

Disclaimer for Rough Real-Time Transcripts

“Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.”

U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS

+ + + + +

MEETING **UNEDITED**

+ + + + +

FRIDAY, NOVEMBER 18, 2016

+ + + + +

The Commission convened in Suite 1150 at
1331 Pennsylvania Avenue, Northwest, Washington, D.C.
at 10:00 a.m., Martin R. Castro, Chairman, presiding.

PRESENT:

MARTIN R. CASTRO, Chairman

PATRICIA TIMMONS-GOODSON, Vice Chair

ROBERTA ACHTENBERG, Commissioner

GAIL HERIOT, Commissioner

PETER N. KIRSANOW, Commissioner

DAVID KLADNEY, Commissioner

KAREN K. NARASAKI, Commissioner

MICHAEL YAKI, Commissioner*

MAURO MORALES, Staff Director

MAUREEN RUDOLPH, General Counsel

* *Present via telephone*

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

STAFF PRESENT:

WARIGIA BOWMAN*

TERESSA BROOKS*

GAVIN BROWN*

DONNA BUDNICK, Michigan SAC Chair*

MATTHEW DIAL

PAMELA DUNSTON, Chief, ASCD

SIABHAN HAWKINS, Intern, OGC

JENNIFER HEPLER, Parliamentarian

TINALOUISE MARTIN, Director, OM*

DAVID MUSSATT, Director, RPCU*

MICHELE RAMEY*

JUANDA SMITH*

BRIAN WALCH

MELISSA WOJNAROSKI, MWRO*

COMMISSIONER ASSISTANTS PRESENT:

SHERYL COZART

ALEC DEULL

JASON LAGRIA

CARISSA MULDER

AMY ROYCE

ALISON SOMIN

KIMBERLY TOLHURST

IRENA VIDULOVIC

NEAL R. GROSSCOURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

A G E N D A

I. APPROVAL OF AGENDA.....4

II. BUSINESS MEETING

 A. PROGRAM PLANNING

 Vote and Discussion on FY17 Statutory.....6
 Enforcement Report

 Vote and Discussion on Native American....8
 Heritage Month Statement

 Vote and Discussion on Dakota Access11
 Pipeline Statement

 B. STATE ADVISORY COMMITTEES

 State Advisory Committee Appointments

 Arkansas.....20

 Pennsylvania.....21

 Ohio.....23

 Iowa.....26

 C. MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONS

 Staff Director's Report.....28

III. ADJOURN MEETING.....30

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

P R O C E E D I N G S

(10:00 a.m.)

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: This meeting will come to order. This is a meeting of the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights. We are meeting here on November 18th commencing at 10 a.m. at the offices of the Civil Rights Commission at 1331 Pennsylvania Avenue NW in Washington, D.C.

I am Chairman Marty Castro. Commissioners who are present with me here at the meeting are Vice Chair Timmons-Goodson; Commissioners Kirsanow, Kladney, Achtenberg, Heriot, and Narasaki. Participating by telephone is Commissioner Yaki. A quorum of the Commissioners is present. Is the court reporter present? Yes, she is. Is the staff director present?

MR. MORALES: Yes, I am.

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. So the meeting will now come to order. The first item is the approval of the agenda.

I. Approval of Agenda

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I know we're going to have some amendments, but let me first move that we approve the agenda. Is there a second?

COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Second.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Are there any
2 amendments?

3 (No response.)

4 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I know we have to add two
5 statements. I will entertain a motion that we add for
6 consideration a statement on the Dakota Access Pipeline
7 as well as a statement on Native American History Month.
8 Is there a motion on that?

9 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: So moved.

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Is there a second?

11 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: I second.

12 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Are there any
13 further amendments?

14 (No response.)

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Hearing none, I move
16 that we approve the agenda as amended. All in favor,
17 say aye.

18 (Chorus of ayes.)

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Any opposed?

20 (No response.)

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Any abstentions?

22 (No response.)

23 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. So first item is
24 a discussion and vote on the outline and timeline and
25 discovery plan for the fiscal year 2017 Statutory

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Enforcement Plan -- I am sorry, report.

