

Disclaimer for Rough Real-Time Transcripts

“Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.”

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS

+ + + + +

MEETING

+ + + + +

FRIDAY, APRIL 11, 2014

+ + + + +

The Commission convened in Suite 1150 at 1331 Pennsylvania Avenue, Northwest, Washington, D.C. at 9:30 a.m., Martin R. Castro, Chairman, presiding.

PRESENT:

MARTIN R. CASTRO, Chairman

ROBERTA ACHTENBERG, Commissioner*

GAIL HERIOT, Commissioner

DAVID KLADNEY, Commissioner*

MICHAEL YAKI, Commissioner*

MARLENE SALLO, Staff Director

* Present via telephone

ALSO PRESENT:

BLAKE AINSWORTH, U.S. GAO

KATHY PEYMAN, U.S. GAO

SHANNON SMITH, U.S. GAO

NEAL R. GROSS
COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

STAFF PRESENT:

MARGARET BUTLER

BARBARA de LA VIEZ, Deputy Director

PAMELA DUNSTON, Chief, ASCD

ALFREDA GREENE

TINALOUISE MARTIN, Director, OM

LENORE OSTROWSKY, Acting Chief, PAU

JOHN RATCLIFFE, Chief, BFD

EILEEN RUDERT

ROREY SMITH, General Counsel, OGC

MICHELE YORKMAN, Director, IT

COMMISSIONER ASSISTANTS PRESENT:

ALEC DEULL

KENESHIA GRANT

CARISSA MULDER

JUANA SILVERIO

ALISON SOMIN

KIMBERLY TOLHURST

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

A-G-E-N-D-A

I. APPROVAL OF AGENDA.....5

II. PROGRAM PLANNING
Discussion of Concept Papers and Future Briefings..5

III. MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONS
Staff Director's Report.....35

IV. STATE ADVISORY COMMITTEE (SAC) APPOINTMENTS
Idaho.....38

V. ADJOURN BRIEFING.....41

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

(9:30 a.m.)

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: All right. We have a
quorum now, so I'm going to gavel this meeting to order.

Good morning, everyone. This is a
business meeting of the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights.
It's taking place today, April 11, 2014. The hour is
now 9:30 exactly and we're meeting at the Commission's
headquarters, 1331 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., in
Washington, D.C.

I'm Chairman Marty Castro. The
Commissioners who are present with me are Commissioner
Heriot. As you can see, our other Commissioners are
participating by phone. They are Commissioner
Achtenberg, Commissioner Kladney and Commissioner
Yaki. We don't believe that Commissioner Kirsanow will
be participating today, but if he does, I'm sure he'll
let us know when he's on the phone.

Is the court reporter present? Yes. We
have a quorum present. Is the staff director present?

MS. SALLO: Present.

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. So the meeting
will now come to order. The first item of course as
always is Approval of the Agenda.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

I. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I approve that we
approve the agenda. Is there a second?

COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Second.

COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Second.

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Are there any
amendments?

(No audible response.)

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Hearing none, let's vote
to approve the agenda. All in favor, say aye?

(Chorus of ayes.)

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Any opposed?

(No audible response.)

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Any abstentions?

(No audible response.)

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. The ayes have it,
unanimously.

So the first item on our agenda is Program
Planning.

II. PROGRAM PLANNING

Discussion of Concept Papers and Future

Briefings

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: We're going to have a
update on various projects. And for that, I will turn

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

1 it over to our staff director who will talk to us about
2 concept papers and future briefings, etcetera.

3 MS. SALLO: Good morning.

4 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Good morning.

5 MS. SALLO: I wanted to first address the
6 submission of concept papers for potential briefings to
7 be scheduled during fiscal year 2015. I wanted to
8 advise everyone that we received a total of 22 concept
9 papers. Those concept papers need to be reviewed by our
10 Office of General Counsel. The concept papers will
11 then be returned to their respective Commissioners with
12 an indication as to whether the concept paper needs to
13 be revised or whether the concept paper -- not revised,
14 but tweaked or whether the concept paper is completely
15 outside the scope of the jurisdiction. And then at that
16 point in time we would ask for the Commissioners to make
17 the necessary changes, if they choose to do so, and then
18 resubmit with the hope that we can have finalization of
19 all of the papers to be considered at the June meeting.

20 I also wanted to remind everyone that we
21 currently have several papers in the pipeline. I know
22 that the sex trafficking and the Arab Muslim paper --
23 the Commissioners were kind enough already to provide
24 us with their edits. Both papers will be submitted for

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 legal sufficiency review with the hope that we can get
2 that completed and returned to the Commissioners for
3 consideration at the May meeting. If that is not
4 possible, then we will definitely target it for the June
5 meeting.

