

U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS

+ + + + +

TELEPHONIC BUSINESS MEETING

+ + + + +

THURSDAY, AUGUST 22, 2019

+ + + + +

The Commission convened via teleconference at 10:30 a.m., Catherine Lhamon, Chair, presiding.

PRESENT:

CATHERINE E. LHAMON, Chair

PATRICIA TIMMONS-GOODSON, Vice Chair

DEBO P. ADEGBILE, Commissioner

GAIL HERIOT, Commissioner

DAVID KLADNEY, Commissioner

KAREN K. NARASAKI, Commissioner

MICHAEL YAKI, Commissioner

MAURO MORALES, Staff Director

MAUREEN RUDOLPH, General Counsel

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

STAFF PRESENT:

EVELYN BOHOR

LASHONDA BRENSON

PAMELA DUNSTON, Chief ASCD

ALFREDA GREENE

LENORE OSTROWSKY

MICHELE RAMEY

JOHN RATCLIFFE

SARALE SEWELL

JUANDA SMITH

BRIAN WALCH

MARIK XAVIER-BRIER

COMMISSIONER ASSISTANTS PRESENT:

SHERYL COZART

JASON LAGRIA

CARISSA MULDER

AMY ROYCE

RUKKU SINGLA

ALISON SOMIN

IRENA VIDULOVIC

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

T-A-B-L-E O-F C-O-N-T-E-N-T-S

I. Approval of Agenda 5

II. Business Meeting

 A. Discussion and Vote on Commission's Report,

 In the Name of Hate: Examining the Federal Government's Role in Responding to Hate Crimes 6

 B. Discussion and Vote on Chair for North Dakota State Advisory Committee 16

 C. Discussion and Vote on 2020 Business Meeting Calendar 17

 D. Management and Operations

 Staff Director's Report 20

 E. Meeting of the Commission's Subcommittee on Condition of Immigration Detention Centers and Treatment of Immigrants in Detention 26

III. Adjourn Meeting 35

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

(10:32 a.m.)

CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: This meeting of the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights comes to order at 10:32 a.m. Eastern Time on August 22nd, 2019. The meeting takes place over the phone.

I'm Chair Catherine Lhamon. I'd like to confirm each of the Commissioners who's on the line, so I'll take a roll call here at the outset. Please say present when I say your name if you are on the line.

Vice Chair Timmons-Goodson?

VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Present.

CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner Adegbile?

COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Present.

CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner Heriot?

COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Here.

CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner Kirsanow?

(No audible response.)

CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner Kladney?

COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Here.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner

2 Narasaki?

3 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Present.

4 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner Yaki?

5 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Here.

6 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you. Based
7 on that a quorum of the Commission is present.

8 Is the court reporter present?

9 COURT REPORTER: The court reporter is
10 present.

11 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you. Is the
12 staff director present?

13 (No audible response.)

14 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: All right. When
15 the staff director joins us, he will announce
16 himself.

17 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: The meeting shall
18 now come to order.

19 **I. APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

20 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Is there a motion
21 to approve the agenda for this business meeting?

22 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Commissioner
23 Adegbile. So moved.

24 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you. Is
25 there a second?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Commissioner
2 Narasaki. Second.

3 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you. Are
4 there any amendments to the agenda?

5 (No audible response.)

6 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Hearing none,
7 let's vote to approve the agenda. All those in
8 favor, say aye?

9 (Chorus of aye.)

10 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Any opposed?

11 (No audible response.)

12 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Any abstentions?

13 (No audible response.)

14 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: The motion passes
15 unanimously.

16 II. BUSINESS MEETING

17 A. DISCUSSION AND VOTE ON COMMISSION'S REPORT, IN

18 THE NAME OF HATE: EXAMINING THE FEDERAL

19 GOVERNMENT'S ROLE IN RESPONDING TO HATE CRIMES.

20 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: The first item on
21 the agenda is a discussion and vote on the
22 Commission's Report titled In the Name of Hate:
23 Examining the Federal Government's Role in
24 Responding to Hate Crimes.

25 We'll hold two votes: First, we will

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 consider the report, and second we will consider
2 the findings and recommendations.

3 To open the floor for discussion, is
4 there a motion?

5 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Vice Chair
6 Timmons-Goodson. So moved.

7 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Second.
8 Kladney.

9 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you. I'll
10 offer a few points to begin our discussion.

