHAIR CANTU: All right. Under Robert's Rules of Order we need to vote on the amendment before we can vote on the content. Is that correct, folks?

COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Yes.

CHAIR CANTU: So is there no objection --

1	I'm sorry?
2	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Yes.
3	CHAIR CANTU: So I'm going to call I'm
4	going to treat the acceptance as a second, and go
5	ahead and proceed with a vote on the proposed change.
6	Commissioner Adams oh, first, is there
7	discussion?
8	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Yes.
9	CHAIR CANTU: I'm opening the floor for
10	discussion.
11	Let me start the discussion. The first
12	time that, that I'm in full league with
13	Commissioner Adams on the law enforcement. We've not
14	had a discussion about the places where the hearings
15	would be held until yesterday.
16	And yesterday I raised New York as a place
17	not to hold, as an example, a place not to hold a
18	briefing until we had a description of the method that
19	we selected New York.
20	There are many sites where it is possible
21	for the public to be able to either do a virtual or
22	in-person. And it seems that we do have to have a
23	we have not had a discussion. And I think that this

moment, this motion is premature.

1	But I'd like to hear the discussion from
2	the commissioners. Perhaps there's been a discussion.
3	I've just not been present.
4	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Madam Chair.
5	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Madam Chair, this
6	is Kirsanow.
7	Are you Commissioner Heriot.
8	CHAIR CANTU: Yes, thank you.
9	Commissioner Heriot.
10	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I thought that New
11	York was a good idea because that's where the
12	Manhattan Institute is located. And there are a
13	number of experts that I think that would be really
14	crucial for the Commission to get.
15	And we're much more likely to get them if
16	it's convenient for the fellows there at the Manhattan
17	Institute. They've taken a lead over the last few
18	decades on crime issues, locally in New York and
19	nationally as well.
20	So that's why I thought New York was a
21	good idea.
22	CHAIR CANTU: Thank you.
23	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Madam Chair.
24	CHAIR CANTU: Yes. Commissioner Kirsanow.

COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yeah, I concur with Commissioner Heriot. But it goes even further than that, I think, further than that.

In addition to the Manhattan Institute, there are several other think tanks there that we've, you know, accessed in the past that have data on this issue and have experts on this issue. Manhattan Institute is obviously one. There's Brookings. There's the Center for Urban Future. There's the Roosevelt Institute. It goes on and on. The Center for American Progress has a think tank there, although I don't know if they have an expert on this issue, but the Aspen Institute I think does.

In addition, since I'm the old man of the Commission, we've had a Commission hearing, a field briefing in New York before. And I thought it went splendidly. Because despite the fact that it's a big city, it was easily accessible. And it's only 170 or so miles from Washington, so I think we can convey staff and others there who need to get there from Washington pretty readily as opposed to almost anyplace else in the country.

No doubt it's a transportation hub, so that makes it easier.

1 In addition, as we've seen at least one 2 other briefing, New York has fairly robust data on this issue. And there are a number of experts and other witnesses in that area that have information on 5 And I think since we're having anti-Asian 6 racism on the West Coast, may as well have something 7 on the East Coast also. 8 CHAIR CANTU: Thank you. 9 More discussion, please? 10 All right. We're now going to go, 11 going to call the question and take a roll call vote 12 on the amendment, on the proposed amendment that in 13 addition to the two briefings for the anti-Asian, 14 also be two briefings for the there will 15 enforcement. 16 Now, keep in mind that the staff director 17 will still have to have the staff take a look at it 18 because these are moving parts. It's not just the 19 places, it's also the time that it would take to make 20 all four hearings happen. 21 So we're now talking about the amendment. 22 Commissioner Adams, how do you vote on the 23 proposed amendment to the timeline, outline, 24 research plan for the anti-Asian racism report?

1	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: I vote yes.
2	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Adegbile?
3	COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Nay.
4	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Gilchrist?
5	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Aye.
6	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Heriot?
7	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I vote yes.
8	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kirsanow?
9	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.
10	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kladney?
11	COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: No.
12	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Yaki.
13	COMMISSIONER YAKI: Aye.
14	CHAIR CANTU: And I will abstain.
15	Four yeses, 2 noes, and one abstain. The
16	motion passes.
17	So the outline, timeline, and research
18	plan are modified.
19	And I would proceed to
20	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Hang on, Madam
21	Chair.
22	CHAIR CANTU: Yes, sir?
23	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Point of order.
24	CHAIR CANTU: Yes.