2 **II. Business Meeting: Program Planning**

3 **Vote and Discussion on FY17 Statutory Enforcement**

4 **Report**

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Any folks want to make
6 a motion for discussion purposes?

7 MR. MORALES: I move to adopt.

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Is there a second?

9 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: I second.

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Discussion? Go
11 ahead.

12 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: I will begin
13 the discussion by observing that our staff counsel has
14 done -- and others have done a tremendous amount of work
15 on this, and I especially appreciate the manner in which
16 she has addressed the concerns that have been expressed
17 throughout, and for me, I -- I think it looks good.

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Others?

19 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Chairman, I
20 just want to --

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner
22 Achtenberg?

23 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: -- comment on
24 that. I think it was an extraordinary amount of work
25 and work well done, so I want to add my congratulations.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Any other comments from
2 Commissioners?

3 (No response.)

4 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: If not, I will do a roll
5 call vote.

6 Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

7 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot,
9 how do you vote?

10 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I am going to
11 abstain on this one.

12 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Commissioner
13 Narasaki, how do you vote?

14 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,
16 how do you vote?

17 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner
19 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

20 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how
22 do you vote?

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I vote yes, but I
24 would just like to say that I can barely understand
25 anyone on this call.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, we just have the
2 same problem back with you. We will have them check
3 the -- could you check the -- oh, I am sorry, someone
4 is looking into it already Commissioner Yaki. He
5 cannot hear us well, and he just came back a bit garbled
6 as well.

7 Madam Vice Chair, how do you vote?

8 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

9 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I vote yes, so it is
10 seven yeses and one abstention. The discovery plan
11 passes.

12 We now move on to a vote and discussion on
13 the Native American Heritage Month statement.

14 **II. Business Meeting: Program Planning**
15 **Vote and Discussion on Native American Heritage Month**
16 **Statement**

17 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Could we get a motion
18 for discussion?

19 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: So moved.

20 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Is there a second?

21 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Second.

22 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Anybody have any
23 discussion here? Can I get a copy of that?

24 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Mr. Chair?

25 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: I just want to
2 note that there were two typos that were corrected since
3 we had circulated this statement.

4 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay.

5 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: It's in your
6 quote on the last page, spelling out "U.S." to "United
7 States" and fixing it so it is "Native Americans."

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. And I think that
9 was -- those were fixed, right?

10 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

11 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, okay. Any
12 questions?

13 (No response.)

14 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Hearing none, then we
15 will vote on the motion. Let me do a roll call vote
16 on this. Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

17 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot,
19 how do you vote?

20 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Narasaki,
22 how do you vote?

23 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes, and
24 hopefully, the motion includes asking -- directing
25 staff to go ahead and issue it.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Oh, of course. It is
2 always --

3 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Okay.

4 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: -- given, yes. They
5 will issue a press release along with this.

6 Commissioner Kladney, how do you vote?

7 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner
9 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

10 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

11 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how
12 do you vote?

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I think you just asked
14 me how I voted, so I will say "Yes."

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay.

16 (Laughter.)

17 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: That is a man who has a
18 lot of faith in --

19 COMMISSIONER YAKI: It sounds like I am in
20 the back room of a rock concert.

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, we're having the
22 exact same problem with you, but tech people are looking
23 into it right now.

24 Commissioner -- Madam Vice Chair, how do
25 you vote?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

2 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I vote yes, so we
3 have unanimous passage, and our staff will issue an
4 appropriate press release to circulate that to the
5 public. Thank you.

6 We now move on to a discussion and vote on
7 the Dakota Access Pipeline statement.

8 **II. Business Meeting: Program Planning**

9 **Vote and Discussion on Dakota Access Pipeline Statement**

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I will entertain a
11 motion for discussion purposes.

12 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: So moved.

13 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Is there a second?

14 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Second.

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. And discussion?
16 Any questions?

17 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Are we sure we want
18 to say something like "The pipeline also poses a threat
19 to the water supply"? I mean, I don't know how we as
20 a Commission know that.

