

## U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS

+ + + + + **UNEDITED**

BUSINESS MEETING

+ + + + +

FRIDAY, SEPTEMBER 16, 2022

+ + + + +

The Commission convened via  
Teleconference at 10:00 a.m. EDT, Norma Cantu,  
Chair, presiding.

PRESENT:

NORMA V. CANTU, Chair

J. CHRISTIAN ADAMS, Commissioner

DEBO P. ADEGBILE, Commissioner

STEPHEN GILCHRIST, Commissioner

GAIL HERIOT, Commissioner

PETER N. KIRSANOW, Commissioner

DAVID KLADNEY, Commissioner

MICHAEL YAKI, Commissioner

MAURO MORALES, Staff Director

PILAR VELASQUEZ McLAUGHLIN, General Counsel

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

STAFF PRESENT:

PAMELA DUNSTON, Chief, ASCD

ALFREDA GREENE

TINALOUISE MARTIN, Director, OM

DAVID MUSSATT, Director, RPCU

JULIAN NELSON, ASCD Pathways Intern

ESSENCE PERRY, ASCD Pathways Intern

MICHELLE YORKMAN

COMMISSIONER ASSISTANTS PRESENT:

JAMES DANSBY

ALEC DUELL

ALEXIS FRAGOSA

JOHN K. MASHBURN

CARISSA MULDER

JUANA SILVERIO

THOMAS SIMUEL

IRENA VIDULOVIC

A G E N D A

APPROVAL OF AGENDA.....5

BUSINESS MEETING

Discussion and Vote on Advisory Committee

Appointments . . . . .  
.6

Discussion and Vote on 2023 Topics for

USCCR Reports . . . . .  
8

Management and Operations

Staff Director's Report . . . . .  
.44

ADJOURN MEETING .....47

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 (10:00 a.m.)

3 MR. NELSON: Good day and welcome to the  
4 September Commission business meeting. Today's  
5 conference is being recorded. At this time, I'd like  
6 to turn the conference over to Chair Norma Cantu.  
7 Please go ahead.

8 CHAIR CANTU: Thank you. Welcome to the  
9 business meeting of the U.S. Commission on Civil  
10 Rights. The meeting comes to order at 9:00 a.m.  
11 Eastern Standard Time on Friday, September 16, 2022.  
12 I am Chair Norma V. Cantu.

13 We thank the staff who completed the  
14 public notice needed for today's meeting and arranged  
15 today's business meeting. We thank the general public  
16 for their interest in attending.

17 Due to respect for health and safety  
18 during the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic and due to the  
19 brevity of today's agenda, the commissioners are in  
20 attendance via conference call. We are hosting the  
21 general public also by phone conference.

22 I would like to confirm the commissioners  
23 present on the line, and we'll take a roll call.  
24 Please say present or aye when I say your name.  
25 Commissioner Adams.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Present.

2 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Adegbile.

3 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Aye.

4 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Gilchrist.

5 COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Aye.

6 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Heriot.

7 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I'm here.

8 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kirsanow.

9 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Here.

10 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kladney.

11 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Here.

12 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Yaki.

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Present.

14 CHAIR CANTU: And we have full attendance,  
15 and based on this response, a quorum of the  
16 commissioners is present. Is the court reporter  
17 present?

18 COURT REPORTER: Yes, ma'am.

19 CHAIR CANTU: Thank you. Is the Staff  
20 Director present?

21 MR. MORALES: I am present.

22 CHAIR CANTU: Thank you, Director Morales.  
23 The meeting will now come to order.

24 Our first meeting is regarding the agenda  
25 for today's meeting, so I ask the commissioners do we

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 have any amendments to propose to today's agenda? For  
2 the court reporter, we have paused and I hear no  
3 proposed amendments to today's agenda.

4 If there are no amendments, we next turn  
5 to voting to approve the agenda. All in favor, please  
6 say aye.

7 (Chorus of ayes.)

8 CHAIR CANTU: Any opposed? The agenda is  
9 approved. Thank you.

10 Our first item for today's agenda concerns  
11 a discussion and vote on State and Territory Advisory  
12 Committee appointments. As the public knows and our  
13 commissioners know, the Commission depends on advice  
14 from highly-qualified persons who serve in each of our  
15 50 states, plus the District of Columbia and, most  
16 recently, the U.S. Virgin Islands, Puerto Rico,  
17 Northern Mariana Islands, Guam, and American Samoa.  
18 Today we will appoint one advisory committee, and that  
19 is for the state of Utah.

20 So I will start by a motion. I move to  
21 appointment the following persons to serve as State  
22 Advisory Committee members in Utah based on the  
23 recommendation of the Staff Director: Jani Iwamoto,  
24 nominated for chair and new appointee; Helene  
25 Ainbinder, new appointee; Brian Alen, new appointee;

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 John Arthur, new appointee; Justin Darrel Jones, new  
2 appointee; Rick Larsen, new appointee; Jacob Minas,  
3 new appointee; Bianca Mittendorf, new appointee; Shawn  
4 Newell, new appointee; Michelle Suzuki, returning  
5 appointee; Jeanetta Williams, returning appointee.  
6 All of these individuals will serve as uncompensated  
7 government employees. If the motion passes, the  
8 Commission will authorize the Staff Director to  
9 execute the appropriate paperwork.

10 Do I have a second for this motion?

11 COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Gilchrist  
12 seconds, Madam Chair.

13 CHAIR CANTU: I heard Gilchrist, and thank  
14 you also to Commissioner Adams. We have a second.  
15 I'll open the floor for discussion. Having taken a  
16 pause for discussion, thank you.

17 So without any further discussion, I'll  
18 call the question and take a roll call vote.  
19 Commissioner Adams, how do you vote?

20 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Aye.

21 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Adegbile.

22 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Aye.

23 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Gilchrist.

24 COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Aye.

25 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Heriot.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I'll vote yes.

2 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kirsanow.

3 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

4 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kladney.

5 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

6 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Yaki.

7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Aye.