1	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: You said four
2	yeses. Did Commissioner Gilchrist not vote?
3	CHAIR CANTU: I'm sorry. Hold on.
4	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Commissioner, yes,
5	I did, in the affirmative.
6	CHAIR CANTU: Yes. I have 4 yeses. I have
7	Gilchrist, Heriot, Kirsanow, Yaki. And Adams. And
8	Adams. I have five. Five yeses.
9	Thank you.
10	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.
11	CHAIR CANTU: All right. I know what I'm
12	doing here. I'm on the wrong line. Thank you.
13	Five yeses, 2 noes, and one abstaining.
14	And the motion passes. Thank you for the correction.
15	So now we are
16	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Madam Chair.
17	CHAIR CANTU: Yes, sir? Who's speaking?
18	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: This is
19	Commissioner Kirsanow.
20	Given that we would be doing a couple of
21	briefings here, I think it's important that we try to,
22	as quickly as we can, get the logistics confirmed on
23	this. I think it's doable, and I think it will be a
24	really enlightening couple of briefings. But I think

1	that
2	CHAIR CANTU: Okay.
3	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: we need to move
4	on getting
5	CHAIR CANTU: But we haven't, we haven't
6	voted on, we haven't voted on the main motion. So
7	that would be part of
8	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Okay.
9	CHAIR CANTU: the discussion of the main
10	motion. Okay?
11	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: All right.
12	CHAIR CANTU: All right. So now we're
13	going backward, we're going back to the main motion as
14	amended. So we are in the discussion phase now.
15	So please proceed now, Commissioner
16	Kirsanow.
17	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Well, we could go
18	ahead and vote on that and I could make another
19	motion.
20	But what I was saying is that with respect
21	to the planning of these briefings, we're going to
22	need to have, I think, an outline of the planning
23	documents related to the in-person briefing. And
24	we're going to have to have a notational vote on that.

1	And it should be done as quickly as we possibly can.
2	But we can do that after we have a vote.
3	CHAIR CANTU: Thank you.
4	Further discussion on the main motion
5	regarding the statutory enforcement report Anti-Asian
6	Racism in the U.S.?
7	And, again, I want to thank the staff who
8	prepared the first proposal with regards to outline,
9	timeline, and research plan. It is a very thorough
10	presentation of all of the moving parts of an
11	important and large endeavor.
12	But, however, the hate crimes topic is a
13	topic that our staff are proficient on and our
14	Commission has already issued prior reports upon.
15	So I'm saying that as a way of expressing
16	my thanks to all the hard work that's gone into it by
17	staff, special assistants, and commissioners.
18	Are we ready to vote?
19	Further discussion?
20	I will call the question and vote on the
21	main motion.
22	Commissioner Adams, how do you vote?
23	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Aye.
24	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Adegbile.
I	1

1	COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Aye.
2	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Gilchrist.
3	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Aye.
4	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Heriot.
5	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I vote yes.
6	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kirsanow.
7	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.
8	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kladney.
9	COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: No.
10	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Yaki.
11	COMMISSIONER YAKI: Aye. Aye, aye, aye,
12	aye.
13	Sorry. Thought I was on mute.
14	CHAIR CANTU: I vote thank you I vote
15	yes as well.
16	We have 7 yeses, and 1 no. The motion
17	passes.
18	Now, are there any there was a request
19	from Commissioner Kirsanow to speak after the vote.
20	Did you want to make a statement again?
21	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Right.
22	I guess I would make a motion that and
23	I don't have a firm deadline for this, but I think we
24	need to move with some alacrity here that by, I'll

1 pick a date, November 1st, the staff provide the final 2 planning documents for the field briefings on the crime victims, and the San Francisco anti-Asian briefing. 5 We can do this by a notational vote to 6 approve both sets of planning documents. But I think 7 we need to complete it as soon as possible. 8 would suggest that it be done by the close of business 9 on Friday, November 4th. 10 You know, the notational vote would be on 11 to approve both or disapprove both set of planning 12 documents. 13 CHAIR CANTU: This motion is already on 14 approving the first set of documents. 15 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes. Right. 16 CHAIR CANTU: So that would leave the 17 remaining work to approve the, by notational vote, the 18 documents regarding the law enforcement on violent 19 crimes report. 20 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Uh-huh. 21 CHAIR CANTU: Okay? 22 Is there a second to the motion? 23 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Heriot seconds. 24 CHAIR CANTU: We are open for discussion.