11 First, I thank Vice Chair Timmons-
12 Goodson for her leadership with this project as
13 well as my fellow co-sponsors, Commissioners
14 Adegbile and Narasaki. I thank our staff,
15 particularly Katherine Culliton-Gonzalez and Marik
16 Xavier-Brier, as well as all the other members of
17 our staff who pitched in during the research and
18 development of this project. Thanks to all of
19 their efforts we today consider a report that
20 delves into an issue that feels distressingly
21 topical nearly every week: the manifestation of
22 hate in our communities including our schools.

23 The text we vote on today reads the
24 history of hate in this country with a wide and
25 modern lens that captures the varying ways that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 perpetrators attack people based on how they look,
2 their faith and whom they love. The report
3 comprehensively assesses the work of the
4 Departments of Education and Justice to
5 investigate, prosecute and prevent hate crimes and
6 bias-motivated incidents. We also dive into the
7 practices of five local cities because their
8 research showed that it is a necessary goal for the
9 Federal Government, local and state communities are
10 central partners in this work.

11 I'll open the floor for discussion
12 beginning with Vice Chair Timmons-Goodson as the
13 lead co-sponsor of this project.

14 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you very
15 much, Madam Chair.

16 It seems at times that our country is
17 hopelessly divided, but I believe that all
18 Americans can agree that hate crimes have no place
19 in this country. Not only do hate crimes harm
20 individuals and communities, but hate crimes also
21 tear the very fabric of our nation. They undermine
22 the promise of equality.

23 Alarmed by numerous reports of a
24 significant increase in hate crimes and incidents
25 across the country, the Commission has examined the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 impact of these heinous crimes and the efforts to
2 stem their rise.

3 Back on the 11th of May of 2018 we
4 heard from hate crime survivors, local law
5 enforcement, community stakeholders, legal experts
6 and current and former federal officials. In our
7 open comment session we also heard from members of
8 the public.

9 I believe that this report that you've
10 all received a copy of has come about through the
11 very hard work of many as you have already singled
12 out, Madam Chair. I believe that the report does a
13 good job and I believe that it's going to be of
14 value as our nation comes to grips with the
15 frequent, unfortunately frequent occurrences of
16 crimes that are motivated by hate. The
17 Commission's role is to stand up against that which
18 assaults the rights we all hold so dear. Left
19 unaddressed hate crimes and bias-related incidents
20 prevent Americans from living up to the democratic
21 ideals we revere.

22 I believe that we've done a good job
23 with this report and I will be supporting it and
24 hope that all others will as well. Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you. Any

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 other discussion or amendments?

2 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes, this is
3 Commissioner Narasaki. Madam Chair, I move to
4 amend the text of the report and the findings and
5 recommendations so that they conform with the text
6 my special assistant circulated by email last
7 night, August 21st at 8:45 p.m. For the sake of
8 efficiency I will not read each amendment unless
9 one of the Commissioners would prefer I do so.

10 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you,
11 Commissioner Narasaki. A friendly an amendment to
12 your amendment. This motion is about the report
13 itself, so if you wouldn't mind making a motion to
14 amend the report text as circulated by your special
15 assistant last night -- to amend the findings and
16 recommendations section, I'd appreciate it.

17 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Happy to do
18 that.

19 So I'd move to amend the text of the
20 report to conform with the text that was circulated
21 last night at 8:45 p.m.

22 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you. Is
23 there a second?

24 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Commissioner
25 Adegbile.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: If
2 appropriate --

3 I'm sorry. Go ahead, Commissioner
4 Adegbile.

5 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Apologies,
6 Madam Vice Chair. I was just intending to second
7 the motion of Commissioner Narasaki to amend the
8 text of the report consistent with the revisions
9 that were circulated by email last night.

10 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: And, Madam Vice
11 Chair, do you accept the amendments motion and
12 therefore incorporated?

13 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: What I was
14 going to say is if appropriate I -- at this time I
15 would express that as a friendly amendment.

16 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you.

17 Any further discussion on our now-
18 amended motion to approve the text of the Hate
19 Crimes Report as amended -- as recommended and
20 circulated last night?

21 (No audible response.)

22 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: All right. Unless
23 there's further discussion, I'll call the
24 discussion -- call the question, take a roll call
25 vote.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Commissioner Adegbile, how do you vote?

2 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Aye.

3 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner
4 Heriot?