8 CHAIR CANTU: And I vote yes. The motion  
9 passes. Congratulations to the new members and  
10 returning members of the State Advisory Committee for  
11 Utah.

12 The second item on today's amendment, on  
13 today's agenda -- I had amendment on my head -- is a  
14 discussion and vote on the fiscal year '23-24  
15 Statutory Enforcement Report and Briefing Report. The  
16 Commission has undertaken a thoughtful and extensive  
17 process to build consensus on the commissioners' focus  
18 for the next fiscal year. In line to fulfilling our  
19 statutory obligation to Congress and to the President,  
20 as well as our responsibility to the American public  
21 to ensure civil rights across our federal government  
22 are being enforced with equity, the Commission will  
23 vote today regarding fiscal year '23 Statutory  
24 Enforcement Report and one briefing topic.

25 The process, by the way, I went back in to

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309



1 the count. There were ten titles for proposed ideas  
2 and concepts that were uploaded and shared among all  
3 commissioners. And there are different versions. I  
4 want to thank the commissioners and their special  
5 assistants for a very thoughtful and very engaged  
6 level of preparation for today's meeting.

7 So I open the floor for discussion and  
8 vote on the statutory enforcement topic. The  
9 statutory enforcement topic, Commissioner Yaki, can I  
10 have you state that so I will say it correctly,  
11 please; or I will say it and you can correct me. I  
12 have the New Exclusion Act: The Reemerging Rise of and  
13 Federal Response to Anti-Asian Racism in America.

14 So I move to open the floor for  
15 discussion. Do I have a second?

16 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Don't you mean an  
17 actual motion?

18 CHAIR CANTU: The motion is to approve the  
19 concept for the Statutory Enforcement Report for the  
20 New Exclusion Act: The Reemerging Rise of and Federal  
21 Response to Anti-Asian Racism in America.  
22 Commissioner Michael Yaki, author --

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Madam Chair, this is  
24 Commissioner Yaki.

25 CHAIR CANTU: Yes, yes, who's speaking?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 Yes, thank you.

2 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner Yaki is  
3 speaking. Yes, this is for the concept paper and  
4 draft that was distributed this week. I believe that  
5 it was on Tuesday that we distributed it to the  
6 members of the Commission, on Tuesday or maybe late  
7 Monday, but it was distributed earlier this week. So  
8 that is the draft that is before us.

9 The purpose of the Statutory Enforcement  
10 Report is, number one, part of the very heavy focus of  
11 this will be on the rise of anti-Asian violence and  
12 hate that has occurred recently in this country. A  
13 lot of it has been associated with the pandemic, but I  
14 believe there may be some that pre-dates it just by a  
15 little bit, but a lot of it does stem from that. The  
16 statistics show that in terms of reported instances of  
17 crime against Asian Americans has gone up over 500  
18 percent into the largest cities in America with large  
19 Asian American population, but I also wanted to take a  
20 look at the fact that there has been other parts of  
21 this manifesting itself in other parts of federal  
22 policy as well.

23 So that is the draft that is before the  
24 Commission at this particular moment in time, and I  
25 appreciate my colleagues' consideration of that. It

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 will be the first report of its kind on the Asian  
2 American community from a statutory enforcement  
3 perspective by this Commission in its history. And  
4 given that this is a topic that has personal interest  
5 to myself but to a community that has been part of the  
6 fabric of this nation and major participants, as all  
7 of us are. But the fact that people who look like me  
8 have been singled out lately for and creating a  
9 feeling of -- even amongst people who I care about, a  
10 feeling of being unsafe in their own communities is  
11 something that I believe the federal government needs  
12 to examine and respond to and one which the Commission  
13 has a duty and obligation to explore in some detail.

14 So thank you very much.

15 CHAIR CANTU: I need a second.

16 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Kladney will  
17 second.

18 MR. MORALES: Madam Chair, there is no  
19 other discussion in a procedural vote.

20 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Madam Chair,  
21 Kirsanow here. Madam Chair.

22 MR. MORALES: I'm wondering if the Chair  
23 has lost her connection.

24 CHAIR CANTU: I muted out. I apologize.  
25 Commissioner Kirsanow, I recognize you with a

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 question.

2 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Thank you. I  
3 support this with an amendment that would include an  
4 examination of the extent to which educational  
5 institutions discriminate against Asian Americans in  
6 admissions due to claims that Asian students don't  
7 provide sufficient diversity. And as I've indicated  
8 in the past, I believe this to be timely. I've, I  
9 think, moved for this type of examination several  
10 times in the past. But given that this is currently  
11 pending before the Supreme Court and there's also  
12 litigation related to not just higher education but  
13 secondary school education, I think this would be very  
14 timely and appropriate.

15 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I second Pete's  
16 motion to amend.

17 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Heriot, thank  
18 you. I open that --

19 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Madam Chair, may I  
20 respond?

21 CHAIR CANTU: Yes, please. Yes, please,  
22 Commissioner Yaki.

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes, Madam Chair, I  
24 want to thank Commissioner Kirsanow for his remarks.  
25 The purpose for not examining that at this time, there

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 are many reasons, but the major reason at this point  
2 is precisely because there's a case before the U.S.  
3 Supreme Court on this issue this coming term. It  
4 seems that this would be something that I do not want  
5 us to get involved with at this particular juncture.

6 There is also, I think that it takes away  
7 from the focus of the report, which is anti-Asian  
8 violence and other instances of discrimination that  
9 have arisen. I have, in a previous version, talked  
10 about examining some aspects of this, but the emphasis  
11 in Commissioner Kirsanow's amendment simply is  
12 unacceptable to me at this time, and, again,  
13 especially because this is going before the Supreme  
14 Court at this particular time for a number of reasons,  
15 one of the reasons being which one of our own  
16 commissioners can't participate in that report. And I  
17 think this is something that deserves a participation  
18 of all commissioners as part of our work as a body to  
19 ensure that you do not select a topic that  
20 disqualifies any single one of us at any given moment  
21 in time when we engage in this kind of thing as a  
22 commission because we are essentially saying we are  
23 doing it not as a commission but as part of a  
24 commission. So that is why I object to the amendment.