1	COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Can somebody
2	clarify what the motion is?
3	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: I'm sorry, was that
4	Commissioner Adegbile?
5	COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Yes. Commissioner
6	Kirsanow, I'm just, I'm a little confused about what
7	the motion is.
8	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Okay. It's just
9	that I move that, and I'm just going to select the
10	date, that by November 1st, that's two days from now,
11	the staff provides final planning documents for the
12	crime victims report and the in-person briefing. And
13	that the Commission hold a notational vote to approve
14	the planning documents by November 4th.
15	CHAIR CANTU: I think it's fair to have the
16	staff director speak to this topic.
17	Staff director.
18	MR. MORALES: Thank you, Madam Chair. I'm
19	happy to speak about what's gone on here,
20	unfortunately.
21	As commissioners are aware, I wrote a memo
22	to all of you last Friday outlining the dilemma the
23	commissioners created when they voted to report topics
24	over two years late. They left the staff with less

1 than 8 months to hold briefings and draft reports. 2 And I remind commissioners that the first 3 draft, the statutory enforcement report, is due in 4 February, with a final vote in June. 5 Commissioners have regularly 6 repeatedly exceeded their own deadlines that they have 7 set, and yet they expect the staff to adhere to such 8 deadlines. I would point out that to have four 9 briefings between, to have four briefings will require 10 one briefing per month. We're in a continuing 11 resolution, so the soonest we could have a briefing 12 would be January. 13 And if they need to be concluded by May or 14 So that would be June, that's one a month. 15 addition to holding a Commission business meeting for 16 commissioners. That means commissioners, SAs, and 17 staff would have to travel twice a month, whether it 18 be to a field hearing, a headquarters hearing, and/or 19 Commission business meetings. 20 So, you know, this would create a chaos 21 that certainly is unprecedented, you know. 22 again, one briefing per month. 23 However, I will state, as always, you 24 know, the staff will act as professionals and carry

1 out their responsibilities as professionals as best 2 they can under the circumstances provided. So, you know, selecting an arbitrary date 4 that you selected out of the air without consultation 5 of staff and the Office of Civil Rights is, again, 6 unprecedented and, you know, not helpful. 7 So I would encourage the commissioners and 8 their SAs to hold off on putting a date and allowing 9 the staff to look at the demand that commissioners 10 have placed on them in trying to dissolve a dilemma 11 that the commissioners have created. 12 So we will do our best, as always. But we 13 would request that commissioners also take into 14 consideration their demand on staff 15 resources, and personnel. 16 So, thank you. I have nothing further. 17 CHAIR CANTU: Thank you. Now, you've done 18 a very good job of describing what the consequences 19 were of the delays that we've experienced on the 20 Commission side of -- on the Commission by 21 commissioners commissioners. The have the 22 responsibility for planning ahead and making decisions 23 on time. And could not come to closure. And I accept

that as a chair.

But we, as commissioners, I don't believe should rush the staff and should give the staff at least -- at least have conversations and have, and meet with staff. So far, the commissioners have not even met with all of us together as a group about this proposal, about having it by notational vote. it is -- I compliment the So it is, with which the commissioners want But I, I do believe that it was not until proceed. today that it was described, you know, where what the reasons were and what the methodology suggestion would be to the staff. And so my contribution to the discussion on this proposed motion is that we're not working in an organized plan, thoughtfully, and using, and making the best use of the remaining time. We already have a meeting scheduled for our November business meeting. And it's already something that will be on the agenda. And nothing stops us as commissioners from talking with each other about what the answers are or any comments that people want to make on the outline

time and research plan, they can make those comments.

