

U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS

+ + + + +

MEETING **EDITED**

+ + + + +

FRIDAY, NOVEMBER 9, 2012

+ + + + +

The Commission convened in Suite 1150 at 1331 Pennsylvania Avenue, Northwest, Washington, D.C. at 1:30 p.m., Martin R. Castro, Chairman, presiding.

PRESENT:

MARTIN R. CASTRO, Chairman

ROBERTA ACHTENBERG, Commissioner

TODD GAZIANO, Commissioner

GAIL L. HERIOT, Commissioner

PETER N. KIRSANOW, Commissioner

DAVID KLADNEY, Commissioner

MICHAEL YAKI, Commissioner (via telephone)

VANESSA EISEMANN, Parliamentarian (via telephone)

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

STAFF PRESENT:

TERESA BROOKS

MARGARET BUTLER, Acting Director, OCRE

PAMELA DUNSTON, Chief, ASCD

YASMIN ELHADY

ALFREDA GREENE

JENNIFER CRON HEPLER, Solicitor

TINALOUISE MARTIN, Director, OM

DAVID MUSSATT, Acting Director, RPCU (via telephone)

LENORE OSTROWSKY, Acting Chief, PAU

ELOISE PLATER

EILEEN RUDERT

MICHELE YORKMAN

JOHN RATCLIFFE, Chief, BFD

COMMISSIONER ASSISTANTS PRESENT:

NICHOLAS COLTON

ALEC DEULL

JOHN MARTIN

CARISSA MULDER

ALISON SOMIN

MARLENE SALLO

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

A G E N D A

I. APPROVAL OF AGENDA 4

II. PROGRAM PLANNING UPDATE AND DISCUSSION
OF PROJECTS 5

III. APPROVAL OF STATE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
SLATES 20

IV. ADJOURN MEETING 26

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

P R O C E E D I N G S

(1:38 p.m.)

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Calling the meeting to order. This is a meeting of the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights. It is November 9th, 2012 at the hour of 1:38 p.m. This meeting is taking place at the Commission's headquarters located at 1331 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., in Washington, D.C.

I'm Chairman Marty Castro. Commissioners who are present with me are myself, Commissioner Kirsanow, Commissioner Heriot, Commissioner Gaziano, Commissioner Achtenberg, Commissioner Kladney, Commissioner Yaki is joining us by telephone. We also have Vanessa Eisemann who's on the phone who will be presenting a little later, so in terms of the Commissioners we have a quorum present. Is the court reporter present?

COURT REPORTER: Yes.

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, okay. So, the meeting shall now come to order. The first item is the Approval of the Agenda.

I. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I move that we approve the agenda. Is there a second?

COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Second.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. That was a second
2 from Commissioner Achtenberg. Are there any
3 amendments?

4 (No response.)

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: So, we need to amend the
6 agenda to anything?

7 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Are we going to take
8 up the Texas SAC? I don't think that was circulated.

9 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I don't think so.

10 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I don't think we need
11 to amend the agenda to not do something.

12 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, so we don't need an
13 amendment then. Okay. Do we? Excuse me.

14 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: It's listed but
15 we're not going to bring it up.

16 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. That's fine. So,
17 let's then move to approve the agenda. All those in
18 favor say aye.

19 (Chorus of ayes.)

20 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Any opposed? Any
21 abstentions? Okay, the motion passes.

22 So, the first item up is the Program
23 Planning Update.

24 **II. PROGRAM PLANNING UPDATE**

25 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: We're going to be

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 discussing the approval of a Discovery Plan for the
2 2013 Statutory Enforcement Report. I hope everyone has
3 had a chance to review that. Vanessa disseminated it
4 by email I believe yesterday, so do any Commissioners
5 have questions or comments on the Discovery Plan for
6 the Enforcement Report? I'm sorry, Commissioner
7 Gaziano.

8 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes, I do. First, I
9 want to thank Vanessa in two regards, first of all,
10 for reaching out to Commissioners and for calling in
11 on a day off. I had one or two minor suggestions.
12 Again, thank you for already incorporating some of my
13 thoughts.