6 In addition, we still have three other
7 briefing papers. That's the NVRA Section 7, the
8 Religious Liberties paper, as well as the Vets and Civil
9 Rights paper. I will be circulating at least one next
10 week for review by the Commissioners, hopefully two, so
11 that we can also put that in queue and start the process.

12 And we continue to work on the Patient
13 Dumping paper. I believe that next week, April 14th,
14 is the deadline for public comments for a statutory
15 enforcement report on a hearing that occurred last
16 month. And I will keep you updated as to where we are
17 at with the drafting of the statutory enforcement
18 report.

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: If I could just
20 interrupt you, Madam Staff Director.

21 The Commissioners on the phone, could you
22 mute your phone? We're getting a little bit of
23 background noise. Thank you.

24 Go ahead.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MS. SALLO: I'm sorry. So that's the
2 concept papers.

3 So then we also have two that are pending.
4 We have the -- well, it's for briefing. It's not
5 papers. I'm sorry. And so those are scheduled for
6 July, as well as a date that needed to be set as it
7 applied to the Stand Your Ground. So first, I want to
8 give you an update on the Stand Your Ground, because it
9 was left to the decision of the Chair and the Staff
10 Director as to which date it would be. Based on the
11 feedback that I received from the Commissioners and
12 their availability and based on the fact that September
13 should not be a month that we travel, because that is
14 when I close out the fiscal year.

15 We are looking to do the Stand your Ground
16 briefing in October. As such, next week on Monday we
17 will be visiting some of the sites in Orlando to try to
18 ascertain which would be the best site for us to hold
19 the briefing. And so I will then circle back and
20 provide that information to the Commissioners. So as
21 it stands, it will have to be in October of this year,
22 the briefing for Stand your Ground.

23 And then we also have the Sexual Harassment
24 briefing that's scheduled for July. So at this point

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

1 in time we've identified speakers and we are also in the
2 process of setting up the process to receive any
3 discovery that we need. So I wanted to provide you with
4 that information as well.

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Thank you, Madam Staff
6 Director. I don't know if there's any questions with
7 that. Actually, I have one.

8 I understand that, Commissioner Heriot,
9 when we approved your initial concept for the July
10 briefing it involved universities and now it's been
11 expanded, to my understanding, to include K through 12
12 in the schools. And I think that that's a little bit
13 of a -- well, a lot of a broad expansion beyond what we
14 had agreed upon. So what I'd like to do is kind of open
15 that for discussion with the other Commissioners. I
16 think it's only fair that, you know, we vote on something
17 in terms of the substantive focus and that that not
18 change dramatically as this appears to have done. And
19 if in fact you do want to include -- I'll give you a
20 chance to talk -- if you do want to include colleges and
21 universities and K through 12 together, then I would
22 suggest we need to re-vote on that, or vote on a separate
23 paper on K through 12.

24 So go ahead and respond and then I'll open

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

(202) 234-4433

1 it up to any other Commissioners that have comments.

2 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: My understanding is
3 it is in the transcript for the meeting, that we did in
4 fact vote on both and that it was mentioned in the
5 meeting, it was clear in the meeting, and that's what
6 we voted on.

7 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: That's not my
8 recollection. I don't know if anyone has any
9 information on that.

10 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Why don't we check
11 the transcript then?

12 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: So is Alison going to go
13 get a copy?

14 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes, she's going to
15 go try to get a copy of it.

16 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: In the interim, do we
17 have any other Commissioners who want to address this
18 issue?

19 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: I do, Mr. Chairman.

20 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, go ahead,
21 Commissioner Kladney.

22 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: My concern is that
23 in the blurb it talks about getting documents from DOJ
24 and I think Department of Education OCR and it talked

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 about misstating the law. There were concerns about
2 misstatement of the law in the new guidance, which I
3 think was in May of 2013, something like that. And also
4 there were concerns about whether it would infringe upon
5 constitutionally-protected speech of the university
6 students, faculty and staff. There was no mention of
7 obtaining documents from all these schools, whether K
8 through 12 or university, and I think that's beyond the
9 scope of the paper because it was -- these two issues,
10 that would be the briefing and then we would do so with
11 government enforcement people, experts on either side
12 of the issue regarding the misstatement of the law on
13 whether it chilled constitutional rights and scholars.
14 I didn't foresee reams and reams of documents coming
15 from nine universities, nor was there any mention of it
16 in the blurb. So I would object to that type of
17 discovery.

18 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Blurbs never
19 contain all of the information about what a briefing
20 does. That's why they're called blurbs. They're
21 usually three sentences long.

22 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Mr. Chairman?