write a good notational ballot, the language for a

But my experience is it takes time to

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1 notational vote. And I think that time would better 2 be spent on sharing with each other what our ideas are for the law enforcement report. 4 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Madam Chair. 5 CHAIR CANTU: Or the out -- yes, please. 6 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Kirsanow here. 7 Thank you very much. I'm sensitive to what the staff director 8 9 is indicating because of logistical challenges. 10 would note that this is not unprecedented. I've been 11 on the Commission for 21 years, and we've done these 12 kinds of things in the past. We've been pretty -- we 13 used to have briefings almost every month. In fact, I 14 think my first few years it was every month. 15 We had a slightly larger staff there. 16 we've now gotten a little bit more staff than we had 17 in the past, a little bit more money. That doesn't 18 necessarily mean it's going to be an easy drill. 19 I think in voting in this fashion each commissioner 20 took their responsibility seriously in either voting 21 yes or no, and the motion passed. 22 I think that Commissioner Yaki's report 23 I'm, I'm really in favor of it, the anti-Asian one. 24 It's one of my pet peeves also, or pet projects.

I think it's essential that we have that. 1 2 I also think it's essential we have it in 3 the field, whether it be San Francisco or elsewhere. Same with the crime increase. 5 I am willing, and I think all staff, all 6 our special assistants, all the other commissioners, 7 are more than happy to provide whatever assistance we 8 possibly can consistent with the statutory framework, 9 to conduct these hearings and get the reports out. 10 Ι also aware that, you know, am 11 commissioners have sometimes taken time to, you know, 12 write their own opinions and dissents, et cetera. 13 I'm sure that, given the time frame that we've just 14 offered, and given the fact that we're all sensitive 15 to the fact that we're asking for two reports that 16 we're going to do whatever we can to promote alacrity. 17 So it's just my comment with respect to this. We are 18 sensitive to the demand that we've placed on staff, 19 but we also think highly of the staff, and we think it 20 can be accomplished. 21 CHAIR CANTU: If I can respond. I mean, 22 I'm going to -- I am going to respond. 23 I mean, I voted along with giving an 24 earlier vote today on the New York being added for the

1	law enforcement paper. And that was because for the
2	first time I got a description of what had to happen,
3	and New York was the right choice.
4	So the justification for the choice of the
5	place for the briefing was that we were going to reach
6	out to a number of community folk. We were going to
7	reach out to a lot of academic folk. We were going to
8	reach out to think tanks. And all of that is going to
9	have to happen with some discussion of, and a good
10	amount of staff work.
11	So giving folks a couple of days to line
12	up doesn't possible presenters is not a reasonable
13	ask. I think we should stay with the schedule of our
14	November vote.
15	Are there other discussions?
16	COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Call the question,
17	Madam Chair.
18	CHAIR CANTU: Thank you.
19	COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Call the question.
20	This is Kladney.
21	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I think one
22	CHAIR CANTU: We have a call.
23	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: one thing.
24	CHAIR CANTU: We've called the question.

1	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I think
2	CHAIR CANTU: Are you saying something
3	different?
4	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I think he maybe
5	misspoke about the date. Today is only the 21st. So
6	November is not, like, two or three days away, it's
7	still quite a bit of time away.
8	We've got 10 more days of October.
9	CHAIR CANTU: I understand that. It is not
10	very many days. In business days we're looking at a
11	handful of days.
12	Let's call the question. I think, I think
13	we, we've aired the same suggestions of whether it
14	should be on the regular scheduled November business
15	meeting or whether we should put the effort into doing
16	it by notational vote.
17	So I'm going to go ahead and ask for you
18	all to vote, please.
19	The motion is that we direct the staff to
20	present an updated outline, timeline, and research
21	plan to have that done so that we can Is that to be
22	done by November 4th, Commissioner Kirsanow? Or so
23	that the notational
24	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yeah, I'd move

1	CHAIR CANTU: vote takes place on
2	November 4th?
3	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: I think that we
4	have a notational vote to be completed by November
5	4th.
6	I move that by November 1st.
7	CHAIR CANTU: That's a couple of days.
8	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Right, right.
9	November 1st the planning documents for
10	both briefings be provided.
11	CHAIR CANTU: And what days of the week are
12	between our date on the paper and our having the
13	notational vote turned in?
14	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Well, that would
15	be, November 1st is a Tuesday. And November 4th where
16	the notational vote will be completed, is a Friday.
17	CHAIR CANTU: That's not leaving very much
18	discussion time or reaction time at all.
19	But let's I think, I think we know, we
20	can see the differences in terms of whether we're
21	proceeding I mean, what I don't understand is how
22	much of a difference it's going to make in the savings
23	of the couple of weeks.
24	Can you explain that?