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: How about "could pose a
22 threat"?

23 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Possibly.

24 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Is that the -- is that
25 the --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: The pipeline is
2 supposed to go over the river, and pipelines have been
3 known to leak going over rivers from time to time.

4 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Is that the
5 only concern you have, Commissioner Heriot?

6 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Can I --

7 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Narasaki,
8 go right ahead.

9 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes, so I
10 actually watched an interview of the owner of the
11 pipeline, and his company actually has the worst record
12 in terms of all companies who do this kind of work for
13 leaks, and even many of the recent projects that his
14 company has done have resulted in numerous leaks, so
15 there is actually a rational concern that this could
16 result in leaks.

17 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: That's not the same
18 as a threat to the water supply.

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Any -- what
20 other questions do you have, Commissioner? Anybody?

21 If not, then I will call it for a vote.

22 Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

23 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Abstain.

24 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot,
25 how do you vote?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No.

2 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Narasaki,
3 how do you vote?

4 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,
6 how do you vote?

7 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner
9 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

10 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

11 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how
12 do you vote?

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

14 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. You sound like
15 Darth Vader. Madam Vice Chair, how do you vote?

16 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

17 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I vote yes, so we
18 have six yeses, one abstention, and one no. The
19 statement passes, with directions to our staff to
20 appropriately issue this to the public via press
21 release.

22 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Maybe Michael
23 should try to call in again.

24 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, have our tech
25 people figured that issue out yet? It's on a -- so even

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 if he dials in, it won't make a difference? No? Okay.

2 Commissioner Yaki, if you can hear me,
3 while this may not solve the problem, could you hang
4 up and try to dial in again? Hopefully, it will clear
5 up, but it sounds like it is something that we cannot
6 control from here.

7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I'm sorry, what?

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I'm going to have your
9 special assistant text you.

10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I can barely -- did
11 you -- ?

12 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Your special assistant
13 is texting you, if you can even hear that, to ask you
14 to hang up and dial in again.

15 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Okay. Sorry, hang up
16 and dial again, okay, got it.

17 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Correct. We will wait
18 for you to dial on before we proceed.

19 (Pause.)

20 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, have
21 you dialed back in yet?

22 (No response.)

23 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay.

24 (Pause.)

25 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Kim, was there a way you

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 can dial in on your phone, and then maybe we could bring
2 it near a mic or something? But that might cause
3 feedback though, wouldn't it? Yeah, nevermind. Kim,
4 could you find out if he is trying to dial in?

5 PARTICIPANT: He is trying to dial in.

6 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Oh, he is? Okay.

7 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Can you plug the
8 phone into your board?

9 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Why don't we do this?
10 While we wait for him to dial in, do you think we could
11 just ask the Chair of the Michigan Advisory Committee
12 to begin the presentation? I mean, there is nothing
13 we need to vote on there.

14 Chairman Donna Budnick? Is she on the
15 phone yet, Michigan State Advisory Chair? Yeah, she
16 is not on either, so we'll just continue -- oh, are you?

17 MS. BUDNICK: I am sorry --

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Okay. Are you
19 on a speakerphone, Madam Chair? If you could speak
20 directly into your phone, that would be better. We are
21 getting a little distortion. Madam Chair?

22 MS. BUDNICK: Yes, I am sorry. Yes, there
23 is a bit of distortion, but I am on speakerphone. Do
24 you want me to call back?

25 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yeah, it sounds like she

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 is having the same problem we are having with
2 Commissioner Yaki. Yeah. No, I understand.

3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Well, that did not
4 help at all.

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: No, it does not, and we
6 have the similar problem with the State Advisory
7 Committee Chair. May I suggest if possible, it would
8 be -- if -- I don't know how much we're going to be able
9 to hear the Chair speak, or she hear us. Let's put her
10 off until next month, if possible. Does that work for
11 folks? Yes, well it sounds like it's not something our
12 people can fix here right now.

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Wait, wait, wait,
14 wait, who else -- who just spoke?

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: This is --

16 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Who just spoke?

17 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, this
18 is Chair Castro.