5 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I vote no.

6 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner
7 Kirsanow?

8 (No audible response.)

9 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner
10 Kladney?

11 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner
13 Narasaki?

14 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: I vote yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner Yaki?

16 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Aye.

17 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Vice Chair
18 Timmons-Goodson?

19 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: And I vote yes.

21 The motion passes. One Commissioner opposed; no
22 Commissioner abstained, all others were in favor.

23 I'll also note I understand that the
24 staff director has been on the line the whole time
25 unable to speak and is now on with us on a speaking

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 line.

2 Staff Director Morales, would you mind
3 confirming that you are on and able to speak?

4 MR. MORALES: I am on the line now.
5 Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Okay. Thank you.

7 So next we'll consider the findings and
8 recommendations to the report.

9 To open the floor for discussion is
10 there a motion?

11 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Madam
12 Chair, Vice Chair Timmons-Goodson. I so move.

13 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you.

14 So there's a motion to approve the
15 findings and recommendations. Is there a second?

16 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Commissioner
17 Adegbile. Second.

18 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Commissioner
19 Narasaki -- oh, go ahead, Debo.

20 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Sorry. Sorry.
21 I yield to Commissioner Narasaki.

22 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: I second the
23 motion.

24 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Appreciate that
25 you're seconding.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Is there any discussion around my -- to
2 this motion?

3 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes, Madam
4 Chair. This is Commissioner Narasaki. I move to
5 amend the findings and recommendations to conform
6 with the text that my special assistant circulated
7 via email last night, August 21st at 8:45 p.m.

8 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you, Madam
9 Vice Chair. Do you accept those amendments as
10 friendly to your motion and therefore incorporated?

11 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: I do accept
12 them as friendly to my motion.

13 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you.

14 Any further discussion on our now
15 amended motion?

16 (No audible response.)

17 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Vice Chair
18 Timmons-Goodson. The only thing that I have to add
19 is again that no one in this country should have to
20 live in fear because of their race or religion,
21 disability, sexual orientation, ethnicity or
22 national origin. And we've taken up this topic and
23 we've offered what I feel to be good
24 recommendations and -- that are so critical to the
25 challenge that's before us, and thus I'll be

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 supporting the findings and recommendations.

2 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Madam Chair,
3 this is Commissioner Narasaki. I want to add my
4 thanks to my fellow Commissioners and the staff.
5 We had a very ambitious research project for this
6 report. This is an area of work that I have spent
7 most of my professional life working on, so it's
8 been very personal to me. And I agree with the
9 Vice Chair that we have some very strong
10 recommendations that hopefully can begin to move us
11 forward to be able to more strongly address this
12 issue.

13 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you.

14 Unless there's further discussion, I'll
15 call the question. We can take a roll call vote.

16 Commissioner Adegbile, how do you vote?

17 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Aye.

18 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner
19 Heriot?

20 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I vote no.

21 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner
22 Kirsanow?

23 (No audible response.)

24 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner
25 Kladney?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

2 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner
3 Narasaki?

4 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

5 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner Yaki?

6 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Aye.

7 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Vice Chair
8 Timmons-Goodson?

9 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: And I vote yes.

11 The motion passes. One Commissioner opposed; no
12 Commissioner abstained. All others were in favor.

13 I'll note now that with the adoption of
14 the report and the findings and recommendations the
15 clock begins ticking with respect to the deadlines
16 for statements in rebuttal. Statements will be due
17 on Monday, September 23 with rebuttals due on
18 Wednesday, October 23. Commissioners must file
19 notice of their intention to file a surrebuttal by
20 Wednesday, October 30 and then must file the text
21 of their surrebuttal on Wednesday, November 6.

22 **B. DISCUSSION AND VOTE ON CHAIR FOR NORTH DAKOTA**

23 **STATE ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

24 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: The next item on
25 our agenda is to consider the recommendation from

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the staff director for the appointment of a new
2 chair for our North Dakota Advisory Committee that
3 the previous chair resigned.

4 To open the floor for discussion I move
5 that the Commission accept the staff director's
6 recommendation and appoint Michelle Rydz to serve
7 as the chair of the North Dakota Advisory
8 Committee. Do I have a second?

9 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Second. Gail
10 Heriot. Second.

11 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner
12 Heriot, thank you for the second.

13 Any discussion?

14 (No audible response.)