23 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner
24 Achtenberg?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

1 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: (No audible
2 response.)

3 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner
4 Achtenberg? COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Hello?

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Sounded like you were
6 asking to speak.

7 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Mr. Chairman?

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, Commissioner
9 Achtenberg, go ahead.

10 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Hello?

11 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Hello?

12 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: You've got me,
13 Roberta.

14 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Oh, okay.

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Go ahead.

16 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: This is Kladney.

17 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: We can hear you,
18 Commissioner Achtenberg. Can you hear us?

19 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: So we don't have
20 the others?

21 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: I don't think so.
22 Hold on a second.

23 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,
24 can you hear me?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

1 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: (No audible
2 response.)

3 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Well, we're not on mute,
4 so --

5 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: I just messaged
6 Kaneesha. Hopefully she'll get back to me and let me
7 know.

8 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: I thought you
9 stated it very well. I was just going to speak up to
10 concur.

11 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: We can't hear him.

12 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Hello?

13 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Hello?

14 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: We can hear you. Can
15 you hear us?

16 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Hello? Hello?

17 COMMISSIONER YAKI: That was me joining,
18 rejoining.

19 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Well, we're
20 talking to each other. Oh, you can hear us?

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, we can hear you.
22 Can you hear us?

23 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: We can't hear them.

24 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: We can hear you. You

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

1 obviously cannot hear us. They still can't hear us.

2 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: So I just got an
3 email from Marty saying we can hear you.

4 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Right. They can
5 hear us, but we can't hear them.

6 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Right.

7 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: So --

8 MEMBER KLADNEY: I'm going to ask them if
9 we should call back in. Wait a minute.

10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I just did that.

11 MEMBER KLADNEY: Oh, you got us?

12 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes, so it's got to be
13 on their end.

14 MEMBER KLADNEY: Yes, they can hear us.

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Now, I have a question.
16 Do these emails have to be a part of the transcript now?

17 (Laughter.)

18 COMMISSIONER YAKI: So I can't start
19 making colorful comments about technology.

20 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes, I was about
21 to say. No joke, you guys.

22 MEMBER KLADNEY: They can hear us, so let's
23 be quiet and try and see what they want us to do here.

24 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Okay. So they

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

1 said go ahead and discuss because they can hear us.

2 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: So I just told them to go
3 ahead and discuss their points. So let them finish.

4 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: So I was going
5 to ask for recognition from the Chair to express my
6 concurrence with the views as expressed by Commission
7 Kladney.

8 COMMISSIONER YAKI: And I will ask for
9 recognition and virtually receive recognition --

10 (Laughter.)

11 COMMISSIONER YAKI: -- and join my
12 colleagues Commissioners Achtenberg and Kladney with my
13 understanding that the vote had been limited to the
14 university college level and not to K through 12.

15 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: And --

16 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I yield back the floor
17 to the virtual other Commissioners.

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I just texted them to let
19 them know we're going to take the system down and reboot
20 it.

21 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Mr. Chairman, I
22 was just going to inquire of Commissioner Yaki whether
23 or not is concurrence extends to the question that
24 Commissioner Kladney expressed with regard to polling

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

1 the nine university campuses, none of which was made
2 mention of in the concept paper and seems like quite an
3 extension beyond the government --

4 (Whereupon, at 9:43 a.m. off the record
5 until 9:49 a.m.)

6 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. We're going to go
7 back on the record.

8 I have been handed portions of the
9 transcript of the meeting where we voted on this topic,
10 and the motion as it was put forward by me. Apparently
11 we couldn't find the transcript exactly where the issue
12 came up, but Commissioner Heriot surmises she sent us
13 an email indicating that she was going to add K through
14 12 because in the motion it says, as we were replacing
15 the ADA concept paper with this one, quote, "And in
16 addition, comma, that we would replace the ADA Online
17 Accessibility concept paper previously approved by the
18 Commission as a briefing topic and replace it with a
19 topic presented by Commissioner Heriot on sexual
20 harassment and higher education, period. And also she
21 amended that to add K through 12. So that is the motion.
22 Is there a second?"

23 And it was seconded by Commissioner Yaki.
24 And the vote occurred. Let's see, we don't have the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

(202) 234-4433

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

1 vote here, but obviously -- yes, Commissioner Yaki voted
2 yes; Commissioner Kladney, yes; Commissioner Heriot,
3 yes; Commissioner Achtenberg, yes; Kirsanow, yes; the
4 Vice-Chair, yes; myself, yes.

5 So that does address the K through 12
6 expansion. I'm not sure if it addresses the issues that
7 you raised, Commissioner Kladney, so -- and that is
8 about the -- I think you were talking about subpoenas.