25 CHAIR CANTU: Thank you. Is there further

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 discussion please?

2 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes, Madam Chair,  
3 Kirsanow here.

4 CHAIR CANTU: Yes, Commissioner Kirsanow.

5 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Thank you, Madam  
6 Chair. Although I disagree with Commissioner Yaki's  
7 take on this, I understand it. He argues it  
8 eloquently. I disagree with it, but I think the  
9 topic, as he had posed it, is an important one, and I  
10 think, at least speaking for myself, I'd be willing to  
11 vote in favor of Commissioner Yaki's main motion if we  
12 can also make sure that, if this version is adopted in  
13 a vote today, that in addition to adopting  
14 Commissioner Yaki's motion, that if in a later vote  
15 today at this particular meeting we adopt without  
16 amendment the latest version of the crime concept  
17 paper, then, you know, that would be fine if under the  
18 motion to the adoption of the Asian American concept  
19 paper would be null and void if the Commission fails  
20 to adopt the crime concept paper -- the latest version  
21 of the crime concept paper.

22 CHAIR CANTU: You're making a procedural  
23 proposal. Okay.

24 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Shouldn't we vote on  
25 this motion to amend first?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 CHAIR CANTU: Yes, you have a motion to  
2 amend and a second. Is there any other discussion on  
3 the vote on the question of amending? We've heard  
4 from Commissioner Yaki. Are any other commissioners  
5 going to contribute before we go to that next step?

6 COMMISSIONER YAKI: This is Commissioner  
7 Yaki speaking.

8 CHAIR CANTU: Yes.

9 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I want to, I am trying  
10 to understand and perhaps appreciate what Commissioner  
11 Kirsanow just said, which appears to be that he would  
12 support my original, the concept paper draft that was  
13 distributed this week without amendment conditionally  
14 upon a subsequent vote that would also approve the  
15 other concept paper. Is that what I'm trying to  
16 understand, Commissioner Kirsanow?

17 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

18 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Okay. That would be a  
19 different amendment than the amendment that  
20 Commissioner Kirsanow originally proposed. So rather  
21 than get into a voting merry-go-round, why don't we  
22 see whether or not -- so we can vote on Commissioner  
23 Kirsanow's amendment, or we can vote on Commissioner  
24 Kirsanow's other amendment, which is to vote in favor  
25 of the concept paper as it was drafted and distributed

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 this week by myself without amendment, conditional  
2 upon passage of the briefing report that was put out.

3 So which amendment are we going to be playing with  
4 here? Because I think one --

5 CHAIR CANTU: It's pretty clear what the  
6 order is. Yes, let's vote on the first motion to  
7 amend quickly, and let's go on, just to keep things in  
8 order here.

9 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Okay. I thought  
10 Commissioner Kirsanow, by implication, was withdrawing  
11 his motion, but okay. And substituting it with the  
12 procedural motion but --

13 CHAIR CANTU: Yes, but since I seconded,  
14 that wouldn't be possible. Let's just do it in order  
15 because I'm going to get confused otherwise.

16 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Okay. So the first  
17 one is going to be on adding his amendment to the --  
18 substantive amendment to the concept paper that I  
19 distributed this week, correct?

20 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Correct.

21 CHAIR CANTU: Correct.

22 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Okay. Which I oppose.  
23 Got it, okay. So let's do that. Madam Chair, let's  
24 get that vote out of the way.

25 CHAIR CANTU: Understanding the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309



1 conversation in front of us, I'm going to then call  
2 for a vote, hearing no further discussion, I'm going  
3 to call for a vote on the proposed amendment to the  
4 fiscal year '23 Statutory Enforcement Report on Asian  
5 hate crimes to add a higher education component  
6 dealing with affirmative action and the pending  
7 lawsuit in front of the U.S. Supreme Court involving  
8 Asian Americans. Is that a fair summary?

9 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I don't think Peter  
10 was saying higher education because he mentioned the K  
11 through 12, as well, or the --

12 CHAIR CANTU: Thank you.

13 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Correct.

14 CHAIR CANTU: Dealing with admissions.  
15 Okay, thank you.

16 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Can we be clear  
17 about what the proposed amendment is? I'm now  
18 confused about what the subject matter is.

19 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes, it would  
20 include an examination of the extent to which  
21 educational institutions that includes anything from K  
22 through 12 and colleges and law schools and medical  
23 schools discriminate against Asians in admissions.  
24 The current, at least rationale for that, is that  
25 Asian students don't provide sufficient diversity

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 under the Grutter rationale. So that would be an  
2 examination that would be included in Yaki's,  
3 Commissioner Yaki's proposal.

4 CHAIR CANTU: If I could just add one more  
5 clarification, and then I'm going to call the  
6 question. The clarification is the original one, the  
7 original proposal is looking at xenophobia that is  
8 growing and coming up for recommendations on anti-  
9 Asian racism and xenophobia. This is a departure, but  
10 that's all I have to add.

11 So does anyone have any other comments or  
12 other questions before we call the question?

13 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Commissioner  
14 Adegbile.

15 CHAIR CANTU: Yes, Commissioner.

16 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: We do have any  
17 information from OCRE about whether or not we could  
18 achieve this scope of doing both of those topics as  
19 part of a single inquiry? As I understand them,  
20 they're both pretty expansive topics, and I know if we  
21 try and focus our concept papers with some degree of  
22 specificity to make sure that it can be achieved and  
23 at the level of analysis required can be done instead  
24 of -- so I'm just wondering what information we have  
25 about this substantial substantive expansion and how

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 viable it would be.