15 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Okay. I'll call
16 the question and take a roll call vote.

17 Commissioner Adegbile, how do you vote?

18 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Aye.

19 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner
20 Heriot?

21 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I vote yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner
23 Kirsanow?

24 (No audible response.)

25 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Kladney?

2 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

3 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner

4 Narasaki?

5 COMMISSIONER Yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner Yaki?

7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Aye.

8 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Vice Chair

9 Timmons-Goodson?

10 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: And I vote yes.

12 The motion passes unanimously.

13 **C. DISCUSSION AND VOTE ON 2020 BUSINESS MEETING**

14 **CALENDAR**

15 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: We'll now discuss
16 and vote on the schedule for business meetings in
17 2020. Everyone should have a proposed list of
18 dates for meetings next year, which I'll read out
19 loud now just for clarity.

20 Friday, January 24; Friday, February
21 28; Friday, March 20; Friday, April 17; Friday, May
22 8; Friday, June 5; Friday, July 17; Friday, August
23 14; Friday, September 11; Friday, October 16;
24 Friday, November 13; and Friday, December 4.

25 To open the floor for discussion I move

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that the Commission adopts the schedule as I have
2 just read. Do I have a second?

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I second. Gail
4 Heriot.

5 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: I second.

6 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you for
7 those enthusiastic seconds.

8 Is there any discussion?

9 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: We love those
10 Fridays.

11 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Yes. I love being
12 together with you all once a month.

13 Unless there's further discussion, I'll
14 call the question and take a roll call vote.

15 Commissioner Adegbile, how do you vote?

16 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Aye.

17 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner
18 Heriot?

19 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner
21 Kirsanow?

22 (No audible response.)

23 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner
24 Kladney?

25 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner
2 Narasaki?

3 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

4 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner Yaki?

5 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I have a question.
6 Given that we always meet on Fridays, do I have my
7 date wrong and today's actually Friday and not
8 Thursday?

9 (Laughter.)

10 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Let's first vote
11 and I'm happy to discuss your dates. How do you
12 vote on these dates?

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Aye.

14 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you.

15 Vice Chair Timmons-Goodson?

16 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

17 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: And I vote yes.

18 The motion passes unanimously.

19 And for the record today is Thursday.
20 We're off of our regular schedule and I appreciate
21 everyone's accommodation.

22 (Laughter.)

23 **D. MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONS - STAFF DIRECTOR'S**

24 **REPORT**

25 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Next we'll hear

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 from staff director Mauro Morales for the monthly
2 staff director's report.

3 MR. MORALES: Thank you, Madam Chair.
4 In the interest of everyone's time I'll not go into
5 any details of the report, however, I'm always
6 available to discuss a specific item or question
7 that a Commissioner may have. Thank you, Madam
8 Chair.

9 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you, Mr.
10 Staff Director.

11 Just a point of personal privilege, I
12 understand that tomorrow will be the last day for
13 Special Assistance Sheryl Cozart who has ably
14 served the Vice Chair for the duration of time I
15 have been on who proceeds my service on the
16 Commission.

17 I just want to say how much I will miss
18 you, Sheryl, how very much I have relied on your
19 help and assistance including before I had a
20 special assistant to work with me and ever since
21 you have been an extraordinary assist for the
22 Commission. Your expertise across lots of area,
23 your beautiful writing, your relentless research,
24 your lovely support and personality have been a
25 real benefit. I am so sorry to see you go, but

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 very glad to see that you will be able to use your
2 expertise in your next endeavors and I look forward
3 to being able to benefit from them. Thank you for
4 your service to the Commission and to our country.

5 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Madam
6 Chair, when appropriate I'd like to say a word or
7 two.

8 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Please go ahead,
9 Madam Vice Chair.

10 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Thank you
11 very much.

12 I have been -- since learning that
13 Sheryl would be leaving been in a bit of a
14 depression. As I told her, it's rare that you just
15 click with someone in the way that we have clicked.
16 She has been not only my right hand, at times I
17 felt that she was my left hand as well. She has
18 the disposition, the heart, the ability and her
19 passion for what we do at the Commission that has
20 really helped us along. And frankly, I don't know
21 what I'm going to do without her, but she has
22 earned the opportunity that she now has to continue
23 serving.