14 (Off the record comments.)

15 The first is that --

16 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, you
17 might want to mute your phone. We're hearing your
18 other conversation.

19 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Huh?

20 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: You might want to mute
21 your phone.

22 (Off the record comments.)

23 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, we're
24 hearing your conversation. You might want to mute your
25 other phone.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Anyway, back to --
2 first of all, I also want to thank you for including
3 the draft interrogatories --

4 (Off the record comments.)

5 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: And just for maybe
6 others on our staff. Normally, we adopt a Discovery
7 Plan and then we're shown the actual draft discovery.

8 (Off the record comments.)

9 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I'll try to speak
10 over, but it makes sense in this case that you did
11 both at once.

12 Now, with regard to the interrogatories,
13 one suggestion that I want to make that doesn't
14 require much discussion, and then the second might
15 invite just a little bit of discussion, is that in the
16 -- I'm trying to turn to the right page of the
17 interrogatories, you have what kind of looks like a
18 standard instruction if it were civil discovery. I
19 think here I've turned to it. It's C, and it said, "If
20 DOD should state the basis for any objection to
21 answering any discovery request. In the event that DOD
22 objects to only part of the discovery request, DOD is
23 required to furnish the other information." Again,
24 that sort of follows the civil litigation -- there
25 should be no objections. There aren't at least the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 same objection -- there can't be the same objections
2 to our request as in civil discovery. We are allowed
3 to ask for things that might not even lead to the
4 discovery of admissible evidence, so what I would
5 suggest is that you substitute the sentence from our
6 organic statute that requires all federal agencies to
7 cooperate fully, to comply fully with the Commission's
8 requests, but that we are eager to talk to any agency
9 that receives our discovery request to resolve any
10 issues, come to any compromises.

11 I also think that this doesn't -- the next
12 thing I'm going to suggest doesn't necessarily need to
13 be in the discovery itself in a cover letter, and
14 maybe it probably is standard from the Office of
15 General Counsel, but to ask for someone, since the
16 Statutory Report time line is tight at this point, to
17 ask someone to contact you immediately so that you
18 could begin coordination with DOD. These requests seem
19 to require responses from different people. You want
20 probably a contact person. If that contact person
21 doesn't call you back as requested, or contact you as
22 requested, I would suggest you be very proactive in
23 reaching out, and not wait for 30 days, or whatever to
24 make sure that it's landed in the right office.

25 My more general suggestion, and you or

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 anyone else can respond to both, is that I worry -- as
2 wonderfully exhaustive you were, worry that maybe this
3 is just a bit too exhaustive. And my only concern
4 there -- well, I suppose I have two-fold. One is, can
5 we really make use of everything that we're requesting
6 if we get it all. If we don't, then that's
7 unfortunate. And, secondly, whether it might give the
8 Department inadvertently, consciously, whatever a --
9 excuse is the wrong word because maybe that sounds
10 like it's intentional, that they'll respond to certain
11 things and not others which are more important. So, I
12 think that some of our requests are more important
13 than others, and some individual questions even
14 require a great deal of discovery, but overall I
15 applaud the thoroughness. I'm just raising the
16 question whether it may be just a teeny bit too much.

17 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Do you want to answer
18 that Ms. Eisemann?

19 MS. EISEMANN: Yes. Would you like me to --

20 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Wait, hold on a second.
21 Commissioner Kladney.

22 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: So, what would you
23 take out, Commissioner?

24 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I mean, I have some
25 thoughts but I don't necessarily -- I'm more raising a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 question than necessarily feel strongly about it. If
2 you think that we can really handle all the material
3 and analyze all the material, and make use of it, and
4 that it won't give the Department of Defense some
5 argument about not complying with that which is the
6 most important, then I'll defer.

7 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Well, I just think
8 that if our staff interacts with them, they can define
9 really what's necessary. I understand that there's one
10 major database that I was asking about that's going to
11 be provided, and it apparently includes most of the
12 information that we need. Isn't that correct, Ms.
13 Eisemann?