19 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No, no, no, no,
20 someone -- what I am trying to say -- what I am trying
21 to say, Mr. Chair --

22 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes.

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: -- is I think it is
24 your microphone.

25 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I think it's all --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 it is the conference center, the entity that is relaying
2 this to you and you to us, there is a problem there that
3 we cannot deal with here. We also have the Chair of
4 the Michigan State Advisory Committee prepared to make
5 a presentation, but we are having the same
6 communication problem with her that we were having with
7 you, so we are trying to determine whether out of
8 fairness to her that we ask her to, instead of
9 presenting today, which would be very difficult for us
10 to hear her and she to hear us, that we continue this
11 hopefully to the next meeting, where -- wait, what are
12 you going to say?

13 Oh wait, so we're going to reset all the
14 mics here? Okay. Nevermind. We have a better -- we
15 have another plan. We're going -- we're going to hang
16 up, and we're going to collectively call back in, so
17 please --

18 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Well, I hear Pam just
19 fine.

20 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Really?

21 (Laughter.)

22 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Well, and she doesn't
23 even have a mic. Okay. Well, we are going to -- how
24 about now, Commissioner Yaki? Do you hear me better
25 now?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 (No response.)

2 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Let's -- we're going to
3 hang up and re-dial in. We're going to reboot on our
4 end.

5 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Wait, am I hanging up
6 again?

7 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: You hang on. We're
8 going to hang up.

9 PARTICIPANT: We are hanging up and trying
10 again.

11 COMMISSIONER YAKI: That I hear. It is
12 really the PA system, because I can hear people off mic
13 fine.

14 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Can you hear me,
15 Kladney?

16 (No response.)

17 (Whereupon, the meeting went off the
18 record at 10:15 a.m. and resumed at 10:16 a.m.)

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Madam Chair of Michigan
20 SAC, we're sorry about the communication problem. We
21 are going to coordinate with your office to present with
22 -- present for us perhaps at the next meeting or the
23 meeting after that at a time when it is convenient for
24 you because today, we're not going to be able to hear
25 you well, nor will you be able to hear our questions

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 well.

2 We apologize for the inconvenience. You
3 are free to stay on the line and try to decipher the
4 rest of the meeting, but we will follow up with your
5 office to reschedule a presentation. Thank you.
6 Commissioner Yaki, you're just going to have to stay
7 on, and we're all going to have to make do to try the
8 best to communicate with one another.

9 **II. Business Meeting: State Advisory Committees**

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: So now I will move on to
11 the State Advisory Committee appointments. Today we
12 have four State Advisory Committees to consider, so let
13 me start with the first one.

14 **II. Business Meeting: State Advisory Committee**

15 **Appointments: Arkansas**

16 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I am going to make a
17 motion that the Commission appoints the following
18 individuals to the Arkansas State Advisory Committee
19 based upon the recommendation of our staff director:
20 Warigia Bowman, Erika Benedicto, Jimmy Cline, Diana
21 Gonzalez Worthen, Valerie Hunt, Carol Johnson, Cynthia
22 Nance, Xavier Medina, Michael Cantrell, Josh Mostyn,
23 Robert Steinbuch, Lee Rudofsky, Sean Teuton and Brian
24 Vandiver.

25 Pursuant to this motion, the Commission

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 appoints Warigia Bowman as Chair of the Arkansas State
2 Advisory Committee. These members will serve as
3 uncompensated government employees. Under this
4 motion, the Commission authorizes the staff director
5 to execute the appropriate paperwork for the
6 appointments. Do I have a motion -- I mean, I have a
7 motion. Do I have a second?

8 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Second.

9 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Any discussion?
10 (No response.)

11 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Hearing none, I will
12 call the roll call.

13 Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

14 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: No.

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot,
16 how do you vote?

17 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Narasaki,
19 how do you vote?

20 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,
22 how do you vote?

23 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

24 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner
25 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

2 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how
3 do you vote?

4 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner
6 Timmons-Goodson, how do you vote?

7 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I vote yes. That is
9 seven yeses and one no. The Arkansas State Advisory
10 Committee passes.