1	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: I'm not sure what
2	you're getting at there.
3	CHAIR CANTU: The November business meeting
4	is scheduled for the 18th. So from the 4th to the
5	18th we're saving a couple of weeks. And so we're
6	just distracting the staff from what they're doing for
7	a couple of weeks of savings in terms of time.
8	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: A couple of weeks is
9	a lot.
10	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.
11	CHAIR CANTU: Well, we voted today on the
12	Asian hate crime, and that, that's going to proceed,
13	too.
14	Why don't we, why don't we see what the
15	vote turns out, folks? I mean, unless you've got
16	something new.
17	All right. Commissioner Kladney's already
18	called the question. And I apologize, Commissioner,
19	that I allowed the discussion to continue.
20	I'm ready to call the vote.
21	Commissioner Adams, how do you vote?
22	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: A point of
23	Parliamentary proceeding. This is a vote to do a
24	notation vote?

1	CHAIR CANTU: No. A vote to have a vote.
2	COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Okay. Yes.
3	CHAIR CANTU: Okay. Commissioner Adegbile.
4	COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Nay.
5	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Gilchrist.
6	COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Yes.
7	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Heriot.
8	COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.
9	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kirsanow.
10	COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.
11	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kladney.
12	COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: No.
13	CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Yaki.
14	COMMISSIONER YAKI: No.
15	CHAIR CANTU: And I vote no.
16	We have 4 yeses, 4 noes. The motion does
17	not the motion fails.
18	Okay. So we are, we're back we're
19	done, we're done with the topic of outline, timeline,
20	and research plans for this meeting. We will get back
21	to that conversation at the November business meeting.
22	The fifth item for today's agenda is the
23	discussion and the vote on our fiscal year 2023 Blue
24	Ribbon Report and field briefings.

1	So we're, we're going to open the floor
2	for a conversation about let's see, that was
3	circulated, but I don't have it in front of me. I
4	apologize.
5	Okay, hold on a second. Let me, let me
6	look at this.
7	I've got an agenda item No. We've
8	already done that. We've already done that. I'm
9	sorry.
10	E. MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONS
11	Let me turn, I'm going to turn now to the
12	staff director for the monthly staff director report.
13	And he's going to, he's going to also address some
	And he's going to, he's going to also address some views regarding members of our, of the Commission.
14	
14 15	views regarding members of our, of the Commission.
14 15 16	views regarding members of our, of the Commission. STAFF DIRECTOR'S REPORT
13 14 15 16 17 18	views regarding members of our, of the Commission. STAFF DIRECTOR'S REPORT MR. MORALES: Madam Chair, I believe you
14 15 16 17 18	views regarding members of our, of the Commission. STAFF DIRECTOR'S REPORT MR. MORALES: Madam Chair, I believe you have the script for numbers. So I will defer to you
14 15 16 17 18	views regarding members of our, of the Commission. STAFF DIRECTOR'S REPORT MR. MORALES: Madam Chair, I believe you have the script for numbers. So I will defer to you on that.
14 15 16 17	views regarding members of our, of the Commission. STAFF DIRECTOR'S REPORT MR. MORALES: Madam Chair, I believe you have the script for numbers. So I will defer to you on that. CHAIR CANTU: Thank you.
14 15 16 17 18 19 20	views regarding members of our, of the Commission. STAFF DIRECTOR'S REPORT MR. MORALES: Madam Chair, I believe you have the script for numbers. So I will defer to you on that. CHAIR CANTU: Thank you. MR. MORALES: Thank you. I have nothing
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	views regarding members of our, of the Commission. STAFF DIRECTOR'S REPORT MR. MORALES: Madam Chair, I believe you have the script for numbers. So I will defer to you on that. CHAIR CANTU: Thank you. MR. MORALES: Thank you. I have nothing further to add than is already contained in the Staff