2 CHAIR CANTU: If I can ask the Staff  
3 Director, has the admissions topic been presented to  
4 you or to the OCRE?

5 MR. MORALES: I believe -- this is Staff  
6 Director Morale. I believe it's been presented to us  
7 in previous reiterations in previous years, but it has  
8 not been presented to accompany the report or the  
9 concept paper, the topic, that Commissioner Yaki has  
10 proposed. It would be an additional heavy lift  
11 because it would require a whole complete section and  
12 a whole complete analysis. That paper that  
13 Commissioner Kirsanow proposes should be worthy of its  
14 own briefing, be worthy of its own investigation,  
15 should the Commission vote for it. But it would be a  
16 -- I think it would be a very big mistake to add it,  
17 and we have less than 12 months to try to get the  
18 Statutory Enforcement Report done and to get at least  
19 one briefing in for the proposal that Commissioner  
20 Yaki has done. So adding a completely separate topic  
21 to it would be overwhelming to OCRE, and I would not  
22 recommend it.

23 CHAIR CANTU: That's helpful information.  
24 Thank you. Are we ready to call the question? I'm  
25 taking a pause. I'm calling the question. So we are

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 ready to vote on the proposed amendment. Do I need to  
2 restate it, or are we ready to vote?

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Vote.

4 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: I think we're  
5 ready to vote, Madam Chair.

6 CHAIR CANTU: All right. If you vote aye,  
7 you are voting to add the amendment. Commissioner  
8 Adams, how do you vote? I did not hear you, sir.

9 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Aye.

10 CHAIR CANTU: Thank you. Commissioner  
11 Adegbile.

12 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Nay.

13 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Gilchrist.

14 COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Aye.

15 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Heriot.

16 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I vote yes.

17 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kirsanow.

18 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

19 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kladney.

20 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: No.

21 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Yaki.

22 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No.

23 CHAIR CANTU: And I vote no. The motion  
24 fails.

25 Now we turn to the next proposed

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 amendment. Could you restate it, Commissioner  
2 Kirsanow?

3 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes, if I can  
4 remember. What I would do is I would move to adopt  
5 the proposal or the motion that was articulated by  
6 Commissioner Yaki if we also adopt a later vote today  
7 in this meeting the latest version of the crime  
8 concept paper without amendment.

9 So if you adopt this proposal, then the  
10 crime proposal without amendment will also be passed  
11 at a later vote. If the adoption of, if it's not,  
12 then the adoption of the Asian American concept paper  
13 would be void if the Commission doesn't adopt the  
14 latest version of the crime concept paper.

15 CHAIR CANTU: Does anyone have any  
16 questions about that proposal? Oh, I need a second  
17 for it. We have a second already from Commissioner  
18 Heriot, so we're ready for discussion.

19 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

20 CHAIR CANTU: Yes, thank you.

21 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Commissioner  
22 Kladney here. I always, when, in the past, they've  
23 tried to package these concept papers together, I'd  
24 move to divide division of the question, and I have a  
25 right to divide the question, and this motion would

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 deny me that right and try and obfuscate the Robert's  
2 Rules of Order. I would oppose the motion.

3 CHAIR CANTU: Thank you, Commissioner  
4 Kladney. Anyone else, please?

5 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Madam Chair, I think  
6 this is a nice way to try to satisfy everybody,  
7 except, apparently, Commissioner Kladney. I know that  
8 some members of the Commission prefer not to package  
9 because they like to be able to register their view on  
10 a particular project, and that's fine; I have no  
11 problem with that. But the reason that Commissioner  
12 Kirsanow and I and Commissioner Gilchrist and  
13 Commissioner Adams thought that this would be a good  
14 way to do it is that, you know, yes, we understood  
15 that, you know, progressives don't like to package.  
16 This avoids the problem of not being able to register  
17 your view in each case. We also had understood  
18 progressives insisted that their project go first. I  
19 don't quite see the point in that, but, you know,  
20 fine, we can do that. If we do it according to  
21 Commissioner Kirsanow's motion, then I think that, you  
22 know, we can feel comfortable voting for Commissioner  
23 Yaki's proposal. We can get this through. We can be  
24 cooperative, and, you know, we can leave this meeting  
25 with two things accomplished rather than nothing

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 accomplished. And I very much support the motion, and  
2 I think it's a good idea.

3 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Madam Chair,  
4 Commissioner Adams.

5 CHAIR CANTU: Yes, Commissioner Adams.

6 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: I have a question for  
7 the moving Commissioner Kirsanow regarding his motion.  
8 Commissioner Kirsanow, does your motion allow for a  
9 separate vote on the crime paper and a separate vote  
10 on Commissioner Yaki's proposal?

11 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: They're separate  
12 votes. One is contingent on the other.

13 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No, it's separate  
14 votes, and this would adopt contingently the Asian  
15 American concept paper. And then there would be a  
16 separate vote on the crime paper but if this motion  
17 passes.

18 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Commissioner  
19 Kirsanow, so this is not bundled then? These are  
20 separate votes?

21 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: They're separate  
22 votes, correct. They're separate votes. The  
23 contingency is based on if the first vote passes, you  
24 vote on the second one, the second vote passes. One  
25 is contingent on the other, but they are separate

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 votes.

2 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Madam Chair?

3 CHAIR CANTU: Yes, Commissioner Heriot.

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes, it seems to me  
5 we've come full circle here. Months ago, we had  
6 wanted to come up with a way to where both caucuses  
7 could get the topic that they find, you know, most  
8 appealing. And I think we're there now. It's just a  
9 question of putting out the vote in a way that both  
10 sides can feel secure that they are going to get what  
11 they want. And, you know, we're trying to be  
12 accommodating here.

13 The Asian American proposal would never  
14 have been my first, second, third, or fourth choice  
15 among the many that we had, and I think we had some  
16 good proposals here. But I know that it's important  
17 to Commissioner Yaki, I know that it's important to a  
18 number of the commissioners in the progressive caucus.

19 That's good because it's not like it's a terrible  
20 topic. It would not have been my first choice.

21 But if we can, you know, do it along with  
22 the crime victims proposal, then it's fine with me.  
23 Now, I would note for the record that, you know, on  
24 the crime victims proposal, you know, we did negotiate  
25 with the progressive caucus. It's not exactly the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309



1 proposal that I would have come up with, not even  
2 close. But I think that it's still a good proposal  
3 and I think both of these proposals can work. We just  
4 have to learn to be cooperative and to get this vote  
5 through in a way that protects both groups.