24 And, Sheryl, just know that I, we at
25 the Commission are going to miss you and appreciate

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 so very much all that you have meant to us and to
2 our work. It speaks for itself. And there's a
3 song now that says I'm expecting great things.
4 Anyway, we are. And we'll hear more from you I'm
5 sure. Thank you.

6 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Madam Chair,
7 this is Commissioner Narasaki.

8 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Go ahead,
9 Commissioner Narasaki.

10 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: I would just
11 like to add my thanks and appreciation to Sheryl.
12 She's been an amazing colleague. And we are a very
13 tiny crew at the Commission because of the size of
14 our staff and have put out I think an amazing level
15 of work. and it requires a lot of teamwork, and
16 she has been the ultimate in terms of a leader and
17 team player and a joy to work with.

18 So I very much wish you well. I look
19 forward to seeing how you rise further in your
20 career.

21 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Madam Chair,
22 Commissioner Adegbile.

23 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Go ahead
24 Commissioner Adegbile.

25 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Sheryl, I would

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 just like to join the commendations of the Vice
2 Chair and Commissioner Narasaki and the Chair
3 thanking you for your work and efforts. When I
4 think of you and I think of your contributions to
5 the Commission, I'm reminded of the quiet resolve
6 that so many people who have fought for civil
7 rights have had where they are moored with their
8 feet on the ground and they're committed to justice
9 and quietly pushing constantly in that direction.

10 And when I think of the contributions
11 that you've brought to the Commission with your
12 quiet ways but your centered focus on doing what's
13 right and justice, I know that we all have
14 benefitted from it. And I have heard from the
15 other SAs how much they value you as a colleague
16 and I hope you now know that we as Commissioners
17 share that appreciation and wish you every success
18 as you continue in your career. God speed.

19 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Madam Chair?

20 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Go ahead,
21 Commissioner Heriot.

22 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I just wanted to
23 add my thoughts.

24 Sheryl, it has been great having you
25 with us. You have been a perfectly matched pair

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 with the Vice Chair. It's really quite amazing.
2 Both of you so sweet, hard-working. I will miss
3 you. And indeed we are all expecting great things
4 from you in the future. Maybe, just maybe the
5 Commission one day. So thank you for all you've
6 done.

7 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Commissioner
8 Kladney?

9 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Madam Chair,
10 David Kladney here.

11 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Go ahead.

12 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes, thank you.

13 Sheryl, I'd really like to thank you.
14 Your teamwork and your contributions have been
15 phenomenal to the team. And I understand that your
16 future position sounds so exciting to be able to
17 add to our country's best interests, but I'd really
18 like to thank you for your calmness when I would be
19 like running up and down the hall and I'd stick my
20 head in and you would calm me down. I always
21 thought, boy, this is a great person.

22 And so I'd really like to thank you.
23 Your work has been phenomenal. I know Amy has
24 appreciated you tremendously as have I. So thank
25 you very much and great luck in the future. Thank

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 you.

2 MR. MORALES: Madam Chair, if I may
3 make a statement on behalf of the staff?

4 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Go ahead, Mr.
5 Staff Director.

6 MR. MORALES: Thank you.

7 Sheryl, just wanted you to know on
8 behalf of the entire staff how much you will be
9 missed. You are a team player. You stepped in
10 multiple roles over the years and I can't thank you
11 enough for the work. And personally I can't think
12 you enough for the advice and work you've provided
13 and the assistance you've given me to make my
14 job -- I'm able to do my job. So thank you. We're
15 going to be seeing you through the rest of the day
16 and celebrating with you and I just want you to
17 know I'm -- thank you from the entire staff of the
18 U.S. Commission on Civil Rights.

19 COMMISSIONER YAKI: And, Sheryl --

20 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: As well I'll
21 note -- oh, go ahead, Commissioner Yaki.

22 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Thank you very
23 much, Madam Chair.

24 I just want to add my kudos, praise,
25 thanks, amens, hallelujahs to the chorus for Sheryl

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 as someone who was left staff assistant for some
2 time. She was part of the crew that helped in and
3 enabled me to steer the course with all of you, but
4 really in a -- that's just a minor part of
5 everything that is great and good about her and her
6 demeanor and her hard work and her intelligence.

7 And congratulations to you, Sheryl,
8 for -- on the next step of your career. With
9 everyone, I think we all not only expect, but we
10 know we will see great things from you.

11 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: Thank you, all.