14 MS. EISEMANN: If the DOD does provide the
15 database that they say that they have, we know that
16 they at least have in part because their annual
17 reports provide some of the information on a limited
18 basis, then that would answer many of the statistical
19 questions. I've heard different things from different
20 people about whether this database is fully
21 functioning, fully operational, whether it even has
22 all the information prior years, so I don't have a
23 firm definitive idea of all that is in it.

24 The DOD was supposed to by statute have
25 gotten this database up and running a year ago, but as

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 of a year ago it wasn't fully functioning yet. It
2 should be now, and if it is, then it should have all
3 the statistical information that we're seeking with
4 the exception of certain things, for example, I have
5 an outstanding question to the Deputy Director of the
6 SAPARO, the Sexual Assault Prevention and Response
7 Office about whether they keep that data. It's not
8 provided in the reports, but they may keep it anyway.
9 I noted in the interrogatories items -- I'm sorry,
10 actually in the Discovery Plan, I noted the items that
11 I don't know for sure whether they keep it. If they
12 don't keep the data, then they don't keep it, and
13 there's nothing we can do about that. But most of it,
14 I know that they do in some format.

15 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Commissioner
16 Gaziano, the only reason I'm familiar with that is
17 when we got the interrogatories, I went through and I
18 wrote this whole elaborate interrogatory scheme of
19 years from so and so to so and so, years from so and
20 so to so and so, years from so and so, and then I was
21 told most of it is in this database, so hopefully we
22 get that.

23 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot.

24 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I'm afraid I have
25 more fundamental differences with the Discovery Plan.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 We have a tendency when we do these enforcement
2 reports to basically ask for a giant document but
3 never really think clearly about what question that's
4 actually in dispute that we're trying to resolve. And
5 it seems to me that the fundamental issue where you're
6 getting disagreement these days is that some people on
7 the inside are arguing that the military has
8 overreacted to this issue, and are therefore sometimes
9 prosecuting people or acting on things that are not as
10 significant as they should be for the reaction that
11 they're getting, while others are arguing that the
12 military continues to not give sufficient attention to
13 this area.

14 They might both be right, and maybe
15 neither of them are right, but what we should be
16 trying to accomplish here is to at least bring some
17 new evidence that bears on that question. It seems to
18 me that this plan is not designed to really address
19 that issue, and yet I think that's the fundamental
20 issue before us.

21 I think we need something that will allow
22 us to say look, we're doing more than just going to
23 the military and asking for all of the stuff they've
24 got in their file on this issue already, because
25 that's already basically -- that's already there.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 We're not adding to the sum total of human knowledge
2 on this if we simply ask them to dump on us all the
3 information as they already keep it.

4 It's not clear to me what question we're
5 trying to answer. It's not clear to me how we think
6 we're adding something to what's already known on this
7 issue.

8 The military gets hauled before Congress,
9 you know, often on this issue. They come, I'm sure,
10 armed with lots of information, and they will give us
11 lots of information. But to what degree is it
12 different than the information that they've already
13 supplied to Congress, or were prepared to supply to
14 Congress. It just seems to me we're missing the
15 fundamental issue here. I am not wedded to any
16 particular way of addressing that, but I do want to
17 see some effort to address it, and I don't see it
18 here.

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney, do
20 you want to respond?

21 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: I would say that
22 actually getting this information would be important,
23 because it's actually looking into the information and
24 seeing the difference in ranks, how they're treated,
25 whether -- I mean, the question I still have is

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1 whether those convicted of sexual assault in the
2 military go on the sexual offender list. I actually
3 understand that's not -- that there's no requirement
4 that they do that. Sometimes officers are imprisoned.

5 The definition of sexual assault in the military is
6 very broad, sexual crimes, and I think that this type
7 of discussion will -- and this type of information
8 will be able to be looked at in a different way.