6 CHAIR CANTU: I don't disagree --

7 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: It's a shame this  
8 has taken as long as it has.

9 CHAIR CANTU: I don't agree with -- the  
10 difficulty is that it has taken a long time, but we're  
11 almost there. So what I'm hearing is that each of the  
12 papers will receive a full discussion. Each of the  
13 papers will have a vote on it, and, on the record,  
14 each will be able to state their views on each  
15 separate report. This procedure allows both to go  
16 through is what I understand.

17 Because this is the first time we've done  
18 this, and I spent time last night going through  
19 Robert's Rules of Order, I couldn't find the  
20 conditional type of voting. I appreciate people being  
21 creative, but I also can understand the concern we  
22 need to fully understand what we're doing because  
23 we've not voted conditionally on anything that I'm  
24 aware of.

25 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Madam Chair, I can

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 say that, yes, I can say that the faculty at the  
2 University of San Diego votes conditionally on lots of  
3 things, not one quite like this but very often in  
4 making offers. We vote offers that are conditional on  
5 whether, you know, somebody else accepts an offer or  
6 doesn't accept an offer and things like that. It's  
7 not that strange.

8 CHAIR CANTU: Thank you.

9 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

10 CHAIR CANTU: I'm always learning about  
11 new ways people can --

12 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Madam Chair, I  
13 believe they do that when -- Commissioner Kladney  
14 here; I'm sorry.

15 CHAIR CANTU: Yes, Commissioner Kladney.

16 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: I don't believe  
17 that's done when there's a division of the question  
18 which is a privilege under the Robert's Rules of  
19 Order. Thank you.

20 CHAIR CANTU: Could I ask our legal  
21 counsel, David Ganz, a little bit about the division  
22 of the question? Does that require the Chair to make  
23 a call on whether this is the appropriate time to deal  
24 with the division of the question aspects?

25 MR. MORALES: Madam Chair, General Counsel

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 David Ganz is not available. We have Senior Counsel  
2 Pilar McLaughlin who can opine, if possible, to your  
3 question.

4 MS. MCLAUGHLIN: Good morning,  
5 Commissioners. I don't have that information  
6 available to me at the moment, so I can't offer an  
7 opinion on that right now.

8 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: This is easy stuff,  
9 ladies and gentlemen. You know, we can have a  
10 compromise here.

11 CHAIR CANTU: I want our decision to  
12 stick, so let's just give me a second and let me look  
13 at voting.

14 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Madam Chair, this is  
15 Commissioner Yaki.

16 CHAIR CANTU: Thank you.

17 COMMISSIONER YAKI: While I understand the  
18 strategy behind the amendment, it does, in many ways,  
19 undermine the division of the question issue that  
20 Commissioner Kladney raises because what it does is it  
21 essentially creates a rather interesting situation  
22 where you are not actually voting for each individual  
23 report because you are inherently basing that vote  
24 upon a contingency of another report, rather than the  
25 report on its own merits.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1           If there is any understanding about how  
2 the vote would and could go forward, I mean, that is  
3 what, you know, part of what we do. We facilitate  
4 discussion about whether or not the votes are  
5 sufficient to support a one or the other report. I  
6 would note that either report can be approved by a  
7 majority of those voting, not a majority of the  
8 Commission, which means that, if someone were to  
9 abstain, for example, and we were to have a four to  
10 three to one vote, it would still go through.

11           In the vote counting, or discussions,  
12 shall I say, amongst and between members, if it is not  
13 clear that that kind of situation, either 5-4 or 4-3-1  
14 exists, I would just submit that probably means that  
15 neither report has a requisite support to go forward.

16           But if those discussions have been had and there is  
17 sufficient reliance between people on those  
18 discussions, which I have not been a party of, but,  
19 discussions between other members of the Commission  
20 have occurred, I would say trust on that reliance or  
21 discussions as to how it should work out. And if you  
22 haven't, then we have, then we will be at a, then we  
23 will be at a stalemate, but the stalemate is the  
24 product of individual votes on each one of these  
25 topics, rather than a vote that purports to be

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 individual votes but are indelibly linked to one  
2 another because of some inability to understand how to  
3 count to four or how to count to five, depending on  
4 how you do it.

5 So I'm not a big fan of this. I know that  
6 in Congress, which uses Jefferson's Manual, there are  
7 procedures like this where you can essentially make  
8 motions that require both in order for both to go.  
9 But we are not that yet. We're adhering to Robert's  
10 Rules, and I don't know if Robert's Rules has that  
11 provision in there.

12 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner, may I  
13 interrupt? I found the rule. Robert's Rule, Section  
14 27, division of a question. Part one, when a motion  
15 related to a symbol subject contains several parts,  
16 each of which are capable of standing as a complete  
17 proposition if the others are removed, the parts can  
18 be separated. Okay. It goes on, but 27.10 says,  
19 motions that must be divided on demand, and I believe  
20 that's what Commissioner Kladney is referring to,  
21 sometimes a series of independent resolutions or main  
22 motions dealing with different subjects is offered in  
23 one motion. In such a case, one or more of the  
24 several resolutions must receive separate  
25 consideration and vote at the request of a single

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 member. And the motion for division of a question is  
2 not used. Such a demand, open parenthesis, which  
3 should not be confused with demand for division of the  
4 assembly, can be made even when another has the floor,  
5 as in, Mr. President, I call for a separate vote on  
6 Resolution No. 3. This demand must be asserted before  
7 the question on adopting the theory had actually been  
8 put to vote.

9 So, Commissioner Kladney, I ask you since  
10 you raised the issue, is this what you're referring  
11 to, a separate vote, or are you referring to a  
12 division of a question?

13 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: A division of a  
14 question which requires separate votes.

15 CHAIR CANTU: So it's both. And do you  
16 see this as a single subject, or do you see this as  
17 two separate subjects?

18 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Each concept paper  
19 is a separate subject.