9 MEMBER KLADNEY: The discovery, yes.

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes.

11 MEMBER KLADNEY: The discovery was --
12 because this is how I felt, was it was a new guidance
13 and we were going to look into whether it followed the
14 current law; and it was the Harris case. And we were
15 going to see how DOJ and the Office of Civil Rights of
16 DOE was enforcing it by getting their documents. We
17 weren't going to go to nine universities and nine school
18 districts and get all their documents regarding sexual
19 harassment or anything like that. That is not what this
20 blurb said. That was never mentioned. And I object to
21 any of that discovery. And I make a motion that we not
22 conduct that discovery. We don't need discovery from
23 DOJ and DOE Office of Civil Rights.

24 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Is there a second to that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 motion?

2 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Second.

3 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Discussion?

4 Commissioner Heriot?

5 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Let's see, how can I
6 put this?

7 MEMBER KLADNEY: Can she turn her mic on,
8 please?

9 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, you need to put your
10 mic on.

11 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Sorry. I'm trying
12 to think of a polite way to put this. We tried to come
13 up with a bipartisan set of issues that we would address.
14 And the Chairman told Commissioner Kirsanow and I that
15 we would be able to pick a topic. And the idea was that
16 we would cooperate in your topics and in return you would
17 let us have a topic as the minority. The
18 first thing that happened to unravel this deal was that
19 Commissioner Kladney objected somehow, somewhere to
20 something and had to undo the entire deal. Instead of
21 the topic that we had selected for the majority, he
22 wanted a different topic and we had to unravel that deal,
23 recreate the deal. And this is basically an unraveling
24 of a deal after you've gotten the votes. I object to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 this greatly.

2 We had two people come in from the GAO
3 yesterday and talk to me, and they're here today. And
4 I mistakenly told them that the Commission had been
5 doing reasonably well in cooperating on topics. I
6 hereby withdraw that statement. I find this to be
7 outrageous that after we have worked on this thing --
8 and let's face it, ladies and gentlemen, we have not
9 turned out as many reports as we should. But now we're
10 unraveling the deal and that's going to make it that much
11 more difficult to turn out good reports. I am outraged.

12 MEMBER KLADNEY: May I speak, Mr.
13 Chairman?

14 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Go ahead, Commissioner
15 Kladney.

16 MEMBER KLADNEY: In regards to the
17 changing of topics, it was not my idea, nor did I put
18 the idea forward of switching topics, Commission
19 Heriot. What occurred was the Office of General
20 Counsel scratched the topic that we had, our topic, my
21 topic that I put forward, and we had to come up with
22 another one. They said that there was no -- it wasn't
23 the federal question in the topic that we put forth. We
24 didn't say that you had to put forth a different topic.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

1 You did that of your own discretion. That was not
2 anything that was done at the Commission level with the
3 Commissioners or with the staff. So I want the record
4 to reflect that. It was the Office of General Counsel
5 that required our side to obtain a new topic, which we
6 did. You at your own discretion decided to change the
7 topic and put forward this subject in this blurb in this
8 form.

9 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot?

10 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay. Number one,
11 the idea is a deal if we select topics as a package. The
12 original idea was that the conservatives would select
13 a topic that they could agree to from the list that the
14 majority had submitted and vice versa. And so it went
15 from we had picked the topic from your list that we
16 thought was the best and you guys had picked a topic from
17 our list that you thought was the best. When you
18 switched to a topic that you liked better -- and let me
19 add the OGC does not tell you which topics are with our
20 jurisdiction and which are not. The staff works for the
21 Commission. You do not work for the staff. So, no, I
22 believe that topic was within our jurisdiction and you
23 obviously though so, too, since you voted for it. So
24 that was an unraveled deal.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Let me add that when the current
2 Commissioners came on board two years ago, we scratched
3 several topics that were in the pipeline where reports
4 were being already prepared. That's why we don't have
5 as many reports as we should have, I believe. You know,
6 we're just putting ourselves in a position now where
7 we're going to create a report that is doing no good
8 whatsoever. It is something that we voted on. The
9 blurb was never intended to be a list of all the
10 discovery options. If you had wanted to vote on the
11 discovery, then you could have done that, but it's
12 months, months, months later now. To now go back and
13 say we need to start again is just silly.

14 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot --

15 MEMBER KLADNEY: I would ask the --

16 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Mr. Castro?

17 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,
18 let me just insert here a second.

19 We're not changing your topic. I mean, I
20 think you've proven to us that there's an expansion here
21 to K through 12, so that's the topic. We're not
22 changing the topic. The issue I guess is the scope of
23 the discovery. I'm going to have Commission Yaki and
24 then I'll send it back to you, Commission Heriot.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Commissioner Yaki, go ahead.