9 I mean, if we look at it from those points
10 of view among many others that the information is
11 contained that we'll actually be able to discern a lot
12 more things than just Congress. I mean --

13 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Well, there are many
14 people who are suggesting that the military overreacts
15 sometimes to these issues. To what extent do you see
16 this Discovery Plan as helping to answer that
17 question?

18 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Well, I think the --
19 it's not the Discovery Plan itself. I mean, we get
20 information from discovery, and like in any kind of
21 litigation then you go through it and discern what it
22 says and what it doesn't say. I mean, the Discovery
23 Plan itself doesn't draw a conclusion --

24 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: What would you
25 envision that could answer that question the way

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 you've asked for information here? I mean, you don't
2 want to conduct just a general fishing expedition on
3 anything related to sexual assault. What -- how have
4 you tried to address that question about whether the
5 military may have at least in some instances
6 overreacted?

7 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,
8 might not some of the witnesses we invite be able to
9 answer those questions?

10 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Well, I mean,
11 hopefully yes. Hopefully, that's what your witnesses
12 will do. I mean we're supposed to --

13 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: How could witnesses
14 do anything other than just --

15 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Can I finish my
16 statement? Commissioner, is it all right if I finish?

17 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Well, if you answer,
18 yes.

19 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: I couldn't get two
20 words out. We're going to invite witnesses from a
21 varied and assorted background. We want JAGs who have
22 prosecuted cases, JAGs who have defended cases. We'd
23 like the approach as to whether it would be over-
24 burdensome at this point, whether they're looking at
25 everything, whether they're prosecuting everything, or

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 how the system works. I don't know how the JAG system
2 works. I've never been a JAG. I've never been in the
3 military, the JAG Corps. I was only a soldier.

4 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Well, I don't know if we
5 have an impasse here or maybe we can move forward on a
6 motion?

7 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Let me ask one other
8 quick question that Commissioner Kladney two
9 statements ago raised. I didn't see a definition at
10 least in the interrogatories for sexual assault. There
11 was one in the Concept Paper that I know was from the
12 DOD, but I'm not sure it's from the UCMJ. And I would
13 at least -- I don't know what the right definition is,
14 but I would like to say unless otherwise indicated
15 when use the term sexual assault, we mean X. And I
16 would prefer it to be a term that's -- and this is
17 where I haven't spent enough time, but I would think
18 one from the UCMJ, even if it is broader than in the
19 civilian context to be used so that at some later date
20 we can at least be trying to compare apples to apples.
21 Sexual harassment is somewhat different, and might be
22 a different military crime, but --

23 MS. EISEMANN: Can I just ask for
24 clarification?

25 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, go ahead.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MS. EISEMANN: In the instructions,
2 Instruction C, the term sexual harass -- I'm sorry,
3 the term sexual assault is -- it says means as define
4 in the Uniform Code of Military Justice.

5 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I'm sorry, where is
6 that?

7 MS. EISEMANN: And that is a very -- well,
8 initially it's broken down into many levels from
9 groping to rape and forcible sodomy. But what I've
10 tried to do is within the interrogatories, or if it's
11 produced in the database that would be preferable,
12 break it down into each of those types of sexual
13 assault. But I just wanted to be clear about what you
14 have in mind, if that's not the definition that you
15 think we should be using for purposes of the
16 interrogatories.

17 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: As long as you've
18 defined it, you've partially answered. I don't know
19 that I have the right -- I had a different version, I
20 think, of the interrogatories, and I didn't see that
21 definition.

22 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: So, may I make a
23 motion to approve this Discovery Plan?

24 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: We have a motion from
25 Commissioner Kladney. Is there a second?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Second.

2 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: A second from
3 Commissioner Achtenberg. Any additional discussion?

4 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I do want to at
5 least -- maybe it doesn't go to the interrogatories,
6 or it's exclusively the interrogatories. I want to
7 support the kind of inquiry though that Commissioner
8 Heriot spoke about, and I'd like our staff to pursue
9 that. And I pass this on through my special assistant,
10 as well. There is a question added about comparisons
11 that DOD may have, and I know that they're imperfect,
12 where we're asking for DOD to produce them.