12 At this time -- well, let me note first
13 that Sheryl is not on the speaker line, so I
14 imagine that it's been uncomfortable to listen to
15 all of us sing your praises and I hope you have
16 enjoyed and I know that you couldn't say anything
17 back to us.

18 **E. MEETING OF THE COMMISSION'S SUBCOMMITTEE ON**
19 **CONDITION OF IMMIGRATION DETENTION CENTERS AND**
20 **TREATMENT OF IMMIGRANTS IN DETENTION - DISCUSSION**
21 **AND VOTE ON SUBCOMMITTEE'S REPORT TO COMMISSION**

22 CHAIRPERSON LHAMON: At this time the
23 Commission will now move to a meeting of our
24 Subcommittee on Immigration Detention. Since I'm
25 not on that subcommittee and I'm recused from its

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 work, I will now turn the gavel over to
2 Commissioner Yaki and I will exit the room. Thank
3 you, all.

4 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Thank you very
5 much, Madam Chair, and good luck wherever you are
6 going right now. Hopefully it is a nice and
7 comfortable warm place, like back to sleep.

8 Thank you, all. We are going to be
9 considering today the -- for lack of -- for
10 shorthand, the Immigration Detention Report, or as
11 it's formally titled, Trauma at the Border: the
12 Human Cost of Inhumane Immigration Policies.

13 I want to first acknowledge two things:
14 One, that the report has been sent out, has
15 received agency review. You received the updated
16 report. The findings and recommendations as
17 amended with a redline were sent out last night and
18 I know that we may have some adjustments to that
19 later today and perhaps even next week. But this
20 is just for the Subcommittee consideration, not for
21 the Full Committee. So I am going to very quickly
22 call the roll for the Subcommittee and starts with
23 Commissioner Narasaki.

24 Are you present?

25 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Present.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner
2 Kladney, are you present?

3 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

4 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner
5 Adegbile, are you present?

6 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Present.

7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: And, Commissioner
8 Kirsanow, are you present?

9 (No audible response.)

10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: For the record I
11 note that Commissioner Kirsanow was not on the
12 previous meeting and is not at this one today.

13 So today, thank you, all, we have a
14 quorum of the Subcommittee.

15 First I want to just briefly -- well,
16 actually not so briefly, thank one of -- a person
17 who is no longer with the Commission, Jason Lagria,
18 who is -- who was Commissioner Narasaki's special
19 assistant, who really pulled the yeoman's oar on
20 this. I think we all owe him a tremendous debt of
21 gratitude and thanks, as well as to Amy Royce and
22 Carissa Mulder for their hard work, Rukku Singla,
23 Irena Vidulovic, Alison Somin, and at the very last
24 minute my mew and old at the same time Special
25 Assistant Todd Dual.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 I also really want to thank the staff,
2 especially the staff director and the general
3 counsel and the head of OCRE who despite the fact
4 that this was a report that was put together with
5 spit and glue because of the resource constraints,
6 all of them managed to find and carve time out to
7 help with this report, but not at the cost or
8 detriment of our incredibly big workload that we
9 have in turning out other reports.

10 This was an extraordinary undertaking
11 in all aspects of that definition. We did not seek
12 this issue; it sought us. And I just want to thank
13 everyone: the law clerks, interns, everyone who
14 were part of this endeavor. We can talk about this
15 more next week. I know we're all on a time
16 schedule.

17 So with that I am going to reserve my
18 comments about the issue until next week at the
19 Full Commission and simply use this time to
20 formally move the mechanics of this up to the Full
21 Commission for a report.

22 So unless anyone has any other sort of
23 background remarks, I'd like to move on approving
24 the report for consideration to the Full
25 Commission.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: This is
2 Commissioner Narasaki. I would just like to
3 acknowledge your leadership of this subcommittee
4 and thank you for that. And also welcome my new
5 special assistant. Thank you for acknowledging
6 Jason Lagria's very hard work. He will be missed.
7 I'm very excited though to introduce everyone to
8 Peach Soltis who has had a wild two first days. So
9 thank you, Michael.

10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Thank you. Thank
11 you, Commissioner Narasaki.

12 And welcome, Peach. Look forward to
13 meeting you soon and thanks for stepping into the
14 whirlpool.

15 Anything else from the Commissioners?
16 If not, I'd like a motion to approve the main body
17 of the report for forwarding to the Full
18 Commission.