2 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes, I am not going to
3 try and respond to everything that Commissioner Heriot
4 said, but I will say that as the current, with the
5 exception of Commissioner Kirsanow, who's not present,
6 most-senior member of the Commission, there are some
7 things that she did raise that I need to respond to.

8 First, while I gladly accede to
9 Commissioner Heriot's correctness in what topic was
10 that we voted for, there is nowhere in that topic and
11 nowhere in any topic that we have done that completely --
12 unless it was specifically mentioned and specifically
13 discussed and specifically voted on, as we did, for
14 example, in the Stand Your Ground investigation
15 discussion, mention of how we would conduct specific
16 discovery. And that is not usually -- that is not up
17 to the discretion of staff to do. This is not just
18 directly in discovery. This is specific directed and
19 specific university discovery. And I would
20 just like to remind -- not remind, but to educate the
21 members of the audience who might be hearing this
22 slightly -- a history of what the Commission may or may
23 not have done, that this is not something that is usual
24 or normal. And if it is the desire of Commissioner

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Heriot to direct discovery at these particular
2 universities, then that is something that, yes, the
3 Commission can decide on, but the Commission should at
4 least vote on, which we have not been given the
5 opportunity to do.

6 Upon looking at the list of the
7 universities, I am somewhat -- I don't want to say
8 suspicious. I would just simply say that we have in the
9 past had a situation where we became entangled with the
10 privacy and confidentiality issues with universities in
11 the past and to the point where a Commissioner had to
12 be told by the General Counsel to give up that data after
13 we had completed the report because it violated the
14 confidentiality provisions; which took months and
15 months and months, by the way, to negotiate with these
16 universities.

17 So when you go in this manner, when you
18 target specific universities and you're targeting
19 potentially confidential data that they may possess, I
20 can tell you firsthand that that alone, if I recall
21 correctly from that one briefing that we had, required
22 months of negotiation and discussion with these
23 universities, which means that the likelihood of
24 anything happening in July is unlikely and unrealistic

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to begin with.

2 Secondly, as I said before, that was a
3 product of specific discussion and both by the
4 Commission as to those specific universities in that
5 particular case -- and in this opportunity we were not
6 given that opportunity, nor given the opportunity to
7 contact or interview universities to see whether they
8 were even predisposed to even negotiating with us in any
9 timely manner or not, not that anything that would
10 involve them would require their permission.
11 Obviously that's not the case, but certainly would go
12 a long way towards ascertaining what kind of a fight we
13 may or may not have with regard to discovery on these
14 kinds of issues.

15 So, you know, with that being said, I would
16 strongly object to any discovery in any particular
17 university mandated by any Commissioner as a part of a
18 report. And as to what a deal is or not, you know, as
19 frequently the lone Commissioner in the minority on this
20 Commission for a period of five to six years, the notion
21 that I would have complete carte blanche over any topic
22 that may have been a part of any deal with the full
23 majority, which I was in the minority, is something that
24 would have happened only my dreams. Every topic that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 I tried to get through, every topic that I tried to
2 compose, every topic that I did manage to get through
3 was controlled solely, completely and totally by the
4 staff director in attempts by me to do anything
5 otherwise were met with resistance and outright
6 hostility by both staff and by the other Commissioners.

7 So I would say that in this instance we've
8 been more than fair. We've been more than open. We are
9 just simply stating that in this particular instance,
10 as in any other instance that we might have, that the
11 issue of how this would be conducted, how this would be
12 put together is at the discretion of the staff. And if
13 the Commissioner has specific concerns or ideas or
14 direction in which he or she wants it to go, they can
15 bring that up specifically to the Commission and the
16 Commission will specifically vote and thereby direct
17 staff in order to conduct it.

18 In this case we have not done that with
19 these nine universities proposed by Commissioner Heriot
20 and I think that therefore is out of order.

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. So, Commissioner
22 Heriot will speak next and then the staff director.

23 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Okay. Coming from
24 Commissioner Yaki the notion that discovery is bad a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

1 thing, Commissioner Yaki, the one thing that we have
2 agreed on consistently in the past --

3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Wait, wait, wait.

4 We --

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki,
6 please let her finish.

7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No, no, no.
8 Seriously, what do you mean discovery is a bad thing?
9 Go through the entire transcript of what I just said,
10 Commissioner Heriot. I never said anything of the
11 sort. I didn't say discovery is a bad thing. I said
12 this particular discovery, this particular narrowing
13 and specifying of certain universities is not something
14 we discussed on. It's not something that we voted on
15 and it is and has in the past been the subject of
16 extensive negotiation and time-consuming negotiations
17 between the Commission and universities.