13 But I hope through both our own research
14 and our own witnesses, and probably it's more
15 important to do so through experts, we really drill
16 down on experts who can -- even if we're not going to
17 get new data. Maybe out data analysis will produce
18 something that is unique.

19 But beyond that, I am particularly
20 interested in being able to say whether the rate of
21 sexual assaults, whether increasing, decreasing is
22 especially problematic compared to whatever the
23 relevant populations. And the truth is, of course,
24 there is no other population that's exactly like the
25 U.S. military, whether foreign militaries, whether

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 college campuses are arguably analogous or not, I'd
2 like at least a fair amount of attention.

3 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Thanks. So, we'll call
4 the question. Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

5 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: No.

6 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot, how
7 do you vote?

8 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No.

9 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Gaziano, how
10 do you vote?

11 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Let me pass.

12 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how do
13 you vote?

14 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Aye.

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Achtenberg,
16 how do you vote?

17 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Aye.

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney, how
19 do you vote?

20 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I vote yes, so we
22 have one, two, three, four yeses, two nos, and a pass.

23 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I'll --

24 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Oh, come on, join the
25 dark side, vote yes.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 (Laughter.)

2 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: I'll say yes with
3 again the understanding that both Commissioners and
4 staff will work to make this as meaningful a
5 investigation as possible. And with that, I'd like as
6 regular and thorough reports as we are -- we only have
7 a couple of months before January. Maybe we shouldn't
8 wait until -- I don't think we should probably wait
9 until the next meeting to get some sort of update on
10 what the DOD is likely to give us.

11 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Fair enough. Okay, thank
12 you. We're now moving on to the State Advisory
13 Committee issues.

14 **III. APPROVAL OF STATE**

15 **ADVISORY COMMITTEE SLATES**

16 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: We have two things up,
17 the agenda for approving the Massachusetts slate, and
18 then also the appointment of a new chair for Nebraska.

19 So, the first item is the Massachusetts State
20 Advisory Committee. I move that the Commission
21 recharter the Massachusetts State Advisory Committee
22 under this motion. Actually, let me hold off here for
23 a second.

24 Did the Subcommittee address the Unified
25 Charter issue yet?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: No.

2 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Then we'll just
3 move forward on this. The first item, as I said, the
4 approval of the Massachusetts Advisory Committee, so
5 moving that the Commission recharter the Massachusetts
6 State Advisory Committee. Under this motion, the
7 Commission appoints the following individuals to that
8 committee based upon the recommendations of our SAC
9 Subcommittee; David J. Harris, Karen M. Blum, Gregory
10 D. Cote, Martha F. Davis, Charles L. Glenn, Wendy
11 Kaminer, Ronald G. Marlow, Eva M. Millona, Allison W.
12 Phinney, III, Elbert L. Robertson, John S. Sivolella,
13 Siobhan M. Sweeney, Greer T. Swiston.

14 Pursuant to this motion, the Commission
15 appoints Mr. David J. Harris as Chair of this
16 rechartered Massachusetts State Advisory Committee.
17 These members will serve as uncompensated government
18 employees. Under this motion, the Commission
19 authorizes the SAC Subcommittee to execute the
20 appropriate paperwork for the appointment. Is there a
21 second?

22 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Second.

23 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Second. Any discussion?
24 Hearing none, I'll call the question. Commissioner
25 Kirsanow, how do you vote

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

2 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot, how
3 do you vote?

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Gaziano, how
6 do you vote?

7 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes.

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how do
9 you vote?

10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

11 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Achtenberg,
12 how do you vote?

13 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

14 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney, how
15 do you vote?

16 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: I abstain.

17 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Abstain, okay. And I vote
18 yes, so it passes.