20 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: But we are doing a  
21 vote on the concept papers. I mean, this just sounds  
22 the legislative single subject rule, in which this  
23 case these things, Pete's motion, is a single subject.

24 And as far as we're talking about voting on separate  
25 concept papers, that's the deal here. We're

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 suggesting that. If it makes everybody happy, we can  
2 vote on the crime victims issue first.

3 CHAIR CANTU: I've got the agenda already  
4 posted. We've given public notice so, under due  
5 process, I would follow what we've already told the  
6 public we were going to do.

7 (Simultaneous speaking.)

8 CHAIR CANTU: At this point --

9 COMMISSIONER YAKI: So if we want to make  
10 this a separate question -- this is Commissioner Yaki  
11 -- it should not be tied to a vote, it should not be  
12 tied to an approval vote for the Asian American  
13 concept paper. It should be a motion precedent prior  
14 to that vote by Commissioner Kirsanow, which would  
15 state that the -- so, Commissioner Kirsanow, and I  
16 believe we can, I would be willing to hold in abeyance  
17 the vote on the Asian concept paper for the separate  
18 procedural vote prior to those votes that would state,  
19 essentially, that both reports must receive approval  
20 in order for both reports to be approved.

21 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Second. Adams.

22 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Madam Chair.

23 CHAIR CANTU: Yes. Who is speaking?

24 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Commissioner  
25 Adegbile.

1                   CHAIR CANTU:    Thank you, Commissioner  
2                   Adegbile.

3                   COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE:  Just two points of  
4                   factual clarification based on some of the discussion  
5                   that has ensued, which neither goes to the procedural  
6                   points but just goes to the record.  So as an initial  
7                   matter, we have already achieved something.  We voted  
8                   a SAC through, and so we've already achieved something  
9                   in this meeting.

10                   And the second point, which is the more  
11                   important point, is Commissioner Yaki's topic is not  
12                   just a topic that is of interest to Commissioner Yaki  
13                   or to the progressive caucus.  It's not just a topic  
14                   that's of interest to the actual victims or persons  
15                   who are attacked on account of their race and targeted  
16                   for hate crimes.  It is a topic that has the interest  
17                   and the import of the broader people of our nation.

18                   And so, to the extent that any comments  
19                   were susceptible of a reading that the scope and  
20                   subject matter of the Commission's first anti-Asian  
21                   violent concept paper was a discrete topic of special  
22                   pleading, I just want to clarify about what the  
23                   subject matter of the concept paper is.  I doubt that  
24                   it's the view of Commissioner Yaki, and I doubt that  
25                   it's the view of anybody who follows the business of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309



1 the United States Civil Rights Commission. So I don't  
2 know whether or not that was the intended import of  
3 some of the earlier remarks that were made, but I just  
4 want to answer it to make clear it's certainly not the  
5 view in this weighty question.

6 CHAIR CANTU: Thank you.

7 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Madam Chair, Madam  
8 Chair, Adams.

9 CHAIR CANTU: Yes, Commissioner Adams.

10 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Parliamentary  
11 procedure question directed to Commissioner Yaki.  
12 Did, in fact, he make a motion to do as I thought he  
13 did, and that is to move this thing along, which we  
14 would have done 15 minutes ago, and I thought I was  
15 seconding a motion of his, but I just want a point of  
16 clarification whether or not there was a motion to do  
17 what Commissioner Yaki suggested.

18 CHAIR CANTU: And is it a substitute  
19 motion for the motion that we began the discussion  
20 with with Commissioner Kirsanow?

21 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No. What I was trying  
22 to say is that, well, first of all, the motion to  
23 amend failed. The main motion is on the floor. What  
24 I was suggesting is that I would hold the vote on the  
25 main motion in abeyance if the -- I'm not going to do

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 this, but, if Commissioner Heriot or Kirsanow were to  
2 make a motion to state that prior to the vote on the  
3 main motion that a vote that today, in order for the  
4 Statutory Enforcement Report and the Briefing Report  
5 to be approved and be in effect, both shall have to  
6 pass today.

7 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: That is a motion  
8 that you are making right now?

9 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No, that is what I'm  
10 stating you might make. I'm not going to make it.  
11 I'm saying that I'm willing to hold the vote on the  
12 main motion in abeyance in order for you to make that  
13 motion.

14 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay. As I  
15 understand it, instead of the two motions that Pete  
16 was going to make, there's three motions now, and  
17 you're saying that you would be willing not hold your  
18 motion in abeyance if we make a motion that says that  
19 any adoption of a concept paper that we do today, it  
20 has to be such that both of them pass; otherwise,  
21 neither of them will, in fact, have approval, in  
22 effect. And doing it in three steps is fine with me.

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Well, just to be a  
24 little helpful, I would simply say that the approval  
25 of the Statutory Report and the Briefing Report

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 topics, neither shall go into full force and effect  
2 after passage of one or the other unless both receive  
3 approval.

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Is that a motion?

5 COMMISSIONER YAKI: You can restate it,  
6 but that's essentially what I would say.

7 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Are you making a  
8 motion, or do you want me to --

9 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I don't think you can  
10 negate a vote, but you can say that it shall not be,  
11 it shall not be carried out in full force effect by  
12 the Commission or by the staff, by the Commission --

13 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: It's easy. It's  
14 really easy. All we have to do is then make the  
15 second and third motion subject to the motion that  
16 we're about to make now. It's easy. This is not  
17 rocket science.

18 COMMISSIONER YAKI: So say it.

19 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay. I move, I  
20 move that any motion that is made and carries adopting  
21 one of the two concept papers currently under  
22 consideration, that neither motion will go into effect  
23 unless the other concept paper is also adopted. Does  
24 that work? I think we all know what we're talking  
25 about here.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 CHAIR CANTU: And that works with Robert's  
2 Rules. It's not inconsistent.

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: All of this works  
4 with Robert's Rules.

5 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Seconded, Adams.