11 **II. Business Meeting: State Advisory Committee**

12 **Appointments: Pennsylvania**

13 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I am now going to make
14 a motion that the Commission appoints the following
15 individuals to the Pennsylvania State Advisory
16 Committee based upon the recommendation of our staff
17 director: Patricia Hopson-Shelton, Marcus Allen,
18 Christopher Armstrong, Juan Baez, Deborah Gordon
19 Klehr, Steven Irwin, Julia Kernan, Romana Lee-Akiyama,
20 Blake Lynch, Angela McIver, Yvette Nunez, David
21 Osbourne, William Rothman, Riya Saha Shah, Stewart
22 Wiener.

23 Pursuant to this motion, the Commission
24 appoints Patricia Hopson-Shelton as Chair of the
25 Pennsylvania State Advisory Committee. These members

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 will serve as uncompensated government employees.
2 Under this motion, the Commission authorizes the staff
3 director to execute the appropriate paperwork for the
4 appointments. Do I have a second?

5 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Second.

6 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Any discussion?

7 (No response.)

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Hearing none,
9 Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

10 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: No.

11 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot,
12 how do you vote?

13 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes, but just
14 barely.

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Narasaki,
16 how do you vote?

17 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,
19 how do you vote?

20 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner
22 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

23 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

24 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how
25 do you vote?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes, but not barely.

2 (Laughter.)

3 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Madam Vice Chair, how do
4 you vote?

5 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

6 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I vote yes, so we
7 have seven yeses and one no. The state passes.

8 **II. Business Meeting: State Advisory Committee**

9 **Appointments: Ohio**

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I am now going to make
11 a motion that the Commission appoints the following
12 individuals to the Ohio State Advisory Committee based
13 upon the recommendation of the staff director: Diane
14 Citrino, Cassandra Bledsoe, Deborah
15 Burstion-Donbraye, Dan Carter, Subodh Chandra,
16 Catherine Crosby, Sharon Davies, Dilip Doshi, David
17 Forte, Scott Gerber, Emerald Hernandez, Kevin
18 McDermott, Robert Salem, Lee Strang, Mark Strasser,
19 Edith Thrower, and David Tryon.

20 Pursuant to this motion, the Commission
21 appoints Diane Citrino as the Chair of the Ohio State
22 Advisory Committee. These members will serve as
23 uncompensated government employees. Under this
24 motion, the Commission authorizes the staff director
25 to execute the appropriate paperwork for the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 appointments. Is there a second?

2 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Second.

3 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner
4 Achtenberg seconds. Any questions?

5 (No response.)

6 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. I will call the
7 vote.

8 Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

9 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Abstain.

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot,
11 how do you vote?

12 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No.

13 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Narasaki,
14 how do you vote?

15 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

16 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,
17 how do you vote?

18 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner
20 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

21 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

22 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how
23 do you vote?

24 (No response.)

25 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 do you vote?

2 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I'm sorry. Yes, yes.

3 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay.

4 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Madam Vice Chair?

6 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

7 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: How do you vote? Yes?

8 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

9 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Hold on a second. What
10 was that? Okay. I made a mistake in the reading. Dan
11 Carter's name should not be on there. He did not submit
12 his paperwork, so just for the record, Dan Carter's name
13 should be stricken.

14 And then I vote yes. Does that change
15 anybody's vote, by the way?

16 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Wait, wait,
17 what?

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: In the list of names
19 that I read, I read Dan Carter as a member of the
20 committee. His name should not have been on there. He
21 did not submit his paperwork, so is everybody clear on
22 that? So the motion passes without Mr. Carter, six
23 votes yes, one no, and one abstention.

24 **II. Business Meeting: State Advisory Committee**

25 **Appointments: Iowa**

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. I am now going to
2 make a motion to appoint the following individuals to
3 the Iowa State Advisory Committee based upon the
4 recommendation of our staff director: Emma
5 Aquino-Nemecek, Genevieve Babecki, Nancy Boettger, Joe
6 Coulter, Richard Dedor, Art Figueroa, Juan Garcia,
7 Anthony Gaughan -- Gaughan, Gaughan, sorry about that
8 -- Sheryl Leonard, Cynthia Miller, Angela
9 Onwuachi-Willig, Allan Max Richards, Sal Valadez, and
10 Zach Whiting.