19 The next item is the Interim Nebraska SAC
20 Chair. I move that the Commission approve the
21 appointment of Dr. Edmund T. Hamann as Interim Chair
22 of the Nebraska State Advisory Committee based upon
23 the recommendation of our SAC Subcommittee. This
24 member will serve as an uncompensated government
25 employee. Under this motion, the Commission also

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 authorizes the SAC Subcommittee to execute the
2 appropriate paperwork for the appointment. Is there a
3 second?

4 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Second.

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay, any discussion?

6 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Could I just make a
7 comment?

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Sure.

9 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: My understanding is
10 that the SAC itself took a vote on this, and I just
11 want to establish that it is not the SAC that elects
12 its own chairman, it is the Commission that appoints
13 Chairmen, and that we have to make sure that everyone
14 understands that. That said, this guy is fine.

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Absolutely. Okay. Any
16 other questions on that? Commissioner Gaziano.

17 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Maybe this is a
18 question to the SAC Chair that I should have addressed
19 prior to this morning, but it wasn't until I focused
20 on it last night. I voted against the slate because I
21 thought it was very ideologically unbalanced.

22 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Is this the Nebraska
23 slate?

24 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes, the Nebraska
25 slate.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay.

2 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: There were a couple
3 of people who identified themselves as Republican,
4 but in almost every case but the previous Chairman, I
5 saw no indication that they were Conservative, or
6 Libertarian. Maybe one or two of them were, but it was
7 a very unbalanced slate for Nebraska. And I voted
8 against it, notwithstanding the only member of the
9 State Advisory Committee who seemed to be somewhat
10 Conservative was the Chair. So, in replacing an
11 unbalanced slate this becomes more ideologically
12 imbalanced, so I'm a little uncomfortable in making it
13 more so. With that -- but I do want to say for the
14 record I think that the person nominated to be Chair
15 looks fully qualified and to be a fine individual.
16 I would have just preferred maybe to review the slate
17 and add three or four, six or ten, whatever --

18 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Given that it's a
19 two-year charter --

20 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: We'll get the
21 chance.

22 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes, it will come
23 soon.

24 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Okay.

25 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: So, shall we take a vote?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Okay. Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

2 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

3 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot, how
4 do you vote?

5 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

6 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Gaziano, how
7 do you vote?

8 COMMISSIONER GAZIANO: Yes.

9 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Commissioner Yaki,
10 how do you vote?

11 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I'm sorry, on approving
12 the Nebraska Interim Chair?

13 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: That's correct.

14 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Aye.

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Commissioner
16 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

17 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Aye.

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney, how
19 do you vote?

20 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Abstain.

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Abstain, okay. And I vote
22 yes, so the motion passes. And let me just say that
23 despite the news accounts there is bipartisanship here
24 in Washington, at least here at the Civil Rights
25 Commission, so thank you all.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

IV. ADJOURN MEETING

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Now, I move to adjourn.

Is there a second?

COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: You got it.

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: All right. Thank you.

COMMISSIONER YAKI: Mr. Chair?

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, Commissioner Yaki.

COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes, I just want to say, again, I'm sorry I couldn't be there today, but I just wanted to put out there that at some point I want to bring up an issue that we had started, I thought came out rather starkly in this last election, and it's one where I'd like to at some point for us to think about investigating and talking about the idea of whether or not elections involving the Presidents, and perhaps maybe all federal elections should be -- the mechanisms of it should be federalized and not left to the whims of state and local authorities given the kinds of problems that were had with early voting, issues of voter purges, et cetera.

I'm currently convinced that having a single federal standard with monitoring oversight or something along those lines may be one way to prevent the kinds of political shenanigans that go on on both sides, on both Democrat and Republican sides, when it

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 comes to partisan appointed local elected officials. I
2 just want to put that out there. I think it's a non-
3 partisan way to look at elections, and one where the
4 Civil Rights Commission is uniquely qualified to take
5 a look at.

6 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Thank you, Commissioner.
7 All right, we're adjourned. Thank you.

8 (Whereupon, the proceedings went off the
9 record at 2:08 p.m.)

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1

2

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com