1 commissioners have any further discussions. I have nothing further. Thank you, Madam 2 3 Chair. CHAIR CANTU: Thank you. 5 Okay. I see it now. And it is bad news. 6 I want to share with you a statement, an 7 obituary regarding the loss of Philip Montez. 8 Philip Montez, former Regional Director of 9 the Western Regional Office of the U.S. Commission on 10 Civil Rights, passed away on August 2nd at his home in 11 Pasadena, with Marcia, his wife of twenty -- of 37 12 years by his side. He was 93 years old. 13 Philip served in the U.S. Air Force during 14 the Korean War, and following he earned a Bachelor and 15 Master's Degree from the University of Southern 16 California. 17 He began his professional career in high 18 school education. His observations about education 19 suggested that the educational needs of minority 20 students were not being met. 21 Educators established the Mexican-American 22 Educational Association, which quickly spread to 23 districts throughout California, Arizona, and New 24 Mexico.

1 Phil was recruited and appointed to serve 2 as the Commission's Area Coordinator in 1967, and 3 became Regional Director in 1968. He served 37 years 4 with distinction and an abiding sense of concern for 5 communities and civil rights issues. 6 During his tenure, the Western Regional 7 Office undertook groundbreaking studies and reports of 8 education in the farming communities, and on Asian 9 American and Pacific Islander issues, and on minority 10 participation in crews for television and movie 11 production, police-community relations and in prison 12 reform. He retired from the Commission in 2004. 13 14 And he is survived by his wife and their combined 7 15 children and 12 grandchildren. He will be missed by 16 family, friends, and former colleagues. But his 17 spirit of adventure, activism, and commitment to civil 18 rights will remain. 19 The second statement in the obituary is 20 regarding Reverend Cassandra Bledsoe. 21 The Ohio Advisory Committee members will 22 Reverend Cassandra Bledsoe miss Advisory as an 23 She passed away on June 14, 2022. Committee member. 24 Over the past 20 years, Cassandra served an instrumental role in making the Ohio Advisory Committee one of the most productive and exemplary advisory committees to the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights. The committee itself is a model of political balance and diversity of opinion. And Cassandra was instrumental in ensuring that these were characteristics which led to positive meaningful contributions to the civil rights topic study, and not a source of contention and conflict.

This includes -- inclusiveness is exemplified by the fact that over her nearly 20 years of service, Cassandra served as a leading member or a vice chair for reports to the Commission on hate crimes, for reports on voting rights, fair housing, barriers to entrepreneurship, human trafficking, public health disparities, education funding, and COVID-19 disparities.

Her fellow Advisory Committee member Scott Gerber said Cassandra was a wonderful colleague and will be sorely missed. Former Chair Diana Citrino said that Cassandra was always a shining light directing our committee's way forward toward justice.

We offer our sincere thanks for Reverend Bledsoe's years of service to the Commission, and our

1	condolences to her family, particularly her three
2	children.
3	We've heard from the staff director that
4	he has already submitted his report. Are there any
5	questions on the staff director's report?
6	COMMISSIONER YAKI: Madam Chair, this is
7	Commissioner Yaki.
8	CHAIR CANTU: Yes, Commissioner?
9	COMMISSIONER YAKI: I would just ask that
10	we adjourn in the memory of both these individuals and
11	their contributions to the Commission.
12	III. AJOURN MEETING
13	
	CHAIR CANTU: I agree. That concludes the
14	CHAIR CANTU: I agree. That concludes the business for today. We adjourn in their memory and
14 15	
	business for today. We adjourn in their memory and
15	business for today. We adjourn in their memory and may they rise in power.
15 16	business for today. We adjourn in their memory and may they rise in power. If there's nothing further, we adjourn at
15 16 17	business for today. We adjourn in their memory and may they rise in power. If there's nothing further, we adjourn at 10:25 Central, 11:25 Eastern Standard Time.