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Commissioner
19 Heriot, please continue.

20 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Again, the one thing
21 that Commissioner Yaki and I have agreed on consistently
22 in the past is that having briefings that don't produce
23 actual data are not good, that we really ought to be
24 doing exactly what then majority leader Lyndon Baines

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

(202) 234-4433

1 Johnson said that the Commission was for, and that is
2 to go out and find facts.

3 We have not been good at that. We have
4 frequently brought professional talking heads to talk
5 to us. They have said the same things they've said in
6 the articles that they have written. What we really
7 need to do is spend more time finding actual facts.
8 There is no confidential material that we're talking
9 about here. These are policies and presentations we're
10 asking these universities to produce. And it seems to
11 me a pretty easy thing. This is not time-consuming.
12 This is something that can be done relatively quickly
13 and I think it is useful.

14 As to whether or not we voted on this, I
15 actually expected that this would have been put on the
16 agenda. I was asked to produce a more complete concept
17 paper. I did that. I expected it to be on the agenda.
18 It never made it onto the agenda. I don't set the
19 agenda. But after something has been lying around as
20 many months as this, suddenly to be told that despite
21 months and months of planning, you know, this is just
22 off the agenda, after I voted in favor of projects that
23 the majority wanted, to now be ambushed this way I think
24 is completely inappropriate. CHAIRMAN CASTRO:

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Madam Staff Director?

2 MS. SALLO: I just want to put on the record
3 that the General Counsel will be providing an opinion
4 as to whether any concept paper is beyond the scope or
5 not even meeting the scope of what we are required to
6 do. That is the General Counsel's job, and that is what
7 we will be doing.

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And --

9 MEMBER KLADNEY: Mr. Chairman?

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney?

11 MEMBER KLADNEY: I would ask the staff
12 director to correct the record as far as Commissioner
13 Heriot's comments go about the statutory report and
14 whether in fact OGC directed that that be the statutory
15 report, the one about prisons and sentencing.

16 MS. SALLO: That is correct, Commissioner
17 Kladney. The General Counsel did meet with
18 Commissioner Kladney and a special assistant to advise
19 them that the report as written did not meet the
20 requirements of our statute, and therefore we were not
21 able to use that as a topic because it was beyond the
22 scope of our mission.

23 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And in fact that's why
24 we're --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

1 MEMBER KLADNEY: And also we never asked
2 Commissioner Heriot or any other Commissioner to change
3 the other topic, did we? Did the staff do that?

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: That was not my
5 argument. The point was that we had been asked to pick
6 from that list that the majority had the topic that we
7 were happiest with. And the majority picked from our
8 list the topic they were happiest with. And so for you
9 then to be able to pick a different topic meant that we
10 should be able to pick the topic we wanted most as well.

11 MEMBER KLADNEY: Commissioner Heriot, we
12 did not choose to pick a different topic. We did not
13 try to do that at all.

14 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: That's not what I've
15 heard.

16 MEMBER KLADNEY: We were barred from using
17 our topic. I would have preferred to have done that
18 topic, but I was told it did not fit the jurisdictional
19 parameters of the statutory report.

20 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: So we got another
21 Nevada topic.

22 MEMBER KLADNEY: That did not require you
23 to go about choosing another topic.

24 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

1 MEMBER KLADNEY: You did that in your own
2 discretion.

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I don't think you
4 understand what I'm saying.

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: All right. Okay.
6 Here's what we're going to do: I think, you know, we've
7 addressed the substantive matters here. We have the
8 process that we're now instituting where we are actually
9 having the OGC review our concept papers beforehand, not
10 afterwards so we don't end up in this problem again.

11 You do have your topic. It was voted on.
12 It's very clear. You made the case that it is higher
13 ed and K through 12. We are not taking that topic away
14 from you. The only concern is the scope of the
15 discovery. And so with a motion pending on that
16 specific issue, not removing your topic, but dealing
17 with the discovery issue, your topic remains in place.
18 You've obviously shown that, you know, we were in error,
19 that I was in error on my understanding of the expansion
20 of it.

21 And so now we will call the question on
22 Commissioner Kladney's motion.

23 Could you restate the motion,
24 Commissioner, just so that we're really clear?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

(202) 234-4433

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

1 MEMBER KLADNEY: The motion is to limit the
2 discovery on this paper to what is stated in the blurb.
3 That would be obtaining documents from DOJ and DOE, the
4 Office of Civil Rights, that there be no discovery to
5 school districts or universities.

6 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And that motion has been
7 seconded. I'm going to take a roll call vote on that.