6 CHAIR CANTU: Are we ready to call the  
7 question?

8 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Kladney still  
9 objects. I believe you're eviscerating my privilege  
10 under the Robert's Rules. Thank you. I believe that  
11 this motion is invalid.

12 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: File a lawsuit.

13 CHAIR CANTU: As the Chair, I am taking  
14 into account the time urgency of moving forward, and I  
15 am going to make a motion under Robert's Rules that  
16 we're going to proceed to have a vote on the motion  
17 made by Heriot and seconded by -- was it Adams?

18 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Adams seconds.

19 CHAIR CANTU: Thank you, thank you,  
20 Commissioner. So I'm going to call a roll call vote.  
21 Commissioner Adams, how do you vote?

22 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Aye.

23 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Adegbile.

24 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Nay.

25 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Gilchrist.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Aye.

2 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Heriot.

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I vote yes.

4 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kirsanow.

5 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

6 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kladney.

7 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: No.

8 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Yaki.

9 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No.

10 CHAIR CANTU: I am going to vote aye. Oh,  
11 I'm sorry, I'm going to vote abstained so that the  
12 motion does pass. Thank you. So now we will  
13 hopefully move on to a vote on the -- we've gotten the  
14 procedural stuff out of the way. Do we need to go  
15 back to the main motion?

16 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Let's do it because  
17 I think you want to be explicit that it's subject to  
18 what we just did.

19 CHAIR CANTU: All right. Back to the main  
20 motion. Is there further discussion?

21 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Am I correct that  
22 this is subject --

23 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Yaki.

24 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I think, Commissioner  
25 Heriot, that the motion pretty much speaks for itself.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1       On this, I just want to thank my colleagues, I want  
2       to thank the staff, I want to thank Alec Duell for  
3       helping put this together. But I do want to second  
4       and amplify the remarks by Commissioner Adegbile.  
5       Even though this is of obvious interest to me as an  
6       individual, it is, I think, of interest to the  
7       country. This is how we, as a country, work to answer  
8       the better angels of our nature. And when an  
9       injustice is inflicted upon one, it is inflicted upon  
10      all of us. And being able to examine this in-depth  
11      for the first time in the history of the Commission,  
12      it's something that I think has significance, benefit,  
13      and import to all of us in this country who care about  
14      civil rights.

15                   So thank you and let's vote on this.

16                   CHAIR CANTU: And please don't take my  
17      abstention as speaking against it. In fact, I want to  
18      be on the record I favor the proposed concept paper.  
19      Asians were forced apart, forced to live apart and to  
20      build a society to survive on their own, and so this  
21      is a most urgent matter.

22                   COMMISSIONER YAKI: Chair Cantu, I would  
23      just, as a friendly, as friendly gesture, I would  
24      simply say this, which is I would withhold your  
25      abstention until you count the number of noes.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 CHAIR CANTU: Let's find out. Thank you.

2 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Because, otherwise,  
3 that could be an issue.

4 CHAIR CANTU: Okay. I was talking about  
5 my abstention on the vote on procedure, not talking  
6 about how I intend to vote. What I was trying to  
7 explain is that I favor and intend to vote in a  
8 positive way, so there we go. Thank you.

9 All right. Are we ready to vote?  
10 Commissioner Adams --

11 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Again, I am saying  
12 that this motion is, in fact, subject to the previous  
13 motion.

14 CHAIR CANTU: Fine. Thank you.  
15 Commissioner Adams, how do you vote on the main  
16 motion, which is subject to the previous motion?

17 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Aye.

18 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Adegbile.

19 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Voting on the  
20 individual question of Commissioner Yaki's concept  
21 paper as circulated, I vote aye.

22 CHAIR CANTU: Thank you. Commissioner  
23 Gilchrist.

24 COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Aye.

25 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Heriot.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I vote yes.

2 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kirsanow.

3 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

4 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kladney.

5 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

6 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Yaki voting  
7 last.

8 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Aye.

9 CHAIR CANTU: And as Chair, I vote aye, as  
10 well. The motion passes.

11 Now we turn to our next topic, the  
12 Briefing Report. I am co-author, along with  
13 Commissioner Adams. And thank you to Commissioner  
14 Adams and to the special assistants and to all of you  
15 for input on this report. It is entitled U.S.  
16 Department of Justice Data Collection from 2017 to  
17 2022 Concerning Victims of Violent Crimes: Inquiring  
18 How that Data has Informed the DOJ's Policy and  
19 Practice to Reduce Discrimination Against Crime  
20 Victims Because of Race and National Origin.

21 I move adoption of this Briefing Report.  
22 Do I have a second?

23 (Simultaneous speaking.)

24 COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Second, Madam  
25 Chair. Gilchrist.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309



1 CHAIR CANTU: Okay. Hold on. Was one of  
2 those Adams?

3 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Adams can second,  
4 too.

5 CHAIR CANTU: Okay. I have a second then.  
6 Okay. Open for discussion. Commissioner Adams,  
7 would you like an opening statement?

8 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Thank you, Madam  
9 Chair. I thank all the SAs who worked hard on this.  
10 I think we reached a great compromise. We're going to  
11 focus on DOJ data collection, various aspects of how  
12 we quantify crime increases and whether or not there  
13 are shortcomings in that data collection process and  
14 whether or not people are being affected by a rise in  
15 crime that aren't being captured by the statistical  
16 methods currently being used. I don't think there's  
17 any greater civil right than the right to live in  
18 peace, take your kids to the park, walk on the street,  
19 run a business; and, right now, that fundamental civil  
20 right is suffering in many places in this country.  
21 It's disproportionately affecting minorities, and I'm  
22 very happy to move forward with this project.

23 CHAIR CANTU: I would add that we're  
24 looking both for shortcomings and for best practices.  
25 Other than that, that was a very succinct

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 description. Questions?

2

3 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Call the question,  
4 Madam Chair.

5 CHAIR CANTU: Call the question then.  
6 We're ready to vote. Commissioner Adams, how do you  
7 vote on the Briefing Paper on U.S. Department of  
8 Justice Use of Data and the Impact on Racial  
9 Minorities?