19 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: This is
20 Commissioner Narasaki. And sorry, I would like to
21 add also our gratitude to the staff. While the
22 Commissioners and our special assistants agreed to
23 take the oar because of our limited capacity on
24 this report, staff, particularly our general
25 counsel and OCRE director, have been very critical

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 in helping us to get this report to this stage and
2 thank them very much for their hard work. And also
3 the staff who helped organize the briefing, the
4 public briefing which was incredibly moving and
5 very important to this report, and everyone who
6 testified. Thank you.

7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Thank you.

8 So do I have a motion to approve the
9 report and send it to the Full Commission for
10 consideration?

11 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: This is
12 Commissioner Narasaki. So moved.

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I will -- is there
14 a second?

15 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: I'll second it.
16 Commissioner Adegbile seconds, Commissioner Yaki.

17 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Thank you,
18 Commissioner Adegbile.

19 Let me call the roll.

20 Commissioner Narasaki?

21 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Aye.

22 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner
23 Adegbile?

24 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Aye.

25 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Kladney?

2 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner
4 Kirsanow?

5 (No audible response.)

6 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Actually I --

7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: And I vote -- oh.

8 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Sorry,
9 Commissioner Yaki. This moved so fast. I had an
10 amendment to the findings.

11 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Right, we're just
12 doing the report.

13 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: So are we --
14 we're just doing the report? Okay. Thank you.

15 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

16 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Sorry about
17 that. Go ahead.

18 COMMISSIONER YAKI: You're welcome.
19 Commissioner Kirsanow?

20 (No audible response.)

21 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner
22 Kirsanow not voting. Commissioner Yaki votes aye.
23 The report is approved for consideration of the
24 Full Commission by a four to zero vote.

25 We will now move to the findings and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 recommendations. Commissioner Narasaki, you --

2 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Sorry.

3 Commissioner Yaki, I --

4 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes?

5 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: -- think just
6 for clarity of the record, as I understand it
7 Commissioner Kirsanow is not present, not just not
8 voting, but not present as I understand it.

9 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Thank you very
10 much. That will be noted.

11 On the findings and recommendations,
12 Commissioner Narasaki, you had an amendment?

13 (No audible response.)

14 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner
15 Narasaki?

16 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Sorry, I was on
17 mute. This is Commissioner Narasaki. I would like
18 to move for consideration to the Full Committee the
19 findings and recommendations. I would like offer a
20 friendly amendment that was circulated last night
21 at a little after 9:30 by my Special Assistant
22 Peach Soltis.

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Without objection
24 if there -- without objection that amendment will
25 be included in the findings and recommendations and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 is included in the motion. Seeing no objection, so
2 ordered.

3 We will now move -- is there a second
4 to Commissioner Narasaki's --

5 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Mr. Chairman?

6 COMMISSIONER -- motion? Yes,
7 Commissioner Kladney?

8 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Mr. Chairman?

9 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

10 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Is it the one
11 where we're adding a single word to the findings
12 and recommendations?

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

14 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Thank you.

15 COMMISSIONER YAKI: The word detention,
16 yes.

17 So with that, having heard no objection
18 about that, it will be amended into it. On the
19 amendment as -- on the findings as amended, is
20 there a second to approve this for consideration by
21 the Full Commission?

22 (No audible response.)

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Looking for a
24 second.

25 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Commissioner

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Adegbile, second.

2 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner

3 Adegbile seconds the amended motion to the findings

4 and recommendations on the motion as amended.

5 We'll now call the roll.

6 Commissioner Narasaki?

7 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

8 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner

9 Narasaki Aye.

10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner

11 Adegbile?

12 COMMISSIONER ADEGBILE: Aye.

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner

14 Kladney?

15 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

16 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner

17 Kirsanow?

18 (No audible response.)

19 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Commissioner

20 Kirsanow not present.

21 Commissioner Yaki votes aye. The

22 findings and recommendations as amended are

23 presented to the Full Commission for consideration

24 by a four to zero vote.

25 **III. ADJOURN MEETING**

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: That concludes the
2 business of the Subcommittee. And I believe that
3 concludes our business today. So thank you very
4 much all of you for your assistance and your hard
5 work on this report. Look forward to discussing it
6 more next week. We are adjourned. Enjoy the day
7 and the weekend, even though I thought today was
8 Friday.

9 (Whereupon, the above-entitled matter
10 went off the record at 11:08 a.m.)

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701