8 Commissioner Heriot, how do you vote?

9 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: This is a first of
10 many no votes.

11 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,
12 how do you vote?

13 MEMBER KLADNEY: Yes.

14 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner
15 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

16 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

17 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how
18 do you vote?

19 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes, but after this
20 vote I'm going to offer a possible substitute amendment.

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. And then I also
22 vote yes. So the motion passes.

23 Now, Commissioner Yaki, you have a
24 substitute motion?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes, I would say that
2 I do agree with Commissioner Heriot on her
3 characterization of my position that too often this
4 Commission has not been engaged in the past; I'm talking
5 about when I was in the minority, in getting real data
6 for its reports, whether they were a briefing or whether
7 they were statutory. I understand her point of view and
8 I would simply say that the briefings, as I've often
9 stated, are often a way of getting the full flavor, full
10 facts, the full range of issues and discussions. And
11 one of my concerns with where this particular briefing
12 was headed was that I did not unfortunately any logic
13 as to the selection of those particular universities and
14 how they related to this particular topic in specific.

15 I do believe that -- simply that if in the
16 discretion of the staff it would be useful to obtain any
17 policies and procedures from any particular, from any
18 randomly selected or easily accessible school districts
19 or universities in their discretion in order to augment
20 and fully flesh out the topic, I would say that would
21 be appropriate, but I would leave that in the discretion
22 of the staff for the purposes of managing the briefing.
23 Because if we all really think about it, this could be
24 a very long briefing if we were to attempt to go quite

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 as far afield as it already is right now with regard to
2 the addition of the K through 12. So in that instance,
3 I would simply say I would direct the staff to in their
4 discretion and if needed in order to make this briefing
5 more well-rounded, if in their discretion they seek to
6 find some sample or representative policies from in each
7 school district or university in their discretion, I
8 would not object to that.

9 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: So is that --

10 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Is that a
11 motion?

12 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: -- a motion,
13 Commissioner?

14 (Laughter.)

15 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

16 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Is there a
17 second?

18 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Second.

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Any additional
20 discussion, or any discussion?

21 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Mr. Chairman, I
22 think that sounds imminently reasonable and quite
23 salutatory, which I think is a very good idea under the
24 circumstances. So I want to thank Commissioner Yaki

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 for contributing such a Solomon-like addition to the
2 prior motion.

3 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay.

4 MEMBER KLADNEY: And if I may add --

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, Commissioner
6 Kladney.

7 MEMBER KLADNEY: -- some clarification,
8 Commissioner Yaki? Is that the staff director makes
9 these decisions? I mean, there has to be one person,
10 right, not just the staff?

11 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Well, I mean, all
12 these are ultimately at the discretion of the staff
13 director working with the staff, so yes, it's going to
14 be the judgment of the -- and ultimately it's the
15 judgment of the staff director who is ultimately
16 responsible for making an arranged brief.

17 MEMBER KLADNEY: Then I can concur.

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Any other questions,
19 comments?

20 (No audible response.)

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Hearing no, we'll vote
22 on that motion.

23 Commissioner Heriot, how do you vote?

24 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,
2 how do you vote?

3 MEMBER KLADNEY: Yes.

4 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how
5 do you vote?

6 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Aye.

7 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner
8 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

9 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Aye.

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I vote yes. It
11 passes 4 to 1.

12 Okay. We now move onto Management and
13 Operations, and I'll turn it over to the staff director
14 to give us her monthly report.

15 MEMBER KLADNEY: Mr. Chairman?

16 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes?

17 MEMBER KLADNEY: I'd like to make one
18 comment.

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay.

20 MEMBER KLADNEY: Someone said that this
21 concept paper has been around for months. We just
22 received it in my office this month, just like two weeks
23 ago. So I just want to put that for the record. I don't
24 know why it wasn't distributed widely before that, but

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that is when we received it. Thank you.

2 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. We're moving on
3 now to Management and Operations. Madam Staff
4 Director?

5 **III. MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONS**

6 MS. SALLO: Yes, sir. I wanted to advise
7 everyone that unfortunately for the Commission Eileen
8 Rudert will be retiring after 29 years with the
9 Commission. So I wanted to let everyone know that she
10 will be greatly missed. I've truly enjoyed working
11 with her in the almost three years that I've been here
12 and it's a great loss for the Commission. So I just
13 wanted to let everyone know that and to thank her for
14 all of her years of commitment to us.

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Congratulations,
16 Eileen. You'll definitely be missed. So thanks for
17 all the work you've done and the support you've given
18 to the Commission over your career, and especially in
19 the three years I've been Chairman. I appreciate that.
20 You'll be missed.