10 COMMISSIONER ADAMS: Aye.

11 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Adegbile.

12 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Any.

13 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Gilchrist.

14 COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: Aye.

15 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Heriot.

16 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I vote yes.

17 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kirsanow.

18 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

19 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Kladney.

20 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: No.

21 CHAIR CANTU: I abstain. The motion  
22 passes.

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: You didn't call for my  
24 vote.

25 CHAIR CANTU: Oh, I'm sorry.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: You didn't call for my  
2 vote.

3 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Yaki --

4 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I mean, seriously?  
5 Seriously?

6 CHAIR CANTU: I'm doing it again? Really?

7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I know you were, like,  
8 moving really fast.

9 CHAIR CANTU: Commissioner Yaki, surprise  
10 me with your vote.

11 COMMISSIONER YAKI: You know, I mean, I'm  
12 sort of interested in the new and expansive definition  
13 of civil rights as enunciated by Commissioner Adams  
14 because it goes to a very progressive definition of  
15 the kind of rights that exist, the rights to live in  
16 safe and secure housing, the right to access  
17 meaningful work, all sorts of things that can be  
18 implicated by what Commissioner Adams said.

19 Notwithstanding that, I actually don't  
20 believe that he believes in any of this stuff, so I'm  
21 voting no.

22 CHAIR CANTU: And while I'm abstaining, I  
23 support both of your caucuses and both of your  
24 concepts because you did have a full and thorough  
25 discussion of this topic and you did work toward

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 compromise. So this is progress, folks. We've made a  
2 difficult topic into something that's more  
3 understandable and more easy to proceed, so thanks to  
4 everyone for this. I abstain, but the motion does  
5 pass.

6 So does that resolve the topic of putting  
7 both into effect? My understanding is that we are  
8 fulfilling the vote that carried on both topics being  
9 passed today. Noting the objection that Commissioner  
10 Kladney made, then both the Briefing Report and the  
11 Enforcement Report have been voted by majority today.

12 Now we will turn to Staff Director  
13 Morales. Mr. Morales, could we hear from you about  
14 our Staff Director's report?

15 MR. MORALES: Thank you, Madam Chair. In  
16 the interest of time, I have nothing further to add  
17 than what's already contained in the report. I'm  
18 available to discuss with any commissioner any item in  
19 the report that they may have a question about.

20 I would like to take a moment, Madam  
21 Chair, to acknowledge the work of the staff on the  
22 media outreach for the 65th year anniversary of the  
23 Commission. Despite recent challenges in selecting  
24 civil rights topics to investigate, the Commission has  
25 had a distinguished history and body of work to be

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 proud of at this juncture. In particular, I want to  
2 acknowledge the work of our Director of Media and  
3 Public Affairs, Angelia Rorison. Ang, as we all know  
4 her, has done a wonderful job of bringing attention to  
5 the 65th year anniversary of USCCR. Thank you, Ang.

6 Lastly, I want to call attention to the  
7 retirement of Carolyn Allen. Carolyn was instrumental  
8 in opening the then Midwestern Regional Office in  
9 Chicago in 1991 and since then has served as a steady  
10 and effective staff member supporting the Regional  
11 Programs Unit until her retirement this past May.  
12 Although her contributions to the unit success in  
13 achieving the mission of supporting the agency's  
14 advisory committees cannot be understated, Carolyn's  
15 latest contribution to the agency was how she opened  
16 her loving heart to all and consistently demonstrated  
17 great concern for others. She always looked out and  
18 ensured the well-being of her fellow co-workers, first  
19 at Chicago as a staff assistant and as the staff dealt  
20 with a personal challenge in her own, but, eventually,  
21 throughout the entire unit, as rapid change left many  
22 feeling uncertain. Throughout the unit's growth and  
23 development, Carolyn was always the person people  
24 turned to for support or simply be a sounding board.

25 Certainly, a lasting memory that Carol

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 leaves with all the staff of the Regional Programs  
2 Unit and headquarters were her Friday emails. Every  
3 week throughout the pandemic, they would have a simple  
4 subject line, food for thought. In it, she would  
5 share a personal reflection, prayer, or positive  
6 saying in a way that only Carolyn could. Throughout  
7 those uncertain early days of the pandemic, Carolyn's  
8 food for thought was a consistent hug we all looked  
9 for. We thank you and wish you well, Carolyn.

10 Thank you, Madam Chair. I have nothing  
11 further.

12 CHAIR CANTU: That was --

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Chair, this is  
14 Commissioner Yaki.

15 CHAIR CANTU: Yes, Commissioner Yaki.

16 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I would like to ask  
17 that we join in a impromptu resolution of thanks to  
18 Carolyn and for all that she's done for the  
19 Commission.

20 CHAIR CANTU: All right. I support it.  
21 Do we need a formal motion and a second for that to  
22 happen?

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Sure. Why not? I  
24 move that the Commission send a resolution of support  
25 and thanks to Carolyn for her contribution to the U.S.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14TH ST., N.W., STE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 Commission on Civil Rights and to the people of this  
2 country.

3 COMMISSIONER GILCHRIST: I second that,  
4 Madam Chair. Stephen Gilchrist.

5 CHAIR CANTU: And I'll call a quick  
6 question and call for a vote. Do we unanimously  
7 support the congratulations in the form of this  
8 resolution? All say aye.

9 (Chorus of ayes.)

10 CHAIR CANTU: Congratulations to Carolyn.  
11 We won't miss you because we'll see you in our office  
12 every day, the impact that you had on us. Always  
13 positive. Thank you so much.

14 Any other items, Staff Director?

15 MR. MORALES: No, Madam Chair.

16 CHAIR CANTU: Thank you. That concludes  
17 the business of the agenda for today's USCCR. If  
18 there's nothing further, I hereby adjourn the meeting  
19 at 10:05 Central, which is 11:05 Eastern Time. We are  
20 adjourned. Thank you.

21 (Whereupon, the above-entitled matter went  
22 off the record at 11:05 a.m.)

23

24

25