11 Pursuant to this motion, the Commission
12 appoints Joe Coulter as the Chair of the Iowa State
13 Advisory Committee. These members will serve as
14 uncompensated government employees. Under this
15 motion, the Commission authorizes the staff director
16 to execute the appropriate paperwork for the
17 appointments. Is there a second?

18 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Second.

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: A second from
20 Commissioner Achtenberg. Any discussion?

21 (No response.)

22 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Seeing none, I will call
23 the question for a vote.

24 Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

25 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: No.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot,
2 how do you vote?

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No.

4 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Narasaki,
5 how do you vote?

6 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

7 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,
8 how do you vote?

9 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Abstain.

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner
11 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

12 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

13 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how
14 do you vote?

15 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

16 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Madam Vice Chair, how do
17 you vote?

18 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I vote yes, so we
20 have one, two, three, four, five yeses, two noes, and
21 an abstention. The package passes.

22 And that terminates our State Advisory
23 Committee votes. Now we have a management and
24 operations report from our staff director. Mr. Staff
25 Director, you have the floor.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 **II. BUSINESS MEETING: MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONS: STAFF**

2 **DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

3 MR. MORALES: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

4 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: You're welcome.

5 MR. MORALES: I of course have the staff
6 director's report, and I can obviously talk to you about
7 that individually. It is in there.

8 What I do want to talk to you about are a
9 couple items. One has to do in particular to the OCRE
10 vacancies in the Office of Civil Rights evaluation. I
11 wanted to inform Commissioners that we made an offer
12 that was accepted for a civil rights analyst, and we
13 have another outstanding offer we have not heard back
14 from.

15 Our detail from USDA has agreed to come and
16 serve the detail, and we are finalizing an announcement
17 with OPM to bring in a Presidential Management Fellow,
18 so we're taking I think some good steps to help staff
19 of OCRE. We are optimistic that we will have it up to
20 speed in the next few months here and weeks, so we are
21 looking forward to that.

22 And I really appreciate the staff, both
23 Tina and of course Maureen, for all their help in
24 getting out the vacancy announcements, doing the
25 interviews. It's a very time-consuming process, so I

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 really appreciate all of them and all their staff and
2 their efforts to get this done.

3 Wanted to let folks know, of course next
4 week is Thanksgiving. I will probably do an early
5 announcement of early dismissal for staff for next week
6 so that they can join their families for the holiday.
7 We are -- we just received a draft of a -- an assessment
8 on the SAC regional offices from our contractor,
9 Optimal Solutions. We are evaluating that, and I will
10 get that to Commissioners as soon as we have an
11 opportunity to -- to go through that with staff.

12 Lastly, I would like to mention that we
13 have a December 2nd tour of the African American Museum.
14 We have invited all staff, including regional staff,
15 to come. Regional staff will make a presentation
16 during the business meeting after the tour, and then
17 I understand there may be some sort of a holiday
18 celebration as well, so we are looking forward to that.

19 And lastly, I will send out a reminder of
20 the schedule for next year's Commission business
21 meetings, and the next one I believe is December -- I
22 am sorry, January --

23 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: The one after the
24 December 2nd meeting?

25 MR. MORALES: Yes, the one after that is

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 -- I just -- I just had it, and it just slipped my mind.
2 I guess I am --

3 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: 13th.

4 MR. MORALES: The 13th, thank you.
5 Friday the 13th, wow, that is interesting.

6 (Laughter.)

7 MR. MORALES: So thank you very much.

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Thank you. Any
9 questions for the staff director?

10 (No response.)

11 **III. Adjourn Meeting**

12 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Seeing none, I hereby
13 adjourn the meeting. It is now 10:27 Eastern Time.
14 Until December 2nd, see you all then.

15 (Whereupon, the above-entitled matter
16 went off the record at 10:27 a.m.)

17

18

19

20