21 MS. SALLO: And her last day with us --

22 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, go
23 ahead.

24 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes, and I would say,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

1 Eileen, as long as I've been on the Commission you've
2 been a great resource and a great public servant. And
3 thank you for your service to this Commission and to this
4 country and I wish you all the best in your next
5 endeavor.

6 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: You were going to say,
7 Madam Staff Director?

8 MS. SALLO: I was going to say her last day
9 with us is April 30th.

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Thank you.

11 MS. SALLO: I also wanted to advise the
12 Commissioners that we've now completed the alignment of
13 our strategic plan with our performance appraisal
14 system. And so we will be now meeting. The managers
15 will be meeting individually with the employees to
16 ensure that we go over the revised performance appraisal
17 plans. And those will hopefully go into effect across
18 the Commission for July 1st of this year.

19 We are also preparing for our audit that you
20 know happens annually. So we will be in the process of
21 trying to find an auditor who can come in and start the
22 process. And as we you know, we are working with GAO
23 for the next I guess 60-some-odd days. So I am the
24 contact person and I will be providing them with any all

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at transcripts@usccr.gov.

1 documents or information that they require. And that
2 is all, sir.

3 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, Madam Staff
4 Director, you have in the past done what I think is a
5 great job of periodically -- not at every meeting, but
6 periodically reporting to us on where we stand in terms
7 of hitting the goals of your strategic plan. Maybe for
8 the next month's meetings, because I think it's been at
9 least a month --

10 MS. SALLO: I did it last month.

11 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes.

12 MS. SALLO: So I do it every other month.

13 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: So if we can do it every
14 other month?

15 MS. SALLO: Yes.

16 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I think that's really
17 helpful to keep us on task as to what we need to do.

18 MS. SALLO: Yes.

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: So thank you. Any other
20 questions for the staff director?

21 (No audible response.)

22 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Hearing none, we will
23 then move on to State Advisory Committee Appointments.

24 **IV. STATE ADVISORY COMMITTEE (SAC) APPOINTMENTS**

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Today's agenda gives us
2 one, and that is for Idaho. So I am now going to make
3 a motion that the Commission appoint the following
4 individuals to the Idaho State Advisory Committee based
5 upon the recommendation of our staff director:
6 James Annest, Richard A. Cummings, Louise E. Dixey,
7 Maurice O. Ellsworth, Dina M. Flores-Brewer, Margie A.
8 Gonzalez, Marshall E. Mend, Gladys B. Montoya, Stephen
9 C. Smith, Carmen A. Suarez, Rudolph Wilson and Scott
10 Yenor. Pursuant to this motion the Commission appoints
11 Marshall E. Mend as chair of the Idaho State Advisory
12 Committee.

13 These members will serve as uncompensated
14 government employees. Under this motion the
15 Commission authorizes the staff director to execute the
16 appropriate paperwork for the appointments. Is there
17 a second?

18 (No audible response.)

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Do I have a second on the
20 motion?

21 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Second.

22 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Thank you. Any
23 discussion? Any questions?

24 (No audible response.)

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Hearing none, I'll take
2 a vote.

3 Commissioner Heriot, how do you vote?

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner
6 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

7 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: (No audible
8 response.)

9 MS. SALLO: Did we lose them?

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Have we lost them?
11 Commissioner Kladney?

12 MEMBER KLADNEY: (No audible response.)

13 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki?

14 COMMISSIONER YAKI: (No audible
15 response.)

16 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: All right. Well, we're
17 going to put it on hold until we get the Commissioners
18 back.

19 (Whereupon, at 10:19 a.m. off the record
20 until 10:26 a.m.)

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. We're back on.

22 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: We're all on.

23 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Can you hear us?

24 MEMBER KLADNEY: Yes.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

2 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: We'll move quickly
3 before we lose connection again. So we had made a
4 motion and it was seconded. Did you hear the motion on
5 the Idaho State Advisory Committee?

6 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes, we all voted.

7 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: We did.

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. All right. So
9 now we're going to take a vote.

10 Commissioner Heriot, how do you vote?

11 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

12 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner
13 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

14 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,
16 how do you vote?

17 MEMBER KLADNEY: Yes.

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how
19 do you vote?

20 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Aye.

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I vote yes. The Idaho
22 Committee passes unanimously. Thank you.

23 **V. ADJOURN BRIEFING**

24 I now move to adjourn. Is there a second?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Second.

2 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: All those in favor, say
3 aye?

4 (Chorus of ayes.)

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: All right. Thank you,
6 everyone. It is now adjourning at 10:26 a.m. Eastern
7 Time.

8 (Whereupon, the meeting was adjourned at
9 10:26 p.m.)

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701